

Law and Legal Studies
Update on Unit Response to External Reviewers' Report & Action Plan
Programs Being Reviewed: Graduate and Undergraduate Programs
Completed by: Zeina Bou-Zeid, Chair Department of Law and Legal Studies
Approved by Dean: Brenda O'Neill, Dean Faculty of Public Affairs/2 May 2023

Note: This document is made available for public posting on the Vice-Provost's website.

***** Denotes items that SQAPC would like the unit to pay particular attention to based on their past review of the original action item.**

External Reviewer Recommendation	Action Item	Owner	Timeline	Progress Update	Will the action described require calendar changes? (Y or N)
<p>1. <i>Add frontline administrative support (convert the .5 front line position to 1) to enhance efficiency and enable the department to be proactive in supporting students.</i></p>	<p>LLS to request ODFPA to increase existing 0.5 Undergraduate Administrative Assistant position from 0.5 FTE to 1.0 FTE</p>	<p>LLS</p>	<p>Winter 2020</p>	<p>This was completed in September 2020. Both front line positions (Administrative Assistant and Undergraduate Administrative Assistant) are full time 1.0 positions.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>2. <i>Develop ways to address the uneven distribution of graduate supervision and enhance broad faculty engagement with graduate programs, including developing a policy for formal recognition of graduate supervision in faculty workload.</i></p>	<p>Continue discussions within LLS to determine best ways to achieve more even distribution; Begin discussions with ODFPA about potential policy development.</p>	<p>LLS LLS</p>	<p>Ongoing Ongoing</p>	<p>Discussions on how to address this are still ongoing in the Graduate Committee.</p>	<p>N</p>

<p>3. Add faculty to increase the capacity to deliver courses at the fourth-year level without increasing class sizes.</p>	<p>LLS to request more tenure-track faculty positions to be allocated to the Department by ODFPA and Provost</p>	<p>LLS</p>	<p>Winter 2020</p>	<p>We have been able to moderately increase the number of 4000-level courses since 2020. Faculty members are asked to identify courses at all levels they are willing to teach. This allows the Chair to assign more regular faculty members to 4000-level courses. Class sizes have not increased.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>4. Add courses on Indigenous issues and the law, as well as colonial legal matters, to the curriculum.</p>	<p>Continue current review of curriculum to identify opportunities for additional Indigenous content and continue to explore opportunities for hiring additional Indigenous faculty members.</p>	<p>LLS</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>In 2020-2021 the Undergraduate Curriculum Committee recommended the addition of a 2000-level course on Indigenous Law that would be required for all LAWS students. The course description and learning outcomes have been drafted and the course has been approved by the Department Board. The new course and requisite program changes have been delayed pending the hiring of an Assistant Professor in Indigenous Law. The hiring process for this position is anticipated to be completed in Winter 2023. The new faculty member is expected to take the lead in creating and teaching this new course.</p> <p>In addition, the Undergraduate Curriculum Committee recommended the inclusion of more indigenous content in all LAWS courses, especially those at the second year level.</p>	<p>Y</p>
<p>5. Elaborate learning outcomes for core undergraduate courses with multiple sections.</p>	<p>Draft and implement learning objectives/outcomes for core courses (Approximately 4 courses per year)</p>	<p>LLS</p>	<p>Initiate Fall 2020, target completion April 2023</p>	<p>In the Fall of 2020 the Undergraduate Curriculum Committee completed the review of the learning outcomes of the two required methods courses that are offered at the 2000- and 3000-level, Laws 2908 Methodological Approaches in Legal Studies I and Laws 3908 Methodological Approaches in Legal Studies II.</p> <p>The Undergraduate Curriculum Committee continues to discuss the process for developing the learning outcomes of the 1000- and 2000-level required courses.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>6. Improve efficiency of Research Accounts in disbursing funds.</p>	<p>Continue ongoing discussions with Associate Dean Research in ODFPA to advocate on behalf of the Department with Research Accounting</p>	<p>LLS, Research Accounting</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>This is an ongoing issue. Discussions are taking place with the Associate Dean (Research and International) to resolve issues as they occur.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>7. Prioritize in-program students for teaching assistantships.</p>	<p>The Department will consult with graduate students to clarify these concerns. Once the specific nature of the concern is identified,</p>	<p>LLS</p>	<p>Fall 2020</p>	<p>It is apparent that some graduate students are unclear about how the TA process works at Carleton, and we are seeking to ensure that they have a better understanding going forward. Unfortunately, it is unavoidable that some of our students with Priority TAs will be assigned to other units. This is the case for two reasons: First, we do not have a perfect match between our TA requirements and the backgrounds and qualifications of our students with</p>	<p>N</p>

