

Carleton University

Winter Term 2018

College of the Humanities
Religion Program: RELI4850C/5850Y

"Secularism, Religion, Public Space and the Media in India and Canada."

Professor: Richard Mann

Office: Paterson Hall 2A51 or Paterson Hall 330 (the Dean's Office)

Office Hours: Fridays 2:30-3:30 or by appointment

Office Phone: 520-2600 ext. 2504

Office e-mail: richard.mann@carleton.ca

Classroom: PA 240

Class time: Fridays 11:35 am - 2:25 pm (as class runs over the lunch hour please feel free to bring your lunch)

Course Introduction and Description:

Somewhat famously in the 1960s Peter Berger laid out an argument in his book, *The Sacred Canopy: Elements of a Sociological theory of Religion*, that eventually secularism would dominate the world. The secularization hypothesis, popular in the social sciences in the 1960s, and 70s, claimed that progress and secularism moved together and as the world progressed religion would fade away and be replaced by secular institutions. Religion, it was thought, would have no place in the modern world. More recent historical events have done much to challenge the notion that religion will fade from relevance on the global scene. Indeed, in 1991 Berger published an article in another book, *The Desecularization of the World: Resurgent Religion and World Politics*, summarizing his thoughts on why secularization had not come to dominate the world in the manner he predicted three decades previous, and that, if anything, the inverse process had occurred.

Since the 1990s ideas of secularism and related terms and concepts like multiculturalism and reasonable accommodation have been much debated in academia and elsewhere. This course seeks to generate critical understandings about what secularism (or perhaps the plural 'secularisms' is more appropriate) is and debates related to the term in two national contexts: Canada and India. The course begins with a brief survey of the history of secularism in the west and then shifts to the Canadian and North American contexts. In the Canadian context we will explore two case studies both dealing with legal decisions related to minority groups. The first is the 2003 to 2006 debate in Ontario related to the desire by some to allow for sharia law in arbitration cases. The second is a Supreme Court of Canada case (*Multani v. Commission scolaire Marguerite-Bourgeoys*) dealing with the display of the Sikh *kirpan* in public places. The course then shifts to the Indian context. Here we explore the history of secularism in modern India with particular attention to the last two decades that has seen much debate over Indian secularism. We will also examine two Indian Supreme Court cases (*Bommai v Union of India*, and the group of decisions collectively referred to as 'the *Hindutva*' cases) to determine their impact on ideas of secularism both in India and elsewhere.

Finally, the course also examines the use of media and its relationship to the public's perception of religion in the public sphere, particularly in relation to the representation of religious minorities and notions of the separation of 'Church' and 'State'.

Required Text: This text is not available through the bookstore

There is no single text for this course. Rather, the weekly readings are sections of books and articles on topics. Most have either been scanned and will be made available to you, or they are available as e-versions through the library.

Course Requirements and Evaluation:

For Students Registered in RELI 4850C:

1. Two response papers, $2 \times 10\% = 20\%$

Each undergraduate student will submit two papers responding to the assigned readings for two of the eleven classes we have starting in week two. Each paper is to be 750-1000 words long. The response papers must demonstrate three things: 1. a clear grasp of the key issue (or issues) in the reading to which

you are responding; 2. a well-developed critical evaluation of the central arguments of the reading; 3. a reflection on the material from the reading. A reflection discusses how the article impacted how you think about an issue (do you think differently about an issue or figure after reading the article, or has it confirmed what you thought, a reflection can also discuss how the article may impact your final essay). One of the two response papers will be due on the day you present to the class and the other will be free for you to choose.

The response paper that accompanies your presentation is due the day before you present and must be

distributed to the class. The response paper that does not accompany your presentation is due at the start of that week's class.

2. One presentation based on assigned readings, $1 \times 15\% = 15\%$

Starting in week two, each student will make a 15 minute presentation on that week's readings to the class. On the week you present your response paper for that week must be circulated to the class the day before class. Your presentation should be based on your response paper, but you should not simply read your paper to the class. Each presenter is also required to take questions from the class and the instructor. Presentation dates will be selected in week one along with the dates for your two response papers.

