Recommendations for Equity, Diversity and Inclusion (EDI)

Institutional Action

Equity and Inclusive Communities Advisory Group Carleton University Nov 12, 2020

Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION	.3
Purpose	
The Value of Inclusion	
THE IMPORTANCE OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND EQUITY	4
CRITICAL LOCAL INSIGHT (THE EIC ADVISORY GROUP)	5
GLOSSARY	7

PHASE 1 (YEARS 1 AND 2)

SA1 – Curriculum and Pedagogy	9
SA2 – Student Supports	
SA3 – Research	
SA4 – Senior Leadership Team and Board of Governors	13
SA5 – Leadership Development (Non-Academic Employees)	14
SA6 – Leadership Development (Academic Employees)	15
SA7 – Disaggregated Demographic Data Collection	17
SA8 – Representation and Outreach	
SA9 – Culture	19
SA10 – EDI Planning, Infrastructure and Reporting	21

PHASE 2 (YEARS 3 TO 5)	
PHASE 2 (YEARS 3 TO 5)	
SA1 – Curriculum and Pedagogy	23
SA3 – Research	23
SA5 – Leadership Development (Non-Academic Employees)	23
SA6 – Leadership Development (Academic Employees)	24
SA7 – Disaggregated Demographic Data Collection	24
SA8 – Representation and Outreach	24
SA9 – Culture	25
SA10 – EDI Planning, Infrastructure and Reporting	25

Introduction

Purpose

The Equity and Inclusive Communities (EIC) Advisory Group is pleased to present these recommendations to the Carleton Community for discussion and feedback.

We are members of a diverse community, and many of us are guests in this territory or are descendants of those who arrived by transatlantic and transpacific processes not of our making. "We acknowledge and respect the Algonquin Anishinaabeg people within whose unceded, unsurrendered territory the Carleton campus is located. This acknowledgement is important to us and is a reminder of our pledge for(re)conciliation with Indigenous Peoples"¹.

Bearing the requirements of re(conciliation) in mind while exploring their interrelationship with crucial concepts of human rights, equity, diversity and inclusion (EDI), we state the purpose of this document:

We seek to flesh out an institutional strategic vision for EDI at Carleton and propose an operational framework of essential actions. These proposed strategic actions will build upon efforts to integrate EDI in the core activities and the academic mission of the university to accelerate positive institutional and societal outcomes.

This purpose anticipates the creation of a final university plan extending beyond broad conceptual aspirations. In key areas, we go further to specify steps and accountabilities that will advance the university's EDI objectives.

EDI has been identified by Carleton's Board of Governors, Federal Tri-Agency Research Funders, faculty, staff, students, public and private sector employers, and other members of the external community as critical to the future success of the university. That has become even clearer in the immediate environment of pandemic dislocation, transition to virtual operations, economic contraction, geopolitical instability, and social justice reckoning. We know the combined thrust of these dynamics has only exacerbated preexisting societal disparities. And these disparities have deep historical origins.

Against this background, the creation of these recommendations follows the recent completion of Carleton's Strategic Integrated Plan (SIP) journey in which over a 1000 conversations were held with university members. When asked about Carleton's values, several clear themes were identified, revealing what we admire and aspire to as a university. Among those themes, Community, Inclusivity, Diversity and Accessibility dominated. From the SIP, we also note Carleton's renewed commitment to EDI as a driver of desired outcomes in pedagogical and curricular design, organizational excellence, interdisciplinary research collaboration, as well as local and global connectedness. EDI is also deemed central to a vision for community and individual wellness. Accordingly, we consider these recommendations for institutional EDI

¹ Strategic Integrated Plan 2020

Action as a continuation of the EDI engagement pursued under the SIP, rather than a fresh initiative.

The Value of Inclusion

Inclusion is the ongoing excercize of ensuring the university values and proactively cultivates difference so that every member can fulfil their potential and bring their whole selves in service of articulated common goals. "Inclusion increases the total human energy available to the organization. People can bring far more of themselves because they are required to suppress far less"². Moreover, inclusive communities are generative and prolific, bringing together different perspectives, experiences and identities to disrupt convention in ways essential to consequential imagination and discovery. This may be observed within organizations across multiple sectors³ and is especially vital for learning, teaching, research and working in institutions of higher education.⁴

Inclusion also respects an individual's essential need for a sense of uniqueness within, and belonging to, a larger whole. Sometimes, the value of such impressions for members of the university is understood as mainly esoteric. This is a fundamental misapprehension. A combined perception of uniqueness and belonging has real-world impacts. Both are positively correlated with enhanced student capacity for learning⁵ and therefore directly related to student success. Their presence is also connected to employee engagement and perceptions of organizational citizenship⁶. The converse is also true. Where members do not possess these relationships to the university, we should expect weaker outcomes.

The benefits are tangible but the route, complex. Harnessing the power of inclusion for every Carleton member, for the institution generally and for the wider society means strengthening and creating a series of interconnected structures, saturated with an enabling culture.

Importance of Human Rights and Equity

To fully realize the benefits of inclusion, we must first firm a foundation in human rights and attention to equity.

 ² Miller, F.A. and Katz, J.H. <u>The Inclusion Breakthrough</u>, Barrett-Koelher Publishers, California (2002)
 ³ Conference Board of Canada, <u>The Value of Diverse Leadership</u>, Ottawa, 2008. Catalyst. Inclusive Leadership: The View from Six Countries. 2014.

⁴ Williams, D.A., Berger, J.B., & McClendon, S.A., <u>Toward a model of inclusive excellence and change in postsecondary institutions. Washington, D.C.</u>: Association of American Colleges and Universities, 2005. Canada Research Coordinating Committee "EDI and Research Excellence", (<u>https://www.sshrc-crsh.gc.ca/funding-financement/nfrf-fnfr/edi-eng.aspx</u>).

⁵ Clifton, Rodney A., Raymond P. Perry, Christine Adams Stubbs, and Lance W. Roberts, "Faculty environments, psychosocial dispositions, and the academic achievement of college students". <u>Research in Higher Education</u> 45, no. 8 (2004): 801-828.

⁶ Catalyst. Op. cit.

