

## PHIL 4100 Fall 2015

### **Exploitation and Commodification**

Tuesdays 2:30-5:00

Professor Vida Panitch

[vida.panitch@carleton.ca](mailto:vida.panitch@carleton.ca)

office hours by appointment

### **Course Description:**

The concepts of exploitation and commodification are called upon frequently to explain the immorality of certain kinds of financial transactions in a market economy. But do they identify the same kinds of transactions as wrongful, and what reasons do they supply for a ban on these kinds of transactions? Commodification calls out wholesale practices in which a good's social meaning or inherent value is degraded by its assignment of a price tag. Exploitation calls out specific transactions in which a good or service is traded between parties asymmetric in their vulnerability to coercion and distributive injustice. In this course we will explore the arguments supplied by various contemporary moral and political philosophers as to why, and how, we should understand certain kinds of financial transactions as harmfully commodifying or harmfully exploitative, or both. We will concentrate on how these arguments apply to financial transactions involving the sale of bodily goods and services specifically. Examples we will focus on will include prostitution, surrogacy, gamete sales, and kidney sales.

### **Course Assignments:**

- **Reading responses: 4 x 10 = 40%.** These should be 3-4 pages double-spaced. You must submit 4 of these throughout the term, in hard copy at the beginning of class. You may submit them on days of your choose but **you must submit at least one per month.** That is, at least one must be submitted in September, one in October, and one in November. You may focus on one claim or the general argument from one of the week's readings, or on themes that connect the week's readings. These responses must be both expository and evaluative in nature, and as they account for almost half your term mark must be taken seriously and will be marked accordingly
- **Participation: 10%.** Students are expected to come to class, and to come prepared to discuss the readings. This is a seminar, not a lecture course.
- **Take Home Exam: 50%.** This is effectively your term paper. A topic will be chosen by the student, and approved by the instructor. Length: 12-15 pages. Due on the last day of the December exam period.

## **Course Readings:**

The readings are either online, available in the library's electronic journal database, or posted as PDFs on CuLearn (see \*\* in the schedule below).

## **Course Schedule:**

**September 8** Introduction to the course

### ***Recommended Background Reading***

Karl Marx, *Capital*, Volume 1 Part 1 Chapter 1, Section I and IV

<https://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1867-c1/ch01.htm#S1>

Aristotle, *Politics*, Book I, Chapters 8-10

<http://classics.mit.edu/Aristotle/politics.1.one.html>

*Nicomachean Ethics*, Book V, Chapters 3-5

<http://classics.mit.edu/Aristotle/nicomachaen.5.v.html>

John Locke, Second Treatise on Government, Chapter 5

<http://www.constitution.org/jl/2ndtr05.htm>

**September 15**

Michael Sandel, "What Money Can't Buy: The Moral Limits of the Market," Tanner Lectures on Human Values 1998 \*\*

Michael Sandel *What Money Can't Buy* (Farrar, Strauss and Giroux, 2012) pp. 3-16 \*\*

**September 22**

Michael Walzer, *Spheres of Justice*, (Basic Books: 1998) pp. 3-26, 64-67, 75-110 \*\*

**September 29**

Elizabeth Anderson, "Ethical Limitations of the Market," *Economics and Philosophy* 6(2) 1990: 179-205

Elizabeth Anderson, "Is Women's Labor a Commodity?" *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 19(1) 1990: 71-92

**October 6**

Anne Phillips, "It's my Body and I'll do What I Like with It: Bodies as Objects and Property," *Political Theory* 39(6) 2011: 724-748

Kimberly Krawiec, "A Woman's Worth," *North Carolina Law Review* 88 (2010) 1739-1769

**October 13**

Margaret Jane Radin, "Market Inalienability," *Harvard Law Review* 100(8) 1987: 1849-1937

**October 20**

Debra Satz, *Why Some Things Should not be For Sale* (Oxford, 2010) ch 4-5, pp. 91-154\*\*

## **October 27 - Reading Break**

### **November 3**

Robert Goodin, "Exploitation," *Reasons for Welfare*, (Princeton, 1988) ch 5, pp. 123-153 \*\*

Alan Wertheimer, "Exploitation" Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy  
<http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/exploitation/>

Alan Wertheimer, *Exploitation* (Princeton, 1998) ch 1, pp 3-36\*\*

### **November 10**

Ruth Sample, "What is Bad About Exploitation," *Exploitation: What it is and Why it's Wrong*, ch 3, (Rowman & Littlefield, 2003) pp. 55-96 \*\*

Hallie Liberto, "Exploitation and the Vulnerability Clause," *Ethical Theory and Moral Practice* 17(4): 619-629

### **November 17**

Paul M. Hughes, "Exploitation, Autonomy, and the Case for Organ Sales,"  
*International Journal of Applied Philosophy* 12(1): 89-95

Stephen Wilkinson, *Bodies for Sale: Ethics and Exploitation in the Human Body Trade* (Routledge 2003) ch 2 and 7, pp. 9-26, 101-133 \*\*

