

PHIL 1301-B

Mind, World, and Knowledge

Eros Corazza
Carleton University
Department of Philosophy

Term: Winter 2015
Meetings: Wednesdays and Fridays: **11:35-12:55** (12 meetings)
Venue: AT301
Instructor: Eros Corazza
Office: Paterson Hall 3A41
Office h.: by appointment
Phone: 520-2600 Ext: 2326
Email: eros_corazza@yahoo.com; eros.corazza@carleton.ca

Webpage: <http://eroscorazza.org>

- **The PowerPoint slides will be posted on cuLearn.**

Course description

Descartes, one of the central figure of the rationalist school, brought to the philosophical forum questions such as “What am I?”, “Does one’s mind differ from one’s body?” and if so, “How does the mind interact with the body?”. The Cartesians observed that some phenomena of nature (e.g. the mastery of language) do not fall within the mechanical philosophy of their time: they thus posited a new entity, the *res cogitans* (the mind) to account for these phenomena. In rejecting the mechanical philosophy, nowadays rationalists are in a position to deal with Descartes’ traditional questions in a new way. In this Chomsky’s foundational works on language (and the cognitive revolution he initiated) play a central role and welcome new solutions and dissolutions to some traditional philosophical puzzles.

Aims and Objectives

The module aims to provide students with a good knowledge of Descartes and rationalist philosophy of mind and to appreciate how recent studies on the foundation of language can deal with some of the Cartesian traditional problems.

Learning Outcomes

By the end of the class students will appreciate:

- the deepness of Descartes’ philosophy of mind,
- some rationalist developments of it (e.g. Arnauld and Leibniz)
- the actuality of some puzzles he proposed and dealt with and
- the way the latter can be handled within some contemporary form of rationalism.

By engaging in constructive discussion and by critically evaluating some theses and arguments presented, students will also acquire:

- the capacity to communicate ideas clearly and concisely in both written and verbal form and
- to engage with others in constructive debate.

Through essays writing and the feedback:

- you will further develop the capacity to present problems and propose solutions to them in a clear, precise and concise way.

Requirements

It is mandatory to have a Carleton student “connect” account and to register on WebCT.

Assignments

One short essay and a final (2 h.) exam

- Short Essay (1500 words maximum) Weight: 40%
- Final exam (answer 2 questions out of 5) Weight: 60%

Due Assignment

- Short Essay: **TBA**
- Final exam: **Exam Period (a 2 hour exam)**

Texts Recommended

- The books are available at Haven Books (Sunnyside) and Carleton Bookstore.

Primary literature:

- Chomsky, N., 1966, *Cartesian Linguistics: A Chapter in the History of Rationalist Thought*, Harper & Row, New York
- Chomsky, N., 2000, *New Horizons in the Study of Language and Mind*, Cambridge UP, Cambridge
- Descartes, R., 1985, *The Philosophical Writing Vol. I*, Cambridge UP, Cambridge
- Descartes, R., 1984, *The Philosophical Writing Vol. II*, Cambridge UP, Cambridge

Main texts that will be discussed and that you should read:

- **Descartes, R. 1641, *Meditations***
In: **Descartes, R., 1984, *The Philosophical Writing Vol. II*, Cambridge UP, Cambridge**

Other editions available (also on the net).

Descartes' *Meditations* (with *Critics and Replies*) + *Discourse* free at:

- http://www.earlymoderntexts.com/f_descarte.html

Leibniz's *Nouveau Essays* (introduction and first 2 chapters) free at:

- http://www.earlymoderntexts.com/f_leibniz.html

Secondary literature: In bold the most useful texts

- Antony, L. M. & Hornstein, N. (eds.), 2003, *Chomsky and His Critics*, Blackwell, Oxford
- Calvin, W.-H. & Bickerton, D., 2000, *Lingua ex Machine*, MIT, Cambridge
- **Cottingham, J., 1986 *Descartes*, Blackwell, Oxford**
- **Jolley, N. 2005 *Leibniz*. Routledge, London**
- **McGilvray, J. 1999, *Chomsky: Language, Mind, and Politics*, Polity Press, Cambridge**
- Smith, N. 1999, *Chomsky: Ideas and Ideals*, Cambridge UP, Cambridge
- Wilson, C. 2003, *Descartes's Meditations: An Introduction*, Cambridge UP, Cambridge

Net Resources (Free of charge)

Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy:

<http://plato.stanford.edu/>

Essay

You should write—1500 words (or 6 typewritten double-spaced pages) **maximum**—on one of the following three questions:

1. Why, according to Descartes, the idea of God is innate?
2. What is the importance of God in Descartes' philosophy?
3. "I cannot share the opinion of Montaigne and others who attribute understanding or thought to animals" (*Letters to the Marquis of New Castle* 23 Nov. 1646; CSMK III: 302).
Discuss.