As a large diverse institution, Carleton University is an extension of the larger society, susceptible to all of its challenges. We acknowledge that bias, harassment, and discrimination on the basis of inherent and often intersecting aspects of identity occur both outside and inside the walls of the academy. To undertake the challenge of critical self-reflection and self-examination is not easy; nor is the decision to sit in discomfort as the historically underrepresented narrate difficult aspects of experience. Yet this is precisely what we must and will do to continue making progress towards our stated values.

In many areas of Canadian academic life, unconscious and conscious biases inhibit and corrode full participation. Some research is emerging in the areas of Racialization and Indigeneity. This directs our gaze to differential outcomes and systemic bias in responses to research supervision and mentoring requests, in classroom participation opportunities, citational practices, curricular content and design, Eurocentrism and normativity of Whiteness, recruitment, retention and promotion processes, assessment of academic "service", and teaching evaluations,⁷. Other areas of concern may include the design and application of complaints procedures that tend to preserve status quo inequalities rather than dismantle them⁸.

Gender disparities have also been a central research focus. A 2018 report by the Canadian Association of University Teachers underscored underrepresentation across many equity dimensions in the academic workforce as well as compensation gaps between men and women and between white, Indigenous and racialized non-academic employees⁹. More recently, a 2019 article published in *The Lancet* described pervasive gender bias in peer review processes.¹⁰

In general, Persons with Disabilities face well documented barriers to full participation in the Canadian labour market. But by recognizing their inherent dignity through reasonable investments in accessible work spaces and facilities, persons with disabilities would be able to contribute an estimated additional \$16.8 billion to overall economic by 2030.¹¹ Still more is required for as we know, disadvantage in the workforce begins much earlier. Students with disabilities in Ontario universities continue to encounter stigma and negative attitudes, failures to appropriately accommodate, and insufficient resources in the classroom. ¹²

⁷ Henry, Francis, Enakshi Dua, Carl E. James, Audrey Kobayashi, Peter Li, Howard Ramos and Malinda S. Smith, <u>The Equity Myth: Racialization and Indigeneity at Canadian Universities</u>, Vancouver, UBC Press, 2017.

⁸ Bhopal, Kalwant, <u>White Privilege – The Myth of a Post-Racial Society</u>, Policy Press c/o The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, USA, 2018

⁹ CAUT, <u>Underrepresented & Underpaid Diversity & Equity Among Canada's Post-Secondary Education</u> <u>Teachers</u>, 2018.

¹⁰ Holly Witteman, Michael Hendricks, Sharon Straus and Cara Tannenbaum, "Are gender gaps due to evaluations of the applicant or the science? A natural experiment at a national funding agency", <u>The Lancet</u>, Volume 393, Issue 10171, P531-540, February 09, 2019.

¹¹ Robyn Gibbard, Marc Desormeaux, Priya Persaud, Ruth Wright, <u>The Business Case to Build Physically</u> <u>Accessible Environments</u>, The Conference Board of Canada, February 23, 2018.

¹² <u>Policy on Accessible Education for Students with Disabilities</u>, Ontario Human Rights Commission, March 2018.

McCloy, Ursula and Lindsay DeClou, <u>Disability in Ontario: Postsecondary Education Participation Rates</u>, <u>Student Experience and Labour Market Outcomes</u>, Higher Education Quality Council of Ontario, Feb 21, 2013.

Further, we acknowledge the 2012 Carleton University "Report of Commission on Inter-Cultural, Inter-Religious and Inter-Racial Relations on Campus". In specified ways, the document reflects how discrimination, harassment and hate crimes on the intersecting grounds of "creed and race" (including Anti-Semitism and Islamophobia) form part of our societal context as do ostracizing and dehumanizing practices on the basis of sexual orientation, gender expression and identity.¹³

Beyond these issues of human rights compliance, the university is also committed to rededicating itself to matters of equity. Rights regimes are preoccupied with equality, being an appropriate insistence on environments free from harassment and discrimination. But sharing a starting line with a group of elite runners is no comfort when they have shoes and you do not. The result is predestined. Equity (or substantive equality) therefore requires us to consider the removal of barriers and disadvantages and the provision of the necessary supports beyond legal requirements to enable all our members to fulfil their potential and maximize their contributions.

Critical Local Insight (The EIC Advisory Group)

While an appreciation of the human rights and EDI literature landscape is important, there is no substitute for understanding and insight into the specific needs and circumstances at Carleton. To map the pathways to stronger EDI outcomes, we require direct information and experience from the community to scope systemic successes, opportunities and gaps.

The EDI Advisory Group was created as part of a mechanism to fulfil this objective. Serving as key informants, the group is characterized by broad institutional and demographic representation with important experiential and scholarly capability among its faculty, staff, students and external member composition. By these recommendations the group has set the table for conversation and feedback within the larger university community. The value of their service is immeasurable.

The recommendations are structured along ten interconnected strategic actions, each addressing a core organizational facet. Strong and effective EDI planning recognizes that it is difficult to make meaningful advances against a single strategic action without engaging multiple others. In addition, five thematic descriptors emerge from these actions. We cast the document as Innovative, Integrated, Holistic, Flexible and Ambitious.

Innovation appears in the form of positive framing for leadership development throughout the university and the incentivization of pro-social and other EDI-related values and behaviours rather than a cataloguing of corrective measures common to other plans.

¹³ Police-reported hate crime, by type of motivation

https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/t1/tbl1/en/tv.action?pid=3510006601

We seek to **integrate** related planning documents and structures at Carleton. These recommendations reinforce and complement but do not replicate programmatic initiatives of the Kinàmàgawin Report, the Coordinated Accessibility Strategy, the Sexual Violence Policy, the Trans and Non-Binary Gender Work Plan (under development) or the Healthy Workplace Strategic Plan 2109 - 2022. We also take notice of the venerated legacies represented by the Pauline Jewitt Institute of Women's and Gender Studies, the Centre for Research on Inclusion at Work, the READ Initiative, the Zelikovitz Centre for Jewish Studies' work on Holocaust studies and the Paul Menton Centre. Moreover, we acknowledge the ongoing assessments related to pay equity at Carleton. Recognizing this existing EDI infrastructure allowed the group to identify organizational gaps particularly, but not exclusively, as it relates to processes of Racialization and Racial Inequality. Such awareness also permitted discernment of broader EDI proposals based on the totality of intersectional needs where necessary.

