

**LAWS 4106**                      **Law and Violence**  
**PREREQUISITES:**            **Fourth year honours standing or graduate student – strictly enforced**  
**TERM:**                            **Fall 2019**  
**Date, Time, Room:**        **Section B: Thursdays 11:35-2:25    Richcraft Hall 3224**  
   **Section A: Fridays      11:35–2:25    Southam Hall 413**

**PROFESSOR:**                **Dr. Amy Bartholomew**

**CONTACT**  
**Office:**                        **D585 LA (Loeb)**

**Office Hours:**              **Thursdays 3:00-4:00 or 4:30 if people are waiting to see me.**

**Email:**                        **Amy\_Bartholomew@carleton.ca**  
**Telephone:**                 **613-520-2600 x. 3696**

---

---

Calendar Description:

Examination of how law defines, justifies, and addresses individual, collective and state violence: contemporary and historical case studies; theoretical inquiries into the relationship between law, legality and different forms of violence.

Prerequisite(s): (at least) fourth-year Honours standing.

Seminar three hours a week.

The Fall 2019 iteration of “Law and Violence” will concentrate on law, violence, and resistance by considering refugee and migrant camps and prisons, and various forms of resistance, including civil disobedience and political violence, on the one hand, and experiments in resistance, including anarchist-refugee squats, on the other. We will use theoretical contributions (principally Arendt, Habermas, Foucault, and Barga) to explore the implications of such spaces and resistances.

**Required Text:** You are required to obtain the book just below. It is available at Octopus Books (3d Avenue, just off Bank St., in the Glebe). The remainder of the readings are usually available through e-journals (on the library website). Any that aren’t will be provided to you as pdf’s; this is indicated with a “\*” prior to the title.

Barga, Banu. *Starve and Immolate: The Politics of Human Weapons*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2014. We will read the first part of it in the 3d week of seminar and the remainder in the 11<sup>th</sup> week.

### SEMINAR:

This is a fourth year honours seminar. As a seminar, **there will be virtually no lecture component.** I view it as an intensive ‘reading seminar’ or ‘reading group’ the success of which is dependent on you, each member of the seminar, as well as on me. I will attempt to guide the discussion where I think it needs guidance. I will also set the context for debates, where necessary, and, of course, I will let you know when I think your or other seminar participants’ interpretations of the literature and issues require reconsideration. But, **this seminar is a *completely collective project*** for which we are all responsible and it should be embraced as such by each of you. **If you do not wish to be an active participant in a seminar in which you seriously study and discuss both theoretical and grounded literature, please don’t take this one!**

**You absolutely must read all required readings, carefully, for the seminar, before the seminar.** The success of a seminar depends on informed, lively, and critical student participation. Regular attendance in seminar is necessary, but not sufficient, to constitute participation. The participation mark is a hefty 25% of your overall mark so please make the most of it. The foundation for informed participation (not to mention evaluation and critique) is close **study** of the readings before the seminar in which they are assigned, coming to seminar with your readings and your **summaries** of the material along with questions and evaluations to be addressed in seminar.

### EVALUATION:

Evaluation will be based on the following combination of seminar participation and written work, as follows:

#### **1. Participation mark based on weekly seminar participation including discussion leadership. 25%**

The participation mark is a *composite mark* evaluating your performance over the entire term with respect to discussion leadership, weekly seminar participation, and discussion of the literature on the basis of summaries prepared for seminar each week. You are expected to participate in seminar on the basis of having read and reflected seriously on the literature and issues each week. Please come to seminar **with your readings, your summary** of the readings (see below), **and a question, an objection, or an issue** you would like to discuss **and** be prepared to discuss it with the seminar. Our discussion will focus on making sense of and evaluating the claims the literature makes.

You will be asked to lead the discussion with others at least one week during the term. The discussion leadership schedule will be determined early in the term. You will also be asked to be part of a less formal group of “especially well-prepared participants” each week.

#### **2. Seven weekly summaries of the readings handed in in seminar. 25%**

**Each week’s summaries is worth 3.5% except for week 11 which is worth 5%.**

Please prepare a summary (not an outline) of *each reading* for weeks 2 through 11. The summary of each reading should (ideally) be no longer than 1 page (single-spaced) but exceptions are noted in the weeks below. *You must include a proper citation and your name.* You must also use proper citation method in your summaries. Also, pose at least one question (on any of the readings) for the seminar possibly to address. Put this on a *separate sheet*, typed out twice, with your name on each half so you can hand one copy to me and one to your discussion group. You may use the summary to inform your seminar participation and then hand it in to me at the end of each seminar. I will mark the summaries as 3.5, 2.5, 2, 1, or, 0. They are for your preparation for seminar, for discussion, to develop low risk writing habits, and they will help you prepare for and write the essay and take-home examination.

**You must write summaries on weeks 2, 3, 5, 7, 10, 11. These weeks are indicated in red font to remind you. The remaining (7<sup>th</sup>) summary may be written for any other week except week 12.**

**Late summaries will not be accepted.** You may submit a summary **once** during the term by email attachment by the beginning of the seminar. The remainder must be turned in during seminar. This is a strict requirement. When submitting your summary (once) by email, you must put 4106 A or B (depending on which section you are in) in the subject line. Otherwise, I won't be responsible for it.

I will return summaries to you two weeks after you have submitted them.

**LATE REGISTRANTS:** Please note that you will require evidence that you registered late in the seminar to be excused early absences and must submit missed summaries one week after your late registration.

**3. 1 voluntary short essay** 10 pages maximum double-spaced (about 3000 words excluding endnotes) **25%**

The **essay** must be written on Week 7 readings approached through the lens of either week 5 or week 6 readings (i.e. through Arendt, Foucault, or Mbembe). **Due Friday 31 October before 4pm in the Law Dept. Drop Box.**

Because the essay is voluntary, late essays **NOT** will be accepted unless you discuss the matter with me *ahead of time* and have a *very good reason*.

