

**CARLETON UNIVERSITY COMMITTEE ON
QUALITY ASSURANCE
Cyclical Review of the graduate programs
in Philanthropy & Nonprofit Leadership
Executive Summary and Final Assessment Report**

This Executive Summary and Final Assessment Report of the cyclical review of Carleton's graduate programs in Philanthropy & Nonprofit Leadership are provided pursuant to the provincial Quality Assurance Framework and Carleton's Institutional Quality Assurance Process (IQAP).

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The graduate programs in Philanthropy and Nonprofit Leadership reside in the School of Public Policy and Administration, a unit administered by the Faculty of Public Affairs.

As a consequence of the review, the programs were categorized by Carleton University's Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee (SQAPC) as being of good quality. (Carleton's IQAP 7.2.13-7.2.14).

The External Reviewers' report offered a very positive assessment of the programs. Within the context of this positive assessment, the report nonetheless made a number of recommendations for the continuing enhancement of the programs. These recommendations were productively addressed by the Director of the School of Public Policy and Administration and the Dean of the Faculty of Public Affairs in responses to the External Reviewers' report and Implementation on Plan that was submitted to SQAPC on October 26, 2023.

Master of Philanthropy and Nonprofit Leadership
Unit Response to External Reviewers' Report & Implementation Plan
Programs Being Reviewed: Graduate

Note: This document is forwarded to Senate, the Quality Council and posted on the Vice- Provost's external website.

General Comments

The School of Public Policy and Administration (SPPA) is pleased to receive the very positive External Reviewers' report on the Master/Diploma of Philanthropy and Nonprofit Leadership on May 21st, 2023. This report has been shared with SPPA faculty and staff, and we are committed to the continual improvement of the program to enhance the student, staff, and faculty experience. This document contains both a response to the External Reviewers' Report and an Implementation Plan which have been created in consultation with the SPPA Director and the Deans of the Faculties of Public Affairs and Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs. We thank the Reviewers for their careful, detailed and thoughtful analysis which is of great value in strengthening the program further into the future.

In response to each of the Reviewers' recommendations, one of the following actions has been indicated:

Agreed to unconditionally: used when the unit agrees to and is able to take action on the recommendation without further consultation with any other parties internal or external to the unit.

Agreed to if additional resources permit: used when the unit agrees with the recommendation, however action can only be taken if additional resources are made available. Units must describe the resources needed to implement the recommendation and provide an explanation demonstrating how they plan to obtain those resources. In these cases, discussions with the Deans will normally be required and therefore identified as an action item.

Agreed to in principle: used when the unit agrees with the recommendation, however action is dependent on something other than resources. Units must describe these dependencies and determine what actions, if any, will be taken.

Not agreed to: used when the unit does not agree with the recommendation and therefore will not be taking further action. A rationale must be provided to indicate why the unit does not agree (no action should be associated with this response).

The person responsible for the action, the timeline and whether calendar changes are required is also noted.

UNIT RESPONSE AND IMPLEMENTATION PLAN

Programs Being Reviewed: Master of Philanthropy and Nonprofit Leadership

Prepared by (name/position/unit/date):

External Reviewer Recommendation & Categorization	Unit Response (choose only one for each recommendation): 1- Agreed to unconditionally 2- Agreed to if additional resources permit (describe resources) 3- Agreed to in principle 4- Not agreed to Rationales are required for categories 2, 3 & 4	Action Item	Owner	Timeline	Will the action described require calendar changes? (Y or N)
<p>1) Support hiring to replace retired faculty and those with course payouts (weakness)</p>	<p><i>Agreed to if additional resources permit</i></p> <p>The report indicates that the MPNL is “nearing a crisis point” due to lack of replacement of retired faculty and the pending retirement of the only Full Professor (and Graduate Supervisor since its beginning). As indicated, “if there is no additional faculty hired to teach core courses, supervise capstone projects, and ensure academic integrity and continuity, the program will be by necessity reliant on contract instructors.”</p> <p>In the early years, there were six faculty and the (salaried) director of a University Research Centre with teaching responsibilities in the MPNL and research interests in this field. There are currently three faculty, of whom: one is half-time; one has a two-course teaching release for a major research project over the next four years; and one will retire in the near future.</p> <p>The University will need to determine if and how to address the sustainability of the program; SPPA will need to ensure designated resources are allocated to it.</p>	<p>Decision of the Dean and Provost on the future of the program including replacement of retired faculty. SPPA Director to ensure designated resources are allocated to the program.</p>	<p>Dean, Faculty of Public Affairs; Provost; SPPA Director</p>	<p>By July 1, 2024</p>	<p>N</p>