3. One essay proposal, $1 \times 10\% = 10\%$

On February 29, each student must submit an essay proposal. The proposal must include a thesis statement or organizing question, a brief plan for the paper and an annotated bibliography. The thesis statement and plan should be 1-2 pages in length; the page length for the bibliography is not limited. Students are encouraged to speak with me well before February 29 to determine a suitable paper topic. We will also be breaking into groups in the class that will be designed to give you feedback on your essay topics.

4. Active participation in class discussions, $12 \times 1.25\% = 15\%$

Each student is expected to come to class with the readings completed and ready to discuss the material. You will receive each class after the first class for active participation. If you are absent from a class you cannot make-up the lost percent unless you have a medical note.

5. A Final Research Paper, $1 \times 40\% = 40\%$

Each student will submit a 15-20 page research paper on the last day of class. In this course I will propose on the first day of class that we engage in a ladder approach to your final essay. Ideally, I will not be reading an essay that I have never seen before when you submit your final essay; rather, you will submit drafts for feedback to me as well as groups we may establish on the first day of class. The goal is to be proactive in generating your essays and to produce an exceptional final essay.

For Students Registered in RELI 5850Y:

1. Four response papers, 4 X 5% = 20%

Each graduate student will submit four papers responding to the assigned readings for four of the eleven classes we have starting in week two. Each paper is to be 750-1000 words long. One of the four response papers will be due on the day you present to the class and the others will be free for you to choose. The response papers must demonstrate three things: 1. a clear grasp of the key issue (or issues) in the reading to which you are responding; 2. a well-developed critical evaluation of the central arguments of the reading; 3. a reflection on the material from the reading. A reflection discusses how the article impacted how you think about an issue (do you think differently about an issue or figure after reading the article, or has it confirmed what you thought a reflection can also discuss how the article may impact your final essay). The response paper that accompanies your presentation is due the day before you present and must be distributed to the class. The response papers that do not accompany your presentation are due at the start of classes that correspond to the readings in your response papers.

2. One presentation based on assigned readings, 1 X 15% = 15%

Starting in week two, each student will make a 15 minute presentation on that week's readings to the class. On the week you present your response paper for that week must be circulated to the class the day before class. Your presentation should be based on your response paper, but you should not simply read your paper to the class. Each presenter is also required to take questions from the class and the instructor. Presentation dates will be selected in week one with the dates for your two response papers.

3. One essay proposal, 1 X 10% = 10%

On February 29, each student must submit an essay proposal. The proposal must include a thesis statement or organizing question, a brief plan for the paper and an annotated bibliography. The thesis statement and plan should be 1-2 pages in length; the page length for the bibliography is not limited. Students are encouraged to speak with me well before November 9 to determine a suitable paper topic.

4. Active participation in class discussions, 12 X 1.25% = 15%

Each student starting in week two is expected to come to class with the readings completed and ready to discuss the material. You will receive 1.25% each class after the first class for active participation. If you are absent from a class you cannot make up the lost percent.

5. A Final Research Paper, 1 X 40% = 40%

Each student will submit a 20-25 page research paper on the last day of class. In this course I will propose on the first day of class that we engage in a ladder approach to your final essay. Ideally, I will not be reading an essay that I have never seen before when you submit your final essay; rather, you will submit drafts for feedback to me as well as groups we may establish on the first day of class. The goal is to be proactive in generating your essays and to produce an exceptional final essay.

General Notes on Evaluation:

1. Please see "Regulations Common to all Humanities Courses" attached to the syllabus for policy on plagiarism, grading systems, requests for academic accommodation and petitions to defer.
2. Missed assignments can only be made up if the student supplies adequate written documentation (i.e., a doctor's note, an obituary) for the absence.
3. Assignments submitted after the due dates are subject to a 2% penalty per day late.