	the Department will then initiate discussions with FGPA and Associate Dean Academic, ODFPA, as appropriate.			<p>TAships. Second, in the Faculty of Public Affairs Priority TAs are pooled and centrally allocated for assignment to any unit in FPA where they are needed – not necessarily to their home unit.</p> <p>The Associate Chair does prioritize in-program students for TA assignments and submits requests to the Associate Dean (Academic), who is responsible for TA allocations. We do receive most, but not all, of the TAs we request. Some LAWS TAs are assigned to other units (such as Criminology), where the need for TAs is particularly high. When the department hires Outside Priority TAs (OPTAs), we prioritize LAWS students. However, we are required by the CUPE 4600 Collective Agreement to consider a broader pool of students and to hire only the most qualified TA, regardless of their home unit. In most cases, LAWS students meet those qualifications.</p>	
8. Make the TA allocation process more transparent to students.	Create document explaining general steps in TA allocation and assignment process.	LLS	Spring 2021	At the beginning of every year there is a TA Orientation, usually organized by the departmental TA Mentor (who is assigned by the Associate Chair). At that orientation, the Associate Chair outlines the process of assignments to all attendees. In order to ensure this continues, out-going Associate Chairs will make sure in-coming Associate Chairs are made aware of this practice.	N
9. Ensure the Department has autonomy to determine priorities in TA allocation.	The Department will consult with graduate students to clarify these concerns. Once the specific nature of the concern is identified, the Department will then initiate discussions with FGPA and Associate Dean Academic, ODFPA, as appropriate.	LLS	Fall 2020	The Department does not have complete autonomy when it comes to TA Assignments. This process is completed in conjunction with the Associate Dean of the Faculty of Public Affairs and so complete autonomy is not possible. Past practice has been that the Departments needs have largely been met through this process.	N
10. Add space for visiting scholars, post-doctoral fellows, and research teams	Confirm allocation of additional space to LLS by ODFPA; work to allocate some of the new available space to	LLS	New space is anticipated to become available	There has been a delay in the new space that was allocated to LLS. We anticipate that the space will become available in December 2022 or early 2023 (assuming no additional delays). When this space becomes available it will provide an additional three offices and one of those offices has room for a three member research team.	N

	visitors and research teams.		Summer 2021		
11. Improve air quality and temperature control in the building.	Report concerns to Loeb Building authority and request follow-up with Facilities Management at Carleton	LLS, Loeb Building Authority, Facilities Management	Fall 2020	FMP has been notified on multiple occasions about concerns from faculty and staff over air quality and pest control issues. There are limited options available to resolve the temperature control issues due to the age of the building. FMP has been notified repeatedly of pest control issues and has yet to successfully resolve the issues in faculty offices and departmental shared spaces. The Department has purchased several air purifiers for shared departmental spaces including the main office, meeting rooms and lounge. We are reviewing options for purchasing air purifiers for graduate student spaces.	N
12. Set up a clear process to evaluate progress on responding to this Report's recommendations	Follow established process for Quality Assurance Review	Office of Vice –Provost (Academic)	Ongoing	A Quality Assurance Committee has been appointed for 2022-2023 consisting of the Department Chair, Associate Chair, Graduate Supervisor and Undergraduate Supervisor. This committee will begin to evaluate the department's progress on the Report's recommendations in January 2023 as we begin the next Quality Assurance Review.	N
13. Develop university, faculty and departmental strategies for international and national recruitment of MA and PhD students.	In addition to current processes initiated with ODFPA, initiate discussions with FGPA to develop additional recruitment strategies	LLS; ODFPA; FGPA	Initiate additional discussions Summer 2020 with completion of revamped recruitment process by Winter 2022	The Department has developed a strategy for recruiting MA students through the undergraduate program through three workshops held by a member of the graduate committee. We continue to recruit International and Domestic PhD students through conventional means of publications and conferences, but we have broadened our web presence through twitter, academia.edu , and updating our websites.	N

<p>14. Bolster PhD comprehensive exam committees (external examiner outside committee)</p>				<p>The Graduate Committee has revised the structure of our comprehensive exams.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>15. Convene a Workshop on Teaching for PhD students at the end of year 2 of the programme.</p>	<p>Initiate consultation with EDC to determine how LLS PhD students can be best trained for teaching, including possibility of developing LLS workshop</p>	<p>LLS; EDC</p>	<p>Fall 2020</p>	<p>This has been completed ad hoc to date, but we are in the process of institutionalizing this workshop for all years in the program.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>16. Offer anticipated course pathways and timelines that reflect progression through undergraduate program concentrations (enunciating which courses taken in year one and two are prerequisites for fourth year courses).</p>	<p>Work with EDC to develop pathways resource for various programs.</p>	<p>LLS</p>	<p>Winter 2022</p>	<p>The Department has created a suggested pathways document for all concentrations and Honours students. This document describes which courses meet the program requirements and the year those courses are offered. These documents do not list which courses must be taken in every year in order to take a specific 4000-level course. Because our Department offers many courses, there are many pathways available to students. Therefore, creating this type of document would be difficult. The Undergraduate Administrative Assistant is looking at potential options to conceptualize what this document could look like.</p> <p>The Undergraduate Calendar lists all LAWS courses with required prerequisites to assist students with course planning. In addition, our students are encouraged through emails from our Undergraduate Advisor to meet yearly to discuss their progress through the program. These meetings should alert students early on to any potential issues.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>17. Embrace the idea that Law undergraduate programs are “pre-law” for many students and re-imagine what that could mean by drawing on the interdisciplinary and critical orientation of the department.</p>	<p>Continue ongoing inclusive strategic dialogue in the Department, including scheduling additional department retreats to engage this process</p>	<p>LLS</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>An inclusive dialogue and strategic planning session that considers the Department strengths and identity occurs twice a year at department retreats.</p>	<p>N</p>