The short essays should **evaluate** some aspect of the **literature** for the relevant week(s). Your evaluation must be based on a clear and concise demonstration that you understand the literature but it must go beyond mere description or summary of the literature. The paper should be conceptual in nature, not merely empirical. The short essays will be marked on the basis of **demonstrated understanding of the main themes in all of the literature for that essay**, the thoughtfulness of the issue(s) chosen for consideration, and the evaluation **and argument** provided. Writing style, grammar, proper citation etc. will count in your mark.

Please provide a title page for your essay that includes your name, student number, date, course Number, and my name. Please number your pages.

4. **Take-home examination or research essay 25% or 50% (if you choose to opt out of the short essay). Due Monday, December 16 by 4pm, deposited in the Law Dropbox.** Late essays will result in failure in the course in the absence of a medical or other excuse accepted by me.

The **take-home examination** will be distributed in the final seminar. The take home examination will pose a question and ask you to integrate and assess the literature we have read and discussed this term. You will not be required to do outside research for the examination. But, you will be expected to have mastered a wide swath of the literature. The exam answer should be approximately 3000 words (about 8 double spaced pages) and no longer than 4000 words (about 10 pp double spaced, Times New Roman 12).

You may do a **research essay** instead of the take home examination. If you choose this option please clear the subject with me by November 8/9. The research essay must draw on an area of research related to the course. You will be required to do research beyond the readings in the course. The essay must be original to this course. The research essay should be about 4500 words (about 15 pp. double spaced) and no more than 6000 words (about 20 pages) not including endnotes.

**GENERAL RULES:**

**Failure to complete any aspect of the requirements may result in failure in the course.** Failure to submit the final exam or research essay on time *will* result in failure.

**Plagiarism will not be tolerated. There is a zero tolerance policy on plagiarism which means that any act of plagiarism – whether intentional or inadvertent – will be taken directly to the Dean.**

The OED (Oxford English Dictionary) defines plagiarism as follows: “The action or practice of taking someone else's work, idea, etc., and passing it off as one's own; literary theft.”<sup>1</sup> Plagiarism includes failing to use quotation marks around quoted material, even if one provides a citation, or providing an inadequate citation such as failing to provide a page number for quoted material.

In addition to Carleton’s site on plagiarism, a very useful source is:

<http://www.writing.utoronto.ca/advice/using-sources/how-not-to-plagiarize>

"Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor subject to the approval of the Faculty Dean. This means that grades submitted by the instructor may be subject to revision. No grades are final until they have been approved by the Dean."

---

<sup>1</sup> “Plagiarism, n,” *Oxford English Dictionary*. Third Edition, June 2006.

## SEMINAR SCHEDULE

(Schedule may be changed during the term. I will announce any major schedule or reading changes in the seminar that precedes the one with the change and will follow that up with an email on culearn.)

### Week 1: Administrivia      5/6 September

In next week's seminar I will ask each of you to give me a list of discussion leadership preferences. Please list 3 preferences by week (not by reading) in writing with your name on the list. If you would like to work with a particular student group, list that as your preference (and that will take precedence over week selection).

### **Week 2: Introduction to the Issues: The Contemporary "Barbed-Wire Labyrinth"**<sup>2</sup> 12/13 September

In week two's seminar we will canvass some forms of detention and resistance to it, ask what (if anything) legitimates states' use of detention and its associated forms of domination (and, possibly, violence)? What are the similarities between refugee detention camps and prisons? What are some dissimilarities? What forms of resistance do detainees deploy? How legitimate do you think those forms are? How possibly effective? In general, what is your preliminary assessment of the condition of humanity today, taking these matters into account?

**Please write** a two-three page, single spaced (max) *reflection* on some of the issues raised in the readings, naming authors by name (e.g. "Kadletz argues..."). While all of the readings are required, you must reflect, at least, on Pitzer, Kadletz, Dunn, Haralambous, and Page in your reflection short paper. Include one question for the seminar to discuss. **Print the question twice with your name on it. You will hand one copy of the question to me when you enter seminar.** You must also bring your written reflection to seminar for discussion and then hand it to me at the end of seminar.

#### **Required readings and listenings:**

Pitzer, Andrea. "'Some Suburb of Hell': America's New Concentration Camp System," *New York Review of Books*, 21 June 2019. <https://www.nybooks.com/daily/2019/06/21/some-suburb-of-hell-americas-new-concentration-camp-system/>

Holpuch, Amanda. "Revealed: Man Force-Fed in ICE Custody at Risk Due to 'Substandard Care', Doctor Says," *The Guardian*, 30 August 2019. <https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2019/aug/30/ajay-kumar-hunger-strike-asylum-seeker-us-detention>

Kadletz, Brunna. "Displaced, Dispossessed, Disposable." *NewsDeeply*, 6 July 2016. <https://www.newsdeeply.com/refugees/community/2016/07/26/displaced-dispossessed-and-disposable>

---

<sup>2</sup> Hannah Arendt, *The Origins of Totalitarianism*, New Edition with Added Prefaces. New York: Harcourt, 1968, originally published 1951, 292.