### **November 24**

Rob Lawlor, "Kidney Sales Needn't be Exploitative (but it matters if they are),"  
*Bioethics* 25(5): 250-59

Rob Lawlor, "Exploitative at any Price?" *Bioethics* 28(4) 194-202

Debra Satz, *Why Some Things Should not be for Sale* (Oxford, 2010) ch 9, pp. 189-205\*\*

### **December 1**

Hallie Liberto, "Noxious Markets vs Noxious Gift Relationships," *Social Theory and Practice* 39(2):265-287

Janet Radcliffe Richards, "Nepharious Goings On: Kidney Sales and Moral Arguments," *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* 21(4) 1996: 375-426

## Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (2015-16)

### **Assignments:**

Unless specifically told otherwise by their instructors, students:

- must not use a plastic or cardboard cover or paper clips
- must staple the paper (there is a stapler on the essay box)
- must include the following:
  - student name
  - student number
  - course number and section
  - instructor's name
- No assignments will be accepted after the last day for handing in term work – see dates in next column.
- Assignments handed in through the essay box (just inside the glass doors, Paterson Hall, Floor 3A) must be dropped into the box by **4:15** on a regular business day in order to be date-stamped with that day's date. Assignments handed in after 4:15 or on a non-business day will be stamped as having been handed in on the next business day.
- Students are required to keep copies of their assignments. If your paper is lost at any point, you will be considered not to have submitted it if you cannot produce a copy immediately on request.

### **Deferrals for Term Work:**

If you miss a final examination and/or fail to submit a final assignment by the due date because of circumstances beyond your control, you may apply for a deferral of examination/assignment. For deferred examinations, you must apply within 5 working days after the scheduled date of your exam. To apply for deferral of a final assignment, you must apply within 5 working days of the last scheduled day of classes. Visit the Registrar's Office for more information.

### **Plagiarism:**

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of 'plagiarism' as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. (Undergraduate Calendar Academic Regulations, section 14.3, or <http://calendar.carleton.ca/undergrad/regulations/academicregulationsoftheuniversity/acadregsuniv14/>)

### **Academic Accommodation:**

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

**Pregnancy obligation:** write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

**Religious obligation:** write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

**Academic Accommodations for Students with Disabilities:** The **Paul Menton Centre** for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or [pmc@carleton.ca](mailto:pmc@carleton.ca) for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send your **Letter of Accommodation** at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (*if applicable*). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with your professor to ensure

accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC website for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (*if applicable*) at <http://www2.carleton.ca/pmc/new-and-current-students/dates-and-deadlines/>

You can visit the Equity Services website to view the policies and to obtain more detailed information on academic accommodation at <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

### **Important Dates:**

Sept. 2	Classes start.
Sept. 4	Classes follow a Monday schedule.
Sept. 7	Labour Day - University closed.
Sept. 18	Last day for registration and course changes in Fall and Fall/Winter courses.
Sept. 30	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from Fall term or two-term courses.
Oct. 12	Thanksgiving Day – University closed.
Oct. 26-30	Fall Break – no classes.
Nov. 24	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000-level before the Final Examination period.
Dec. 7	Last day of classes, Fall term. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for Fall term courses.
Dec. 7	Last day to withdraw from Fall term courses (academic purposes only).
Dec. 8	No classes or examinations take place. Review classes may be held, but no new material may be introduced.
Dec. 9-21	Final examinations for Fall courses, mid-terms for Fall/Winter courses. Exams are normally held all seven days of the week.
Dec. 21	Take-home exams are due.
Jan. 6	Winter term classes begin.
Jan. 19	Last day for registration and course changes in Winter term classes.
Jan. 31	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter courses or winter portion of two-term courses.
Feb. 15-19	Winter Break, no classes.
Mar. 24	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000-level before the Final Examination period.
Mar. 25	Good Friday – University closed.
Apr. 8	Last day of Fall/Winter and Winter term classes. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for Fall/Winter and Winter term courses.
Apr. 8	Last day to withdraw from Fall/Winter and Winter term courses (academic purposes only).
Apr. 9-10	No classes or examinations take place. Review classes may be held, but no new material may be introduced.
Apr. 11-23	Final Examinations. Exams are normally held all seven days of the week.
Apr. 23	Take-home exams are due.

### **Addresses:**

Department of Philosophy:	3A35 Paterson Hall <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/philosophy">www.carleton.ca/philosophy</a> 520-2110
Registrar's Office:	300 Tory <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/registrar">www.carleton.ca/registrar</a> 520-3500
Student Academic Success Centre:	302 Tory <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/sasc">www.carleton.ca/sasc</a> 520-7850
Writing Tutorial Service:	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor, Library <a href="http://www1.carleton.ca/sasc/writing-tutorial-service/">http://www1.carleton.ca/sasc/writing-tutorial-service/</a> 520-6632
MacOdrum Library	<a href="http://www.library.carleton.ca/">http://www.library.carleton.ca/</a> 520-2735