

**Minutes of the 598th Meeting of the
Board of Governors**

**Tuesday, September 27th, 2016 at 4:00 p.m.
Room 2440R River Building, Carleton University**

PRESENT:	Dr. F. Afagh	Mr. K. Evans	Mr. G. Owens
	Mr. F. Alhattab	Mr. D. Fortin	Dr. R. O'Reilly Runte
	Ms. D. Alves	Ms. C. Gold	Dr. E. Sloan
	Ms. D. Armstrong	Mr. O. Javanpour	Ms. C. Switzer
	Dr. C. Carruthers (Chair)	Mr. I. Lee	Mr. A. Tattersfield
	Ms. G. Courtland	Dr. P. Merchant	Mr. A. Ullett
	Mr. D. Craig	Mr. N. Nanos	Mr. B. Wener
	Ms. L. A. Daly	Mr. J. Nordenstrom	Mr. M. Wernick (Vice Chair)
	Mr. J. Durrell	Dr. B. Örmeci	
REGRETS:	Ms. J. Ostrajanskiy	Ms. R. Thompson	Ms. L. Watson
STAFF:	Ms. S. Blanchard	Ms. A. Goth	Dr. N. Rajapakse
	Mr. D. Boyce	Dr. R. Goubran	Dr. P. Ricketts
	Ms. J. Conley	Mr. S. Levitt	Mr. T. Sullivan
	Mr. D. Cumming	Mr. M. Piché	Mr. B. Winer

OPEN SESSION

1. CALL TO ORDER AND CHAIR'S REMARKS

The Chair called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. and welcomed all attendees, guests and observers. Board members were reminded that there is an Annual Members meeting following the closed session. The Open Session was live-streamed to Southern Hall 617 and was audio recorded for the purpose of accuracy of the minutes.

2. DECLARATION OF CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The Chair asked for any declarations of conflict of interest from the members. There were none.

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Mr. Nordenstrom moved, and it was seconded by Ms. Daly, that the agenda be approved as presented. It was carried.

4. APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT AGENDA

Mr. Tattersfield moved, and it was seconded by Mr. Wener, that the Open Consent agenda minus the 284th Meeting of the Finance Committee be approved as presented. It was carried.

There was a question regarding an item from the Finance Committee's 284th Meeting regarding Item 5.2 Approval of 16/17 Student Association Fees specifically the requirement of a minimum threshold of 15% voter turnout in order to approve changes to fees. Since this doubles the previous threshold it was questioned why this decision was made. Carleton University and the Carleton University Student Association negotiated a minimum threshold of 15% for student turnout for referendums results and this is now in effect. There are ongoing negotiations with the Graduate Student Association regarding the ancillary student protocol fee referendum process.

Mr. Javanpour moved, and it was seconded by Mr. Wener, that the minutes of the 284th Meeting of the Finance Committee be approved as presented. It was carried.

5. ITEM(S) FOR DISCUSSION

5.1 Research Rankings and Reputation

Dr. Rajapakse was invited to give a presentation on Research Rankings and Reputation. A copy of the presentation and the 2015-2016 Carleton University Research and International Year in Review were distributed to the Board prior to the meeting. The presentation summarized the three internationally recognized university rankings (Times Higher Education, QS, Academic Ranking of World Universities), the 2 Canadian Rankings (Research Infosource and Maclean's), international comparisons for 2013 – 2016, peer group comparison, Research Infosource Metrics and how do we respond to rankings with reputation and development of a strategy.

The Research Infosource Metrics gives a break down with five metrics of 50 universities:

- 1) total research income
- 2) research intensity, \$/FTE, (dollars per faculty member – normalized measure)
- 3) total number of publications (international conferences and journals, etc),
- 4) publication intensity (number of publications per faculty member) and
- 5) publication impact (where the paper is published).

The research rankings build a reputation for the university and can affect recruitment of students, faculty and staff. An approach we could use is to develop a strategy to address the rankings and find ways to improve. We could use external communication to help reputation building, including positioning and branding. Talent Management could also be used to build reputation including recruitment of senior faculty members (build talent). We could help faculty members more with their research enterprise, support for grant writing, position Carleton to generate innovation, develop a reputational strategy including a research communication strategy to raise the profile of Carleton's research.

Over the last three years the universities have become much more competitive in terms of pursuing opportunities and investing strategically in major initiatives and the results of that improve the rank. The number of universities that are included in the international rankings has greatly increased and now includes Asian Universities.

