

## Course Outline Template

---

---

<b>COURSE:</b>	<b>LAWS 4307 A – Medical Criminal Law Issues</b>
<b>TERM:</b>	<b>Winter 2025</b>
<b>PREREQUISITES:</b>	<b>LAWS 2908, CRCJ 3001 or CRCJ 3002 and LAWS 2301, LAWS 2302 and 4th year Honours standing</b>
<b>CLASS:</b>	<b>Day &amp; Time: Monday 6:05pm – 8:55pm (in-person)</b> <b>Room: Please check with Carleton Central for current room location</b>
<b>INSTRUCTOR:</b>	<b>Kelly Lauzon</b>
<b>CONTACT:</b>	<b>Office Hrs: By appointment</b> <b>Email: <a href="mailto:kelly.lauzon@carleton.ca">kelly.lauzon@carleton.ca</a></b>
<b>BRIGHTSPACE:</b>	<b><a href="https://brightspace.carleton.ca/d2l/home/285193">https://brightspace.carleton.ca/d2l/home/285193</a></b>

---

---

### CALENDAR COURSE DESCRIPTION

Legal-medical issues, conflicts and relationships in the field of social control. Topics include mental disorder and criminal liability, diversion of offenders to civil commitment in hospital, insanity, automatism, fitness to stand trial, prediction of dangerousness, regulation of psychoactive drugs.

### COURSE DESCRIPTION

In this class, we will look closely at one factor that has been linked to wrongful conviction cases. We will use this knowledge to study known cases of wrongful conviction within the Canadian and American justice systems to help us consider the implications that a wrongful conviction has for the accused person who is subsequently exonerated as well as for the justice system as a whole. In doing so, we will attempt to answer a variety of questions such as: What is the role of forensic science in criminal cases? What is the role of the expert witness in relation to these cases? What role do forensics play in the criminal justice system? What are the differences between junk science, pseudo-science and forensic science? What makes something a junk or a good science?

## **LEARNING OUTCOMES**

Upon successful completion of the course, student should be able to:

- Identify the role that forensic science plays in wrongful conviction cases.
- Appreciate the human side of science and the impact this has on its objectivity.
- Understand the impact that expert witnesses have in a criminal case.
- Identify avenues of redress as well as mechanisms that can be introduced to reduce or prevent forensics from contributing to wrongful convictions in the future.
- Critically look at and think about this area of the criminal justice system.

## **REQUIRED TEXTS**

Students are not required to purchase textbooks or other learning materials for this course.

The assigned readings for each week are listed in the lecture schedule below. These readings will be available via Brightspace.

## **COMMUNICATION**

The primary means of communication for this class will be through Brightspace. However, I am always happy to answer any questions you may have or to discuss the class material further. If you would like to talk to me in person, we can set up an appointment to meet via Big Blue Button. If you would like to communicate via email, please be sure to use your Carleton email account.

Email policy: I check my email regularly from 8 am to 4pm (Monday to Friday) and aim to reply the same day. I do not check my e-mail regularly after these hours during the week or on the weekend/holidays; if you send your email during these times, I will aim to reply by the next business day.

## **EVALUATION**

Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor, subject to the approval of the Department and of the Faculty Dean. This means that grades submitted by the instructor may be subject to revision. No grades are final until they have been approved by the Department and the Dean.

**NOTE: All components must be successfully completed in order to get a passing grade.**

### **1. Attendance and Contribution to Discussion (20%)**

- This class will focus strongly on discussion. You are expected to come to class prepared to discuss the readings and the course material.
- Class attendance will only account for 10% of your grade. You need to be prepared to contribute to the class discussions to earn the additional 10%.

- Attendance will be taken at the beginning of each class. Attendance grades will not be given retroactively.
- In accordance with the [Student Rights and Responsibilities Policy](#), discrimination and harassment will not be tolerated.