<p>18. Improve graduate student funding to enhance recruitment, especially for international students.</p>	<p>Initiate discussions with FGPA concerning this issue.</p>	<p>LLS, FGPA</p>	<p>Winter 2021</p>	<p>We have not been able to increase funding for International PhD beyond the addition of the International Doctoral Tuition Scholarship that reduces their tuition from international rates to domestic rates (this is only available to one International PhD applicant per year).</p> <p>In addition, we have committed to nominating international students for the Vanier Fellowship (over domestic applicants), because it is the one scholarship we can nominate International PhD students for, beyond the Ontario Graduate Scholarship.</p> <p>Lastly, we have started to tether research assistantships to funding International students.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>19. Give SSHRC etc. recipients top-up scholarships and reallocate base funding.</p>	<p>Initiate discussions with FGPA about this issue.</p>	<p>LLS, FGPA</p>	<p>Winter 2021</p>	<p>The Department has decided not to pursue this. There is no appetite at the level of FGPA or at the Departmental level to reallocate base funding. One of the reasons students come to Carleton University for graduate studies is the fact that we do not reallocate base funding when a student receives SSHRC.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>20. Create a PhD ad hoc committee to make recommendations with respect to recruitment, course diversity, and the timing and nature of professional development initiatives.</p>	<p>Initiate discussions among faculty and PhD students to determine best process to move forward with this recommendation.</p>	<p>LLS</p>	<p>Initiate process Fall 2020</p>	<p>We have voted on and widened the number of graduate student representatives in the Department and a PhD student from this representatives group sits on the Graduate Committee as a voting member. This member makes recommendations on behalf of the graduate students in respect to recruitment, course diversity, and professional development initiatives.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>21. Enhance communication by adding profiles for CIs on the Department website and highlighting guest speakers.</p>	<p>Collect updated CI profiles and add to department website as available</p>	<p>LLS</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>The CI profiles were updated on the Department website in the summer of 2022. The Assistant to the Chair and Communications Coordinator will review these every year.</p> <p>Guest speakers and department events are advertised on the department website, emailed to faculty, CIs, staff and students and posted to the Department social media accounts.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>22. Embark on an inclusive strategic dialogue for the Department to consider how to narrate its collective strength and distinctiveness, as well as articulate an academic vision for its future directions.</p>	<p>Continue ongoing inclusive strategic dialogue in the Department, including scheduling additional department retreats to engage this process</p>	<p>LLS</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>An inclusive dialogue and strategic planning session that considers the department strengths and identity occurs twice a year at department retreats.</p>	<p>N</p>

<p>23. <i>Create an executive committee (comprising the chair, associate chair, graduate and undergraduate supervisors, and a contract Instructor representative — supported by appropriate administrators) to assist the Chair in decisions regarding academic course assignments and offerings.</i></p>	<p>Chair to continue consulting with Undergraduate Supervisor, Graduate Supervisor, and Associate Chair during timetable construction</p>	<p>LLS</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>The Chair continues to consult with Department Administrator, Undergraduate Supervisor, Graduate Supervisor, and Associate Chair during timetable construction.</p> <p>Due to the challenges with course planning during the pandemic and post-pandemic and lower enrollments, consultation with a contract instructor representative has not been possible.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>24. <i>Create a mechanism for CI input on undergraduate curriculum, perhaps by adding a CI to the undergraduate curriculum committee.</i></p>	<p>The Department will undertake to consult CI representatives</p>	<p>LLS</p>	<p>Fall 2020</p>	<p>All undergraduate policy and curriculum changes that pass through the Undergraduate Curriculum Committee must get Department Board approval. There are two contract instructor representatives on the Department Board. This offers CIs the opportunity to contribute to undergraduate curriculum changes.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>25. <i>Enlarge PhD student space by renovating current space or providing shared offices.</i></p>	<p>Confirm allocation of new space to LLS; work to allocate some of this new space to PhD students</p>	<p>LLS and ODFPA</p>	<p>New space is anticipated to become available Summer 2021</p>	<p>In January 2023, the PhD students moved into a new renovated work space with cubicles that can accommodate 10 students. In addition, the PhD students now have access to a private lounge area.</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>26. <i>The Department (through its graduate studies committee) should liaise with the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs to develop strategies for increasing the number of PDFs within the Department.</i></p>	<p>Consult with FGPA, ODFPA concerning ways to recruit PDFs to department. Department to continue applying to ODFPA postdoctoral position competition.</p>	<p>LLS</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>No progress has been made in relation to this recommendation.</p>	<p>N</p>