

PHIL 5000: Health and Justice

Winter 2013 Thursday 2:30-4:30

Prof. Vida Panitch / vida_panitch@carleton.ca

Patterson 3A55 Office Hours: Tuesday 12:00-1:30

Course Description:

This course explores the relationship between health and distributive justice. It asks whether there is a basic entitlement to health (care) and what obligations this may engender with respect to the allocation of scarce goods both at the domestic and the international level. We will begin by looking at Norman Daniels' case for public health care grounded in the Rawlsian principle of fair equality of opportunity, followed by a discussion of Shlomi Segall's luck egalitarian defense of public health care. We will go on to look at communitarian arguments and finally at the human rights based model for grounding universal health entitlements, specifically as articulated by Jonathan Wolff.

Course Assignments:

- First Paper: 25%. A topic will be assigned pertaining to course material. Students will be expected to exposit, evaluate and apply one author's views to a matter of practical relevance. Length 10 pages. Due date: February 14th
- Take Home Exam: 50%. This is effectively your term paper. A topic will be chosen by the student, and approved by the instructor. Individual meetings will be held with each student to discuss topics, additional research materials and a general outline for the paper. Length: 15-20 pages. Due on April 27th.
- Discussion Questions: 15%. Students are expected to submit questions based on course material *every week*. Students must submit their question by email no later than noon the day of class. These questions must be thoughtful, reflect a considered reading of the material, and be approximately one paragraph in length. Students should be prepared to raise their question in class and also be prepared to suggest and/or defend possible answers to their questions.
- Participation: 10%. Students are expected to come to class, and to come to class prepared, having done the assigned reading and ready to discuss it. This is a seminar, not a lecture course, which means everyone has to pull their weight.

Course Texts:

The books for this course are as follows, available for purchase at the bookstore.

Norman Daniels, *Just Health: Meeting Health Needs Fairly*, Cambridge: 2008

Shlomi Segall, *Health, Luck and Justice*, Princeton: 2009.

Jonathan Wolff, *The Human Right to Health*. W.W. Norton & Company: 2012.

There are also a number of articles (* in the schedule below) that can be accessed through the library's online journal catalogue, and a few excerpts from books (# in the schedule below) which I will make available outside my office door.

Course Schedule:

January 10: Introduction to the Course

Lecture on John Rawls theory of Justice as Fairness; readings not required but suggested:

*John Rawls, "Justice as Fairness," *The Philosophical Review*, 67/2 (1958) 164-194

January 17: Equal Opportunity and Health

Norman Daniels, *Just Health*, introduction and chapter 1, pp. 1-28

*Norman Daniels, "Health Care Needs and Distributive Justice," *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 10:2 (1981) 146-179

*Gopal Sreenivasan, "Health Care and Equality of Opportunity," *Hastings Center Report* 37:2 (2007) 21-31

January 24: Equal Opportunity and Health

Norman Daniels, *Just Health*, chapters 2-3 pp. 29-102

January 31: Equal Opportunity and Health

Norman Daniels, *Just Health*: chapters 4-5 pp. 103-160, and chapter 11, 297-313

February 7: Justice, Luck, and Health Insurance

Shlomi Segall, *Health, Luck and Justice*, introduction, pp 9-26

*Ronald Dworkin, "Equality of Resource," *Philosophy and Public Affairs*, 10/4 (1981) sec 1-VI, 283-335

February 14: Justice, Luck, and Health Insurance

Shlomi Segall, *Health, Luck and Justice*, part I, pp. 27-87

February 28: Justice, Luck, and Health Insurance

Shlomi Segall, *Health, Luck and Justice*, part II pp 87-136, chapter 11 pp 153-171

March 7: Pluralism, Nationalism, and Just Health Care

#Michael Walzer, *Spheres of Justice*, pp 3-26, 64-69, 75-91

#David Miller, *On Nationalism*, chapter 3, pp 49-80

March 14: David Miller Conference at University of Ottawa (details TBD)

March 21: The Human Right to Health

*Allan Buchanan, "The Right to a Decent Minimum of Health Care," *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 13:1 (1984) 55-78

*Elizabeth Fenton and John Arras, "Bioethics and Human Rights: Access to Health Related Goods," *Hastings Center Report* 39:5 (2009) 27-38

*Onora Oneill "A Dark Side of Human Rights," *International Affairs* 81:2(2005) 427-439
Norman Daniels, *Just Health*, chapter 13, pp 333-357

March 28: The Human Right to Health

*Gopal Sreenivasan, "A Human Right to Health? Some Inconclusive Skepticism". *The Aristotelian Society Supplementary Volume* 86 (2012) 239-265.