## 2. Presentation (30%)

- Presentations will take place during the last 4 weeks of class.
- Groups of 2-3 students will be required to prepare slides and lead class discussion for their chosen topic.
- Presentations will last approximately 30-40 minutes (including discussion) and will not last longer than 50 minutes as we must ensure enough time is dedicated to each group.
- It is your responsibility to attend the class that you have signed up for; there will not be a chance to reschedule.
  - If you haven't signed up by the week 5 (Feb 3), I will assign your topic/week (and partners)
- The presentation should address the following:
  - Pick a case to highlight how forensics were improperly used to gain a conviction.
    - Each presentation must use a different case example.
  - What questions does this case raise?
  - Has the conviction been overturned? If so, how?
  - What have we learned from this case?
- In addition to the presentation, you are required to:
  - conduct research beyond the assigned readings.
  - circulate at least one reading to the class the week prior to your presentation (you will **lose marks** if it is not circulated at least 1 week in advance).
  - circulate your slides 1 week in advance of your presentation to allow the class time to review your material (you will **lose marks** if it is not circulated at least 1 week in advance).
  - develop at least 3 questions to guide class discussion. The questions should draw upon the main points of your presentation and foster lively academic debate. The discussion period should last approximately 20-25 minutes (you may want to prepare a few extra questions to ensure the discussion period is adequately covered).

## 3. Presentation paper (10%)

- Due by 6pm the Monday following your presentation.
- 5-7 pages, outline the main points of your presentation.
- Individual submissions.
- The case synopsis can be the same as your groupmates', but the focus of your submission should be on answering "*What is the take home message from this case?*"

- Be sure to address the shortcomings of the forensic test/method used and what we have learned (if anything).
- If it doesn't appear that anything has changed, what should we learn from this case?

#### 4. Peer Evaluation of Presentation (5%)

- Each group of presenters will be assigned a corresponding group of peer evaluators.
- You will sign up in class for an evaluation spot once all of the presentation spots have been filled on (no later than week 6 Feb 10).
  - The list of evaluators will be posted on Brightspace.
  - It is your responsibility to attend the class that you are assigned to be an evaluator. There will not be an opportunity to be reassigned to another group.
- Evaluators will provide the student presenters with feedback on 3 main areas:
  - Quality of information imparted
  - Delivery of the presentation
  - Research conducted
- Evaluators will not assign a grade to the presenters, only comments.
- The peer evaluators will be graded on the submission of the feedback provided to their peers.

#### 5. Take Home Exam (35%)

- Instructions and information will be provided during our last scheduled class (Mar 31).
  - This information will also be posted on Brightspace the following day (Apr 1).
- Responses are due by **4pm on April 26**. Anything received after this time will require a deferral arrangement through the Registrar's Office.
- Responses are to be submitted via the drop box available in Brightspace. Emailed submissions will **not** be accepted.

#### **LATE PENALTIES AND REQUESTS FOR EXTENSIONS**

All assignments are due by via the appropriate dropbox on Brightspace. The submission deadline (date and time) is stipulated via the dropbox and on the class schedule below. **Do not** submit your assignment via email. **Unless you have been granted an extension, one letter grade** will be deducted for each calendar day (including weekends and holidays) that your submission is late. Assignments will not be accepted any later than seven days past their due date without prior instructor approval for an official extension.

The granting of extensions is determined by the instructor, who will confirm whether an extension is granted and the length of the extension. For requests for short-term extensions, please complete the form at the following link and submit it to the instructor prior to the assignment due date: <https://carleton.ca/registrar/academic-consideration-coursework-form>.

**Extensions for longer than 7 days will normally not be granted.** In those extraordinary cases where extensions lasting longer than 7 days are granted, the student will be required to provide

additional information to justify the longer extension (up to a maximum of 14 days).