Haralambous, Chloe. “Making Live and Letting Die: ‘Refugees,’ ‘Migrants,’ and Fortress Europe.” *rs21*, 16 October 2015. <http://rs21.org.uk/2015/10/16/making-live-and-letting-die-refugees-migrants-and-fortress-europe/>

Dunn, Elizabeth. “The Failure of Refugee Camps.” *Boston Review*, 28 September 2015. <http://bostonreview.net/editors-picks-world/elizabeth-dunn-failure-refugee-camps>

Smith, Helena and Patrick Kingsley, “Far Right Group Attacks Refugee Camp on Greek Island of Chios.” *The Guardian*, 18 November 2016. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/nov/18/far-right-group-attacks-refugee-camp-greek-island-chios>

Kingsley, Patrick, “Better to Drown’: A Greek Refugee Camp’s Epidemic of Misery,” *New York Times*, 2 October 2018. <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/10/02/world/europe/greece-lesbos-moria-refugees.html>

Tondo, Lorenzo. “Nearly 900,000 asylum seekers living in limbo in EU, figures show,” *The Guardian*, 25 August 2019, <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/aug/25/asylum-seekers-limbo-eu-countries>

Page, Tiffany. “Self-Immolation and Asylum in Australia: ‘This is how tired we are’.” *Open Democracy*, 18 August 2016. <https://www.opendemocracy.net/5050/tiffany-page/self-immolation-and-asylum-in-australia-this-is-how-tired-we-are>

Doherty, Ben. “Nauru self-harm ‘contagion’ as 12-year-old refugee tries to set herself alight,” 25 August 2018. <https://www.theguardian.com/australia-news/2018/aug/23/nauru-self-harm-contagion-as-12-year-old-refugee-tries-to-set-herself-alight>

Cwienk, Jeannette, “Refugees Sent to Libya under EU Deal Face ‘Catastrophic’ Conditions,” *DW*, 15 July 2019, <https://www.dw.com/en/refugees-sent-to-libya-under-eu-deal-face-catastrophic-conditions/a-49602120>

Jawad, Rana. “Migrant Crisis: Self-immolation exposes UN failures in Libya,” *BBC News*, 31 July 2019, <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-49154959>

Richard Skretteberg, “The Rohingya: Trapped in the World’s Largest Refugee Camp,” Norwegian Refugee Council, 25 August 2019, <https://www.nrc.no/perspectives/2019/trapped-in-the-worlds-largest-refugee-camp/>

Amnesty International, “Israel’s Refusal to Grant Palestinian Refugees Right to Return has Fuelled Seven Decades of Suffering,” 15 May 2019, <https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2019/05/israels-refusal-to-grant-palestinian-refugees-right-to-return-has-fuelled-seven-decades-of-suffering/>

The list could go on....Now, for something different:

Crabapple, Molly. “This Refugee Squat Represents the Best and the Worst of Humanity,” *The Guardian* 23 June 2017 <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2017/jun/23/refugee-squat-city-plaza-greece-best-worst-humanity>

“Greece’s First Housing Squat for Refugees & Migrants, Notara 26,” Unicorn Riot, 18 May 2018. <https://unicornriot.ninja/2018/greeces-first-housing-squat-for-refugees-migrants-notara-26/> [listen]

In seminar we will watch:

“Refugees on Lesbos,” DW Documentary. 19 December 2017. (12 minutes)  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bltWKd82tzE>

“City Plaza: Swarming Solidarity,” 14 June 2017, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qRY5o-REg2E> (about 5 minutes).

**Supp:**

“Life As An Illegal Immigrant in Greece,” *Vice News*, 16 April 2014,  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7ASpKCnx4D4>

Rettman, Andrew. “EU guilty of Libya migrant 'tragedy', ICC lawsuit says,” *EU Observer*, 4 June 2019, <https://euobserver.com/migration/145071>

Wintour, Patrick. “Libya rejects EU plan for refugee and migrant centres,” *The Guardian* 20 July 2018.

Beaumont, Peter. “Trump's UN funding move risks damage to Palestine, Israel and US.” 31 August 2018. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/aug/31/trumps-un-funding-move-risks-damage-to-palestine-israel-and-us>

“No Borders Kitchen: An Anarchist Refugee Camp,”

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Vc2MHTfE5KY>

80% of Gitmo Prisoners Hunger Strike for 100 days,” *The Real News*, 17 May 2013

Youtube <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=knb6WE9hUIY>

Channel 4 News, “Guantanamo Bay: Violence, Hunger Strikes and Protests”. Watch video at

[https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=H7V\\_MLZm7K4](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=H7V_MLZm7K4) (about 8 minutes long)

Cohen, Roger. “Broken Men in Paradise,” *New York Times*, 9 Dec 2016 Guerra, Crystal Vance and Gabriel M. Schiavone. “From Suffering to detention: Why does the U.S. put Asylum Seekers Behind Bars?” *The Guardian* 13 October 2015.

<http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2015/oct/13/why-us-put-asylum-seekers-behind-bars>

“Stranded Asylum Seekers Sew Lips Together for Hunger Strike,” 23 November 2015.

<http://www.telesurtv.net/english/news/Stranded-Asylum-Seekers-Sew-Lips-Together-for-Hunger-Strike-20151123-0004.html>

Thomas, Andrew. “A Glimpse of Australia’s Manus Island Refugee Prison,” *Al Jazeera* 1 December 2015. Read and listen at:

<http://www.aljazeera.com/blogs/asia/2015/12/australia-manus-island-refugees-151201080133207.html>

Mehta, Sekatu, "Immigration Panic: how the west fell for manufactured rage," *The Guardian*, 27 August 2019, [https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2019/aug/27/immigration-panic-how-the-west-fell-for-manufactured-rage?CMP=share\\_btn\\_tw](https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2019/aug/27/immigration-panic-how-the-west-fell-for-manufactured-rage?CMP=share_btn_tw)

**Week 3: Sovereignty, state violence, and resistance 19/20 September**

For this week, write a summary of Bargu. It may be 2-3 single-spaced pages. Concentrate on her thesis and concepts.

Bargu, Banu. *Starve and Immolate: The Politics of Human Weapons*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2014. Pp. xi-xiv, and pp.1-86 ("Introduction" and chapter 1).