<p>2) Increase student-centered events in Fall and Spring semesters (weakness)</p>	<p><i>Agreed to in principle</i></p> <p>The lack of events has been due to limited time of faculty to organize these. The current Graduate Supervisor will assume responsibility for organizing more student-centred events.</p>	<p>Faculty, in collaboration with a committee of 2-3 students, will plan and deliver student-centred events in Fall and Winter terms. This relies on the Graduate Supervisor to take the lead; when a new faculty member (whose research interests are not in this field and who has not taught in the program) assumes the roles of Graduate Supervisor in July 2024, they will be encouraged to continue with these efforts.</p>	<p>MPNL Graduate Supervisor</p>	<p>Fall 2023, and on an annual basis</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>3) Create process for recruitment and retention of adjuncts and contract instructors, which currently are recruited largely from individuals' working networks. (concern)</p>	<p><i>Agreed to in principle</i></p> <p>The hiring of Contract Instructors has always adhered to the prescribed University process, rather than take place through informal recruitment and personal networks. The descriptions of open positions are posted on the Carleton University Job Posting and SPPA websites for the requisite time period, and are widely advertised through the MPNL Supervisor's and faculty's social media and networks. Applications are submitted to the SPPA Administrator and reviewed by the SPPA Director and MPNL Graduate Supervisor, from which candidates are chosen based on qualifications and fit with the advertised course. The choice of successful applicants is made by the SPPA Director, with input from the MPNL Supervisor;</p>	<p>For Contract Instructors: SPPA Director and Administrator ensure the process is as open and fair as possible, with extensive advertising of open positions by the School and the University.</p> <p>For Fellows and Adjuncts: SPPA Director in consultation with MPNL faculty review the appointment of specific Fellows and Adjuncts, including current ones who are due for renewal. The School's Management Committee would need to determine if a more open call for these appointments should be implemented (which would remove the expectation that Fellows and Adjuncts have already made some contributions to the School).</p>	<p>SPPA Director and MPNL Graduate Supervisor</p>	<p>Fall 2023</p>	<p>N</p>

	<p>the SPPA Administrator manages all communications with applicants. While many of the successful applicants are known to faculty due to their extensive networks, this process is a very formal and, we believe, a fair one.</p> <p>The School shares the concern raised, however, that the ability to widely advertise and attract quality candidates to Contract Instructor positions relies heavily on the extensive personal networks of the MPNL Supervisor. We plan to enlist the assistance of Carleton's Human Resource Department for additional ways of advertising beyond the University's normal channels.</p> <p>Adjuncts and Fellows are nominated by faculty and reviewed by the SPPA Tenure and Promotions Committee, which is responsible for all nominations in the School. The normal expectation is that a nominated fellow or Adjunct has already made some contribution to the Program/School and has identified in the application statement anticipated future contributions. Faculty are expected to engage the relevant Fellows and Adjuncts in their work with the School. Given this process, the appointed Fellows and Adjuncts normally have existing and ongoing connections with MPNL Faculty, although we are encouraging of those beyond existing relationships. The number of Fellows and Adjuncts with a relationship to the MPNL is limited, however, because the School seeks to balance equal appointments across its programs and research areas.</p>				
--	---	--	--	--	--