Topics to be discussed

Each topic requires a 3 h class

1. Descartes

Primary reading: Descartes, *Meditation 1 and 2*

Secondary reading: Cottingham, *ch. 1, ch. 2*

2. Descartes on God and His Existence

Primary reading: Descartes, *Meditation 3 and 4*

Secondary reading: Cottingham, *ch. 3*

3. Ideas and Reality

Primary reading: Descartes, *Meditation 4, 5 and 6*

Secondary reading: Cottingham, *ch. 4*

4. Leibniz: Metaphysics

Primary reading: Leibniz, *Monadology*

Secondary reading: Jolley, *Leibniz*

5. Leibniz on Mind, Knowledge, and Ideas

Primary reading: Leibniz, *New Essays, Introduction and ch. 1*

Secondary reading: Jolley, *Leibniz*

6. Mechanism and Linguistic Creativity

Primary reading: Arnauld & Nicole, *Port Royal Grammar*

Secondary reading: Chomsky, *Cartesian Linguistics (+ Introduction)*
McGilvray, *ch. 2, ch. 3*

7. Universal Grammar

Primary reading: Arnauld & Nicole, *Port Royal Grammar*

Chomsky, *Cartesian Linguistics*

Secondary reading: McGilvray, *ch. 2, ch. 3*

8. Res Cogitans and Dualism

- Primary reading: Descartes' *Meditations*, *Fourth set of Objections (Arnauld)* + *Descartes' Reply*
Chomsky, *New Horizons*, ch. 4
- Secondary reading: Cottingham, ch. 5

9. Dualism and Its Problems

- Primary reading: Chomsky, *New Horizons*, ch. 1, ch. 4
Louise & Horenstein (eds.), *Chomsky and His Critics: Lycan's article (ch. 1) + Chomsky's reply*
- Secondary reading: Cottingham, ch. 5

10. The Poverty of the Stimulus Argument

- Primary reading: Chomsky, *New Horizons*, ch. 6, ch. 7
- Secondary reading: McGilvray, ch. 3, ch. 4

11. Language Origins and Development

- Primary reading: Chomsky, *New Horizons*, ch. 3, ch. 5
- Secondary reading: Calvin & Bickerton, *Lingua ex Machina*

12. Evolution and Rationalism

Revision class

The Fine Print – Policies and Rules

1. **cuLearn mandatory.** Every student must have a student computing account, in order to use CuLearn. Grades are visible on it.
2. **Written work.** No handwritten essays will be accepted; they must be typed or word-processed. Use a title page and identify yourself by student number only. Use any reference style, but use it consistently. Writing in the first person (e.g., “I will argue that ...,” “I find this difficult to believe because...”) is permitted.
3. **Extensions.** Deadlines will be extended only in case of documentable medical or personal emergencies. Excuses like “I had to work on my History essay” will not be accepted.
4. **Penalties.** Essays are due by 4:00 p.m. on due dates. Essays received late will be penalized by one mark per day. (For instance, a short essay marked 24/30 on its merits will be reduced to 23/30 on the first day they are late and to 19/30 on the fifth day. University regulations forbid the instructor to accept term work for this course after December 5.
5. **No fax.** It is Department policy that work transmitted by fax will not be accepted.
6. **Keep a copy.** It is Department policy that it is every student’s responsibility to keep a copy of each essay submitted to a Philosophy course.
7. **Submitting essays.** Essays can be submitted to the instructor in class or in the locked essay deposit box just inside the glass door to the Philosophy Department offices (Paterson 3A – look for the Philosophy Department sign). Essays must be submitted on paper. No binders: essays should not be enclosed in plastic or other binders except at the specific request of the instructor. If you are submitting an essay via the Philosophy essay box, it must be deposited there by 4:00 p.m. in order to be stamped as received on that day. Essays deposited after 4:00 p.m. will be stamped as received on the following business day. Binders may not be put in the essay box at any time. University regulations forbid the instructor to accept term work for this course after December 5.
8. **Deferrals for term work.** Before the end of term, you can apply to Registrar to defer the final deadline for term work.
9. **Plagiarism.** It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of ‘plagiarism’ as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding/abetting plagiarism by other students.

