

**Carleton University
Fall 2015**

STUDIES IN HISTORICAL REPRESENTATION

CLMD 6106/HISTORY 5906/ENGLISH 5900/ARTH 5112S

Special theme:

HISTORY, NARRATION, AND MEDIATION: PROBLEMS OF HISTORICAL DISTANCE

Time: Tuesdays 2:35pm – 5:25pm

Location: St. Patrick's Building Rm 201D – *Please confirm on Carleton Central*

Instructor: MARK PHILLIPS

Office: St. Patrick's, 201L

Email: Mark_Phillips@Carleton.Ca

Home phone: 613 521 3154

This course examines issues of narratively and historical distance in historical thought and practice. Our starting point will be the idea that history is essentially a mediatory art and therefore that a central issue for historical representation (whatever the genres or media) is the problem of what we will call “historical distance.” Drawing on a variety of theoretical discussions as well as primary readings in history, biography, and fiction, we will explore the idea of “distance” as a tool for analyzing structures of historical representation in a number of different kinds of narrative – including historiographical, philosophical, fictional, and visual texts.

Please note: though the course readings will focus on historical and fictional narratives of the Enlightenment and Romantic-period, students will also be invited to extend the analysis of “distance” and historical mediation to other genres and media, or to other eras of historical description, when these are appropriate to their own fields of study. In the past students have chosen to write their research papers on issues of mediation and distance as they arise in biography, film, visual art, and fiction, as well as in historiography itself.

SCHEDULE.OF SEMINARS/TOPICS for fall of 2015

Note: readings in square brackets are intended as background or suggestions for further reading. They are not required.

Sept 8 – Introduction: Mediation and Distance in Historical Representation

Sept 15 – Narrative: Knowledge and Tradition

Louis Mink, "History and Fiction as Modes of Comprehension"

Alasdair MacIntyre, *After Virtue*, ch. 15

David Carr, "Narrative and the Real World" *History and Theory*, vol 25 (1986) (Jstor)]

[Paul Ricour, "The Reality of the Historical Past," in Adam Budd ed., *The Modern Historiography Reader*, Routledge, 2009]

Sept 22 – Representation

Ann Rigney, "Representability" in *Imperfect Histories*, 59-98

Chris Prendergast, *Triangle of Representation*, Introduction.

Martin Jay, "Photo-unrealism: The Contribution of the Camera to the Crisis of Ocularcentrism," in *Vision and Textuality*, ed. Stephen Melville and Bill Readings, Macmillan, 1995.

[David Somers, "Representation," in *Critical Terms for Art History*, R. Nelson and R. Shiff eds.]

Sept 29 – Gadamer: Hermeneutics and History

Hans Georg Gadamer, "On the Scope and Function of Hermeneutical Reflection" (from Gadamer, *Philosophical Hermeneutics*)

Gadamer, *Truth and Method*, 270– 311

[Georgia Warnke, *Gadamer*, ch.1 and 3]

Oct 6 – Class cancelled

Oct 13 – Distance and Representation

Georg Simmel, "Stranger" in *Sociology of Georg Simmel*

Mark Salber Phillips "Preface" and "Introduction," from *On Historical Distance*, New Haven: Yale U Press

Michael Ann Holly, "The Melancholy Art," *Art Bulletin*, 2007

[Shklovsky "Art as Technique" in Shklovsky *Theory of Prose*]

[Charles Taylor. "Understanding the Other: A Gadamerian View on Conceptual Schemes" (in *Gadamer's Century* ed. Malpas MIT Press)

[Phillips, M S – "Relocating Inwardness" PMLA/reprint *The Modern Historiography Reader*, Routledge, 2009]

W. J. T. Mitchell, "Abstraction and Intimacy," in *What Do Pictures Want*, 222-244.

Oct 20 – History and Visual Representation

Michael Fried, *Absorption and Theatricality*, Introduction, Johns Hopkins,
Susan Sontag, "Photographic Evagels," from *On Photography*, Picador 1973, 115-49.
The Meaning of Photography, ed. Robin Kelsea. "Introduction: Photography's Double Index,"
Clark Studies in the Visual Arts, Yale Press, 2008.

