

PHIL 5000F: Contemporary Animal Ethics

Fall 2016

Thursdays 5:30-8:30pm

Dr. Katherine Wayne

Office: PA (Paterson Hall) 3A54

Office hours: Thursdays 3-4, and by appointment

E-mail: katherine.wayne@carleton.ca or via cuLearn

COURSE DESCRIPTION

This course involves rethinking fundamental social categories such as companionship and citizenship through an investigation of the ethics of human-animal relationships. Rather than pursuing a broad historical survey of these relationships or revisiting the traditional animal rights literature, here we will examine contemporary research that reflects the recently rapid progress in animal ethics and politics. More specifically, we focus on the relationship between humans and domesticated animals (typically bred and raised for food, labour/service, or companionship), and consider how humans and domestic animals may contribute to and flourish together in a just moral and political community.

The first half of the course will provide an overview of contemporary debates and topics in animal ethics and politics. The second half will narrow in on the normative dimensions of the human-domestic animal relationship, and is divided into two parts. First, we will focus on theoretical foundations of this relationship, considering questions like: what kinds of relationships are morally appropriate and desirable between domestic animals and humans? To what extent and in what ways are humans permitted or required to intervene in domestic animals' lives? Second, we will identify and assess how different theoretical approaches to the relationship between humans and domestic animals address concrete issues such as pet ownership, meat and animal product consumption, animal labour, and reproduction regulation.

REQUIRED TEXTS

Course pack, available for purchase at Octopus Books (116 Third Avenue)

Some additional articles and/or other sources may be added on cuLearn

EXPECTATIONS AND EVALUATION

General

Students are expected to refrain from using their phones during class time. While laptop use is not prohibited, paper and pen will often be preferable, as they are more conducive to the conversational nature of the course and to sharing writing exercises. If you do choose to use a laptop, it should be only for note-taking; keep in mind that other screen activity is distracting to those around you.

Please submit your course assignments as Word documents via cuLearn, unless indicated otherwise. I will generally grade your work using track changes in Microsoft Word, over cuLearn. I aim to provide helpful and timely feedback in order to help you get the most out of the course and do your best work.

I encourage students to take advantage of my office hours, and to feel welcome to approach me with any questions or discussion points related to the course. While e-mail is best for quick/logistical inquiries, meeting in person is otherwise preferable.

1) Attendance (10%) and Participation (20%)

As a seminar, this course requires strong student participation and consistent engagement with the material. Students are expected to attend classes in full, complete the assigned readings on time, and participate actively in discussion.

Attendance will be taken during each class. You may miss up to two classes without penalty, and will lose 2% of your final grade for each subsequent absence.

Participation will be evaluated on the basis of sustained attention and active listening (regarding both the instructor and fellow students), and informed, relevant, and thoughtful contributions to the discussion. While the ideal is to regularly offer articulate, philosophically reflective, and considered questions and comments, this does not mean you should feel pressured to say something brilliant every time you speak, be apprehensive about voicing critical thoughts, or worry about offering potentially misguided interpretations of authors or speakers. The basic requirements for a good participation grade are that you consistently demonstrate that you have completed the assigned readings, that you are engaged in the lecture/presentation/discussion/group work, and that you aim to make positive contributions to the class. I will be making notes in this regard for every student present during and/or after each class. I encourage any students who are concerned about this portion of their grade, or who desire feedback (on this or any aspect of the course), to meet with me.

2) Comment Sheets (25%)

Students are expected to complete and submit five comment sheets of approximately 500 words, which will each contribute 5% to the final grade. You will also have the option of submitting up to two revised comment sheets at the end of term (during final exam period; deadline TBA), if you wish to try to increase the two lowest comment sheet grades.

While some summary is understandable and expected in these commentaries, the objective is not to summarize the course texts. Rather, you are asked to introduce and explore some critical issue or question that comes up in any or all of that class's assigned readings. For instance, you may provide an objection to an argument and consider how the author might respond, discuss the theoretical or practical implications of an author's claim, challenge some inconsistency in an argument, or explore the compatibility of different positions that we have been examining. The way you approach these assignments is largely up to you; you are simply expected to provide thoughtful, rigorous, and clearly written commentaries on the target material (i.e., any or all readings assigned for that class).