**Supp:**

Margaronis, Maria. "The EU has turned Greece into a Prison for Refugees," *The Nation* May 2016. <https://www.thenation.com/article/the-eu-has-turned-greece-into-a-prison-for-refugees/>

De Genova, Nicolas. "Spaces of Migrant Illegality: The Scene of Exclusion, the Obscene of Inclusion." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 36, no. 7 (2013): 1180-1198.

John Torpey, "Coming and Going: On the State Monopolization of the 'Legitimate Means of Movement' *Sociological Theory* 16, no. 3 (1998): 231-259.

Nicholas Keung, "UN Alarmed by Canada's Immigration Detention," 23 July 2015. <http://www.thestar.com/news/immigration/2015/07/23/un-alarmed-by-canadas-immigration-detention.html>

Diana Al Raifi, "Riot at Australian Detention Camp after Refugee's Death," *Al Jazeera* 9 November 2015. <http://www.aljazeera.com/news/2015/11/riot-australian-detention-camp-refugee-death-151103083241635.html>

Human Rights Watch, "Trauma in Family Immigration Detention," 15 May 2015. <https://www.hrw.org/news/2015/05/15/us-trauma-family-immigration-detention-0>

Kandylis, George "Urban Scenes of Citizenship: Inventing the Possibility of Immigrants' Citizenship in Athens." *Citizenship Studies* 21, no. 4 (2017): 468-482.

**Week 4: Prison detention, making live, and letting die: states, law, and violence 26/27 Sept.**

Write summaries on Dayan, and Murray and Holmes. 2pp. max. Read Mortimer.

Dayan, Colin. "With Law at the Edge of Life." *South Atlantic Quarterly* 113, no. 3 (2014): 630-639.

Murray, Stuart J. and Dave Holmes, "A New Form of Homicide in Canada's Prisons: The Case of Ashley Smith," *Truthout* 10 March 2014. <http://www.truth-out.org/news/item/22321-a-new-form-of-homicide-in-canadas-prisons-the-case-of-ashley-smith>

Mortimer, Caroline. "600 Refugees in Australian Detention Centre Write Open Letter Demanding Assisted Suicide," *The Independent* 2 December 2015. Read and listen at:



<http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/australasia/refugees-australian-detention-centre-open-letter-assisted-suicide-manus-island-regional-processing-a6756911.html>

**Supp:**

Murray, Stuart J. "Thanatopolitics: On the Use of Death for Mobilizing Political Life." *Polygraph* 18, no. 191-215 (2006).

Thomas, Andrew. "What's Going on at Manus Island Facility?" *Al Jazeera* 20 January 2015 <http://www.aljazeera.com/blogs/asia/2015/01/100196.html>

Guenther, Lisa. "Political Action at the End of the World: Hannah Arendt and the California Hunger Strikers." *Canadian Journal of Human Rights* 4, no.1(2015): 33-56.

**Week 5: Hannah Arendt: Refugees, Rightlessness, the Right to Have Rights, and the Camps 3/4 October**

Write summary on Arendt including the chapter on "Total Domination". 3 pages single-spaced max.

\*Arendt, Hannah. *The Origins of Totalitarianism*. (New edition with added prefaces). New York: Harcourt, 1981 (1951). Read ix, ch. 9 "The Decline of the Nation-State and the End of the Rights of Man," (read pp. 267-290 for material relevant to our concerns (e.g. 275, stateless people); —don't concentrate on the discussion of the re-ordering of Eastern Europe after WWI; read 290-302 carefully), and "Total Domination," (pp. 437-459). pdf

Raj, Suhasini and Jeffrey Gettleman, "A Mass Citizenship Check in India Leaves 2 Million People in Limbo," *New York Times*, 31 August 2019.

<https://www.nytimes.com/2019/08/31/world/asia/india-muslim-citizen-list.html>

**Supp:**

\*Bennhold, Katrin. "Chemnitz Protests Show New Strength of Germany's Far Right." *The New York Times* 30 August 2018

<https://www.nytimes.com/2018/08/30/world/europe/germany-neo-nazi-protests-chemnitz.html?action=click&module=Well&pgtype=Homepage&section=World>

\*Hayden, Patrick. "From Exclusion to Containment: Arendt, Sovereign Power, and Statelessness." *Societies without Borders* 3, (2008): 248-269.

Arendt, Hannah. "The 'Rights of Man': What Are They?" *Modern Review* 3, no. 1 (1949): 24-37.

Menke, Christoph. "The 'Aporias of Human Rights' and the 'One Human Right': Regarding The Coherence of Hannah Arendt's Argument." *Social Research* 74, no. 3 (2007): 739-462.

Gundogdu, Ayten. "'Perplexities of the Rights of Man': Arendt on the Aporias of Human Rights." *European Journal of Political Theory* 11, no. 1 (2011): 4-24.

Gundogdu, Ayten. *Rightlessness in an Age of Rights: Hannah Arendt and the Contemporary Struggles of Migrants*. Oxford UK: Oxford, 2015.

Franke, "The Displacement of the Rights of Displaced Persons...." J of HR 2008.

Daniel Loicke, "We Refugees." *Eutopia* 30 September 2015.

<http://eutopiamagazine.eu/en/daniel-loick/speakers-corner/we-refugees>

**Week 6: Biopolitics/Necropolitics/Necroresistance/Humanitarianism 10/11 October**

Write summaries on Foucault and Mbembe, reflect back on Bargu from week 3.

Davies, Thom and Arshad Isakjee. "Geography, Migration and Abandonment in the Calais Refugee Camp." *Political Geography* 49 (2015): 93-95.

\*Foucault, Michel. *Society Must Be Defended: Lectures at the College de France 1975-1976*. New York: Picador, 1997: 239-263. Pdf

Mbembe, Achille. "Necropolitics." *Public Culture* 15, no. 1 (2003): 11-40.

