CARLETON UNIVERSITY GLOBAL AND INTERNATIONAL STUDIES

FALL 2021

GINS 1020A ETHNOGRAPHY, GLOBALISATION AND CULTURE

Wednesdays 3:35pm – 5:25 pm (online synchronous and recorded)

Location: Zoom

I acknowledge and respect the Algonquin First Nation, on whose traditional territory the Carleton University campus is located.

Instructor: Sandra Fahy, Ph.D.

Office Hours: Wednesdays 12:00-2:00pm

Office Location: Zoom.

Office Phone: For now, please email. Email: SandraFahy@cunet.carleton.ca

Lecture Dates:

September 8, 15, 22, 29 October 6, 13, 20, (October 27th is reading week) November 3, 10, 17, 24 December 1, 8

Section	Day	Time
A1	Monday	13:35-14:25
A2	Monday	15:35-16:25
А3	Thursday	10:35-11:25

Teaching Assistants:

Frankie Finlayson – <u>frankiefinlayson@cmail.carleton.ca</u> Ariel Becherer – <u>arielbecherer@cmail.carleton.ca</u>

Important Date:

September 30 2021: "This is the last day to withdraw from fall term and fall/winter course with a full fee adjustment. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript." See the following for more important dates: https://calendar.carleton.ca/academicyear/

Reading Materials:

Most of the materials for our course are in the public domain as PDFs or videos. You are welcome to purchase the books yourself, or take them out from the library. I will also upload all of the materials to *Brightspace*.

Teaching Style

Our course is composed of a two-hour lecture and a one-hour tutorial section. The teaching assistants (TAs) will each decide how to work with their hour tutorial sections. As to the lecture portion of the class, I have decided to divide this up into digestible chunks. It is very difficult for *anyone* to pay attention for two hours without a break or variation of presentation style. As such, our lecture time will take some version of the following: Warm up activity or review (15 min); guided discussion (15 min); lecture on new content (30 min); team work (25 min); review (15 min); wrap up (10 min). We will also take short breaks to give our brains a rest!

I work with power point for my lectures, but the bulk of the information is transmitted orally. So, please sit back, listen, and record if you wish. I will draw your attention to the most salient points. I retain the copywrite for all materials I deliver in my lectures. Reading the materials prior to lecture will be most useful.

This is my first time to teach at Carleton University, and I am thrilled to be here with you in this special BGINS program. I have taught in many countries and universities, and each has its own character. I look forward to learning from you what works best here, for you, and what doesn't.

My office door is always open to you, and in these pandemic times, "door" means email and zoom. Please feel free to reach out to me. I like learning about my students, what you are interested in, what you are working on, what you hope for your future – these insights always help me to be a better teacher.

Introducing our Course

ETHNOGRAPHY, GLOBALIZATION AND CULTURE

This is one of the foundational courses in our program. As such, it is natural that we take inspiration for its content from the title itself. We will devote four weeks to the study of Ethnography, Globalization and Culture, respectively. Each of these undergird much our program in Global and International Studies as subjects, and as social phenomena. Ethnography,

Globalisation and Culture have been examined and contested. They remain phenomena that are influx. We will study them as such. It is also possible to study these subjects from a range of different academic disciplines such as economics, literature, anthropology, geography, and so on.

Ethnography is the descriptive study of a society, or phenomena within society. It can also be the process of making, or writing, such a study. The method whereby an ethnography is created is usually through fieldwork. Nowadays, fieldwork can take many kinds of forms. Which we will discover. Our course will introduce the history of ethnography, particularly as it emerged in the social sciences. In this process we will read several ethnographies from around the world from the last few decades. These ethnographies will challenge our assumptions about ourselves, our world, and others. To get a taste of the methods behind creating an ethnography ourselves, I will instruct you on several small tasks, designed to become "mini-ethnographies," that you can conduct during our class to reflect upon.

Globalization is a term that describes how the world's economies, cultures, populations, technology, services, goods, and so on, have become increasingly interdependent. Global Studies captures the study of international politics, communications, environmental science, and on and on. It is both micro, meaning small, and macro, meaning large, in scope. As a point of contrast, International Studies, or International Relations, focuses more on the interactions between nation states and nation state alliances. Global Studies permits the study of phenomena that defy the nation state boundary, as such we could say that Global Studies inherently questions the notion of the state and government, itself.