You can submit comment sheets for any class that includes assigned readings, but you may only submit **one** comment per class. All commentaries will be submitted via cuLearn by the beginning of class, and I encourage you to bring a hard copy with you to class as well. Late comment sheets will not be accepted.

3) Presentations (20%)

Each student will give an in-class presentation of approximately 30-40 minutes, which includes questions/activities and class discussion led by the presenter. Presentations will provide analysis of some theme, debate, or question in the day's reading(s). The way you organize this time is largely up to you, but all presenters are expected to make use of the assigned readings and engage the rest of the class with discussion questions and/or interactive exercises. Presenters will be expected to supply a rough outline of their presentation, following consultation with any other students presenting on the same day (to avoid significant overlap), by the Monday preceding their presentations. These will be submitted/discussed via cuLearn.

4) Reflection project (25%)

Taking this class will involve clarifying our relationships, as individuals, with other animals. We often think of our interactions as being limited or uncomplicated (e.g., I pat my dog, I consume a chicken), but human relationships with animals are ubiquitous and often complex. Becoming more aware of each of these interactions and our affective and rational responses to them will lend depth and practical significance to our philosophical investigations into human relationships with animals. To this end, each student will complete a project that involves documentation of and critical reflection on one's own interactions with animals, draws on the philosophical concepts and debates discussed in class, and incorporates some external sources. The resulting paper will be approximately 3500-4000 words. Further instructions will be made available as the deadline approaches. Students will submit this exercise in class on December 8th, our last day of class.

READINGS SCHEDULE

PART I: INTRODUCTION TO ANIMAL ETHICS DEBATES

September 8: Course information and initial reflections on the human-animal relationship

September 15: Introducing and legitimizing the animal question in ethics

Taylor, Angus. 2009. *Animals and Ethics: An Overview of the Philosophical Debate*, 3rd Edition. Chapter 1: Animals and the Moral Community, pages 7-31. Peterborough: Broadview Press.

Adams, Carol. 2006. The War on Compassion. In *Beyond Animal Rights: A Feminist Caring Ethic for the Treatment of Animals*. Eds. Josephine Donovan and Carol Adams, 21-36. New York: Continuum.

September 22: Moral status and its implications for harm to humans and animals

Pluhar, Evelyn. 1995. *Beyond Prejudice: the Moral Significance of Human and Nonhuman Animals* (The Argument from Marginal Cases: Two versions, and selection from Chapter 3: Responses to the Argument from Marginal Cases). 63-102. Durham: Duke University Press.

Harman, Elizabeth. 2011. The Moral Significance of Animal Pain and Animal Death. In *The Oxford Handbook of Animal Ethics*. Eds. Tom L. Beauchamp and R.G. Frey, 726-737. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

September 29: Complexifying the animal: understanding beyond pain

Balcombe, Jonathan. 2009. Animal Pleasure and its Moral Significance. *Applied Animal Behaviour Science* 118: 208-216. Available through Queen's Library.

Andrews, Kristin. 2011. Beyond Anthropomorphism: attributing psychological properties to animals. In *The Oxford Handbook of Animal Ethics* Eds. Tom L. Beauchamp and R.G. Frey, 469-494. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

(Note: September 30th is the last day to add or drop classes without financial penalty)

October 6: Care ethics and Kantian ethics: what matters about animals?

Gheaus, Anca. 2012. The Role of Love in Animal Ethics. *Hypatia* 27(3): 583-600.

Korsgaard, Christine. 2004. Fellow Creatures: Kantian Ethics and Our Duties to Animals. *The Tanner Lectures on Human Values*. 1-38. Available at:
<http://www.people.fas.harvard.edu/~korsgaard/CMK.FellowCreatures.pdf>

PART II: WHAT DIFFERENCE DOES DOMESTICITY MAKE?