Final exam deferrals must be applied for at the Registrar's Office. Please view the following link for more information and how to apply for a deferral: <https://carleton.ca/registrar/deferral/>

For more information regarding academic consideration for short-term incapacitation (illness, injury, or extraordinary circumstances beyond a student's control), please visit the following link: <https://students.carleton.ca/course-outline/#academic-consideration-for-short-term-incapacitation>

**POLICY ON PERMISSIBILITY OF SUBMITTING SAME WORK MORE THAN ONCE, PERMISSIBILITY OF GROUP OR COLLABORATIVE WORK, AND PERMISSIBILITY OF USING GENERATIVE AI**

While it is not in contravention of the Academic Integrity Policy to submit substantially the same piece of work more than once for academic credit, it is strongly discouraged for this class. In the spirit of continued learning, you are encouraged to explore new areas or inquiry and investigate new questions. Please consult with me prior to reusing previously submitted work for this course.

The use of generative artificial intelligence tools (e.g. ChatGPT) to produce assessed content is considered a violation of academic integrity standards. The use of AI tools to produce any part of an assignment is strictly forbidden. Any use of AI for content creation, even for small edits, will result in an automatic grade of 0, and the student will be referred to the academic integrity office for disciplinary action.

**SCHEDULE**

**NOTE: Readings for weeks 9-12 will be selected by the presenting groups (I will post to Brightspace).**

Week	Date	Topic & Readings (LAWS 4307A)
1	Jan 6	Intro and Admin <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Overview of Forensics &amp; WC</li> </ul>
2	Jan 13	History of forensics & CSI Effect Readings: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Simon A. Cole, "More than Zero: Accounting for Error in Latent Fingerprint Identification" 95 The Journal of Criminal Law &amp; Criminology (2005) pp. <b>EXCERPT ONLY</b> 985-996.</li> </ul>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Strengthening Forensic Science in the United States: A Path Forward (2009) <b>EXCERPT ONLY: Chapter 3</b> pp. 85-110 available at: <a href="http://www.nap.edu/catalog/12589.html">http://www.nap.edu/catalog/12589.html</a>.</li> <li>Corey Call et.al., "Seeing is Believing: The CSI Effect Among Jurors in Malicious Wounding Cases" 7 <i>Journal of Social, Behavioral, and Health Sciences</i> (2013) 52-66 Available at <a href="https://core.ac.uk/reader/147830760">https://core.ac.uk/reader/147830760</a>.</li> </ul>
3	Jan 20	<p>Pattern and matching fields: Fingerprints</p> <p>Readings:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Simon Cole, "The Prevalence and Potential Causes of Wrongful Conviction by Fingerprint Evidence" 37 <i>Golden Gate University Law Review</i> (2006) <b>EXCERPT ONLY</b> pp. 39-60.</li> <li>Simon Cole, "More than Zero Accounting for Error in Latent Fingerprint Identification" 95.3 <i>Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology</i> (2005) <b>EXCERPT ONLY</b> pp. 1001-1017.</li> <li>Brandon Garrett &amp; Gregory Mitchell, "How Jurors Evaluate Fingerprint Evidence: The Relative Importance of Match Language, Method Information, and Error Acknowledgment" 10 <i>J Empirical Legal Stud.</i> (2013) 484-511.</li> </ul>
4	Jan 27	<p><b>Guest Speaker: Chris Fabricant (Director of Strategic Litigation, Innocence Project)</b></p> <p>Pattern and matching fields: Bite Mark Analysis</p> <p>Readings:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Bruce Rothwell, "Bite Marks in Forensic Dentistry" 126.2 <i>Journal of the American Dentistry Association</i> (1995) 223-232.</li> <li>A. Olaborede &amp; L. Meintjes-van der Walt, "The Dangers of Convictions Based on a Single Piece of Forensic Evidence" 23 <i>PER</i> (2019) 1-38 available at <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/publication/341524496">https://www.researchgate.net/publication/341524496</a> <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/publication/341524496">The Dangers of Convictions Based on a Single Piece of Forensic Evidence</a>.</li> <li>Jonathan Jarry, "The Tooth Fairy Science of Bite Mark Comparisons" (2021) McGill Office for Science and Society weekly newsletter available at: <a href="https://www.mcgill.ca/oss/article/pseudoscience-history-general-science/tooth-fairy-science-bite-mark-comparisons">https://www.mcgill.ca/oss/article/pseudoscience-history-general-science/tooth-fairy-science-bite-mark-comparisons</a>.</li> </ul>
5	Feb 3	<p>Pattern and matching fields: Hair Microscopy</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Simon Cole &amp; Troy Duster, "Microscopic Hair Comparison and the Sociology of Science" 15.1 <i>Contexts</i> (2016) 28-35 available at <a href="https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/1536504216628838">https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/1536504216628838</a></li> <li>Chris Fabricant &amp; William Carrington, "The Shifted Paradigm: Forensic Sciences's Overdue Evolution from Magic to Law" 4 <i>Va. J. Crim. L</i> (2015) <b>EXCERPT ONLY</b> pp. 63-93.</li> <li>Laura Wilinon &amp; Claire Gwinnett, "An international survey into the analysis and interpretation of microscopic hair evidence by forensic hair examiners" 308 <i>Forensic Science International</i> (2020) 1-15.</li> </ul>