Class Reading and Lecture Schedule (please note that items listed as Additional Resources are not required readings):

Week One (Jan. 12)

Topics: Course introduction. There are no scheduled readings for the first week, but we will be discussing the following CBC program on secularism:

The CBC Radio One program, *Ideas*, ran a seven episode feature in secularism called, "The Myth of the Secular", see <http://www.cbc.ca/radio/ideas/the-myth-of-the-secular-part-1-1.3135538>. The episodes began on Oct 22, 2012 and ran through to Oct 30, 2012. Most of the contemporary thinkers we will read for the course appeared on this *Ideas* series. I would encourage you to listen to the episodes - they are free as podcasts from the CBC.

Also of use will be the Social Science and Research Council (SSRC) site: <http://blogs.ssrc.org/tif/religion-in-the-public-sphere>. A number of other links to biogs related to secularism, religious freedom and specific case studies can be found at the SSRC site *The Immanent Frame* <http://blogs.ssrc.org/tif/exchanges/>.

Week Two (Jan. 19)

Topics: The history of secularism in the west

Readings:

1. Calhoun, Craig; Juergensmeyer, Mark, VanAntwerpen, Jonathan. "Introduction" in *Rethinking Secularism*. (the text has been scanned and is available to you). (Ares)
2. Taylor, Charles. "Western Secularity" in *Rethinking Secularism* (Ares)

Additional Resources:

1. James Madison "A Memorial and Remonstrance Against Religious Assessments" http://religiousfreedom.lib.virginia.edu/sacred/madison_m&r1785.html
2. United States Constitution, esp. Amendment 1 <http://www.law.cornell.edu/constitution/>
3. John Locke "A Letter Concerning Toleration" <http://etext.lib.virginia.edu/etcbin/toccer-new?id=LocTole.xml&images=images/modeng&data=/texts/english/modeng/parsed&tag=public&part=all>
4. Also see: William Uzgalis, "John Locke" Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Fall 2008 edition), esp. Section 4, "Locke and Religious Toleration" <http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2008/entries/locke/>
5. Thomas Jefferson "The Virginia Statute for Religious Freedoms" <http://usa.usembassy.de/etexts/democrac/42.htm>

Week Three (Jan. 26)

Topics: The history of secularism in the west continued

Readings:

1. Charles Taylor "Modes of Secularism" in *Secularism and Its Critics* ed. Rajeev Bhargava (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1998): 31-53. ARES
2. Jose Casanova "The Secular, Secularizations, Secularisms" in *Rethinking Secularism* (New York: OUP, 2011): 54-74. ARES

Week Four (Feb. 2)

Topics: The history of secularism in the west continued: debates over the idea; media and media framing

Readings:

1. Akeel Bilgrami "Secularism: Its Content and Context"
<http://blogs.ssrc.org/tif/2011/10/20/secularism-its-content-and-context/>
2. Robert Entman. 1993. "Framing: Towards Clarification of a Fractured Paradigm" *Journal of Communication*. 43(4): 51-58.
3. Pradip Ninan Thomas. Introduction and pages 70-113 of *Political Economy of Communications in India*.

Additional Resources:

1. Jose Casanova "Rethinking Secularization: A Global Perspective," *Hedgehog Review* 8, nos. 1-2 (2002): 7-22. ARES
2. Jurgen Habermas "Notes on a post-secular society" <http://www.signandsight.com/features/714.html>
3. Mosco, Vincent. 1996. "Introduction" to *The Political Economy of Communication*.

Week Five (Feb. 9)

Topics: Secularism in Canada: legal issues related to freedom of religion and the law

Readings:

1. Canadian Bill of Rights (1960) <http://www.canlii.org/en/ca/laws/stat/sc-1960-c-44/1atest/sc-1960-c-44.html>
2. Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms (1982)
<http://laws-lois.justice.gc.ca/eng/Const/index.html>
3. Beverley McLachlin "Freedom of Religion and the Rule of Law: A Canadian Perspective" *Recognizing Religion in a Secular Society* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's Press, 2004): 12-40 (including the response from Elshstain) ARES
4. Lori G. Beaman "Is Religious Freedom Impossible in Canada?" *Law, Culture and the Humanities* 8 (2010): 266-284. (this journal is available as an e-journal via Carleton's library)