An **holistic** approach to the development of these recommendations was taken, relying on existing multi-disciplinary research, insights from the Advisory Group, and professional experience within the Department (EIC). Following initial drafting and in the subsequent wake of the police-involved killing of George Floyd, we also took notice of petitions and letters from the community. Much of that material resonated with thinking already reflected in these pages. In addition, 40 targeted consultations through the months of June, July and August preceded the approval of the first public draft of these recommendations. Wider consultations including 4 Town Halls and an online submission portal were made available to the community through the Fall of 2020, generating relevant feedback now layered within this iteration.

We have attempted to insert elements of **flexibility** in the document, engaging institutionally central capabilities whenever appropriate while leaving space for faculty, divisional and other local level customization.

Finally, there is an element of **ambition** in these recommendations in that we have traced concrete, and in some respects, granular actions and accountabilities within a comprehensive, interconnected visionary frame.

We hope to further stimulate and engage a robust conversation with the Carleton community on the road to the finalization of an Institutional Plan for EDI Strategic Action.

Glossary

<u>Human Rights</u>. A basic tenet of the Ontario Human Rights system as it applies to the university is to ensure that all members may learn and work with dignity and have equal access to services and opportunities without discrimination or harassment on the grounds of race, ancestry, place of origin, colour, ethnic origin, citizenship, creed, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, age, marital status, family status and disability. In certain contexts, the prohibited grounds of discrimination and harassment extend to receipt of public assistance, and record of offences. Human Rights in Ontario is a quasi-constitutional legal and compliance framework.

<u>Equity</u>. Through the removal of barriers and provision of appropriate supports, the principle of equity refers to fair access to opportunity and services for all, recognizing that members come to the university with relative advantages and disadvantages. Equity considerations extend beyond issues of legal human rights compliance, take up issues of demographic representation and underrepresentation, and examine questions of power and resource allocation.

<u>Diversity and Intersectionality</u>. Diversity describes the representation of various demographic segments and dimensions of identity within a population. In this sense, diversity includes the presence of intersectional identities, or the myriad ways in which individuals identify, live through and experience multiple dimensions of difference simultaneously.¹⁴

<u>Inclusion</u>. Inclusion is the ongoing excercize of ensuring the university values and proactively cultivates difference so that every member can fulfil their potential and bring their whole selves in service of articulated common goals. While inclusion involves and mutually benefits every member of the university, its successful operation is predicated on the fulfilment of human rights and equity objectives.

EDI. Equity, Diversity and Inclusion.

<u>Leader / Leadership</u>. Leadership at Carleton University is a collective and distributed endeavor. It is not defined exclusively by title or role. A leader possesses either organizational or personal capacity to inspire people towards the achievement of common goals. In this sense, leaders exist throughout the institution in all occupational groups.

<u>Decolonization</u>. Decolonizing in a university means creating spaces and resources for a critical discourse among all members about the voices, experiences and perspectives represented and unrepresented in received canons of knowledge; and what it means to integrate multiple and intercultural ways of knowing, learning and being into our curricular, pedagogical and governance practices. Decolonization movements find expression worldwide with varying manifestations across national and transnational locations.

<u>Inclusive Communities</u>. For members to bring their whole selves in the pursuit of personal and institutional excellence, as much value must be assigned to their attachments to multiple cultural identities and distinct lived experiences as to their sense of belonging to a common enterprise. This concept of Inclusive Communities therefore extends our understanding of Carleton University as a community of communities.

Inclusive Communities is also a *process and practice* of cultivating the inherent distinctiveness of each of our members while nurturing and growing points of connection and cohesion. It is the enabling of exploration and discovery at the borders of ideas, values and experience. Residing at the heart of innovation, interdisciplinarity, collaboration and engagement, supporting Inclusive

¹⁴ Crenshaw, K., Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color. Stanford Law Review, 43(6), 1241-1299, 1991.

Communities is critical to our current and future success in a globalized higher education context.

<u>Systemic and Structural Discrimination / Bias</u>. Systemic or structural discrimination and bias refer to patterns of organizational, or societal behaviour, policies and practices that may or may not appear facially neutral but which nonetheless disproportionately disadvantage equity-seeking and Indigenous groups.

Michael F. Charles Chair, EIC Advisory Group

PHASE 1 STRATEGIC ACTIONS (YEARS 1 AND 2)

SA1 – Curriculum and Pedagogy

Carleton University is committed to enhancing the student experience and to creating a high-quality learning environment that fosters student success in the classroom and beyond. Integral to this is recognizing that the experiences, backgrounds and understandings of our students are diverse and matter in how they engage and experience their time at Carleton. We also acknowledge that opportunities for innovative learning are missed when perspectives that expand or disrupt conventional understandings are left out or marginalized. In this light, the section seeks to advance ways to be welcoming and inclusive through our curricular and pedagogical choices.

- Faculties will explore potential for program creation including interdisciplinary programs with a focus on decolonized, EDI-centred knowledge production. Among examples at Carleton, we acknowledge the planning currently underway within FASS for the creation of an interdisciplinary Critical Race Studies Degree Program.
- 2. A Deans EDI Working Group shall be convened to explore best practices for decolonized and EDI-centred curriculum reviews that may be applied in their respective areas and will work towards ensuring that EDI principles and objectives are reflected in all degree programs, specifically in gateway or core courses and in experiential learning. Among examples at Carleton, we acknowledge the curriculum review process underway at the Sprott School of Business.
- Working in conjunction with AVP Teaching and Learning and OIRP, CU will explore the relationship between EDI and student success in academic programming, in particular, gateway courses. Gateway courses include large first-year courses and degree requirement courses.
- 4. As part of the Quality Assurance process, CU will require units to report on how proposed programs and existing programs contribute to the expansion of decolonization, equity, diversity and inclusivity at the university.
- 5. The criteria for Provost's Scholar Award will be published for transparency and shall include EDI elements.
- CU will recruit an EDI Learning Specialist reporting to the AVP EIC with a structured relationship to the AVP Teaching and Learning to deliver EDI advisory programming for faculty and instructors supporting decolonized, anti-racist and inclusive pedagogical practices and curricular development. (For more see SA10 – EDI Infrastructure below)

"Curriculum and pedagogy are very important to focus on. In their experience, only exposed to non-white faculty members in their African Studies course. Certain programs like Political Science doesn't focus on a global perspective; mostly looking at Canada, US, British and Europe. Programs with few electives are also very challenged. Not having as many electives to look into topics related to EDI. How do we continue to focus the attention and research on EDI with a lack of EDI-related content in all our programs?"