October 13: Interventionist versus non-interventionist approaches to needs and agency

Francione, Gary. 2007. Animal Rights and Domesticated Nonhumans (blog).
<http://www.abolitionistapproach.com/animal-rights-and-domesticated-nonhumans/>.

Nussbaum, Martha. 2004. Beyond Compassion and Humanity: Justice for Nonhuman Animals. In *Animal Rights: Current Debates and New Directions*. Eds Cass Sunstein and Martha Nussbaum, 299-320. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Cole, M. & Morgan, K. 2013. Engineering Freedom? A Critique of Biotechnological Routes to Animal Liberation. *Configurations* 21(2): 201-229.

October 20: Complexifying the human-animal relationship: differential obligations

Donaldson, Sue, and Will Kymlicka. 2011. *Zoopolis: A Political Theory of Animal Rights*. Introduction, pages 1-16. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Palmer, Clare. 2012. What (if anything) do we owe wild animals? *Between the Species* 16 (1): 15-38.

Anderson, Elizabeth. 2004. Animal Rights and the Values of Nonhuman Life. In *Animal Rights: Current Debates and New Directions*. Eds Cass Sunstein and Martha Nussbaum, 277-298. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

October 27: No class (Fall break)

November 3: (Some) animals as community members

Kymlicka, Will, and Sue Donaldson. 2014. Animals and the Frontiers of Citizenship. *Oxford Journal of Legal Studies* 34(2): 200-19.

Diamond, Cora. 2004. Eating Meat and Eating People. In *Animal Rights: Current Debates and New Directions*. Eds Cass Sunstein and Martha Nussbaum, 93-107. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

PART III: CASE STUDIES IN THE ETHICS OF HUMAN-DOMESTIC ANIMAL RELATIONSHIPS

November 10: Companion animals

Francione, Gary. 2012. Pets: The Inherent Problem of Domestication (blog) <http://www.abolitionistapproach.com/pets-the-inherent-problems-of-domestication/#.UqEDR-L9Ves>

Harvey, Jean. 2008. Companion and Assistance Animals: Benefits, Welfare and Relationships. *International Journal of Applied Philosophy* 22(2): 161-76.

Palmer, Clare. 2014. "Companion Cats as Co-Citizens? Comments on Sue Donaldson's and Will Kymlicka's *Zoopolis*" *Dialogue: Canadian Philosophical Review* 52 (4): 759-67.

November 17: The ethics of consumption

Singer, Peter. 2013. The World's First Cruelty-Free Hamburger (Opinion). *The Guardian*. <http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2013/aug/05/worlds-first-cruelty-free-hamburger>.

Cochrane, Alasdair. 2012. *Animal Rights Without Liberation: Applied Ethics and Human Obligations*. Chapter 4: Animal Agriculture, pages 79-102. New York: Columbia University Press.

McMahan, Jeff. 2008. Eating Animals the Nice Way. *Daedalus* Winter: 1-11. Available online: http://philosophy.rutgers.edu/dmdocuments/Eating_Animals_the_Nice_Way.pdf

November 24: The ethics of labour

Porcher, Jocelne and Tiphaine Schmitt. 2012. Dairy Cows: Workers in the Shadows? *Society and Animals* 20(1): 39-60.

Valentini, Laura. 2013. Canine Justice: An Associative Account. *Political Studies* 60(1): 37-52.

December 1: The ethics of reproduction

Fusfeld, Leila. 2007. Sterilization in an Animal Rights Paradigm. *Journal of Animal Law and Ethics* 2: 255-262

Boonin, David. 2003. Robbing PETA to Spay Paul: Do Animal Rights Include Reproductive Rights? *Between the Species* 3: 1-8.

December 8: Discussion and conclusions

REFLECTION PROJECTS DUE

ACCOMMODATIONS

If you have any concerns about your ability to fulfill course requirements, but are unsure of how to proceed, please speak with me as soon as possible. Students who think they may need accommodations are also encouraged to be in touch with the Paul Menton Centre as soon as possible (see below for contact).