**Supp:**

Allinson, Jamie. "The Necropolitics of Drones." *International Political Sociology* 9 (2016): 112-127. 117-120 are VERY HELPFUL

Pfeifer, Michelle. "Becoming Flesh: Refugee Hunger Strike and Embodiments of Refusal in German Necropolitical Spaces." *Citizenship Studies* 22, no. 5 (2018).

Fassin, Didier. *Humanitarian Reason: A Moral History of the Present*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012: 133-157 ("Ambivalent Hospitality: Governing the Unwanted"). pdf

Beaumont, Peter. "Trump's UN funding move risks damage to Palestine, Israel and US." 31 August 2018. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/aug/31/trumps-un-funding-move-risks-damage-to-palestine-israel-and-us>

Agamben Giorgio. *Homo Sacer: Sovereign Power and Bare Life*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998. Read pp. 1-12, 126-135, and 166-180

Agamben, Giorgio. "Beyond Human Rights." 2008. <http://novact.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/09/Beyond-Human-Rights-by-Giorgio-Agamben.pdf> [google the words to get a copy]

Arendt, Hannah. "We Refugees." In *The Jewish Writings*, Jerome Kohn and Ron H. Feldman eds. New York: Schocken Books, 2007: 264-274. Also available on the web.

Patricia Owens, "Reclaiming Bare Life: Against Agamben on Refugees." *International Relations*, 23 (2009): 567-582.

**Week 7: Homo Sacer? Camps as spaces of biopolitics, agency, humanitarianism, and resistance 17/18/ Oct.**

Summaries on all except the video (just below) and Bartholomew and Wainwright. Please concentrate on the authors' main theses, not the minute details.

Unpacked, "Palestinian refugee condemns 'life of humiliation'," 12 February 2015, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NpYfm-fPXfk> 13 min. Listen for background.

Minca, Claudio. "Geographies of the Camp." *Political Geography* 49 (2015): 74-83.

Katz, Irit. "From Spaces of Thanatopolitics to Spaces of Natality—A Commentary on 'Geographies of the Camp'," *Political Geography* 49 (2015): 84-86.

Ramadan, Adam. "Spatializing the Refugee Camp." *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 38 (2013) 65-77.

Feldman, Ilana. "What is a Camp: Legitimate Refugee Lives in Spaces of Long-term Displacement." *Geoforum* 66 (2015): 244-252.

\*Bartholomew, Amy and Hilary Wainwright, "Beyond the 'Barbed-Wire Labyrinth': Migrant Spaces of Radical Democracy in Greece," *The Socialist Register 2020*, forthcoming, Leo Panitch and Greg Albo eds., (London: Merlin Press, 2019). Read up to the section "'We, The People of City Plaza'". Pdf provided

**Supp:**

"Palestinian refugees in Lebanon denied many rights,"

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GzEFfq-aPG0>

"Refugees in Moria camp on Lesbos report IS gang violence," | DW English,

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vnL1YoJRUQU> (3 min)

Rozakou, Katerina. "The Biopolitics of Hospitality in Greece: Humanitarianism and the Management of Refugees," *American Ethnologist* 39, no. 3 (562-577).

Loubani, Q. (2016, May 24). "Idomeni: A devil's game." openDemocracy. Retrieved from <https://www.opendemocracy.net/5050/qusay/idomeni-devil-s-game>.

Agier, Michel. "Humanity as an Identity and Its Political Effects (a Note on Camps and Humanitarian Government." *Humanity* 1, no. 1 (2010): 29-45.

Bauman, Zygmunt, "In The Lowly Nowheresvilles of Liquid Modernity," *Ethnography*, 3, no. 3 (2002): 343-349.

Film: The Insult

Ticktin, M. (2011). *Casualties of care: Immigration and the politics of humanitarianism in France*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Patricia Owens, "Reclaiming Bare Life: Against Agamben on Refugees." *International Relations*, 23 (2009): 567-582.

Ramadan, Adam. "From Tahrir to the World: The Camp as a Political Public Space," *European Urban and Regional Studies* 20 no. 1 2012: 145-149.

Trubeta, Sevasti. "'Rights' in the Grey Area: Undocumented Border Crossers on Lesbos." *Race and Class* 56, no. 4 (2015): 56-72.

Bailey, Richard. "Up against the Wall: Bare Life and Resistance in Australian Immigration Detention," *Law and Critique*. 2009, 20: 113-132.

Guenther, Lisa. "Resisting Agamben: The Biopolitics of Shame and Humiliation." *Philosophy and Social Criticism* 38, no. 1 (2012): 59-79.

Bethan McKernan, "Inside al-Hawl camp, the incubator for Islamic State's resurgence," *The Guardian*, 31 August 2019,

[https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/aug/31/inside-al-hawl-camp-the-incubator-for-islamic-states-resurgence?utm\\_term=RWRpdG9yaWFsX0d1YXJkaWFuVG9kYXIVUy0xOTA4MzE%3D&utm\\_source=esp&utm\\_medium=Email&utm\\_campaign=GuardianTodayUS&CMP=GTUS\\_email](https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/aug/31/inside-al-hawl-camp-the-incubator-for-islamic-states-resurgence?utm_term=RWRpdG9yaWFsX0d1YXJkaWFuVG9kYXIVUy0xOTA4MzE%3D&utm_source=esp&utm_medium=Email&utm_campaign=GuardianTodayUS&CMP=GTUS_email)

## READING WEEK – No Seminar

### **Week 8: Alternative Spaces of Statelessness: Volunteers, NGO's, and informal camps or anarchists, squats, and occupations? Oct. 31/Nov.1**

Write summary of Lafazani (you may combine both articles) and Squire (ditto).

