NSERC CREATE Heritage Engineering: Workshop on Ethics and Heritage Conservation

Thursday, April 27, 2017, 9:00am-12:30pm

Location: Carleton Immersive Media Studio, 4th floor, VSIM Building, Carleton University

INTRODUCTION

This workshop on ethics and heritage conservation examines ethical behavior relative to the paying client, the public, colleagues, community and the object of the practitioner's work. Professional codes of ethics have been created internationally for those involved in heritage conservation, ranging from museums to intangible cultural heritage. In Canada, there are codes of ethics for archaeologists, conservators and heritage professionals guided by the principles outlined by ICOMOS. The formulation and treatment of important themes within these documents can provide useful guidance in thinking about possible ethical stances in various contexts or situations.

Current practice in heritage conservation offers examples of challenging ethical situations. Heritage consultants are sometimes required to provide the advice that paying clients desire that in fact negate heritage significance and justify destruction of recognized historic places. On other occasions, political pressure from elected officials over-rules the professional commitment of heritage planners to care for heritage. In other cases, professionals who carry out work for clients are unable to share their reports with successor consultants because of perceived confidentiality and ownership of such materials.

The workshop presents case studies that illustrate ethical problems encountered in practice, followed by contexts, guidelines and principles for an ethical approach to heritage conservation. Participants will be encouraged to comment on the theory and practical examples and to suggest other approaches to address these situations.

Item	Speaker	Time
1. Welcome and Introductions	Mario Santana, Director, NSERC CREATE Heritage Engineering	9:00 – 9:05am
2. Brief Introduction to Ethics & Conservation*	Susan Ross, Professor, School of Indigenous & Canadian Studies, Carleton University	9:05 – 9:15am
3. Part I – Case Studies	Chair: Christina Cameron, Professor, School of Architecture, University of Montréal	9:15 – 9:30am











NSERC CREATE HERITAGE ENGINEERING PROGRAM

A.	Basilica of Santa Maria of Manresa, Spain* This case study raises ethical issues regarding the professional conduct of conservators in terms of acquiring knowledge and showing respect for heritage values. Situated high on a towering cliff dominating the view of Manresa and the river, the Basilica of Santa Maria is one of the great gothic churches of Catalonia. The exterior of this 14th-century cathedral is austere and the interior has a wide nave with eight bays of tall octagonal columns with a clerestory of large, decorated gothic windows that emphasize its height. A recent structural intervention in the interior reveals differences of professional opinion with regard to technical approaches.	Mariana Esponda, Professor, Azrieli School of Architecture, Carleton University	9:30 – 9:45am
В.	Kakadu National Park World Heritage Site* This case study raises ethical issues regarding responsibilities to the heritage object and respect for indigenous culture. Kakadu National Park is a unique archaeological and ethnological reserve located in the Northern Territory of Australia, inhabited continuously for more than 40,000 years. The cave paintings, rock carvings and archaeological sites record the skills and way of life of the region's inhabitants, from the hunter-gatherers of prehistoric times to the Aboriginal people still living there. It is a unique example of a complex of ecosystems and provides a habitat for a wide range of rare or endemic species of plants and animals. The 1997 proposal for a uranium mine within an enclave of the site raised several ethical concerns from a conservation perspective and a cultural perspective.	Christina Cameron, Professor, School of Architecture, University of Montreal	9:45 – 10:00am
C.	14 Blevins and Regent Park, Toronto* 14 Blevins was a residential tower in Regent Park, Toronto, designed by Peter Dickinson. It was supposed to be the one element of the original public housing development that would be conserved. Instead, it was recently demolished. This case involves development pressures, community perceptions and voices, and formal architectural value. This example will examine the feasibility analysis for the conservation of the tower, the conclusions that were reached, and the community-led petition that followed to demolish the building. It shows how practitioners must listen to, and work more effectively with, marginalized communities. It illustrates one approach to negotiating conflicting issues in an ethical manner.	Victoria Angel, Associate, ERA Architects Inc., Toronto	10:00 – 10:15am