Jonathan Wolff, *The Human Right to Health*, chapters 1-2, pp 1-38

April 4: The Human Right to Health

*Thomas Pogge, "Human Rights and Global Health: A Research Program,"
Metaphilosophy vol 36/1-2 (2005) 182-209

Jonathan Wolff, *The Human Right to Health*, chapter 3 pp 39-59, chapter 4-5, pp 92-137

Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (2012-13)

Assignments:

Unless specifically told otherwise by their instructors, students:

- must not use a plastic or cardboard cover or paper clips
- must staple the paper (there is a stapler on the essay box)
- must include the following in the lower right corner of the cover sheet:
 - student name
 - student number
 - course number and section
 - instructor's name
- The Philosophy Department does not accept assignments by FAX. You may send them by courier, if necessary.
- No assignments will be accepted after the last day for handing in term work – see dates in next column.
- Assignments handed in through the essay box (just inside the glass doors, Paterson Hall, Floor 3A) must be dropped into the box by **4:15** on a regular business day in order to be date-stamped with that day's date. Assignments handed in after 4:15 or on a non-business day will be stamped as having been handed in on the next business day.
- Students are required to keep copies of their assignments. If your paper is lost at any point, you will be considered not to have submitted it if you cannot produce a copy immediately on request.

Deferrals for Term Work:

If you miss a final examination and/or fail to submit a final assignment by the due date because of circumstances beyond your control, you may apply for a deferral of examination/assignment. For deferred examinations, you must apply within 5 working days after the scheduled date of your exam. To apply for deferral of a final assignment, you must apply within 5 working days of the last scheduled day of classes. Visit the Registrar's Office for more information.

Plagiarism:

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of 'plagiarism' as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. (Undergraduate Calendar Academic Regulations, section 14.3, or <http://www4.carleton.ca/calendars//ugrad/current/regulations/acadregsuniv14.html#14.3>)

Academic Accommodation for Students with Disabilities:

The Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or pmc@carleton.ca for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send me your Letter of Accommodation at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (if applicable). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with me to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC website for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (if applicable).

You can visit the Equity Services website to view the policies and to obtain more detailed information on academic accommodation at <http://carleton.ca/equity/accommodation>.

Important Dates:

Sept. 6	Classes start (after Orientation events).
Sept. 19	Last day for registration and course changes in Fall and Fall/Winter courses.
Sept. 30	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from Fall term or two-term courses.
Oct. 5	University Day – no classes.
Oct. 8	Thanksgiving Day – university closed.
Nov. 19	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000-level before the Final Examination period.
Dec. 3	Last day of classes, Fall term. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for Fall term courses.
Dec. 3	Last day to withdraw from Fall term courses (academic purposes only).
Dec. 4-5	No classes take place. Review classes may be held, but no new material may be introduced.
Dec. 6-19	Final examinations for Fall courses, mid-terms for Fall/Winter courses.
Dec. 19	Take-home exams are due.
Jan. 7	Winter term classes begin.
Jan. 18	Last day for registration and course changes in Winter term classes.
Jan. 31	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter courses or winter portion of two-term courses.
Feb. 18	Family Day – university closed
Feb. 18-22	Winter Break, classes suspended.
Mar. 27	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000-level before the Final Examination period.
Mar. 29	Good Friday – university closed
Apr. 10	Last day of Fall/Winter and Winter term classes. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for Fall/Winter and Winter term courses. NOTE: On this day all classes follow a Friday schedule.
Apr. 10	Last day to withdraw from Fall/Winter and Winter term courses (academic purposes only).
Apr. 11-12	No classes take place. Review classes may be held, but no new material may be introduced.
Apr. 13-27	Final Examinations.
Apr. 27	Take-home exams are due.

Addresses:

Department of Philosophy:	3A46 Paterson Hall www.carleton.ca/philosophy 520-2110
Registrar's Office:	300 Tory www.carleton.ca/registrar 520-3500
Student Academic Success Centre:	302 Tory www.carleton.ca/sasc 520-7850
Paul Menton Centre:	500 University Centre www.carleton.ca/pmc 520-6608
Writing Tutorial Service:	4 th Floor, Library www.carleton.ca/wts 520-6632
MacOdrum Library	http://www.library.carleton.ca/ 520-2735