Culture is, much like the two terms above, difficult to define. However, most folks would agree that culture is a collection of characteristics and knowledge of a particular group of people that can include language, religion, food, social habits, music, and so on. We might even say that Carleton University's BGINS program has a culture. Perhaps it is different from Carleton University's Physical Sciences. By this we could say there are a sect of customs, morals, codes and traditions.

Each of these key terms are vastly nuanced and complex. In our course together we will explore this vastness and try to get a handle on what each of them means for itself and in relation to each other. This naturally brings us to the topic of course objectives.

Course Objectives

- Understand ethnography: what it is, where it came from and how to carry it out
- Understand globalization: its history and its present manifestations
- Understand culture: draw connections between what is unique and universal
- Develop a solid foundation for ongoing study within BGINS
- Develop sustained listening skills for lectures
- Develop critical reading skills for extracting information
- Identify assumptions and implicit bias in yourself and the world

Broaden your understanding about the world and its people

Course Aims

- To provide you a solid basis for BGInS going forward
- To empower you to understand global dynamics
- To alert you to how the world is interconnected
- To enable you to communicate effectively on these topics
- To equip you will the tools for research, assessment, and analysis of our field
- To empower you to assess arguments, evidence, and conclusions

Evaluation

- 1. Weekly attendance and participation in tutorial sections and lectures 10%
- 2. First Mini-Ethnography (Due Class 4) 15%
- 3. Mid-term Essay (Due Class 7) 30%
- 4. Second Mini-Ethnography (Due Class 9) 15%
- 5. Final Essay (Due final day, Class 13) 30%

Details of Evaluation:

1.) Participation in Tutorial Sections: (10%)

It is very important you participate in online tutorials during the course. Attending online tutorials is mandatory. Your participation grade will reflect the extent to which you contribute to tutorial discussions in an informed way. However, the grade will not just be based on your attendance. You will be expected to do the required readings prior attending the tutorial sessions and also participate in an informed way in discussions. Tutorial session attendance will be taken by the TA at each session meeting. A high participation grade (in the 'A' range) will reflect a well-informed, thoughtful and respectful student engagement, throughout the majority of the classes. A high grade will involve active participation in the in-class application of the tools and approaches learned.

2.) First Mini-Ethnography (Due Class 4) 15%

This will be an assignment combining self-reflexivity, close observation, and engagement/investigation with the world around you. The aim is to explore your lived experience of globalization. This should be a text of approximately 750-1000 words.

3.) Mid-term Essay (Due Class 7) 30%

The topic of your essay must relate closely to the readings and videos and recommended readings for this course up to the point of your paper's deadline. You may choose any topic to

explore as long as it touches upon those readings. You are expected to bridge in other readings, as they relate to these, as you expand out the topic and demonstrate how you have digested and understood our course materials.

Your first paper should be around 2,000 words in length. References are required. You are encouraged to use AAA style for your papers. The following links provide detailed information and examples:

https://www.americananthro.org/StayInformed/Content.aspx?ItemNumber=2044 https://www.unl.edu/rhames/courses/current/readings/AAA%20Style.pdf https://www.stmarys-ca.edu/sites/default/files/attachments/files/aaa.pdf

Please ensure that you use at least six academic references in your submitted essay. These references should include materials that provide information on the issue you are writing about.

Please do not forget to include your name and student number on all assignments. All assignments are due on the date of submission no later than 11:59pm EST.

At the end of this syllabus, you will find a rubric which will describe an A+ paper.

4.) Second Mini-Ethnography (Due Class 9) 15%

This assignment combines a new aspect of self-reflexivity, close observation, and engagement/investigation which was not examined in the former mini-ethnography you wrote involving the world around. Additionally, you will combine your thoughts and reflections on the readings we have covered in the course so far. The aim is to explore your lived experience of globalization. This should be a text of approximately 1000-1,500 words.

5.) Final Essay (Due final day, Class 13) 30%

Your final essay should be 3,000 words. The topic of your essay must relate closely to the readings and videos and recommended readings for this course up to the point of your paper's deadline (as such for this final paper you can combine all of the course readings). You may choose any topic to explore as long as it touches upon our readings, videos and recommended readings. You are expected to bridge in other readings beyond our course, as they relate to these, as you expand out the topic and demonstrate how you have digested and understood our course materials.

