

PHIL 2408 Bioethics Fall 2020

Professor Vida Panitch

vida.panitch@carleton.ca

PHIL 2408 [0.5 credit] Bioethics

Ethical and political issues in medicine, public health, biotechnology, and the life sciences. Topics may include reproductive ethics, research on human subjects, animal research and treatment, justice and health care, physician-patient relationships, death and the end of life, and genetic engineering. Precludes additional credit for PHIL 3408. Prerequisite(s): a course in philosophy or second year standing.

Course Description:

This course aims to introduce students to central debates in medical ethics. We will spend the majority of the course this fall exploring topics in bioethics most relevant to assessing the many ethical questions that have arisen in light of the COVID-19 pandemic. We will begin with a discussion of the philosophical principles that inform bioethical reasoning and go on to address the topics of public health and public health care, health resource allocation, the obligations of medical professionals, research on human subjects, vaccine enforcement, as well as social and global health justice.

Course Readings:

There are two texts for this course, available for online purchase as e-books or in print from Broadview Press www.broadviewpress.com

- *Well and Good, 4th Edition*, Thomas, Waluchow, and Gedge, eds. Broadview Press: 2014
- *The Ethics of Pandemics*, Schwartz, ed. Broadview Press: 2020

Readings from *Well and Good* are indicated in the course schedule as **WG**.

Readings from *The Ethics of Pandemics* are indicated in the course schedule as **EP**.

Additional readings indicated in the course schedule will be posted as PDFs on Cu Learn.

Course Evaluation:

Case Study Commentaries: 3 x 15% for a total of 45%

- Each commentary should be 3-4 pages in length double-spaced. Students must present the key ethical issues raised by the case they have chosen and offer their own critical assessment thereof. The details of the case should make up less than half of each commentary, while the student's own evaluation should substantiate more than the other half. The student should defend a particular resolution to the case, and offer an argument supporting this conclusion. Students may draw on readings from lecture in

their commentaries but are not required to do so. Commentaries are due via CU Learn on the dates indicated below. Late assignments will be penalized by 3% per day.

Tutorial Attendance and Participation: 10%

- Students are expected to virtually attend their weekly tutorials and to attend prepared, having done the required readings and watched the weekly lectures beforehand.

Final Take Home Exam: 45%

- The take home exam will be assigned in the last week of class and is due electronically on the last day of the fall exam period (December 23). Questions will be primarily essay-based and will require a careful analysis of the readings assigned for lectures.

Course Structure

Lectures

All lectures will be virtual and will be posted 24 hours before the official assigned class time of Mondays from 3:30-5:30. Lectures will consist of 3 or 4 videos per week, each 15-20 minutes in length. Students are expected to watch these ahead of the weekly discussion period and their weekly tutorial.

Lecture Discussion (optional)

Mondays from 4:30-5:30 via Zoom.

These virtual discussions will take place in real time every Monday, *beginning on September 14th*, in the second half of the assigned lecture time slot. This will give students the first half of the assigned lecture time slot to watch the lecture videos. The *discussion periods are optional*. Students who would like to discuss any aspect of the weekly readings or lectures are encouraged to call in and raise their questions via the chat function on zoom. Links to the discussions will be posted on Cu Learn when the weekly lectures are posted.

Tutorials

A01 Tuesdays 8:35-9:25 TA TBD

A02 Thursdays 11:35-12:25 TA TBD

A03 Wednesdays 8:35-9:25 TA TBD

A04 Thursdays 1:35-2:25 TA TBD

Tutorials will take place weekly via zoom *beginning the week of September 14th* and concluding December 10th. Tutorials are run in real time and virtual attendance is mandatory. Case study assignments will pertain to material covered exclusively in tutorial, and these assignments will only be discussed further by your tutorial leader.

Course Schedule

Week 1 (Sept 14-18): Introduction to the Course

Lecture and Discussion:

- EP 1.1: John Authers, "How Coronavirus is Shaking Up the Moral Universe."

Tutorial:

- WG Introduction: Ethical Resources for Decision-Making (parts 1, 2, 3, 5, 6a and 6b).

Week 2 (Sept 21-25): Reopening Too Soon?

Lecture and Discussion

- EP 8.1: Arthur Caplan, "The Price of Going Back to Work too Soon."
- EP 8.2: Conor Friedersdorf, "Take the Shutdown Skeptics Seriously."
- EP 8.3: Daniel Weinstock: A Harm Reduction Approach to Physical Distancing."

Tutorial

- EP Chapter 5 Case Study: *Staying in Business*.

Week 3 (Sept 28 -Oct 2): Public Health Care

Lecture and Discussion:

- Norman Daniels, "Health Care Needs and Distributive Justice" (pp. 146-160 only).
- Gopal Sreenivasan, "Health Care and Equality of Opportunity."