[W. J. T. Mitchell, "The Pictorial Turn," *Picture Theory*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press,
1994, 11-34]

[Susan Sontag, "Plato's Cave," from *On Photography*, 1973

[Jonathan Crary, "Modernity and the Problem of the Observer," *Techniques of the Observer: On Vision and
Modernity in the Nineteenth Century*. Cambridge, MA and London: MIT Press, 1990, 1-24.]

W. J. T. Mitchell, "Abstraction and Intimacy," in *What Do Pictures Want*, 222-244.

Margaret Iverson and Stephen Melville, *Writing Art History*, (Chicago: U of Chicago Press)
ch. 4, 5, 7. **]

Oct 27 – 30 --- Reading Week -- no classes

Nov 3 – Eighteenth-Century Histories: the Commercial Present/Classical and Primitive Pasts

David Hume – "Of Commerce"

David Hume – "Of the Rise and Progress of the Arts" (introduction)

M. Phillips, "Hume and the Balances of Enlightenment History," from *On Historical Distance*,
Yale: Yale U. Press, 2013) 61-78.

[David Hume – "My Own Life]

Adam Ferguson, "Rude Nations" from *Essay on the History of Civil Society*

David Hume – Appendix IV to the *History of England*, v. 5:

[M Phillips, *Society and Sentiment*, Princeton: Princeton U Press, 2000: ch,1,3, 4]

Nov 10 – Sentiment and History: Form, Affect, Ideology, Understanding

Hume -- *Enquiry Concerning the Principles of Morals*, "Why Utility Pleases": 104-118

Helen Maria Williams, *Letters from France*, Broadview Press **

Nov 17 – History and Romance: Godwin and Scott

William Godwin – "History and Romance" (in *Caleb Williams*, Penguin ed., appendix)

Walter Scott, *Waverley*

Nov 24 – History and Visual Representation

Joshua Reynolds -- Discourses IV, XI

M S Phillips -- "Distance and History Painting" *Modern Intellectual History*

John Ruskin -- "The Lamp of Memory," from *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*

Dec 1 – Thomas Carlyle

Thomas Carlyle – “Biography”

Carlyle – “The Ancient Monk” in *Past and Present*

New York University Press

Course Requirements and Evaluation

Term essay: approximately 15 pages [75 %] Please note: as stated above, the term essays should reflect some aspect or aspects of the major themes of the course (mediation, historical representation, distance etc.) Nonetheless, it is expected that most of the term essays will draw directly on the student's own areas of research, while also making us of some of the ideas and methods we have explored during the term.

Weekly seminar participation and panel discussions -- including 2 written summaries of panel discussions, to be submitted one week after the initial presentation [25%]

Note: most readings will be made available in the course pack. Course pack and books to purchase will be available at Haven Books at Seneca/Sunnyside

Books to Purchase: **

Helen Maria Williams, *Letters from France*

Thomas Carlyle, *Past and Present*

Walter Scott, *Waverley*

Some Suggested Primary Readings to be Aware Of.

Hume, David – *Essays* (Liberty Classics, Indianapolis)

Hume, David – *History of England*, vols 5 (Liberty Classics)

Hume -- *Inquiry Concerning the Principles of Morals* (Oxford)

Williams, Helen Maria – *Letters Written in France (1790)*

Broadview Literary Texts

Carlyle, Thomas – *Past and Present*

New York University Press

Gadamer, Hans-Georg -- *Truth and Method*. Translated by Joel Weinsheimer and Donald

Marshall. New York: Continuum, 1989, 270-299.