6	Feb 10	<p>Fire Science</p> <p><b>Guest Speaker - Kristine Bunch</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Parisa Dehghani-Tafti &amp; Paul Bieber, "Folklore and Forensics: The Challenges of Arson Investigation and Innocence Claims" 119 W. Va. L. Rev. (2016) <b>EXCERPT ONLY</b> pp. 550-588.</li> <li>Paul Gianelli, "Junk Science and the Execution of an Innocent Man" 7 N.Y.U. J.L. &amp; Liberty (2013) 221-253.</li> </ul>
	<b>FEB 17</b>	<b>READING WEEK – NO CLASS</b>
7	Feb 24	<p>Lab Scandals</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Sean K Driscoll, "I Messed Up Bad" Lessons on the Confrontation Clause from the Annie Dookhan Scandal" 56 Ariz. L.R. (2014) 707-740.</li> <li>Gerald Laporte, "Wrongful Convictions and DNA Exonerations: Understanding the Role of Forensic Science" 279 NIJ Journal (2018) 1-16.</li> <li>Dale Chappell, "Massachusetts Supreme Court Tosses Thousands of Drug Cases After Lab Tech Scandal and Government Cover-Up" Criminal Legal News (2019) Available at <a href="https://www.criminallegalnews.org/news/2018/dec/28/massachusetts-supreme-court-tosses-thousands-drug-cases-after-lab-tech-scandal-and-government-cover-up">https://www.criminallegalnews.org/news/2018/dec/28/massachusetts-supreme-court-tosses-thousands-drug-cases-after-lab-tech-scandal-and-government-cover-up</a></li> </ul>
8	Mar 3	<p>Expert Evidence</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Brandon L. Garrett and Peter J. Neufeld, "Invalid Forensic Science Testimony and Wrongful Convictions" (2009) 95 Virginia Law Review <b>EXCERPT ONLY</b> pp. 3-23.</li> <li>Lena Wahlberg and Christian Dahlman, "The Role of the Expert Witness" in Dahlman, Stein &amp; Tuzet (ed.), Philosophical Foundations of Evidence Law, Oxford University Press, 2021 1-15 Available at <a href="http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3758820">http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3758820</a>.</li> </ul>
9	Mar 10	<p>Presentations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Readings to be assigned by presenters</li> </ul>
10	Mar 17	<p>Presentations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Readings to be assigned by presenters</li> </ul>
11	Mar 24	<p>Presentations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Readings to be assigned by presenters</li> </ul>
12	Mar 31	<p><b>Take Home Exam assigned</b></p> <p>Presentations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Readings to be assigned by presenters</li> </ul>