(Public Consultations – student feedback)

Attention to EDI enriches learning through integration of diverse and global experience and critiques in curriculum and pedagogy.

There is a lack of Disabled, Racialized and Indigenous scholars invited into the classroom (distinct from permanent hiring efforts)

Eurocentrism is present across the university curricula.

COVID-19 poses risk to EDI infusion.

(EIC Advisory Group Survey May 26, 2020)

We support the ongoing calls to revise the format and role of teaching evaluations in tenure and promotions and establish clear and transparent tenure and promotion standards across the university that permit departments and faculty boards to use multi-modal evaluations when reviewing a file.

(Community Letter – Addressing Systemic Racism at Carleton, July 8 2020)

SA2 – Student Supports

As part of an array of activities to promote student success, student supports are a key component of the work we do at Carleton. Carleton has a diverse student body and it is important to ensure that student supports are designed and delivered in ways that assume varied rather than generic student experiences. To that end, Carleton acknowledges the need to integrate EDI throughout its student services and enrolment operations in the spirit of continuous improvement. We also recognize particular opportunities to address service gaps for Racialized students.

- Reporting to the Director Student Affairs and Student Life, a Diversity, Equity & Community Programs Coordinator will be created to support the implementation of EDI (Equity, Diversity and Inclusivity) frameworks within existing Student Life departmental processes, programs and initiatives.
- 2. Carleton will consider the need to review and assess EDI programs and services for graduate students.
- Reporting to the Director Health & Counselling, CU will establish the permanent role of a Racialized-Specific Counsellor with expertise in race-based trauma, anti-racism and anti-Black racism, resilience and success as a means of prioritizing the mental health needs of Racialized students who are said to represent approximately 47% of the student population.
- 4. The Office of the Vice-President Students and Enrolment (OVPSE) will ensure information about the augmented counselling services is communicated broadly to students and student groups.
- At the end of Phase 1, the OVPSE will commence a review of the adequacy of the counselling service complement in light of expressed student requests for additional Racialized-Specific Counsellors and / or a designated counsellor for graduate students.
- 6. All Counsellors in Health and Counselling will participate in annual professional development to incorporate EDI and anti-racism, and anti-Black racism best approaches into departmental practices.
- 7. The Associate Deans will jointly explore means to ascertain the relationship, if any, between academic integrity and equity-seeking groups and make appropriate recommendations to introduce further supportive measures.
- 8. Goals in paragraphs 1 5 shall be completed in Phase 1 (OVPSE on the advice of EIC).

SA3 – Research

Carleton University is committed to supporting, funding and disseminating research that advances Equity, Diversity and Inclusion. Such a commitment requires us to recognize that research excellence demands time, resource opportunities and an enabling environment. We also acknowledge that EDI-informed research stretches the boundaries of knowledge and opens new pathways to discovery regardless of the field of inquiry. In particular, Carleton recognizes the opportunities within our research landscape to address gaps relating to issues of racialization and racial inequality across disciplines.

- With leadership provided by the Office of the Vice-President (Research and International), CU will promote EDI-related interdisciplinary research. The VPRI will conduct a census of faculty members whose scholarship reflects, or has the potential to reflect, EDI concerns. OVPRI will build a database of EDI Scholarship that Faculty members may access to identify potential interdisciplinary research partners and pursue collaborative projects focused on EDI-related topics.
- 2. With leadership and resources from the Vice-President (Research and International), CU will create and provide seed funding for at least one cross-faculty interdisciplinary research cluster focussed on processes of racialization and racial inequality. A non-exhaustive list of research area examples may include cross-cultural histories in STEM, racial inequality and STEM education, racial inequality and corporate governance, racialization and justice, etc.
- 3. The Office of the Provost and Vice-President (Academic) and the Office of the Vice-President (Research and International) will consider and assess the need for additional programs and supports for faculty from equity-seeking groups engaged in research.
- 4. CU will acknowledge excellence in EDI Scholarship by establishing an Annual University Award for Distinguished EDI Scholarship. The Committee of Associate Deans (Research) – OVPRI with support from the Assistant Vice-President and University Advisor, Equity and Inclusive Communities will be tasked with developing the award criteria and will be empowered to evaluate submissions and select annual recipients.
- 5. The Deans EDI Working Group (referred to in SA1) also will serve as a forum for the sharing of best practices related to encouraging EDI research, allocating research support and recognizing and disseminating EDI-related research.
- The Office of the Provost and Vice-President (Academic) will create two Awards for Graduate Student EDI scholarship and Undergraduate Student EDI Scholarship respectively to be granted annually through a competitive selection process.

Attention to EDI enhances the quality, creativity and innovation in teaching, research. (EIC Advisory Group Survey May 26, 2020)

We call on Carleton to enhance its interdisciplinary and cross-faculty research, teaching, and program development in Black Studies and Critical Race Studies. (Community Letter – Addressing Systemic Racism at Carleton, July 8 2020) We call for a commitment to funding anti-racist research at Carleton, including the creation of \$250,000 in new scholarships for Black undergraduate and graduate students, new research grants and assistantships geared toward Black undergraduate and graduate students, and the creation of a pre-doctoral fellowship in Critical Race Studies for Black scholars doing transformative work. Black scholars and research with Black communities are chronically underfunded across Canadian institutions. Research on Black communities is rarely community-based, which means scholarship seldom benefits the very communities on which that research is conducted.