A question was asked about support for research by contract instructors. The Provost responded that the current focus is on our over 800 full-time faculty who have a mandate for research in their position and creating a plan to support them.

International students are considered in the ranking through the international orientation which includes the percentage of international students, faculty and the number of papers that faculty have published with international authors. It was suggested that a strategy for increasing this ranking may be to increase funding for international students. This is encouraged through faculty including funding for international students in grant applications. Some government policies help with recruitment of international students e.g. British Columbia does not have an international differential fee for graduate students. This has allowed universities in that province to recruit more international students and allows professors to more easily support them with research grants.

5.2 Engineering Capstone Projects- Challenges and Successes

Dr. Goubran was invited to give a presentation. The Capstone Project is a mandatory fourth-year project in the Faculty of Engineering and Design that is two terms running September to April. Student teams ranging in size from 3 to 25 work together to develop professional-level experience by applying previously-acquired knowledge to a major design project including design, building and testing. This is hands-on practical experience that is multi-disciplinary with many different engineering program students working together. The projects are important for satisfying the Canadian Engineering Accreditation Board.

Larger scope projects are multi-year (up to four years). The students have to use proper documentation so that the next year's students can advance the design. Soft skills and realistic time, budget and design constraints are imposed.

Examples of projects include:

- Fixed-Wing Unmanned Aerial Vehicles
- High- Performance Housing
- Crash-Test Dummy
- Carleton University Simulator Project (CUSP)
- FSAE Car

Many projects are done in partnership with industry which provides funding to support the projects from concept to commercialization. This program provides an opportunity for undergraduate students to do applied research and for faculty to recruit for Master's programs. It also creates job opportunities for students in industry following completion of their degree.

A letter of intent is being submitted to the AutoDrive 3- year competition which is working with GM and SAE. GM will be donating a Chevrolet Bolt EV, a GM team mentor and start-up funds.

In addition to the undergraduate students involved in the project there are also sometimes graduate students involved. Enrolment in the Bachelor of Engineering and Design has increased year to year with usually about 1,000 students in their 4th year. Carleton's intake of first year students is second in the province to Waterloo.

The High-Performance Housing is an academic project only and mostly from a design aspect with consultation with the community and The School of Architecture and Urban Design.

The group sizes are quite large--up to 25 students but the groups are broken down into subsections of 2 or 3 working on very specific projects contributing to the overall product or concept. The final report includes the contribution of each member. There are faculty members that act as group managers and project managers and oversee the students work.

6. ITEM(S) FOR APPROVAL

6.1 President's Goals and Objectives

The goals and objectives set out by the President include:

- Maintain current enrolment level with possible adjustments for formula changes
- Achieve Strategic Plan Goals including student satisfaction, research and organizational excellence
- Balance the budget
- Complete construction projects
- Ensure success of 75th
- Continue to achieve fundraising campaign goals, 300 million dollar campaign ongoing

Dr. Ricketts was thanked for the 75th pins for the Board Members. There are metrics associated with all of the strategic plan goals and objectives and they are used during the President's Annual Evaluation.

Mr. Durrell moved, and it was seconded by Mr. Owens, that the President's Goals and Objectives for 2016/17, be approved as presented. It was carried.

Dr. Ricketts was thanked for the 75th pins for the Board Members.

6.2 Audited Financial Statements for year ended April 30/16 and Audit Finding Report

The incorrect Audited Financial Statements were sent to the Board in the meeting package but the error was corrected in an email prior to the meeting and a hard-copy was provided at the meeting. The error was accidental and in the Bylaws section 11.03 it states "no error of accidental omission in giving notice of any Board meeting or any Members' meeting shall invalidate the meeting or make void any proceeding taken at the meeting other corporate matters."

The Board was provided with four documents in advance of the meeting:

- 1) 2015/16 Financial Report to the Board of Governors
- 2) Audited Financial Statements for year ended April 30, 2016
- 3) 2015/16 Audit Findings Report
- 4) Management and Independence Letter

Mr. Wener, as Chair of the Audit and Finance Committees introduced Mr. Piché. The Audit and Finance Committees have been through all four documents in details and will recommending them for approval by the Board.

Mr. Piché took gave a brief presentation, speaking to each of the reports. He confirmed that they have been completed in compliance with the generally accepted accounting principles.