Additional Resources :

1. M.H. Ogilvie *Religious Institutions and the Law in Canada* 3rd edition (Toronto: Irwin Law, 2010).

Week Six (Feb. 16)

Topics: Sharia Law and Arbitration

Readings for Sharia Law:

1. Janice Gross Stein "Religion, Culture, and Rights: A Conversation about Women"
<http://www.chumirethicsfoundation.ca/files/pdf/Religion%20Culture%20&%20Rights%20Stein.pdf>
2. Anver M. Emon "Islamic Law and the Canadian Mosaic: Politics, Jurisprudence, and Multicultural Accommodation" *The Canadian Bar Review* 87 (2008): 391-425.
<http://www.law.utoronto.ca/documents/emon/CBR-CanadianMosaic.pdf>
3. Janice Gross Stein "Religion, Culture, and Rights: A Conversation about Women"
<http://www.chumirethicsfoundation.ca/files/pdf/Religion%20Culture%20&%20Rights%20Stein.pdf>
4. Anver M. Emon "Islamic Law and the Canadian Mosaic: Politics, Jurisprudence, and Multicultural Accommodation" *The Canadian Bar Review* 87 (2008): 391-425.
<http://www.law.utoronto.ca/documents/emon/CBR-CanadianMosaic.pdf>

5. Natasha Bakht "Were Muslim Barbarians Really Knocking On the Gates of Ontario? The Religious Arbitration Controversy - Another Perspective"
<http://www.commonlaw.uottawa.ca/en/200708142437/publications-and-scholarship/connect/were-muslim-barbarians-really-knocking-on-the-gates-of-ontario-religious-arbitration-controversy.html>

Additional Resources:

1. Marion Boyd "Dispute Resolution in Family Law: Protecting Choice, Promoting Inclusion" (Report to the Government of Ontario) 2004
<http://www.attorneygeneral.jus.gov.on.ca/english/about/pubs/boyd/fullreport.pdf>
2. Family Statute Law Amendment Act (2006) esp. 1.(1)(b) http://www.elaws.gov.on.ca/html/source/statutes/english/2006/elaws/src_s06001_e.htm
3. Arbitration Act, 1991. <http://www.canlii.org/en/on/laws/stat/so-1991-c-17/1atest/so-1991-c-17.html#P1451928>

Week Seven (Feb. 23) Reading week- no classes (spend it reading!!!)

Week Eight (March. 2)

Topics: the kirpan in the Canadian legal system

Readings for the kirpan case:

1. Multani v. CSMB <http://www.lexisnexis.ca/document/s/2006SC006.pdf>
2. David Koussens "Neutrality of the State and Regulation of Religious Symbols in Schools in Quebec and France" *Social Compass* 56 no. 2 (2009):202-213.
3. Rita Kaur Dhamoon "Exclusion and Regulated Inclusions: The Case of the Sikh kirpan in Canada" *Sikh Formations* 9 no. 1 (2013): 7-28.

Week Nine (March 9)

Topics: An Introduction to Modern India

Readings:

1. Sugata Bose and Ayesha Jalal, *Modern South Asia: History, Culture, Political Economy, 3rd edition*, (London and New York: Routledge, 2011). Ideally, read the entire text, but we will focus our attention on chapters 15-20 (pages 130-210).
2. Paul S. Rowe "Chapter 6: Religion and Politics in India" in *Religion and Global Politics* (Don Mills: OUP, 2012): 131-153. ARES

Week Ten (March 16)

Topics: Secularism in India, early developments

Readings:

1. The Constitution of India <http://indiacode.nic.in/coiweb/welcome.html> esp. sections 12-15, 17, 25-29 and 44.
2. Rajan and Needham "Introduction" in *The Crisis of Secularism in India* (Durham, 2007):1-42. ARES