(Community Letter – Addressing Systemic Racism at Carleton, July 8 2020)

SA4 – Senior Leadership Team and BoG Inspiration and Development (Phase 1 and 2)

Senior leaders and board members at a university are uniquely positioned to drive change. This is no less true at Carleton. Enduring change is accelerated and venerated through the values, beliefs and behaviours they embody and incentivize.

- 1. Inspiration and Accountability:
 - a. The Senior Leadership Team and Board of Governors (BoG) will actively model best practices by completing and endorsing training, education and professional development programs integrating inclusive leadership values, principles and practices, as well as human rights and equity and EDI informed recruitment.
 - b. The Senior Leadership Team and the BoG will make themselves accountable by requesting annual reports, supporting and resourcing efforts to realize progress against the strategic actions set out in this document.
- 2. Representation:
 - a. The Senior Leadership Team and BoG will reflect on the composition of all senior decision-making tables and work to increase demographic representativeness.
 - b. At the application stage, the Senior Leadership Team and BoG will consider demographic representation when selecting for positions and vacancies at senior decision-making tables.

The Board Equity, Diversity and Inclusion Statement

(<u>https://carleton.ca/secretariat/boardofgovernors/about/edi-statement/</u>) amplifies the values and approaches essential to realizing this action.

- 3. Communications:
 - a. The Senior Leadership Team and BoG will be conversant in the benefits of EDI and be prepared to communicate its value from highly visible platforms to further engage and inspire inclusive communities at Carleton.
 - b. The Senior Leadership Team and BoG will ensure these Strategic Actions are communicated through various university platforms and formats to achieve widest reach.

While the document is wide-ranging and well-articulated, there are concerns that the commitment is not there from senior administration and faculty to see this through. Concerns persist that this is a "check box" excercise.

(Public Consultations – Staff and Faculty Feedback)

Attention to EDI:

- improves engagement and sense of belonging and wellness for employees and students
- > strengthens decision-making by integrating broader spectrum of perspectives
- removes physical and other barriers to performance and success

(EIC Advisory Group Survey May 26, 2020)

We call for proactive investments in anti-racist education and resources for Carleton faculty, administrators, governors, and employees. Such investments should expand diversity training measures beyond a psychological emphasis on problems such as unconscious bias. (Community Letter – Addressing Systemic Racism at Carleton, July 8 2020)

SA5 – General Leadership Development (Non-Academic Employees)

Carleton commits to ensuring EDI elements are valued and integrated throughout its leadership programming as well as in its processes of recruitment, retention, appointment and promotion.

- A collaborative process led by the AVP Human Resources will be struck to develop and socialize a set of institutional policies and plans for EDI best practices and criteria in recruitment, performance management (including merit-based compensation), retention and promotion. These will align and incorporate the EDI education and professional development set out in paragraph 3 and will seek to apply the learnings from the Campus Safety Services EDI Employment Systems Review in paragraph 4.
- 2. Human Resource processes for identifying and fostering talent will recognize and integrate EDI education and professional development as described in paragraph 3.
- 3. CU will acquire / design and make available education and professional development to all academic and non-academic employees in the areas of Unconscious Bias, Inclusive Leadership / Management Development, Recruiting for Difference and human rights and equity. This will also be reflected in a review of the content and activities throughout the Carleton Leader initiative. (AVP EIC, Provost and VP Academic, Deputy Provost Operations and Planning (DPAOP) AVP Human Resources, OQI)
- CU will support the ongoing implementation of the <u>Campus Safety Services Action Plan:</u> <u>Service Excellence and Engagement with Carleton's Diverse Communities</u> (<u>https://carleton.ca/safety/wp-content/uploads/Action-Plan-CSS-Service-Excellence-and-Community-Engagement.pdf</u>) as well as the Engagement and Inclusion Officer (EIO) Program, <u>https://students.carleton.ca/2020/01/campus-safety-services-pilot-program-to-foster-inclusion</u>).
- The Service Excellence Standards shall be expanded to include EDI elements to be developed and published for eligibility for the Service Excellence Award. (AVP HR, OQI, AVP EIC)
- A separate working group led by the Community Engagement Steering Committee (CESC) will develop and publish EDI-informed criteria for the establishment of an annual Community Engaged Leader Award for non-academic employees. (CESC with support from AVP EIC)

CU possesses a caring culture is a hallmark for many but "pervasive microaggressions" experienced by all equity-seeking groups among faculty and staff estates indicates **need** for systematic EDI education and professional development across campus for staff and faculty

CU's EDI reputation is linked to more prosperous communities generally:

- Virtuous circle of increased access to diverse stakeholders with business / organizational outcomes
- reflecting increasing diversity of wider society is approved as responsible organizational behaviour

> fosters social cohesion

(EIC Advisory Group Survey May 26, 2020)

SA6 – General Leadership Development (Academic employees)

Carleton commits to ensuring EDI elements are valued and integrated throughout its leadership programming as well as in its processes of recruitment, retention, appointment and promotion.

- 1. Led by the Provost and VP Academic, a Working Group on recruitment in collaboration with the relevant bargaining units shall be created to recommend institutional guidance for best practices. Such practices will reflect:
 - a. principles of transparency,
 - b. EDI-informed interpretations of undefined language and terms including "best" candidate, candidate "excellence", candidate "fit", and "service". This may include but is not limited to reference to definitions within the Tri-Council Dimensions Charter and the San Francisco Dora Declaration.
 - c. Value and weighting ascribed to community-based and community-engaged research.
 - d. the desirability of collecting employment equity disaggregated demographic data at the application stage in accordance with leading sector standards that comply with privacy and human rights standards.
 - e. An assessment of additional human and financial resources necessary to realize best practices.
- CU will acquire / design and make available education and professional development to all academic and non-academic staff in the areas of Unconscious Bias, Inclusive Leadership, Recruiting for Difference, and human rights and equity. This will also be reflected in a review of the content and activities of the Carleton Leader initiative.
- 3. CU will encourage uptake of education and professional development as described in paragraph 2 by integrating and connecting these offerings to criteria used to appoint Directors, Deans, Associate Vice-Presidents, and Vice-Presidents. EDI-based criteria including specific professional development programs used to appoint other academic leadership positions within the collective agreement will be approved through bargaining processes.
- 4. Each faculty will be invited to establish and formalize sponsorship programs for faculty members from underrepresented demographic groups in the early stages of their career. Sponsorship programs pair a leader or a more senior faculty member with someone at an early stage in their career to provide professional development and career advancement advice and advocacy.