The highlights from the Fiscal year 2015- 2016 included:

- An increase of 2.4% in total enrolment
- The net operating results had a small surplus of \$2.3 and the board had approved to appropriate the funds to the pension reserve.
- Ancillary operations finished the year with a positive result of \$1.3 million.
- In March 31, 2016 a special pension contribution of \$30 million was made to reduce the solvency deficit.
- The Board approved an increased investment in marketable securities of up to \$100 million. At the end of the fiscal year \$76.2 million had been invested. To date the full \$100 million has been invested.

- In 2015-16, \$30.9 million was spent on capital investments which included deferred maintenance and capital expenditures.
- Long term debt decreased to \$74.7 million, primarily due to the change in amortization of the various mortgages on residences.

Enrolment

From 2011- 2016 there has been about a 10% growth in enrolment and that is despite the demographic trends in the Ontario 18 year old population and the “Carleton Mix”.

Financial Report for Year 2015-2016

The operating income by source was outlined including the total income of \$441.2 million which was higher than the previous year by \$23.4 million. The total income is composed of government grants (\$8.2 million), tuition fees (\$12.6 million) and other income. Offset of expenditures of \$5.6 million including: expenses due to higher number of students, revenue sharing through ELBA (\$1.2 million), and grants for students (\$3.8 million). The overall trend over five years has been reduced government grants and higher tuition fees.

The university budget has grown significantly from the previous year due to the pension payment to reduce the solvency deficit of \$30 million.

Housing and Conference Services showed a deficit of just under \$1 million last year which was primarily a result of unbudgeted and additional renovations to residences of \$2.5 million.

Capital Projects and Deferred Maintenance

The major project underway is the Health Sciences Building which is a \$45 million project which should be ready by July 2017 with partial move-in in September 2017. The Advanced Research Innovation and Smart Environment (ARISE) Building was recently approved under the Strategic Investment Fund Program - spending \$29.5 million. The government will be providing 13 million to help fund the building. The design is underway and is expected to go to tender in January, with construction to start in March 2017 having the building substantially completed by April 2018. The Cogeneration Facility is well underway with the total project cost of \$15 million with a \$5 million subsidy from Hydro Ottawa.

The Board of Governors has approved a \$140 million deferred maintenance investment over a ten-year period based on the Facility Condition Index Assessment which was prepared on most of the buildings and facilities amounting to about 14 million dollars a year on these projects.

Under development is the new Sprott Business School. The conceptual design is still in progress and will be moving forward to the Building, Finance and Audit Committee this Fall for decision.

Solvency Deficit

The issues of the solvency deficit is a significant concern for the university. There are talks with the Ministry of Finance for a temporary and permanent solution on how to deal with the solvency deficit of Ontario's universities.

Net Assets and Capital Assets

Over the last five years the capital assets and endowments have continued to grow. The liabilities are stable. The net assets are allocated for future commitments and obligations including: employee future benefits, internally restricted net assets, endowments, other unrestricted net assets and investment in capital assets. The Net Assets relate to the capital reserves including capital projects.

Questions during the discussion included the fact Health and Counselling services has a surplus. Have increased services been considered? The Book Store and the Print Shop have been running a deficit has there been research done in continuing these services? The students' call for additional Health Services has been noted and will be considered in the budget next year. In reference to the Health and Counselling Services every ancillary needs to keep a reserve for contingency planning such as updates to equipment for extra services needed throughout the year. The Book Store an important service. This year sales in the bookstore have increased considerably. The Print Shop deficit has been previously been noted and is being monitored. The Directors of Health and Counselling monitors the need for additional grief counselling and has a protocol. If additional counselling is needed the university has a contract for a 24 service to bring in extra counselors.

Mr. Wener moved, and it was seconded by Ms. Armstrong to approve the financial reports as recommended by the Audit Committee. It was carried.

7. ITEM(S) FOR INFORMATION

7.1 Report from the President

a) Update on Strategic Plan

Three documents were circulated to the board including:

- 1) The Strategic Integrated Plan and the Strategic Mandate Agreement
- 2) The Top Performance Indicators 2013-2018
- 3) The Top Performance Indicators June 2016 Update

The Strategic Integrated Plan (SIP) is a five year plan running from 2013-2018. The Strategic Mandate Agreement (SMA) is a document developed at the request of the Provincial Government. Consultations were done to create the SMA but also is the

result of negotiations with the Government. A new SMA will be required in the next few months.