Use this Checklist for Formatting before submitting your Written Assignments

Is my 1.) name, 2.) student number, 3.) course title and number, 4.) Prof's name, and 5.) TA's name on the first page?

Did I title my paper?

Did I number the pages?

Did I leave a 1 inch margin on the side?

Did I satisfy the recommended writing length for the assignment?

Did I add a bibliography? (details on that below).

Did I use 12 point font?

Did I write in Times New Roman or Calibri font?

Did I spell check and grammar check?

If submitted electronically, did I submit the document in word or PDF form?

(Please note these helpful tips for common errors such as: Apostrophes indicate the possessive case, i.e. belonging to. For example: That is Professor Fahy's adorable cat! (Means: The cat belongs to Professor Fahy, and it is adorable!). For singular nouns, use apostrophe + s, e.g. Rousseau's account. For plural nouns, use an apostrophe alone, e.g. voters' concerns.

Because "its" (i.e. belonging to 'it') is a possessive pronoun (like 'his' or 'her') it needs no apostrophe.

An apostrophe with "it", i.e. it's, is a contraction of 'it is'. But, "It's" = it is. Its = belonging to it.)

As someone who is not great at spelling and grammar, trust me, I know it's not easy. Please be patient with yourself. Write your ideas out, give yourself time to complete the grammar and spelling check before submitting. Be sure to make use of the writing services at the university! They are free and fun!!

General Help for Writing:

The following link offers insights on writing tips and prep from the University College Dublin, Ireland. Please feel free to make use of this guide:

https://www.ucd.ie/t4cms/guidelines for essay writing 2009-10.pdf

Bibliography/ References are required. You are encouraged to use AAA style for your papers. The following links provide detailed information and examples:

https://www.americananthro.org/StayInformed/Content.aspx?ItemNumber=2044 https://www.unl.edu/rhames/courses/current/readings/AAA%20Style.pdf https://www.stmarys-ca.edu/sites/default/files/attachments/files/aaa.pdf Please ensure that you use at least six academic references in your submitted essay. These references should include materials that provide information on the issue you are writing about.

Please do not forget to include your name and student number on all assignments. All assignments are due on the date of submission no later than 11:59pm EST.

Grading is broken down in this way:

Percentage	Letter grade	12-point scale	Percentage	Letter grade	12-point scale
90-100	A+	12	67-69	C+	6
85-89	A	11	63-66	С	5
80-84	A-	10	60-62	C-	4
77-79	B+	9	57-59	D+	3
73-76	В	8	53-56	D	2
70-72	В-	7	50-52	D-	1

Submission and Return of Term Work: All class assignments must be submitted directly to dropbox in Culearn. Late assignments will receive 2% deduction for each day. Extensions on assignment deadlines will be considered for legitimate reasons only and must be discussed with the instructor before a missed deadline.

Plagiarism

Please ensure that you do not intentionally or unintentionally use the ideas or writing of others without referencing this writing. Be sure to read Carleton University's statement on plagiarism and how to avoid it: https://carleton.ca/economics/courses/writing-preliminaries/pammett-on-plagiarism-and-paraphrasing/ There are significant consequences for plagiarism. Remember, your ideas and writing are valuable. You can reference others while building your thoughts in writing.

Course Copyright

"My lectures and course materials (including all PowerPoint presentations, outlines, and similar materials) are protected by copyright. I am the exclusive owner of copyright and intellectual property of all course materials. You may take notes and make copies of course materials for your own educational use. You may not allow others to reproduce or distribute lecture notes and course materials publicly for commercial purposes without my express written consent."

Helpful Information

Carleton University has a duty to accommodate students with institutional needs. Please see information on the following page. https://carleton.ca/pmc/faculty-and-instructors/institutional-obligations/ Their website states, "Students with disabilities are responsible for identifying their needs for disability-related accommodation to the Paul Menton Centre by booking an intake appointment with a PMC Coordinator, and bringing appropriate documentation to the first

meeting." Please ensure that you do this, so that you can have the best experience of accommodation at Carleton.