(Provost and VP Academic, AVP Teaching and Learning, Deputy Provost Academic Operations and Planning, Deans, AVP EIC)

Interdependencies: Policy and Procedure on Academic Hiring, CUASA Executive, CUPE 4600 Executive.

"We need to dismantle the way scholarship is valued and evaluated. Journal articles, conference presentations, etc. Indigenous faculty do a tremendous amount of community work that doesn't result in a journal article because that's meaningless in their community. The CUASA collective agreements value traditional valuation. Change needs to come from senior leaders."

(Public Consultation – Staff and Faculty Feedback)

CU possesses a caring culture is a hallmark for many but "pervasive microaggressions" experienced by all equity-seeking groups among faculty and staff estates indicates **need** for systematic EDI education and professional development across campus for staff and faculty

There are disadvantages for equity-seeking faculty members in the application of tenure and promotion processes.

(EIC Advisory Group Survey May 26, 2020)

SA7 – Disaggregated Demographic Data Collection

"Good data lead to good decisions" remarked the Honorable Navdeep Bains, Minister of Science, Innovation and Industry during Carleton University's 2nd Annual Inclusion Week. In order to understand the representation, experiences and perspectives of employees and students needed to inform the design of equitable and inclusive services, build supports and enhance outcomes, Carleton will collect disaggregated demographic data.

- CU will prepare Implementation Plans for the collection of demographic data relating to Gender Identity, Racialized Persons, Indigenous Persons, Persons with Disabilities and Sexual Orientation on a disaggregated, intersectional basis. The Plans shall consider current and proposed changes to disaggregated data collection by Statistics Canada and higher education sector best practices while also respecting privacy considerations. Office of Institutional Research and Planning (OIRP) support is anticipated but 3rd party contracted data collection may also be considered. The support of Information Technology Services will be critical.
 - a. The plan for students will be proposed, socialized, and approved in Phase 1 (Equity Policy Committee, President and Vice-Chancellor)
 - b. The plan for employees will be proposed, socialized, approved and piloted as a voluntary initiative in Phase 1.
 (President and Vice-Chancellor, Joint Committee on Employment Equity, Equity Policy Committee)

EDI data collection is limited at CU and accompanied by institutional resistance to ask deeper questions and engage in more honest conversations. (EIC Advisory Group Survey May 26, 2020)

Carleton University is a public institution with a duty to its constituents. We thus call for a commitment to generate accurate disaggregated data on the racial backgrounds of <u>students</u>, faculty members, and other employees. This data is essential to identify any systemic problems that may inform the recruitment, retention, and graduation rates of Black, Indigenous, and People of Colour at Carleton. (Community Letter – Addressing Systemic Racism, July 8, 2020)

In a November 2019 Universities Canada survey of EDI practices among member institutions, 77% collected self-ID data with more than two options for gender, 56% collected disaggregated data on ethnicity or origin, 54% collected disaggregated data on Indigenous identity, 58% collected disaggregated data on disability, and 33% indicated they collect disaggregated data on sexual orientation.

"To understand the current context and set targets to improve, institutions need to collect self-identification data... It is important to collect disaggregated data to understand differences and potential inequalities within a group." In May 2020, Carleton's Equity Policy Committee has committed to developing an operational proposal to bring disaggregated data collection for students and employees at the university.

SA8 – Representation and Outreach

Attention to EDI in the form of equitable and inclusive representation throughout Carleton University, its students, staff, and instructors, heightens student success and enhances a sense of belonging and community. But this effort does not stop at the borders of our campus, and requires the university to actively reach out to the broader communities to support change, to learn and to dismantle structural underrepresentation.

1. For employees. CU will socialize its intention to establish and publish employment equity goals having regard to labour market availability and Carleton student disaggregated demographic representation.

This will not preclude faculties and administrative divisions from proactively initiating EDIrelated hiring and outreach initiatives.

Among examples at Carleton, we acknowledge the approval within FASS for the intended academic posting in Human Rights for a specialist in Blackness, precarity and labour. Interdependencies: SA7

 For students. CU will socialize its intention to establish and publish recruitment and retention goals for underrepresented student populations having regard to the population proportions in the most recent National Household Survey (disaggregated demographic information) as well as circumstances of historical and present marginalization. This will not preclude faculties and administrative Divisions from proactively initiating EDIrelated recruitment and outreach initiatives. Interdependencies: SA7

CU should pursue greater diverse representation at decision-making tables + work to resolve disconnect between student demography on the one hand and representation among staff / faculty on the other.

Attention to EDI, in the form of increased diversity of representation among instructors, heightens student success through role-modeling.

(EIC Advisory Group Survey May 26, 2020)

SA9 – Culture

Strengthening our shared values and beliefs and learning to increasingly manifest these in our individual behaviours and institutional practices will grow the trust and sense of belonging so critical for success at the university. As we expand our ability to create environments free from discrimination and harassment, Carleton will build spaces of psychological safety, enabling all to fulfill their emotional, educational and professional potential.