CREATE HERITAGE ENGINEERING PROGRAM

D. Questions and Discussion		10:15 – 10:30am
4. Short break	Coffee, tea & snacks	10:30 – 10:45am
5. Part II – Contexts, Guidelines, Theory	Chair: Susan Ross	
A. Overview of Key Canadian & International Conservation Codes of Ethics/Conduct * Including the developing context of indigenous rights and heritage in Canada and Truth & Reconciliation Commission "calls to action" related to Education, Language & Culture, Museums & Archives, Missing Children & Burial Information, Commemoration, etc.	Susan Ross, Professor, School of Indigenous & Canadian Studies, Carleton University	10:45 - 11:00am
B. Thematic presentations of Codes or Statements of Principles		
a. ICOMOS Ethical Principles*	Dinu Bumbaru, Policy Director, Heritage Montreal	11:00 - 11:15am
b. Professional Ethics for Conservation Engineers**	John Cooke, J.G.Cooke & Assoc. (TBC)	11:15 – 11:30am
c. Sustainability/Environmental Ethics for Conservation**	Susan Ross, Professor, Carleton University	11:30 – 11:45am
d. Heritage Tourism & the Angkor Visitor Code of Conduct*	Christina Cameron, Professor, University of Montreal	11:45am – 12:00pm
6. Closing remarks	Mario Santana Susan Ross Christina Cameron	12:00 – 12:30pm

^{*} List of reference documents attached.









^{**} Reference documents to be identified and distributed.

REFERENCE DOCUMENTS

Tracy Ireland and John Schofield, editors, *The Ethics of Cultural Heritage,* Springer, 2015 – available as an online PDF or ebook through CU library.

Harold Kalman, "2.2. Ethics," Heritage Planning: Principles and Process, pp. 114-135.

ICOMOS Ethical Principles, 2014

Adopted by the 18th General Assembly (Florence, 2014) to replace the Ethical Commitment Statement adopted by the 13th General Assembly (Madrid, 2002).

https://www.icomos.org/images/DOCUMENTS/Secretariat/2015/GA_2014_results/20150114-ethics-asadopted-languagecheck-finalcirc.pdf

Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, *Calls to Action*, 2015. http://www.trc.ca/websites/trcinstitution/File/2015/Findings/Calls_to_Action_English2.pdf

APSARA National Authority, *Angkor Visitor Code of Conduct.* http://apsaraauthority.gov.kh/?page=detail&ctype=article&id=1758&lg=en

Canadian Association of Heritage Professionals (CAHP), *Code of Professional Conduct and Ethics* (first three sections on qualifications, professionalism and responsibility to colleagues, employers and clients). http://cahp-acecp.ca/code-of-professional-conduct-and-ethics/

Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies, "Guidelines for Ethical research in Australian Indigenous Studies".

http://aiatsis.gov.au/research/ethical-research/guidelines-ethical-research-australian-indigenous-studies

Canadian Archaeological Association, "Principles of Ethical Conduct" and "Statement of Principles for Ethical Conduct Pertaining to Aboriginal Peoples".

http://canadianarchaeology.com/caa/about/ethics/principles-ethical-conduct

https://canadianarchaeology.com/caa/about/ethics/statement-principles-ethical-conduct-pertaining-aboriginal-peoples

UN World Tourism Organization (UNWTO), "Global Code of Ethics for Tourism". http://ethics.unwto.org/en/content/global-code-ethics-tourism

UNESCO Intangible Cultural Heritage code of ethics. http://www.unesco.org/culture/ich/en/background-of-the-ethical-principles-00867

Case study references to 14 Blevins and Regent Park:

https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2013/11/11/14 blevins a monument to our pattern of failure hume.

https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2015/11/18/preserving-regent-parks-history-amid-revitalization.html