13	Apr 7	This class will be held if required to catch up on outstanding course work or presentations.
	Apr 26	<b>TAKE HOME EXAM DUE BY <u>4PM</u> TO BRIGHTSPACE DROPBOX</b>

<b>Winter 2025 Sessional Dates and University Closures</b>	
<i>Please find a full list of important academic dates on the calendar website:</i> <a href="https://calendar.carleton.ca/academicyear/">https://calendar.carleton.ca/academicyear/</a>	
<b>January 6, 2025</b>	Winter term begins.
<b>January 17, 2025</b>	Last day for registration and course changes (including auditing) in full winter and late winter courses.
<b>January 31, 2025</b>	Last day to withdraw from full winter and the winter portion of fall/winter courses with a full fee adjustment.
<b>February 17, 2025</b>	Statutory holiday. University closed.
<b>February 17-21, 2025</b>	Winter break. No classes.
<b>March 15, 2025</b>	Last day for academic withdrawal from full winter, late winter, and fall/winter courses.
<b>March 25, 2025</b>	Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, in full winter term or fall/winter undergraduate courses, before the official April final examination period (see examination regulations in the Academic Regulations of the University section of the Undergraduate Calendar/General Regulations of the Graduate Calendar).
<b>April 8, 2025</b>	Winter term ends.
	Last day of full winter, late winter and fall/winter term classes.
	Classes follow a Friday schedule (full winter and later winter courses).
	Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for full winter term and late winter courses.
	Last day for take home examinations to be assigned.
<b>April 11-26, 2025</b>	Final examinations in full winter, late winter and fall/winter term courses will be held. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.



<b>April 26, 2025</b>	All final take-home examinations are due on this day, with the exception of those conforming to the examination regulations in the Academic Regulations of the University section of the Undergraduate Calendar/General Regulations of the Graduate Calendar.
-----------------------	---

## University and Departmental Policies

### DEPARTMENT POLICIES AND REGULATIONS

Please review the following webpage to ensure that your practices meet our Department's expectations, particularly regarding standard departmental protocols and academic integrity requirements: <https://carleton.ca/law/student-experience-resources/>.

### PLAGIARISM

The University Academic Integrity Policy defines plagiarism as “*presenting, whether intentionally or not, the ideas, expression of ideas or work of others as one's own.*” This includes reproducing or paraphrasing portions of someone else's published or unpublished material, regardless of the source, and presenting these as one's own without proper citation or reference to the original source. Examples of sources from which the ideas, expressions of ideas or works of others may be drawn from include but are not limited to: books, articles, papers, literary compositions and phrases, performance compositions, chemical compounds, artworks, laboratory reports, research results, calculations and the results of calculations, diagrams, constructions, computer reports, computer code/software, material on the internet and/or conversations.

Examples of plagiarism include, but are not limited to:

- any submission prepared in whole or in part, by someone else, including the unauthorized use of generative AI tools (e.g., ChatGPT);
- using ideas or direct, verbatim quotations, paraphrased material, algorithms, formulae, scientific or mathematical concepts, or ideas without appropriate acknowledgment in any academic assignment;
- using another's data or research findings without appropriate acknowledgement;
- submitting a computer program developed in whole or in part by someone else, with or without modifications, as one's own; and

- failing to acknowledge sources through the use of proper citations when using another's work and/or failing to use quotations marks.

Plagiarism is a serious offence that cannot be resolved directly by the course's instructor. The Associate Dean of the Faculty conducts a rigorous investigation, including an interview with the student, when an instructor suspects a piece of work has been plagiarized. Penalties are not trivial. They can include a final grade of "F" for the course.

### **STATEMENT ON STUDENT MENTAL HEALTH**

As a University student you may experience a range of mental health challenges that significantly impact your academic success and overall well-being. If you need help, please speak to someone. There are numerous resources available both on- and off-campus to support you.