For all students: please be careful to inform yourself on relevant departmental and university policies, accommodations services, and other helpful university services such as health and counselling. You must also be aware of Carleton's academic integrity policy; plagiarism is a serious issue and academic dishonesty will not be tolerated. There is a complete list of services and policies on the last pages of this syllabus.

***NOTE:** This syllabus is as complete as possible, but some details will be filled in as the class progresses, and some minor changes may be implemented as necessary.

Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (2016-17)

Assignments:

Unless specifically told otherwise by their instructors, students:

- must not use a plastic or cardboard cover or paper clips
- must staple the paper (there is a stapler on the essay box)
- must include the following:
 - student name
 - student number
 - course number and section
 - instructor's name
- No assignments will be accepted after the last day for handing in term work – see dates in next column.
- Assignments handed in through the essay box (just inside the glass doors, Paterson Hall, Floor 3A) must be dropped into the box by **4:15** on a regular business day in order to be date-stamped with that day's date. Assignments handed in after 4:15 or on a non-business day will be stamped as having been handed in on the next business day.
- Students are required to keep copies of their assignments. If your paper is lost at any point, you will be considered not to have submitted it if you cannot produce a copy immediately on request.

Deferrals for Term Work:

If you miss a final examination and/or fail to submit a final assignment by the due date because of circumstances beyond your control, you may apply for a deferral of examination/assignment. For deferred examinations, you must apply within 5 working days after the scheduled date of your exam. To apply for deferral of a final assignment, you must apply within 5 working days of the last scheduled day of classes. Visit the Registrar's Office for more information.

Plagiarism:

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of 'plagiarism' as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. (Undergraduate Calendar Academic Regulations, section 14.3, or <http://calendar.carleton.ca/undergrad/regulations/academicregulationsoftheuniversity/acadregsuniv14/>)

Academic Accommodation:

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

Pregnancy obligation: write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

Religious obligation: write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

Academic Accommodations for Students with Disabilities: The Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or pmc@carleton.ca for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send your **Letter of Accommodation** at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (*if applicable*). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with your professor to ensure

accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC website for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (*if applicable*) at <http://www2.carleton.ca/pmc/new-and-current-students/dates-and-deadlines/>

You can visit the Equity Services website to view the policies and to obtain more detailed information on academic accommodation at <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

Important Dates:

Sept. 7	Classes start.
Sept. 20	Last day for registration and course changes in Fall and Fall/Winter courses.
Sept. 30	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from Fall term or two-term courses.
Oct. 10	Thanksgiving Day – University closed.
Oct. 24-28	Fall Break – no classes.
Nov. 25	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000-level before the Final Examination period.
Dec. 9	Last day of classes, Fall term. Classes follow a Monday schedule.
Dec. 9	Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for Fall term courses.
Dec. 9	Last day to withdraw from Fall term courses (academic purposes only).
Dec. 10-22	Final examinations for Fall courses, mid-terms for Fall/Winter courses. Exams are normally held all seven days of the week.
Dec. 22	Take-home exams are due.
Jan. 5	Winter term classes begin.
Jan. 18	Last day for registration and course changes in Winter term classes.
Jan. 31	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter courses or winter portion of two-term courses.
Feb. 20	Family Day – University closed.
Feb. 20-24	Winter Break, no classes.
Mar. 24	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000-level before the Final Examination period.
Apr. 7	Last day of Fall/Winter and Winter term classes. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for Fall/Winter and Winter term courses.
Apr. 7	Last day to withdraw from Fall/Winter and Winter term courses (academic purposes only).
Apr. 10-25	Final Examinations. Exams are normally held all seven days of the week.
Apr. 14	Good Friday – University closed.
Apr. 25	Take-home exams are due.

Addresses:

Department of Philosophy:	3A35 Paterson Hall www.carleton.ca/philosophy 520-2110
Registrar's Office:	300 Tory www.carleton.ca/registrar 520-3500
Student Academic Success Centre:	302 Tory www.carleton.ca/sasc 520-7850
Writing Tutorial Service:	4 th Floor, Library http://www1.carleton.ca/sasc/writing-tutorial-service/ 520-6632
MacOdrum Library	http://www.library.carleton.ca/ 520-2735