Suggestions for Writing a Paper

Source: *Episteme Links*

<http://www.epistemelinks.com/index.aspx>

Cf. G. J Matthey:

<http://philosophy.ucdavis.edu/matthey/phi22n/paphints.html>

Don't bring in extraneous details about the context in which the works were written. Your paper assignments are focussed on a specific topic. Your paper must stick to that topic. For example, "Descartes was a philosopher who was born in France, lived in the Netherlands, and died in Sweden."

Do frame the nature of the philosophical problem clearly. For example, "Is it possible to demonstrate the existence of God using no other information except about what it is to be God?"

Don't go off on a tangent. "Some philosophers have tried to prove that God exists by claiming that the order of nature requires an intelligent designer. Others have thought that the world does not necessarily exist, and if so, then there must be a God which necessarily exists and explains why the world exists. The first kind of argument is called the 'argument from design' and the second kind is called the 'cosmological argument.'"

Do stick to the issues mentioned in the paper assignment.

Don't throw out opinions casually. Example. "How could anybody prove that God exists? That is the kind of things human beings are just incapable of knowing."

Do give reasons for any opinion you express. "Descartes claimed that there is a nature of God. But what evidence is there that there really is such a thing as a nature of God, rather than just a concept of God that we mak up ourselves?"

Don't make undocumented claims about what any of the authors wrote.

Do back up your description of the philosopher's position by use of quotations from the text. Parenthetical page references to the text are sufficient in lieu of footnotes. For example, "According to Descartes, God has a nature and this nature includes existence. He claims that his idea of God's nature is different from a false idea he made up himself, like a four-sided figure that is not a square but is inscribed in a circle. 'For there are a great many ways in which I understand that this idea is not an invention that is dependent on my thought, but is an image of a true and immutable nature' (p. 47)."

Don't use the words of others without quotation. This is plagiarism, which is a punishable academic offence. Your reader will be watching out for plagiarism. One good way to recognize when you are plagiarizing is to notice any change of style, say some sentences which use a lot of words you do not use ordinarily, or whose grammatical structure is very different from your own.

Do use your own words to paraphrase what an author says.

Don't neglect to address all points in the paper topic in detail.

Do provide sufficient detail on all points, so that the grader can recognize your mastery of them.

Don't pad your paper or eliminate vital parts to get it to the suggested length.

Do write economically. Make the paper just long enough to complete the required tasks and no longer. If you deviate significantly from the suggested length, consider whether you have said too much or left something out.

Don't simply write down a bunch of logically unconnected statements or assertions. For example, "Descartes tried to prove that God exists in a couple of ways. Spinoza tried to do the same thing, but he did it differently. Descartes just makes a lot of things up, and Spinoza does too."

Do present the material in the form of arguments. One way of looking at an argument is as the defense of a conclusion by appeal to premises which are acceptable to anyone who considers them objectively, such as that it impossible to think of God except as existing. "From the fact that I cannot think of God except as existing, it follows that existence is inseparable form God, and that for this reason he really exists" (p. 46).

Don't use colloquial language to make a point. For example, "Descartes's second attempt to prove God's existence was totally lame."

Do use standard language.

Don't confuse technical language with ordinary language. For example, Descartes's use of 'nature' is sometimes different from ordinary uses, such as 'part of the earth that is not developed by humans.'

Do explain any technical terms when you introduce them. For example, "The 'ontological argument' is an attempt to prove that God exists simply from the definition, or nature, or idea of God."

Set of Questions for the Exam.

The five exam questions will be drawn from the following list.

In the 2 h. exam you'll be asked to reply to two (no more no less) questions. (Exam without notes/books).

1. What are the differences between Descartes and Chomsky?
2. Discuss and characterize UG and its role in language acquisition.
3. Explain the poverty of the stimulus argument.
4. "The mind-body problem made sense in terms of the mechanical philosophy that Newton undermined, and has not been coherently posed since." (Chomsky 2000: 86)
Explain and Discuss.
5. What's the difference between IL (internal language) and EL (external language) and which one is the object of linguistic study? Why?
6. What does it mean to say that Chomsky is a biological rationalist?
7. Explain, the differences between a Pidgin and a Creole and why some rationalists mention them?
8. What is the importance of the *Port-Royal Grammar*?
9. Explain Plato's problem and how, respectively, Descartes and Chomsky solve it.
10. Why are Chomsky and Descartes rationalists and how do their rationalist programs differ?
11. What are the main arguments supporting the view that LAD is innate? And what does it mean to say that it is innate?
12. Discuss Arnauld's critique in the *Fourth Set of Objections* of Descartes' argument for the mind/body distinction and Descartes' reply.
13. What are the main features of Cartesian linguistics?
14. What is the mind/body problem? How does Descartes attempt to solve it? How does Chomsky address it?
15. "The faculty of language can reasonably be regarded as a "language organ" in the sense in which scientists speak of the visual system, or immune system, or circulatory system, as organs of the body". (Chomsky 2000: 4)
Explain and discuss.
16. Are ideas innate? Why yes/no?