- CU will develop "Understanding Human Rights and the CU Human Rights Complaints Procedure" workshops and infographics for the benefit of faculty and non-academic employees. The subject-matter scope of this initiative will include anti-racism and microaggressions. The workshop will be integrated into Human Resource processes fostering and identifying talent as described in SA5 and SA6. (Deputy Provost Academic Operations and Planning, AVP Human Resources, OQI and AVP, EIC).
- 2. As part of undergraduate course registration or alternatively, through the orientation process, all first-year students will complete an online module in EDI and human rights. The module will take an intersectional approach to concerns of oppression and marginalization as it relates to gender identity and expression, Racialization including Anti-Black racism, religious belief, ability, sexual orientation and Indigeneity. Further discussion with graduate students will be held to determine the appropriateness of the module as part of their orientation. The module will be acquired and customized as necessary to meet the needs of the university. The acquisition together with any prior consultation will be approved in Phase 1. (Office of Vice-President Students and Enrollment, Vice-President Finance and Administration, Information Technology Services, with content support from EIC).
- 3. The President, VPFA, Provost and VP Academic, General Counsel, University Secretary and the AVP EIC shall meet to establish a process to strike a working group to review and revise the CU Human Rights Policy. The Working Group shall be created in Phase 1.
- 4. As an interim measure and pending review of the Human Rights Policy, the following Interpretative Guidance shall be provided forthwith to selected provisions of Part V of the policy relating to conflict resolution and complaint. The selected provisions are attached as Schedule A.
 - a. Paragraphs 8 and 27 may have been historically interpreted as requiring informal resolution in all cases prior to the making of a formal complaint. However, contemporary theories of Alternate Dispute Resolution (ADR) do not support the use of informal resolution or mediation in circumstances where consent to the process has not been freely given.

<u>INTERPRETATIVE GUIDANCE (paragraphs 8 and 27)</u>: An informal resolution shall be deemed attempted when the person affected by impugned conduct or behaviour indicates in writing to the appropriate university official that they have reviewed the provisions related to informal resolution and wish to proceed to a formal complaint.

b. By virtue of their functional roles at Carleton University, Paragraph 31 establishes nine Complaint Managers. Complaint Managers assume file responsibilities once the matter has been determined as satisfying jurisdictional and substantive criteria set in paragraphs 11 and 13 ("initial determination"). These file responsibilities include the management of the complaint and response document exchange process as well as the authority to determine whether a formal complaint should be investigated. It is notable that Complaint Managers are not required to have human rights or administrative law expertise; and further that they are required to, in effect, review their own factual analysis when deciding to refer for investigation. In addition, the existence of nine complaint managers heightens the prospect for inconsistencies in approach and decision-making. The overall effect of this process design tends to unfairly burden the complaint manager and constrains the full independent assessment of complaints on the merits.

<u>INTERPRETATIVE GUIDANCE (paragraphs 31 and 33)</u>: Having met the criteria for an initial determination, the complaints manager is strongly urged in all cases to appoint an internal or external investigator with human rights and administrative law experience at the expiry of the time to exchange complaint and response. This is consistent with best practices and other university process design under the Sexual Violence Policy. General Counsel and the AVP EIC will work together to create a list of qualified investigators.

 Separate Training should be developed to offer complaint managers, Chairs and Deans on the procedure within the Human Rights Policy having regard to the Interpretive Guidance set out above.

Caring culture is a hallmark for many at CU, but the "pervasive microaggressions" experienced by all equity-seeking groups among faculty and staff estates indicates **need** for systematic EDI education and professional development across campus for staff and faculty

"Shocking bias and attitudes" are overheard by students even in women's studies and human rights courses. The "bigotry and inequity" in the broader culture brought to campus by students indicates **need for mandatory EDI training for all first years.**"

"Established institutions like Carleton face challenges acknowledging the existence of systemic racism leading to inequities."

"We call for mandatory course in Indigenous Studies within all programs."

"There is a need for an EDI review of all policies."

Attention to EDI:

- reduces discrimination / harassment and advances movement towards social justice in which all have fair opportunity
- increases sense of physical and psychological safety

(EIC Advisory Group Survey May 26, 2020)

Call for an anti-racism mandatory educational requirement to be completed by all firstyear students. (Anti-Racism on Campuses Collective June 6, 2020)

Filler and the second

SA10 – EDI Planning, Infrastructure and Reporting

To fulfill promises made to our community and ensure our ambitious and critical plans are implemented, Carleton recognizes the need for human and financial resources, the assignment of accountabilities and regular reporting from all faculties and VP portfolios to measure progress. Each Faculty and VP portfolio will be invited to design and implement individual EDI Area Action Plans that reflect area circumstances. In the final years, Carleton will assess our institutional successes and opportunities through an Employment Systems and Culture Review.

- At the request of the President and Provost, the AVP EIC will lead a process of consultation surrounding these strategic actions among, staff, faculty, students and the Board of Governors with a view to securing community, and ultimately university, approval for an EDI Strategic Plan.
- 2. The Faculties (including the Library) and Administrative Service Divisions (VPSE, VPFA, VPRI, Provost and Vice-President (Academic) will designate a representative to collect information and report on challenges / risks and areas of progress towards these strategic actions as applicable to their respective areas on an annual basis.
- 3. CU will establish the permanent role of Senior Advisor, Strategic Initiatives reporting to the Assistant Vice-President, Equity and Inclusive Communities to support the implementation and measurement of these Strategic Actions, conduct internal and external environmental scans, literature reviews, co-lead consultations and undertake applied research.
- 4. CU will establish the permanent role of Communications Specialist within Department of University Communications to, among other responsibilities, create an EDI communications plan including the creation of a social media and other digital presence / platforms for the university / EIC, and support the launch of an Annual EDI report on the progress of the university against the Strategic Actions.
- 5. CU will fund the maintenance of a contract graduate student Information Officer position reporting the AVP EIC to gather and organize EDI-related research and data into an ongoing literature review.
- 6. CU will recruit an EDI Learning Specialist reporting to the AVP EIC with a structured relationship to the AVP Teaching and Learning to:
 - a. Deliver advisory EDI programming for faculty and instructors supporting decolonized, anti-racist and inclusive pedagogical practices and curricular development.
 - b. Provide support and advice in the creation, enhancement and evaluation of EDI professional development and leadership programs for non-academic employees and students.
- 7. The selection, design, use and construction of all physical spaces shall consider EDI at planning and execution stages. The provision reinforces the relevant provisions of the Coordinated Accessibility Strategy and the Kinàmàgawin Report.
- 8. Others infrastructural and resource needs as described in and required by these Strategic Actions.

While the document is wide-ranging and well-articulated, there are concerns that the commitment is not there from senior administration and faculty to see this through. Concerns persist that this is a "check box" excercise.