Thomas Babington Macaulay – “History” (Edinburgh Review, 1828)

Macaulay -- “Hallam” (intro only] (Edinburgh Review, 1828))

Thomas Carlyle – “Biography”

John Stuart Mill – “Carlyle’s French Revolution”

Mill, “Michelet’s History of France”]

August Pugin, *Contrasts* (selections)

Thomas Carlyle -- *Past and Present*, “The Ancient Monk”

Whately, *Historic Doubts Relative to Napoleon Bonaparte*

Some Suggested Secondary Works to Be Aware Of

White, Hayden – *Metahistory* – Preface and Introduction
Johns Hopkins UP

Fay, Pomper and Vann, Richard – *History and Theory; Contemporary Readings*
Blackwell – [selected essays]

Budd, Adam. *Modern Historiography Reader*. Routledge, 2009 [selected essays]

MacIntyre, Alisdair – *After Virtue*: Notre Dame, 1981

Phillips, Mark Salber – *Society and Sentiment: Genres of Historical Writing in Britain, 1740-1820* Princeton UP

– “Relocating Inwardness” PMLA 2003 (reprint *Modern Historiography Reader*, Routledge)

--“Constructing Historical Distance,” *History Workshop Journal*, 2004

Ginzburg, Carlo – “Clues”

Ricoeur, Paul – “The Hermeneutic Function of Distanciation”

Rigney, Ann – *Imperfect Histories*

Shklovsky, Victor --. “Art as Technique.” In *Russian Formalist Criticism: Four Essays*.

tr. Lee T. Lemon and Marion J. Reis. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1965, 3-24.

Simmel, Georg -- “The Stranger.” In *The Sociology of Georg Simmel*. Translated and edited by Kurt H. Wolff. New York: The Free Press of Glencoe, 1950, 402-408.

Stolnitz, Jerome – “The Aesthetic Attitude.” In *Aesthetics and Philosophy of Art Criticism*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1960, 29-63.

Plagiarism

The University Senate defines plagiarism as “*presenting, whether intentionally or not, the ideas, expression of ideas or work of others as one’s own.*” This can include:

- reproducing or paraphrasing portions of someone else’s published or unpublished material, regardless of the source, and presenting these as one’s own without proper citation or reference to the original source;
- submitting a take-home examination, essay, laboratory report or other assignment written, in whole or in part, by someone else;
- using ideas or direct, verbatim quotations, or paraphrased material, concepts, or ideas without appropriate acknowledgment in any academic assignment;
- using another’s data or research findings;
- failing to acknowledge sources through the use of proper citations when using another’s works and/or failing to use quotation marks;
- handing in "substantially the same piece of work for academic credit more than once without prior written permission of the course instructor in which the submission occurs."

Plagiarism is a serious offence that cannot be resolved directly by the course’s instructor. The Associate Dean of the Faculty conducts a rigorous investigation, including an interview with the student, when an instructor suspects a piece of work has been plagiarized. Penalties are not trivial. They can include a final grade of "F" for the course. For more information please go to: <http://www2.carleton.ca/studentaffairs/academic-integrity>

Academic Accommodation

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

Pregnancy obligation: write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist.

For more details see the Student

Guide <http://carleton.ca/equity/accommodation/academic/students/>

Religious obligation: write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist.

For more details see the Student Guide above.

Students with disabilities requiring academic accommodations in this course must register with the Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities (PMC) for a formal evaluation of disability-related needs. Documented disabilities could include but not limited to mobility/physical impairments, specific Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/psychological disabilities, sensory disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), and chronic medical conditions. Registered PMC students are required to contact the PMC, 613-520-6608, every term to ensure that your Instructor receives your Letter of Accommodation, no later than two weeks before the first assignment is due or the first in-class test/midterm requiring accommodations. If you only require accommodations for your formally scheduled exam(s) in this course, please submit your request for accommodations to PMC by **Nov. 7, 2014** for the Fall term and **March 6, 2015** for the Winter term. For more details visit the Equity Services website: carleton.ca/equity/accommodation/