For more information, please consult <https://wellness.carleton.ca/>

Emergency Resources (on and off campus):

- <https://wellness.carleton.ca/get-help-now/>

Carleton Resources:

- Mental Health and Wellbeing: <https://carleton.ca/wellness/>
- Health & Counselling Services: <https://carleton.ca/health/>
- Paul Menton Centre: <https://carleton.ca/pmc/>
- Academic Advising Centre (AAC): <https://carleton.ca/academicadvising/>
- Centre for Student Academic Support (CSAS): <https://carleton.ca/csas/>
- Equity & Inclusivity Communities: <https://carleton.ca/equity/>

Off Campus Resources:

- Distress Centre of Ottawa and Region: (613) 238-3311 or TEXT: 343-306-5550, <https://www.dcottawa.on.ca/>
- Mental Health Crisis Service: (613) 722-6914, 1-866-996-0991, <http://www.crisisline.ca/>
- Good2Talk: 1-866-925-5454, <https://good2talk.ca/>
- The Walk-In Counselling Clinic: <https://walkincounselling.com>

### **ACADEMIC ACCOMMODATIONS**

Carleton is committed to providing academic accessibility for all individuals. You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. The accommodation request processes, including information about the Academic Consideration Policy for Students in Medical and Other Extenuating Circumstances, are outlined on the Academic Accommodations website ([students.carleton.ca/course-outline](https://students.carleton.ca/course-outline)).

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows.

**Pregnancy Obligation and Family-Status Related Accommodations**

Write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details about the accommodation policy, visit the [Equity and Inclusive Communities \(EIC\)](#) website.

**Religious Obligation**

Write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details, please go to: <https://carleton.ca/equity/focus/discrimination-harassment/religious-spiritual-observances/>.

**Academic Accommodations for Students with Disabilities**

The Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or [pmc@carleton.ca](mailto:pmc@carleton.ca) for a formal evaluation. You can find the Paul Menton Centre online at: <https://carleton.ca/pmc/>

If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send me your Letter of Accommodation at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (if applicable). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with me to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC website for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (if applicable).

**Survivors of Sexual Violence**

As a community, Carleton University is committed to maintaining a positive learning, working and living environment where sexual violence will not be tolerated, and where survivors are supported through academic accommodations as per Carleton's Sexual Violence Policy. For more information about the services available at the university and to obtain information about sexual violence and/or support, visit: <https://carleton.ca/equity/sexual-assault-support-services>

**Accommodation for Student Activities**

Carleton University recognizes the substantial benefits, both to the individual student and for the university, that result from a student participating in activities beyond the classroom experience. Reasonable accommodation must be provided to students who compete or perform at the national or international level. Please contact your instructor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. Read more here: <https://carleton.ca/senate/wp-content/uploads/Accommodation-for-Student-Activities-1.pdf>.

For more information on academic accommodation, please visit:

<https://students.carleton.ca/services/accommodation/>.

### **Academic Consideration for Medical and Other Extenuating Circumstances**

Due to medical and other extenuating circumstances, students may occasionally be unable to fulfill the academic requirements of their course(s) in a timely manner. The University supports the academic development of students and aims to provide a fair environment for students to succeed academically. Medical and/or other extenuating circumstances are circumstances that are beyond a student's control, have a significant impact on the student's capacity to meet their academic obligations, and could not have reasonably been prevented.

Students must contact the instructor(s) as soon as possible, and normally no later than 24 hours after the submission deadline for course deliverables. If not satisfied with the instructor's decision, students can conduct an "informal appeal" to the Chair of the department within three (3) working days of an instructor's decision. We have created a webform specifically for appeals to the Chair, which can be found here: <https://carleton.ca/law/application-for-review-of-refusal-to-provide-academic-consideration/>. *Note: This form only applies to LAWS courses and is not the same as a formal appeal of grade.* More information about the academic consideration can be found [here](#).