3. Section I of *The Crisis of Secularism in India*, 45-

103. Additional Resources:

1. V.K.Sinha "Introduction" in *Secularism in India* (Bombay, 1968): v-xiv. ARES
2. A. B. Shah "Secularism in India" in *Secularism in India*, 1-6. ARES
3. V.K.Sinha "Secularism and Indian Democracy" in *Secularism in India*, 7-43. ARES

Week Eleven (March 23)

Topics: Secularism in India, recent debates and issues

Readings:

1. Section II of *The Crisis of Secularism in India*, 107-188.
2. Amartya Sen "Secularism and its Discontents" in *Secularism and Its Critics* (Delhi: OUP, 1998): 454-485. ARES

Week Twelve (March 30)

Topics: Religion, Secularism and Indian Personal Law

Readings:

1. Section IV of *The Crisis of Secularism in India*, 267-330.

Additional Resources:

1. <http://www.hindu.com/2003/08/10/stories/2003081000221500.htm>
2. Nawaz B. Mody "The Press in India: The Shah Bano Judgment and Its Aftermath" *Asian Survey* 27 no. 8 (1987): 935-953.

Week Thirteen (April 6)

Topics: Religion, Secularism and Indian Law

Readings:

1. Marc Galanter "Hinduism, Secularism and the Indian Judiciary" in *Secularism and Its Critics* (Delhi: OUP, 1998): 268-293. ARES
2. Ronojoy Sen "The Indian Supreme Court and the Quest for a 'rational' Hinduism" *South Asian History and Culture* 1 no. 1 (2010): 86-104.
3. S. R. Bommai v Union of India <http://www.indiankanoon.org/doc/596735/> or see: http://www.supremecourtcases.com/index2.php?option=com_content&itemid=1&do_pdf=1&id=223

Additional Resources:

1. Gary Jacobsohn *The Wheel of Law* (Princeton, 2003).

Week Fourteen (Dec. 9)

Topics: The Hindutva Cases

Readings:

1. <http://judis.nic.in/supremecourt/imgsl.aspx?filename=10192>
2. <http://judis.nic.in/supremecourt/imgsl.aspx?filename=10193>
3. <http://judis.nic.in/supremecourt/imgsl.aspx?filename=10194>
4. <http://judis.nic.in/supremecourt/imgsl.aspx?filename=10196>
5. <http://judis.nic.in/supremecourt/imgsl.aspx?filename=10197>
6. <http://judis.nic.in/supremecourt/imgsl.aspx?filename=10199>
7. <http://judis.nic.in/supremecourt/imgsl.aspx?filename=10200>

Additional Resources:

1. Gary Jacobsohn *The Wheel of Law* (Princeton, 2003).



University Regulations for All Humanities Courses

Copies of Written Work Submitted

Always retain for yourself a copy of all essays, term papers, written assignments or take-home tests submitted in your courses.

Academic Integrity at Carleton

Plagiarism is presenting, whether intentionally or not, the ideas, expression of ideas, or work of others as one's own. Plagiarism includes reproducing or paraphrasing portions of someone else's published or unpublished material, regardless of the source, and presenting these as one's own without proper citation or reference to the original source. Examples of sources from which the ideas, expressions of ideas or works of others may be drawn from include but are not limited to: books, articles, papers, literary compositions and phrases, performance compositions, chemical compounds, art works, laboratory reports, research results, calculations and the results of calculations, diagrams, constructions, computer reports, computer code/software, and material on the internet. More information can be found on <https://carleton.ca/registrar/academic-integrity/#AIatCU>.

Academic Accommodation Policy

Academic Accommodation

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

Pregnancy obligation: write to the instructor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details see the [Student Guide](#)

Religious obligation: write to the instructor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details see the [Student Guide](#)

Academic Accommodations for Students with Disabilities: The Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at

613-520-6608 or pmc@carleton.ca for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send me your Letter of Accommodation at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (if applicable). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with me to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the [PMC website](#) for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (if applicable).