<p>4) Support additional administrative resources for the program (concern)</p>	<p><i>Agreed to if additional resources permit</i></p> <p>The MPNL Administrator is responsible for both program administration and community outreach, including management of the experiential learning components, student support, the website and events. Although SPPA has a staff member responsible for events, website and communication, any work related to the MPNL has been excluded from the duties of this position.</p>	<p>Director, SPPA and Dean, Faculty of Public Affairs to determine if additional administrative resources are available or consider possible reallocation of existing resources</p>	<p>Director, SPPA and Dean, Faculty of Public Affairs</p>	<p>By July 2024</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>5) Structure contracts so that faculty who teach in summer can teach in spring and fall to alleviate staffing issues (currently can only teach in 2 of 3 terms) (concern)</p>	<p><i>Agreed to in principle</i></p> <p>Under the collective agreement, faculty teach in only two of three terms. The report recommends maintaining the intensive Summer Institute, which means that some teaching will remain in the summer term. One means of balancing teaching is to offer an elective in the summer term cross-listed with the MPPA and possibly other programs (so some faculty teach two courses in summer and two in fall or winter). With two faculty on half time teaching, a rebalancing does not affect current teaching allocations.</p>	<p>SPPA Director and Administrator, with MPNL Graduate Supervisor, to determine the most efficient teaching schedules and develop elective courses that could be cross-listed across SPPA programs.</p>	<p>SPPA Director, SPPA Administrator and MPNL Graduate Supervisor</p>	<p>Fall 2023</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>6) Additional courses in EDI and Indigenous topics (opportunity)</p>	<p><i>Agreed to unconditionally</i></p> <p>A new elective has been added for Winter term 2023-24 that focuses on Human Resource Management and will extensively address aspects of EDI. Both topics are included in the elective PANL 5307 (Community Philanthropy) which is regularly offered, and EDI is covered in the core courses, PANL 5002 (Policy and Legal</p>	<p>Faculty and Contract Instructors to collectively and individually assess how EDI and Indigenous topics can be more fully integrated into their courses and into the program as a whole.</p>	<p>MPNL Graduate Supervisor with faculty and contract instructors</p>	<p>August 2023, with annual review</p>	<p>N</p>

	Environment) and 5004 (Leadership and Governance). Indigenous perspectives and decolonization of philanthropy have been incorporated into PANL 5001 (Foundations of Philanthropy). The annual faculty teaching evaluation meeting will assess how both EDI and Indigenous topics can be included more fully across the curriculum. If teaching resources permit and with adequate student interest, a new elective on Indigenous Philanthropy could be developed in collaboration with the Indigenous Policy and Administration Graduate Diploma.				
7) Keep the capstone report (opportunity)	<i>Agree to unconditionally</i> The capstone project and report will continue as it currently does.	MPNL Graduate Supervisor and MPNL Administrator to monitor and manage continuation of capstone projects	MPNL Graduate Supervisor and MPNL Administrator	Summer 2023, ongoing	N
8) Recruit more international students (opportunity)	<i>Agreed to if additional resources permit</i> While international students enrich the cohorts and there is a substantial applicant pool, the opportunity to include more international students is constrained by several factors: 1) there is strong domestic demand that the program needs to serve; 2) the University's admission target is set at 20 full-time <i>domestic</i> students, and when a selection of the large number of domestic part-time applicants are included, the program is at capacity (N = 35 students per year to enable a quality learning experience); and 3) the University provides very limited funding to international students (normally 0-1 per year for the MPNL). With greater student financial assistance, the number	MPNL Supervisor, SPPA Director, Dean, Faculty of Public Affairs and Dean, Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs to review potential, including resources, for more international students	MPNL Supervisor, SPPA Director, Dean, Faculty of Public Affairs and Dean, Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs	Fall 2023, with annual review	N

	of international students could be increased from about 2 to 5 per year. With an expansion of teaching resources, the program could double the intake to provide two sections of core courses serving a mix of domestic and international students.				
9) Keep the intensive Summer Institute (opportunity)	<i>Agreed to unconditionally</i> The Summer Institute will continue as it currently does.	MPNL Graduate Supervisor, MPNL Administrator and SPPA Director to oversee continuation of the Summer Institute	MPNL Graduate Supervisor, and MPNL Administrator	Fall 2023, ongoing on an annual basis	N
10) Focus learning assessments on student work already created rather than generating new data each semester (opportunity)	<i>Agreed to in principle</i> We agree that the assessment of achievement of learning outcomes should be based on existing student work, as indicated in the Quality Assurance report. Students indicate they value a short online survey annually as to strengths and suggested improvements in the program, and instructors benefit from an annual roundtable to review curriculum and program learning outcomes. Neither are onerous in terms of time or resources.	Achievement of learning outcomes will be assessed based on existing student work, as indicated in the Quality Assurance report, led by the MPNL Graduate Supervisor. We also propose to continue the existing practices of a brief online student survey of the strengths and shortcomings of the program and an annual roundtable of instructors.	MPNL Graduate Supervisor with MPNL Administrator and instructors	Learning outcome assessment as per the timeline of the QA report; short student survey and faculty roundtable on an annual basis in August	N
11) Work with school to cross list more courses that might serve as electives for MPNL students (might require in-person courses, or moving other courses online) (opportunity)	<i>Agreed to in principle</i> Electives for the MPNL need to be delivered online as few students live in the National Capital region for the fall and winter terms. The potential to cross-list electives with the School's Master of Public Policy and Administration (MPPA) has been limited by the choice to deliver these courses in person only; greater cross-listing requires a change of policy for the MPPA.	SPPA Director and Administrator with MPNL Graduate Supervisor and MPNL Administrator, with MPPA, IPA and DPPE Graduate Supervisors, to assess opportunity for more cross-listed MPPA, IPA and DPPE	SPPA Director, SPPA Administrator, and MPNL Graduate Supervisor	Fall 2023	Y