Commitment to transparency. Even if things don't work out

The recommendations in the document provide an excellent framework for moving EDI forward as a central plank of Carleton's mission. The challenges I see are more to do with implementation and resourcing, ensuring that we are proactively addressing the most challenging and difficult barriers to full inclusion in our campus community.

(Public Consultations – Staff and Faculty feedback)

Mounting an adequate institutional response to the challenges of EDI requires investment of additional resources (human and financial) and long-term commitment.

- *Communications:*
 - Newsroom content doesn't reflect diversity either by topics or individuals featured
 - students are not regularly or adequately informed as to EDI progress or steps taken to address issues

There is uneven attention to EDI across campus as well as disconnects and silos among those who are attentive to its requirements.

(EIC Advisory Group Survey May 26, 2020)

PHASE 2 (YEARS 3 TO 5)

(Phase 1 commitments are implemented and permanent and need not be repeated)

SA1 – Pedagogy and Curriculum

- Subject to approval in the collective bargaining process, criteria for the selection of Annual Achievement Awards for faculty members and librarians will be developed and published including EDI-related criteria such as evidence of inclusive pedagogical and curricular practice.
- 2. CU in collaboration with relevant bargaining unit committees will review Teaching Evaluations with a view to reflecting key indicators of instructor attention to EDI in accordance with their Collective Agreements. These indicators may include efforts to incorporate various cultural perspectives on the subject matter within syllabi, diverse guest speakers, fair and equitable promotion of in class participation regardless of student demographic identity etc.
- 3. Learning Analytics primary goal is to better understand and improve the learning experiences of students through the collection and analysis of relevant data. Recognizing the growing literature around the experiences of racialized students in higher education, it will be important to link disaggregated and learning analytics data to assist in ensuring curricular and pedagogical approaches are sensitive to EDI.
- 4. CU will continue implementing a process to ensure Quality Reviews for new and existing programs require proponents to demonstrate how the proposed program contributes to the expansion of decolonization, equity, diversity and inclusivity at the university.

SA3 – Research

- 1. The research cluster will be established by the end of Year 2.
- CU will continue to promote EDI-related interdisciplinary collaborations using the EDI Research Database which will be updated continuously by the Faculties in conjunction with OVPRI.
- 3. The first Graduate and Undergraduate EDI Scholarship Awards shall be announced at the end of Year 3. The first Award for Distinguished EDI Scholarship shall be announced at the end of Year 5.
- 4. In collaboration with the Faculties, OVPRI will develop a communication strategy to ensure that EDI research results are published widely and, where applicable, are made available to communities for whom the research would be relevant.

SA5 – General Leadership Development (Non-Academic Employees)

1. Implement institutional policies and plans for EDI best practices and criteria in recruitment, retention and promotion procedures and practices, SA5(1).

SA6 – General Leadership Development (Academic Employees)

- Led by the Provost and VP Academic, a Working Group on tenure, promotion and confirmation in collaboration with the Faculty Association shall be created to recommend institutional guidance for best practices. Such practices will reflect:
 - a. principles of transparency,
 - b. EDI-informed interpretations of undefined language and terms including "best" candidate, candidate "excellence", candidate "fit" and "service". This may include but is not limited to reference to definitions within the Tri-Council Dimensions Charter and the San Francisco Dora Declaration.
 - c. Value and weighting ascribed to community-based and community-engaged research.
 - d. the desirability of collecting employment equity disaggregated demographic data on progression through the academic ranks in accordance with leading sector standards that comply with privacy and human rights standards.
 - e. An assessment of additional human and financial resources necessary to realize best practices.

This is subject to approval through the bargaining process.

(Provost and VP Academic, AVP Teaching and Learning, Deputy Provost Academic Operations and Planning, AVP EIC) Interdependencies: Policy and Procedure on Academic Hiring, CUASA Executive, CUPE 4600

SA7 – Disaggregated Demographic Data Collection

Executive.

- 1. The implementation Plan for employees at SA7 will be complete and the census made mandatory by the start of Year 4 (with the option that employees may indicate their preference not to answer all individual questions).
- 2. The implementation plan for students at SA7 will be complete and a pilot census launched by the start of Year 3 (with the option that students may indicate their preference not to answer all individual questions). The student census will become mandatory at the start of Year 4 (with the option that students may indicate their preference not to answer all individual questions). Privacy around the data shall be maintained kept confidential and anonymized data sets may only be used by OIRP and EIC to inform the development of student equity programs and supports.

SA8 – Representation and Outreach

- Employment equity goals will be reviewed and revised by the beginning of Year 4 having regard to representation gaps identified in disaggregated demographic data from SA7. Goals will be assessed having regard to Statistics Canada labour market availability and demographic representation among Carleton students. In year 5, progress towards this strategic action may be evaluated. Goals should be set at the institutional level as well as at faculty and Divisional levels.
- 2. For students. Recruitment and retention goals for underrepresented groups will be established by the end of Year 5 having regard to disaggregated demographic data in the most recent Statistics Canada National Household Survey as well as circumstances of historical and present marginalization. In collaboration with OVPSE, each faculty will establish Outreach Plans to achieve Year 5 goals. In later years, progress towards this strategic action may be evaluated.

SA9 – Culture

- 1. The Working Group will begin and complete the review of the Human Rights Policy by the end of year 5. Pending its completion, the Interpretation Guidance in Phase 1, SA9 will continue.
- 2. The mandatory online module for all first-year students referenced in Phase 1, SA9 will be delivered to the first cohort by the start of year 3.

SA10 – EDI Planning, Infrastructure and Reporting

- 1. Phase 1, SA10 will be completed and implemented on a permanent basis by the start of Year 3.
- 2. Each faculty and VP Division will be invited to design and implement individual EDI Area Action Plans that reflect area circumstances. Area EDI plans should consider the Strategic Action themes identified in phase 1 above, customized as applicable to meet specific area needs.
- 3. CU will devise and conduct a university-wide EDI employment systems and culture review based on, but not limited to the model undertaken by Campus Safety Services referred to in SA5 with a view to supporting the development of inclusive communities for faculty, staff and students at Carleton. (AVP HR, AVP EIC, DPAOP, Bargaining Unit heads)