Questions to consider for seminar: How different is City Plaza from the camps? How is it different? Might City Plaza be considered an act of civil disobedience? Might it be considered a manifestation of the “right to have rights” or, rather, is it more like a “fool’s freedom” (Arendt)?

#### **Watch in seminar:**

BBC News, “The Worst Refugee Camp on Earth,” 28 August 2018,  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8v-OHi3iGQI&t=27s>

“City Plaza: the best hotel in Europe,” 5 July 2017,  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1jKkfh80Jvc>

“No Borders Kitchen: An Anarchist Refugee Camp,”  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Vc2MHTfE5KY>

#### **Required readings:**

Squire, Vicki. "Mobile Solidarities and Precariousness at City Plaza: Beyond Vulnerable and Disposable Lives." *Studies in Social Justice* 12, no. 1 (2018): 111-132.

Squire, Vicki. “City Plaza: A Way Forward for the European ‘Migration Crisis’?” *Open Democracy* 14 June 2016.

Lafazani, Olga "1.5 Year City Plaza: A Project on the Antipodes of Bordering and Control Policies." *California Law Review*, no. November 13 (2017). (5 pages)

Lafazani, Olga. "Homeplace Plaza: Challenging the Border between Host and Hosted." *South Atlantic Quarterly* 117, no. 3 (2018): 896-904.

\*Bartholomew, Amy and Hilary Wainwright, “Beyond the ‘Barbed-Wire Labyrinth’: Migrant Spaces of Radical Democracy in Greece,” *The Socialist Register 2020*, forthcoming, Leo Panitch and Greg Albo eds., (London: Merlin Press, 2019). Read from the section “‘We, The People of City Plaza’” to “Showing it Could be Otherwise”.

Karyotis, Theodoros. “Criminalizing Solidarity: Syriza’s War on the Movements,” *Roar Magazine*, 31 July 2016. <https://roarmag.org/essays/criminalizing-solidarity-movement-refugees-greece/>

**Supp:**

Connolly, Andrew. "Welcome to the City Plaza: Greece's Refugee Hotel," *Irin News* 6 May 2016. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-HlbCCnhIuA> 5min

**"Support the City Plaza Refugee Accommodation and Solidarity Center in Athens, Greece."** 2016 <http://solidarity2refugees.gr/support-city-plaza-refugee-accommodation-solidarity-center-athens-greece/>

Crilley, Rhys. "Review of Communities of Solidarity: The Story of Pikpa Refugee Camp," 24 August 2018. <http://refugeehistory.org/blog/2018/8/24/review-of-communities-of-solidarity-the-story-of-pikpa-refugee-camp>

Loubani, Quasay. "Small, Illegal Refugee Paradise," *Open Democracy* 13 October 2016. <https://www.opendemocracy.net/5050/quasay-loubani/small-illegal-refugee-paradise>

Strickland, Patrick. "Greek Leftist Turn Deserted Hotel into Refugee Homes," *Aljazeera* 3 July 2016. <http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/features/2016/06/greek-leftists-turn-deserted-hotel-refugee-homes-160629131217044.html>

"Greece's Haven Hotel," 13 July 2018, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jMCz99InvsI> (25 minutes)

Tsavidaroglou, Charalampos. "The Newcomers' Right to the Common Space: The case of Athens during the refugee crisis." *Acme: An International Journal for Critical Geographies* 17, no.2 (2018): 376-401.

"Exarchia, a countercultural island in Athens." *Journal Reporters* <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7tvwSwp1TmU>

"In Lavrio, a self-governed camp of Kurdish exiles." [07/03/2018](http://www.kedistan.net/2018/03/07/lavrio-self-governed-camp-kurdish-exiles/)

<http://www.kedistan.net/2018/03/07/lavrio-self-governed-camp-kurdish-exiles/>

RAKOPOULOS, THEODOROS. "Solidarity: The Egalitarian Tensions of a Bridge-Concept." *Social Anthropology* 24, no. 2 (2016): 142-151.

Agier, Michael. "Between War and City." *Ethnography* 3, no. 3 (2002): 317-341.

Papataxiarchis, Evthymios. "Being There: At the Front line of the European Refugee Crisis," Parts I and II, *Anthropology Today* 32 (no's one and two) 2016.

"The Refugee Hotel in Athens," *DW*, 3 November 2016. Youtube

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-HlbCCnhIuA>

Kitching et al "Exploring the Role of Ad Hoc Grassroots Organizations Providing Humanitarian Aid on Lesbos," 17 November 2016

Sciurba, Alessandra and Filippo Furri. "Human Rights Beyond Humanitarianism: The Radical Challenge to the Right to Asylum in the Mediterranean Zone." *Antipode* on line first (5 July 2017).

"Refugee Squats in Athens," *Moving Europe* 24 June 2016. <http://moving-europe.org/24-06-2016-refugee-squats-in-athens/>

Gentleman, Amelia. "Help Refugees: A Lifeline for Teenagers living in Seedy Athens Squats," 16 December 2016. <https://www.theguardian.com/society/2016/dec/16/help-refugees-charity-central-athens-vulnerable-young-people>

Bhimji "Visibilities and the Politics of Space: Refugee Activism in Berlin" *Journal of Immigrant and Refugee Studies* 14, no. 4 (2016): 432-450.

Gavroche, Julius. "Territorializing Solidarity: Okupied Refugee Squats in Athens,"

*Autonomies*. <http://autonomies.org/ar/2016/09/territorialising-solidarity-okupied-refugee-squats-in-athens/>

“Kaminis: Squating is not the Solution for Refugee Housing Problem,” 29 July 2016. <http://dailyhellas.com/2016/07/29/kaminis-squatting-is-not-the-solution-for-refugee-housing-problem/>

Emmanuel Haddad, “Solidarity, Squats and Self-Management Assisting Refugees in Greece,” *Equal Times*, 2 May 2016. <https://www.equaltimes.org/solidarity-squats-and-self?lang=en#.WF84z1cddmA>

\*Pierpaolo Mudu and Sutapa Chattopadhyay, eds. *Migration, Squatting and Radical Autonomy* (New York: Routledge, 2016).