	Beginning in 2023-2024, the SPPA Director has committed to offering at least one online elective for the MPPA in the Fall Term, which will better enable the School to consider cross-listed courses. The potential for cross-listing courses with the Graduate Diplomas in Indigenous Policy and Administration (IPA) and in Policy and Program Evaluation, which are offered online, will be explored.				
12) Create a process for analyzing needs for elective courses rather than ad hoc development based on perceived need (opportunity)	<i>Agreed to unconditionally</i>	The Graduate Supervisor through the Administrator will conduct an online survey (anonymously) of students every August on preferences for existing and new electives. This will inform the selection of electives and creation of new ones for the following year. The number of electives available is determined by the SPPA Director in consultation with the SPPA Administrator depending on funding provided by the Dean, Faculty of Public Affairs.	MPNL Graduate Supervisor	August on an annual basis	Y (when new electives offered)
13) Create option for certain students to test out of mandatory courses (either through prior coursework, experience, or passing some waiver exam that could be developed) (opportunity)	<i>Agreed to in principle</i> This opportunity already exists: if students have taken an equivalent course to one of the core, they are asked to provide a syllabus to the Graduate Supervisor which is reviewed by the course instructor for equivalency. If equivalent, the student is granted 'Advanced Standing' so is not required to take the course.	MPNL Administrator and Graduate Supervisor to continue to manage approvals of Advanced Standing requests on an ongoing basis.	MPNL Graduate Supervisor and Administrator	Fall, Winter and Summer terms annually	N

<p>14) Create network so graduates of program can all be linked rather than just linked by their individual cohorts. (opportunity)</p>	<p><i>Agreed to unconditionally</i></p> <p>An MPNL (cross-cohort) Alumni Association, with an online platform, will be established in Fall 2023. A member of the MPNL Advisory Council has agreed to help develop a sustainable model, and alumni volunteers will be recruited to work with the MPNL Graduate Supervisor in creating and maintaining the network.</p>	<p>The MPNL Graduate Supervisor will work with a committee of alumni/students and a member of the Advisory Council to develop a suitable approach and implement this in fall 2023. The incoming Graduate Supervisor will be encouraged to maintain engagement with the alumni network.</p>	<p>MPNL Graduate Supervisor with a committee of alumni/students</p>	<p>Fall 2023</p>	<p>N</p>
<p>15) Continue to engage the alumni to mentor students, contract instructors, marketing the program, or taking non-credit courses (opportunity)</p>	<p><i>Agreed to if resources permit</i></p> <p>We recognize there is a strong demand by alumni for continuing professional development courses and for mentoring. The ability to meet this demand is constrained by faculty resources. With adequate faculty resources, there is an opportunity to develop a professional certificate program(s) on a cost recovery basis to meet demand by alumni and by sector professionals for continuing education. As noted in 14, the creation of an alumni association could provide opportunities for alumni to mentor students and recent graduates.</p> <p>The Graduate Supervisor continues to work with Carleton’s Advancement Office to raise funds externally for the leadership resources to implement such courses and ongoing mentorship.</p>	<p>Graduate Supervisor to work with Carleton’s Advancement Office to raise funds externally for the leadership resources to implement such courses and ongoing mentorship; if successful, consult with faculty, contractor instructors and alumni regarding course offerings and mentorship approaches.</p> <p>Note that with a new Graduate Supervisor in July 2024, the pursuit of this opportunity may no longer be feasible, depending on the willingness of the new Supervisor to spend time on this.</p>	<p>MPNL Graduate Supervisor</p>	<p>By July 2024, ongoing</p>	<p>N</p>