17. What are Leibniz's monads? How do they differ from Descartes' immaterial substances?
18. What is the unison problem and how does Descartes solve it?
19. What are the similarities between Descartes and Chomsky?
20. What does it mean to say that monads are windowless?

Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (2014-15)

Assignments:

Unless specifically told otherwise by their instructors, students:

- must not use a plastic or cardboard cover or paper clips
- must staple the paper (there is a stapler on the essay box)
- must include the following:
 - student name
 - student number
 - course number and section
 - instructor's name
- The Philosophy Department does not accept assignments by FAX. You may send them by courier, if necessary.
- No assignments will be accepted after the last day for handing in term work – see dates in next column.
- Assignments handed in through the essay box (just inside the glass doors, Paterson Hall, Floor 3A) must be dropped into the box by **4:15** on a regular business day in order to be date-stamped with that day's date. Assignments handed in after 4:15 or on a non-business day will be stamped as having been handed in on the next business day.
- Students are required to keep copies of their assignments. If your paper is lost at any point, you will be considered not to have submitted it if you cannot produce a copy immediately on request.

Deferrals for Term Work:

If you miss a final examination and/or fail to submit a final assignment by the due date because of circumstances beyond your control, you may apply for a deferral of examination/assignment. For deferred examinations, you must apply within 5 working days after the scheduled date of your exam. To apply for deferral of a final assignment, you must apply within 5 working days of the last scheduled day of classes. Visit the Registrar's Office for more information.

Plagiarism:

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of 'plagiarism' as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. (Undergraduate Calendar Academic Regulations, section 14.3, or <http://calendar.carleton.ca/undergrad/regulations/academicregulationsoftheuniversity/acadregsuniv14/>)

Academic Accommodation:

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

Pregnancy obligation: write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

Religious obligation: write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

Academic Accommodations for Students with Disabilities: The **Paul Menton Centre** for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or pmc@carleton.ca for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send your **Letter of Accommodation** at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam

requiring accommodation (*if applicable*). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with your professor to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC website for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (*if applicable*) at <http://www2.carleton.ca/pmc/new-and-current-students/dates-and-deadlines/>

You can visit the Equity Services website to view the policies and to obtain more detailed information on academic accommodation at <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

Important Dates:

Sept. 4	Classes start (after Orientation events).
Sept. 17	Last day for registration and course changes in Fall and Fall/Winter courses.
Sept. 30	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from Fall term or two-term courses.
Oct. 13	Thanksgiving Day – university closed.
Oct. 27-31	Fall Break – no classes.
Nov. 24	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000-level before the Final Examination period.
Dec. 8	Last day of classes, Fall term. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for Fall term courses.
Dec. 8	Last day to withdraw from Fall term courses (academic purposes only).
Dec. 9	No classes or examinations take place. Review classes may be held, but no new material may be introduced.
Dec. 10-21	Final examinations for Fall courses, mid-terms for Fall/Winter courses.
Dec. 21	Take-home exams are due.
Jan. 5	Winter term classes begin.
Jan. 16	Last day for registration and course changes in Winter term classes.
Jan. 31	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter courses or winter portion of two-term courses.
Feb. 16-20	Winter Break, classes suspended.
Mar. 24	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000-level before the Final Examination period.
Apr. 8	Last day of Fall/Winter and Winter term classes. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for Fall/Winter and Winter term courses.
Apr. 8	Last day to withdraw from Fall/Winter and Winter term courses (academic purposes only).
Apr. 9-10	No classes or examinations take place. Review classes may be held, but no new material may be introduced.
Apr. 11-23	Final Examinations. Exams are normally held all seven days of the week.
Apr. 23	Take-home exams are due.

Addresses:

Department of Philosophy:	3A35 Paterson Hall www.carleton.ca/philosophy 520-2110
Registrar's Office:	300 Tory www.carleton.ca/registrar 520-3500
Student Academic Success Centre:	302 Tory www.carleton.ca/sasc 520-7850
Writing Tutorial Service:	4 th Floor, Library http://www1.carleton.ca/sasc/writing-tutorial-service/ 520-6632
MacOdrum Library	http://www.library.carleton.ca/ 520-2735