There are deadlines for this process. They are: "In-class tests: 2 weeks before the date of the inclass test/exam. CUTV midterms: Student must meet with or notify PMC coordinator at least 2 weeks before the 1st midterm exam. Formal Exams (December, April, July, or August): Last day for course withdrawal in the term. See Carleton dates and deadlines for specific dates." (https://carleton.ca/registrar/registration/dates/)

Carleton University is your intellectual home, and for you to make the most of your experience here be sure to reach out and utilize all the services this wonderful university has to offer.

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

Pregnancy obligation: write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist.

Religious obligation: write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist.

Academic Accommodations for Students with Disabilities: The Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or pmc@carleton.ca for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send me your Letter of Accommodation at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in accommodation (if applicable). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet class scheduled test or exam requiring with me to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC website for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally scheduled exam (if applicable).

Here are some links for helpful resources. Make use of what they offer, you deserve it!

Mental Health: https://carleton.ca/studentaffairs/student-mental-health/

Substance Use: https://carleton.ca/studentaffairs/safe-substance-use/

Care and Support: https://carleton.ca/studentaffairs/student-care-and-support/

Rights & Responsibilities: https://carleton.ca/studentaffairs/student-rights-and-responsibilities/

Emergency Fund: https://carleton.ca/studentaffairs/student-emergency-fund/

Class Schedule INTRODUCTION TO THE COURSE

Class One: September 8

Introduction to the syllabus and overview of the Course

Introductory Lecture: no reading required. The lecture today is based on the following readings which you can explore in your tutorial section:

Eriksen, Chapter 2 "A Brief History of Anthropology," Eriksen, Chapter 3 "Fieldwork and Ethnography," in *Small Places, Large Issues, Third Edition: An Introduction to Social and Cultural Anthropology* (2010).

Steger, Chapter 1 Globalization: a contested concept"
Steger, Chapter 5 "The Cultural Dimension of Globalization" in *Globalization: A very Short Introduction* (2003)

ETHNOGRAPHY

Class Two September 15

Lecture: Ethnography and the Contribution of Anthropology Introduction to early Ethnographic Films

Required Reading:

Nanda and Warms, Chapter 3, "Doing Cultural Anthropology" in *Culture Counts: A Concise Introduction of Cultural Anthropology*

Recommended Viewing:

Robert Flaherty - Original Silent Version "Nanook of the North" (1922) https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3IAcRjBq93Y&ab channel=chrisb

Batseon and Mead "Bathing Babies in Three Cultures" (Circa 1940) https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rmvqdDBSY0k&t=24s&ab_channel=vivinaSalvetti

Batseon and Mead "Childhood Rivalry in Bali and New Guinea" https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4NqQ6KL-aUY&t=18s&ab_channel=TheSuhtz

Batseon and Mead "Trance and Dance in Bali" https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Z8YCOdnj4Jw&t=40s&ab_channel=LibraryofCongress

"Kitchen Stories" (2004)

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=I0Oan6gGnVI&t=510s&ab channel=MisutoKazo This is in Norwegian, but I will try to find the English subtitles.

A review here: https://www.nytimes.com/2004/02/20/movies/film-review-scandinavian-comedy-no-knees-slapped.html

Class Three September 22

Lecture: Fieldwork and Ethnography

Trying for a Mini-Ethnography: you and the world

Required Reading:

Van Maanen, Chapter 1 "Fieldwork, Culture and Ethnography" Van Maanen, Chapter 6 "Fieldwork, Culture and Ethnography Revisited" in *Tales of the field: on writing ethnography*

Dara Culhane Chapter 1, "Imagining: an introduction," in A Different Kind of Ethnography: Imaginative Practices and Creative Methodologies

Class Four September 29

Lecture: Contemporary Fieldwork and Ethnography

Case Study: South Korea, and the World: children, adoption, belonging

Required Reading:

Eleana J. Kim, Chapter 6 "Made in Korea: Adopted Koreans and Native Koreans in the Motherland," and

Eleana J. Kim, Chapter 7 "Beyond Good and Evil: The Moral Economies of Children and Their Best Interests in a Global Age" in *Adopted Territory: Transnational Korean Adoptees and the Politics of Belonging*