Schwartz, Mike. “The In-Between: Why Refugee-Operated Squats are a Viable Alternative to Camps,” 19 September 2016.

<https://spark.adobe.com/page/MNYqymdSuvIzN/>

Simit, Can. “Solidarity is Being Criminalized: Anger as Greek Police Raids Refugee Housing Squats and Camps,” 3 August 2016.

<https://ceasefiremagazine.co.uk/solidarity-criminalised-anger-greek-police-raids-refugee-housing-squats-camps/>

**ESSAY DUE Law Department Drop Box. (Room C473 Loeb Building) Friday 3 Nov. by 4pm**

### **Forms of protest, resistance, and violence**

**Week 9: “Nonviolent” protest, civil disobedience, and resistance 7/8 Nov.**

Summary of the Habermas essay. Also pose a question in relation to one of the other articles.

Some questions to guide your reading of Habermas’s essays:

What is Habermas’s opinion of (variously formulated) “sheer legality”, “law is law”, or “authoritarian legalism”?

How does Habermas *define*/conceptualization civil disobedience?

What is Habermas’s *justification* of civil disobedience?

Consider hunger striking, lip sewing, or self-immolation by political prisoners and asylum-seekers. Might these actions fall within the definition of civil disobedience? What would be the justification of it on the basis of Habermas’s work?

Habermas, Jürgen. “Civil Disobedience: Litmus Test for the Democratic Constitutional State,” *Berkeley Journal of Sociology* 30 (1985): 95-116.

Butterly, Luke. “The Gilet Noir Occupy the Pantheon,” *Verso Blog*, 15 July 2019.

<https://www.versobooks.com/blogs/4379-the-gilets-noirs-occupy-the-pantheon>

Mezzadra, Sandro and, and Michael Hardt. “We’ve Launched a Migrant Rescue Ship to Resist the Racist Right in Italy.” *The Guardian*, 9 October 2018,

<https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2018/oct/09/migrant-rescue-ship-racist-politics-italy-us> (2018).

Bargu, Banu. “The Silent Exception: Hunger Striking and Lip-Sewing.” *Law, Culture and the*

*Humanities* forthcoming (2017 on line first): 1-28; JUST READ 1-7.

**Supp:**

Habermas, Jürgen. "Right and Violence -- a German Trauma," *Cultural Critique* 1, no. Autumn (1985): 125-139.

Luke de Noronha and Tanzil Chowdhury, "The Stanstead 15 and the Terror Law," *Verso Blog*, 12 December 2018, <https://www.versobooks.com/blogs/4171-the-stansted-15-and-the-terror-of-law>

Tondo, Lorenzo. "Italian-flagged migrant rescue boat defies anti-immigration minister," *The Guardian*, 4 October 2018, <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/oct/04/italian-flagged-migrant-rescue-boat-mare-jonio-sets-sail-in-challenge-to-far-right-minister-matteo-salvini>

Mezzadra, Sandro and Maurice Stierl. "The Mediterranean Field of Migration," *Open Democracy*, 12 April 2019, <https://www.opendemocracy.net/en/can-europe-make-it/mediterranean-battlefield-migration/>

Mathieu, Mathilda and Rou Guyata Sall. "The Gilet Noir Are in the Building." *Jacobin*, no. July 28 (2019).

Benli, Ali Emre. (2018) "March of refugees: an act of civil disobedience," *Journal of Global Ethics*, 14, no. 3 (2018): 315-331

Smith, William. "Civil Disobedience as Transnational Disruption." *Global Constitutionalism* 6 no. 3 (2017): 477-504.

-----, "The Morality of Border Crossing" Debate between Will Smith and Luis Cabrera. *Contemporary Political Theory* Contemporary Political Theory; London Vol. 14, Iss. 1, (Feb 2015): 90-99.

Scheuerman, William E. "Whistleblowing as Civil Disobedience: The Case of Edward Snowden." *Philosophy and Social Criticism* 40, no. 7 (2014): 609-28.

-----, "Recent Theories of Civil Disobedience: An Anti-Legal Turn?." *Journal of Political Philosophy* 23, no. 4 (2015): 427-49.

-----, "What Edward Snowden Can Teach Theorists of Conscientious Law-Breaking." *Philosophy and Social Criticism* 42, no. 10 (2016): 958-64.

Garber, Megan. "The Revolutionary Aims of Black Lives Matter," *The Atlantic* 30 September 2015 <http://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2015/09/black-lives-matter-revolution/408160/>

Badger, Emily. "Why Highways have become the center of Civil Rights Protest," [https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/wonk/wp/2016/07/13/why-highways-have-become-the-center-of-civil-rights-protest/?utm\\_term=.f5ad3fd6d771](https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/wonk/wp/2016/07/13/why-highways-have-become-the-center-of-civil-rights-protest/?utm_term=.f5ad3fd6d771)

[Habermas, Jürgen. \*Toward a Rational Society: Student Protest, Science, and Politics.\* \(London: Beacon Press, 1970\).](#)

[Holub, Robert C. \*Jürgen Habermas: Critic in the Public Sphere.\* London: Routledge, 1991.](#)

*Peace Review* (journal) 2014 special issue on nonviolent resistance.

Welchman, Jennifer. "Is Ecosabotage Civil Disobedience?" *Philosophy and Geography* 4, no. 1 (2001): 97-107.

Ertur, Basak. "The Gezi Uprising and Particularities of Discontent." *Law and Critique* 25 (2014): 3-7.