Grading System at Carleton University

Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor, subject to the approval of the faculty Dean. Standing in courses will be shown by alphabetical grades. The system of grades used, with corresponding grade points and the percentage conversion is below. Grade points indicated are for courses with 1.0 credit value. Where the course credit is greater or less than one credit, the grade points are adjusted proportionately.

[Grading System Chart](#)

Course Sharing Websites and Copyright

Classroom teaching and learning activities, including lectures, discussions, presentations, etc., by both instructors and students, are copy protected and remain the intellectual property of their respective author(s). All course materials, including PowerPoint presentations, outlines, and other materials, are also protected by copyright and remain the intellectual property of their respective author(s).

Students registered in the course may take notes and make copies of course materials for their own educational use only. Students are not permitted to reproduce or distribute lecture notes and course materials publicly for commercial or non-commercial purposes without express written consent from the copyright holder(s).

Statement on Class Conduct

The Carleton University Human Rights Policies and Procedures affirm that all members of the University community share a responsibility to:

- promote equity and fairness,
- respect and value diversity,
- prevent discrimination and harassment, and

preserve the freedom of its members to carry out responsibly their scholarly work without threat of interference.

Deferred Term Work

In some situations, students are unable to complete term work because of illness or other circumstances beyond their control, which forces them to delay submission of the work.

Students who claim illness, injury or other extraordinary circumstances beyond their control as a reason for missed term work are held responsible for immediately informing the instructor concerned and for making alternate arrangements with the instructor and **in all cases this must occur no later than three (3.0) working days after the term work was due.**

The alternate arrangement must be made before the last day of classes in the term as published in the academic schedule. Normally, any deferred term work will be completed by the last day of term. More information is available [in the calendar](#).

Deferred Exams

Students who do not write/attend a final examination because of illness or other circumstances beyond their control may apply to write a deferred examination.

1. be made in writing to the Registrar's Office **no later than three working days after the original final examination or the due date of the take-home examination;** and
2. be fully supported by appropriate documentation and in cases of illness by a medical certificate dated no later than one working day after the examination or by appropriate documents in other cases. Medical documents must specify the date of the onset of the illness, the (expected) date of recovery, and the extent to which the student was/is incapacitated during the time of the examination. The University's preferred medical form can be found at the Registrar's Office [forms and fees page](#).

The granting of a deferral also requires that the student has performed satisfactorily in the course according to the evaluation scheme established in the Course Outline, excluding the final examination for which deferral privileges are requested. Reasons for denial of a deferral may include, among other conditions, a failure to (i) achieve a minimum score in the course before the final examination; (ii) attend a minimum number of classes; (iii) successfully complete a specific task (e.g. term paper, critical report, group project, computer or other assignment); (iv) complete laboratory work; (v) successfully complete one or more midterms; or (vi) meet other reasonable conditions of successful performance.

More information can be found [in the calendar](#).

Any questions related to deferring a Final Exam or Final Assignment/Take Home Examination should be directed to: [Registrar's Office](#)

Withdrawal From Courses

Withdrawn. No academic credit, no impact on the CGPA.

NEW FALL 2017: WDN is a permanent notation that appears on the official transcript for students who withdraw after the full fee adjustment date in each term. Students may withdraw on or before the last day of classes.

Dates can be found here: <http://calendar.carleton.ca/academicyear/>

Department Contact Information

College of the Humanities 300 Paterson Hall (613)520-2809

CollegeOfHumanities@cunet.carleton.ca

Drop box for CLCV, HUMS LATN GREK Term Papers and assignments is outside 300 P.A.

Greek and Roman Studies 300 Paterson Hall (613)520-2809

GreekAndRomanStudies@cunet.carleton.ca

Drop Box is outside of 300 P.A.

Religion 2A39 Paterson Hall (613)520-2100

Religion@cunet.carleton.ca

Drop box for RELI Term Papers and assignments is outside of 2A39 P.A.

Registrar's Office 300 Tory (613)520-3500

<https://carleton.ca/registrar/>

Student Resources on Campus

[CUKnowHow Website](#)