First Mini-Ethnography Due, 15%



Class Five October 6

Lecture: Contemporary Fieldwork and Ethnography

Case Study: Hmong Culture, and the United States: children, health, and misunderstanding

Required Reading:

Anne Fadiman, The Spirit Catches You and You Fall Down: A Hmong Child, Her American Doctor's and the Collision of Two Cultures

Recommended Listening: Anna Fadiman's book talk

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=C8J7JxVp1Rs&ab channel=DartCenterforJournalism andTrauma

GLOBALIZATION

Class Six October 13

Lecture: Consensus and Controversies in Globalization

Required Reading:

Pieterse, Chapter 1, "Globalization: Consensus and Controversies," in *Jan Nederveen Pieterse Globalization and culture: global mélange*

Eller, Chapter 12, "Colonialism and the Origin of Globalization," in *Cultural Anthropology:* Global Forces, Local Lives

Recommended Reading:

Pieterse, Chapter 2, "Globalization and Human Integration: We Are All Migrants" in Jan Nederveen Pieterse Globalization and Culture: Global Mélange

Class Seven October 20, (October 27th is reading week) Lecture: Globalization, Economics, and Rights

Required Reading:

Eller, Chapter 14 Economics in the Postcolonial World: Development, Modernization and Globalization, in *Cultural Anthropology: Global Forces, Local Lives*

Kadrigic, Chapter 1 "The Human Face of Globalization" in Globalization and Human Rights

Recommended Reading:

Kadrigic, Chapter 8 "Rights the Future of Human Rights Under Globalization," in Globalization and Human Rights



Mid-term Essay (Due Class 7) 30%



Class Eight November 3

Lecture: Globalization, Feminism, Personal Freedom

Required Reading:

Ferree, Chapter 1, "Recognizing Transnational Feminism, 'Globalization and Feminism: Opportunities and Obstacles for Activism in the Global Arena'" in *Global feminism:* transnational women's activism, organizing, and human rights / edited by Myra Marx Ferree and Aili Mari Tripp. 2006, New York.

Kadrigic, Chapter 4, "Globalization and Personal Freedom," in *Globalization and Human Rights*

Class Nine November 10

Lecture: Anti-Globalization, Statelessness, and the in-between

Required reading:

Hassan Al Kontar, "I lived in an airport for seven months," in Guardian, July 9 2021, https://www.theguardian.com/lifeandstyle/2021/jul/09/experience-i-lived-in-an-airport-for-seven-months

DW, "Afghan migrants trapped at the border between Poland and Belarus," https://www.dw.com/en/afghan-migrants-trapped-at-the-border-between-poland-and-belarus/a-58973715

Coventry Peace House, Chapter 1 "Global Statelessness," Coventry Peace House, Chapter 3 "The Power of the State" in *Statelessness: The Quiet Torture of Belonging Nowhere, Coventry Peace House* (2008).

Recommended viewing:

https://www.thesun.ie/travel/3447749/syrian-refugee-stranded-in-canadian-airport-for-seven-months-finally-makes-it-though-passport-control/

DW, "Afghan migrants trapped at the border between Poland and Belarus," https://www.dw.com/en/afghan-migrants-trapped-at-the-border-between-poland-and-belarus/a-58973715 (NB: video at bottom)



Second Mini-Ethnography (Due Class 9) 15%



CULTURE

Class Ten November 17

Lecture: Culture where is it? Identity, who am I?

Required Reading:

Van Maanen, Chapter 2 "In Pursuit of Culture" in *Tales of the field: on writing ethnography*

Eller, Chapter 6, "Individuals and Identities: Race and Ethnicity" in *Cultural Anthropology:* Global Forces, Local Lives

Fedorak, Chapter 4, How do Living, Studying, and Working in a Foreign Culture Affect People? in *Anthropology Matters*

Recommended Reading:

Eller, Chapter 8, "Kinship and Non-Kinship Organization," in *Cultural Anthropology: Global Forces, Local Lives*

The Native Scholar who Wasn't, New York Times, May 25th 2021 https://www.nytimes.com/2021/05/25/magazine/cherokee-native-american-andrea-smith.html

"No you can't identify as Transracial, but you can affirm your gender" July 2 2021, https://theconversation.com/no-you-cant-identify-as-transracial-but-you-can-affirm-your-gender-163729