Thomassen, Lasse. "Within the Limits of Deliberative Reason Alone: Habermas, Civil Disobedience and Constitutional Democracy." *European Journal of Political Theory* 6, no. 2 (2007): 200-218.

White, Stephen K., and Robert Farr. "'No-Saying' in Habermas." *Political Theory* 40, no. 1 (2012): 32-57.

**Week 10: Political Violence? Resistance v. the State 14/15 Nov.**  
Summary on each.

O'Neill, Shane. "Struggles against Injustice: Contemporary Critical Theory and Political Violence." *Journal of Global Ethics* 6, no. 2 (2010): 127-139.

Hage, Gassan. "'Comes a Time We are All Enthusiasm': Understanding Palestinian Suicide Bombers in Times of Exiphobia." *Public Culture* 15, no. 1 (2003): 65-89.

**Supp:**

Film: Battle of Algiers 1966

Habermas, Jürgen. "Fundamentalism and Terror: A Dialogue with Jürgen Habermas," in Giovanna Borradori, *Philosophy in a Time of Terror: Dialogues with Jürgen Habermas and Jacques Derrida* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003): 25-43. Just read 28-34.

Alpert, Avram. "Philosophy against and in Praise of Violence: Kant, Thoreau and the Revolutionary Spectator." *Theory, Culture and Society* on line first (2016): 1-23. Drop in Fall 2017, too much.

Young, Iris Marion. *Justice and the Politics of Difference*. Princeton: Princeton University press, 1999. Ch. 5 "Five Faces of Oppression," pp. 39-65.

Marcuse, Herbert. "Repressive Tolerance." (1965).

<http://ada.evergreen.edu/~arunc/texts/frankfurt/marcuse/tolerance.pdf>

Benjamin, Walter. "Critique of Violence." In Demetz, Peter, ed. *Reflections* (New York: Harcourt Brace, 1978).

**Week 11: Hunger strikes as resistance against state violence. 21/22 Nov.**

Summary of it all (except for the introduction and chapter 1 which you did in week 2. Please review that summary before seminar). Your summary may be 4 single-spaced pages.

Bargu, Banu. *Starve and Immolate*. Pp. 112-113, 120-127, 140, 148-161, 271-309, 327-350. (and ch. 1 from week 3, above)

We will watch in seminar: FOCAL, "The Visual Feast of Hunger," (2008)

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=k-T0paFkx5Q> about 8 minutes.

**Supp:**

Film: Hunger by Steve McQueen

Film: 66 Days, Bobby Sands (available on Netflix)



Bargu, Banu. "The Silent Exception: Hunger Striking and Lip-Sewing," *Law, Culture and the Humanities* 2017: 1-28.

**Week 12: Wrap-up. Make-up. Take-home exam distributed. 28/29 Nov.**  
No summary today!

Hayter, Teresa. "Why We Need Open Borders," *Jacobin*, 20 October 2015,  
<https://jacobinmag.com/2015/10/open-borders-refugees-rights-europe>

---

---

### **Academic Accommodations:**

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

**Pregnancy obligation:** Please contact me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details, visit the Equity Services website: [carleton.ca/equity/wp-content/uploads/Student-Guide-to-Academic-Accommodation.pdf](http://carleton.ca/equity/wp-content/uploads/Student-Guide-to-Academic-Accommodation.pdf)

**Religious obligation:** write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details, visit the Equity Services website: [carleton.ca/equity/wp-content/uploads/Student-Guide-to-Academic-Accommodation.pdf](http://carleton.ca/equity/wp-content/uploads/Student-Guide-to-Academic-Accommodation.pdf)

**Academic Accommodations for Students with Disabilities:** If you have a documented disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact The Paul Menton Centre (PMC) at 613-520-6608 or [pmc@carleton.ca](mailto:pmc@carleton.ca) for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send me your Letter of Accommodation at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (if applicable). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with me as soon as possible to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC Website for their deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (if applicable) [www.carleton.ca/pmc](http://www.carleton.ca/pmc)

### **Plagiarism:**

Plagiarism is presenting, whether intentional or not, the ideas, expression of ideas or work of others as one's own. Plagiarism includes reproducing or paraphrasing portions of someone else's published or unpublished material, regardless of the source, and presenting these as one's own without proper citation or reference to the original source. Examples of sources from which the ideas, expressions of ideas or works of others may be drawn from include but are not limited to: books, articles, papers, literary compositions and phrases, performance compositions, chemical compounds, art works, laboratory reports, research results, calculations and the results of calculations, diagrams, constructions, computer reports, computer code/software, and material on the Internet. Plagiarism is a serious offence.

More information on the University's **Academic Integrity Policy** can be found at:  
<http://carleton.ca/studentaffairs/academic-integrity/>

### **Survivors of Sexual Violence**

As a community, Carleton University is committed to maintaining a positive learning, working and living environment where sexual violence will not be tolerated, and survivors are supported through academic accommodations as per Carleton's Sexual Violence Policy. For more information about the services available at the university and to obtain information about sexual violence and/or support, visit:

[carleton.ca/sexual-violence-support](http://carleton.ca/sexual-violence-support)

### **Accommodation for Student Activities**

Carleton University recognizes the substantial benefits, both to the individual student and for the university, that result from a student participating in activities beyond the classroom experience. Reasonable accommodation must be provided to students who compete or perform at the national or international level. Please contact your instructor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. <https://carleton.c/senate/wp-content/uploads/Accommodation-for-Student-Activities-1.pdf>

For more information on academic accommodation, please contact the departmental administrator or visit: [students.carleton.ca/course-outline](http://students.carleton.ca/course-outline)

### **Department Policy**

The Department of Law and Legal Studies operates in association with certain policies and procedures. Please review these documents to ensure that your practices meet our Department's expectations.

<http://carleton.ca/law/current-students/>

---