Tutorial:

- WG Case Study 2.2: *Social Determinants of Health*.

Week 4 (Oct 5-9): Health Resource Allocation

Lecture and Discussion:

- Joseph Heath, "Health Care as a Commodity."
- Alexander Cappelin and Ole Norheim, "Responsibility in Health Care."
- EP 4.1: Ezekiel Emanuel et al., "Fair Allocation of Scarce Medical Resources in the Time of COVID-19."

Tutorial

- WG Case Study 2.3: *An Artificial Heart: Allocating Health Care Funding*.
- WG Case Study 8.1: *Dialysis Machine Shortages: Who Shall Live?*

Week 5 (Oct 12-16): Thanksgiving

No lecture will be posted this Monday, so no discussion or tutorials will be held this week.

****First Case Study Commentary DUE OCTOBER 13 at 5 PM VIA CU LEARN on any ONE of the cases studied so far in the term.**

Week 6 (Oct 19-23): COVID-19 Resource Allocation

Lecture and Discussion

- EP 4.2: Angela Ballantyne, "ICU Triage: How Many Lives or Whose Lives?"
- EP 4.3: Jackie Leach Scully, "Disablism in the Time of Pandemic."

- EP 4.5: Franklin G. Miller: “Why I Support Age-Related Rationing of Ventilators.”

Tutorial:

- EP Chapter 4 Case Study: *Ventilator Shortages, Who Should Live?*

Week 7 (Oct 26-30): Reading Break

Week 8 (Nov 2-6): Obligations of Health Professionals

Lecture and Discussion:

- EP 2.1: Udo Schuklenk, “Health Professionals are under no Ethical Obligation to Treat COVID-19 Patients.”
- EP 2.2: Abbey Lowe et al., “How Should Clinicians Respond to International Public Health Emergencies?”
- EP 2.3: Seth Holmes and Liza Buchbinder, “In a Defunded Health System, Doctors and Nurses Suffer near Impossible Conditions.”

Tutorial

- EP Chapter 2 Case Study: *Health Care Without PPE.*

Week 9 (Nov 9-13): Research Ethics

Lecture and Discussion

- Nuremberg Code <https://history.nih.gov/research/downloads/nuremberg.pdf>
- Allan Brandt, “Racism and Research: The Case of the Tuskegee Syphilis Study.”
- Samuel Hellman and Deborah Hellman, “Of Mice but Not Men.”

Tutorial

- WG Case Study 3.1: *Research Involving Alzheimer Patients.*
- WG Case Study 7.3: *Who Owns the Research? The Case of The HeLa Cells.*

Week 10 (Nov 16-20): Research Ethics in a Pandemic

Lecture and Discussion:

- EP 6.1: Julian Savulescu, “Is it Right to Cut Corners in Search for a Coronavirus Cure?”
- EP 6.2: Nir Eyal et al., “Human Challenge Studies to Accelerate Coronavirus Vaccine Licensure.”
- EP 6.3: Kelly McBride Folkers and Arthur Caplan, “False Hopes about Coronavirus Treatments.”

Tutorial:

- WG Case Study 7.4: *Access to Experimental Drugs in a Catastrophe.*
- WG Case Study 7.5: *Pandemic Flu Ethics and Risk.*

****Second Case Study Commentary DUE NOVEMBER 13 at 5 PM VIA CU LEARN on any ONE of the cases studied since October 13.**

Week 11 (Nov 23-27): Research Ethics in a Global Context

Lecture and Discussion

- Marcia Angell, "The Ethics of Clinical Research in the Third World."
- Peter Lurie and Sydney Wolf, "Unethical Trials of Intervention to Reduce Perinatal Transmission of HIV in Developing Countries."
- Maged El Satouhy et al., "Moral Standards for Research in Developing Countries"

Tutorial:

- EP Chapter 6 Case Study: *Ethics and Global Research Programs*.

Week 12 (Nov 30-Dec 4): Vaccine Allocation and Enforcement

Lecture and Discussion

- Jason Brennan, "A Libertarian Case for Mandatory Vaccination."
- Euzebiusz Jamrozik et al., "Victims, Vectors, and Villains: Are Those who opt Out of Vaccination Morally Responsible for the Deaths of Others?"
- EP 8.4: Anthony Skelton and Lisa Forsberg, "Mandating Vaccination."

Tutorial

- WG Case Study 3.4: *Choosing not to Vaccinate*.
- EP Chapter 8 Case Study: *Choosing not to Vaccinate*.