The SIP has three key words: Collaboration, Leadership, and Resilience (CLR). The descriptive title: Sustainable Communities and Global Prosperity focusses on building communities that are: culturally vibrant, technologically smart and connected, environmentally conscious and sustainable, safe and secure, economically successful, and well governed and administered. These reflect the Faculties, research and characteristics of the university. The distinctive identifiers are as follows: interdisciplinary, international/global research, diversity/accessibility, collaborative, and innovative. Values included are: excellence in teaching, student-centered, research excellence and connectedness, creativity and enterprise.

The SMA's goal is to differentiate Carleton from other universities, fill the provincial mandate and to remain within the SIP. The SMA includes: jobs, innovation and economic development; students; collaboration. There were five programs proposed in the current SMA and all have been approved by the Government. Carleton led on a collaborative workforce called the Eastern Ontario Taskforce which is a collaboration of five universities and four colleges.

For the next SMA possible topics will likely include: enrolment projections, new program development (strategically), outcome measures, including employment and satisfaction, work with community colleges, and experiential learning.

b) Update from VP Students and Enrolment

Enrolment

Based on current registrations, the OVPSE is projecting the new first-year full-time students to increase by 1.9%. Over all years OVPSE is projecting a 2.9% increase in enrolment.

Ontario Universities Fair for 2016 went extremely well with a large contingent of faculty, students and staff that did an excellent job. The Fair helped identify perspective students. There were 135,000 parents and students at the fair. There was a 30% increase in the number of students interested in getting additional information about Carleton. Ms. Blanchard was thanked for her dedication.

Fall Orientation and move-in weekend went well with a great welcoming of Carleton students. Varsity Athletes were well represented.

The Student Mental Framework 2.0 will be launched in October. There was a framework from 2009. Student engagement was a key factor in the rewriting of the framework and a significant portion of the framework was written by the students. It looked at many different things including resilience.

The Sexual Violence Policy started last year with consultations with stakeholders. The Director of Student Affairs and Coordinator for Sexual Violence met a second time with specific stakeholders and all unions that responded to discuss which points were of importance for inclusion in the policy. Information has been collated and the first draft is planned to be posted to the web for the month of October. All members of the campus community will have the opportunity to provide feedback and comments through email before the final draft is done. The policy will be going through the approval process through Senate (for information), the Senior Management Committee, and the Board of Governors (December 1).

c) Update from Director, University Communications

A wide range of activities have been occurring over the summer to get ready for the school year and a sample of that work was provided in a board report from the Department of University Communications (DUC). A number of back to school stories were assembled to support faculties and departments across campus. A number of new programs were profiled. New funding was announced including \$4.6 million in SSHRC funding for Carleton faculty, \$2.5 million grant for Dr. Kim Matheson for the Youth Futures project which focusses on improving opportunities among Indigenous youth. Banu Örmeci was announced as the Jarislowsky Chair in Water and Global Health. Promotion was done on Komal Minhas's film *Dream Girl* which shares stories of female entrepreneurs. It was premiered at the White House as well. A feature about Carleton students and alumni who participated in the Rio Olympic games was published. DUC also highlighted the president's work on the Eastern Ontario Task Force and the launch of the website www.carleton.ca/eotf which will offer hundreds of on-line courses for municipal or community services sector.

d) Physical Plant Projects

Update was given under the Financial Reports.

7.2 Committee Chair Updates

The Governance Committee will be meeting on October 5th and will be discussing a work plan for the year.

8. OTHER BUSINESS

Pursuant to the Code of Conduct section 4, Mr. Owens moved, and was seconded by Mr. Bueckert that the Executive Committee ask Mr. Wernick be requested to apologize and issue a retraction. The motion was defeated.

9. QUESTION PERIOD

There was one questions posed:

1. In April of this year, three organizations representing academic staff, administrative and support staff and graduate students at Carleton University voted “no-confidence” in the Board of Governors over concerns related to university governance, as well as accusations of a lack of transparency. What is the Board of Governors planning to do to rebuild confidence with campus stakeholders?
 - President Runte previously responded to this question, when it was raised last spring. The matter was raised with the joint committee. The Board Executive and the Board Committees have attempted to improve communication, the speed of communication and invite comments as much as possible. The chair noted that the Community Relations and Advancement Committee is taking on an initiative this board year to look at and improve stakeholder engagement.

10. ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

A motion to adjourn the Open Session of the meeting was made at 6:13 pm. The Chair thanked all guests who attended the Open Session and asked them to leave so that the Closed Session of the meeting could begin.