Class Eleven November 24

Lecture: Culture, Comparison, Context

Required Reading:

Eriksen, Chapter 1, Comparison and Context in *Small Places, Large Issues, Third Edition:*An Introduction to Social and Cultural Anthropology (2010)

Pieterse, Chapter 3 Globalization and Culture: Three Paradigms, in *Globalization and Culture: Global Mélange*

David Robson, "The astonishing vision and focus of Namibia's nomads," June 27th 2020, https://www.bbc.com/future/article/20170306-the-astonishing-focus-of-namibias-nomads

Class Twelve December 1

Lecture: Culture, Globalization, and Contradictions

Required Reading:

Moran, Chapter 5, "What Makes People Do that?" in *People and Nature: An Introduction to Human Ecological Relations* (2006)

Niezen, Chapter 3, "The cultural contradictions of Globalization," in A world beyond Difference, cultural identity in the age of globalization (2004)

Pieterse, Chapter 6, "Globalization Is Braided: East-West Osmosis," in *Globalization and Culture: Global Mélange*

Class Thirteen December 8

Lecture: The Global Culture of Near Far

Required Reading:

Pieterse, Chapter 4, "Globalization as Hybridization" in *Globalization and Culture: Global Mélange*

Pieterse, Chapter 5, "Hybridity, So What? The Anti-hybridity Backlash and the Riddles of Recognition," in *Globalization and Culture: Global Mélange*

Kadrigic, Chapter 5, "Global Television and Human Rights Abuses," in *Globalization and Human Rights*



Final Essay (Due final day, Class 13) 30%



Writing Assessment Rubric

This is adapted from a rubric developed by Pablo Gaston at Berkeley, Teaching and Resource Center.

	Excellent	Proficient	Fair	Inadequate
Thesis	Thesis is debatable and clearly presentedin the opening and concluding sections of the paper.	Thesis is debatable and is evident in theargument, but isnot clearly stated.	Thesis is unclear, and it takes work for the reader to fish it out of thetext. Or, thesisis self-evident and not debatable.	There is no evident thesis.
Argument	Argument is presented clearlyand logically. Logical points build directly upon the thesis and prior points. Counter- arguments are addressed, dismantled, and folded into the main argument ofthe paper.	logically, but points do not necessarily build on each other. Counterarguments areaddressed, butmany are left hanging or are	Argument is rambling, and there are contradictions left unaddressed. Counter arguments maybe presented, but are left unaddressed.	There is no discernable argument, or no alternative interpretation ispresented.

Originality	Argument is original and creative. Goes substantially beyond points raised in lecture and readings. Concepts are related to each other in interesting andcreative ways.	Argument is strong and interesting, but plays it safe anddoes not push boundaries. Concepts are put in conversation with each other.	Argument is expository rather than analytical. Concepts are described, but dealt with separately andnot explicitly related to eachother.	Argument is boring, weak andincoherent.
Organization	There are few or no grammar or spelling errors. Minimal passive voice. Ideas and evidence are correctly cited.	Clear organization, with introduction, transitions and conclusion, but writing is not always fluid. There are several grammar or spelling errors. Ideas and evidence are correctly cited.	Organization is unclear or without necessary component parts. Significant grammar or spelling errors (but not both). Ideas and evidence are correctly cited.	Little discernable organization. Significant grammar and spelling errors. Ideas and evidence are not correctly cited, or not cited at all.
Use of Evidence		Each logical point is backed up by one or more examples. Evidence advances the argument, but it may not be sufficient. Potential counter- arguments are accounted for, but may not be sufficiently addressed with evidence.	Several points of the argument are left without evidence. Evidence is insufficient.	A few pieces of evidence are thrown in here or there, but not used to defend the main argument.
Application of Readings/ Concepts	Demonstrates solid understanding of the major themes of the course, using readings and lectures to define concepts. Argument is placed within the broad discussions outlined in the course.	Concepts are defined, but the author does not demonstrate a solid understanding of the major themes of the course relevant to the argument.	Course readings are used. Concepts are left undefined, or poorly defined. Little broader framework is used.	Paper mentions course readings, but there is little demonstration of how the paper relates to the course.