Week 13 (Dec 7-11): Social and Global Health Justice

Lectures and Discussion

- EP 3.2: Charles Blow, "Social Distancing is a Privilege."
- EP 5.1: Shaun Ossei-Owosu, "Coronavirus and the Politics of Disposability."
- EP 5.2: Alex Broadbent and Benjamin Smart, "Why a One Size Fits All Approach to COVID-19 Could have Lethal Consequences."
- Thomas Pogge, "Responsibilities for Poverty Related Ill-health."

Tutorials

- WG Case Study 8.2: *Ethics and Humanitarian Aid: Vertical Aid Programs*.

****Third Case Study Commentary DUE DECEMBER 11 at 5 PM VIA CU LEARN on any ONE of the cases studied since November 13.**

****Note that although December 11 follows a Monday schedule, there will be no lecture or discussion session on this day.**

Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (Fall/Winter 2020-21)

Assignments:

Please follow your professor's instructions on how assignments will be handled electronically. There will be NO hard copies placed in the essay box this coming year.

Evaluation:

Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor subject to the approval of the Faculty Dean. This means that grades submitted by the instructor may be subject to revision. No grades are final until they have been approved by the Dean.

Deferrals for Term Work:

If students are unable to complete term work because of illness or other circumstances beyond their control, they should contact their course instructor no later than *three working days* of the due date. Normally, any deferred term work will be completed by the last day of the term. Term work cannot be deferred by the Registrar.

Deferrals for Final Exams:

Students are expected to be available for the duration of a course including the examination period. Occasionally, students encounter circumstances beyond their control where they may not be able to write a final examination or submit a take-home examination. Examples of this would be a serious illness or the death of a family member. If you miss a final examination and/or fail to submit a take-home examination by the due date, you may apply for a deferral no later than *three working days* after the original due date (as per the University Regulations in [Section 4.3 of the Undergraduate Calendar](#)). Visit the [Registrar's Office](#) for further information.

Plagiarism:

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of 'plagiarism' as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. ([Section 10.1 of the Undergraduate Calendar Academic Regulations](#))

Academic Accommodation:

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term:

- *Pregnancy or religious obligation:* write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the [EDC](#) website.
- *Academic accommodations for students with disabilities:* The [Paul Menton Centre](#) for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or pmc@carleton.ca for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send your Letter of Accommodation at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class test or exam requiring accommodation. After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with your professor to ensure accommodation arrangements are made.
- *Survivors of Sexual Violence:* As a community, Carleton University is committed to maintaining a positive learning, working and living environment where sexual violence will not be tolerated, and where survivors are supported through academic accommodations as per [Carleton's Sexual Violence Policy](#).
- *Accommodation for Student Activities:* Carleton University recognizes the substantial benefits, both to the individual student and for the university, that result from a student participating in activities beyond the classroom experience. Reasonable accommodation must be provided to students who compete or perform at the national or international level. Please contact your instructor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist.

Important Dates:

| | |
|------------|---|
| Sept. 9 | Classes start. |
| Sept. 23 | Last day for registration and course changes for fall term and fall/winter (two-term) courses. |
| Sept. 30 | Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from fall term or two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript. |
| Oct. 12 | Statutory holiday. University closed. |
| Oct. 26-30 | Fall Break – no classes. |
| Nov. 27 | Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, before the official examination period. |
| Dec. 11 | Last day of fall term classes. <i>Classes follow a Monday schedule.</i> Last day for academic withdrawal from fall term courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for a fall term course. |
| Dec. 12-23 | Final examinations for fall term courses and mid-term examinations in two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week. |
| Dec. 23 | All take-home examinations are due. |
| Jan. 6 | Classes begin. |
| Jan. 20 | Last day for registration and course changes in the winter term. |
| Jan. 31 | Last day for a full fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter term courses or from the winter portion of two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript. |
| Feb. 15 | Statutory holiday. University closed. |
| Feb. 15-19 | Winter Break – no classes. |
| Mar. 26 | Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, in winter term or fall/winter courses before the official examination period. |
| Apr. 2 | Statutory holiday. University closed. |
| Apr. 9 | Last day of two-term and winter term classes. Last day for academic withdrawal from fall/winter and winter courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for two-term and for winter term courses. |
| Apr. 10 | No classes or examinations take place. |
| Apr. 11-23 | Final examinations for winter term and two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week. |
| Apr. 23 | All take-home examinations are due. |

Addresses:

Department of Philosophy:
www.carleton.ca/philosophy
520-2110

Registrar's Office:
www.carleton.ca/registrar
520-3500

Academic Advising Centre:
www.carleton.ca/academicadvising
520-7850

Writing Services:
<http://www.carleton.ca/csas/writing-services/>
520-3822

MacOdrum Library
<http://www.library.carleton.ca/>
520-2735