**PHIL/COMS/LING 2504-A**

**Language and Communication**

Carleton University

Department of Philosophy

**Term**:  Winter 2023

**Meetings**:  Monday and Wednesday 1:05-2:25

**Venue**: SC103

**Instructor**:  Eros Corazza

**Office**:  Paterson Hall 3A41

**Office h.**:  by email

**Phone**:  520-2600 Ext: 2326

[**Email**](http://69.42.87.204/cgi-bin/ezlclk.fcgi?id=6817):  [eros\_corazza@yahoo.com](mailto:eros_corazza@yahoo.com); eros.corazza@carleton.ca

# 

# Course description

We shall begin by discussing some central topics of Frege’s philosophy of language. The main topics discussed will be: Frege’s sense/reference distinction, Frege’s theory of thought, Frege’s anti-psychologism and Frege’s theory of demonstratives. To understand the importance of Frege’s contribution we will focus on Dummett’s interpretation.

We shall then discuss some central topics from Wittgenstein’s *Philosophical Investigations* and the way they have been perceived within the philosophical community. Among these topics we shall discuss notions such as: language games, form of life, rule following, etc.

Finally, we shall look at the direct reference theory of proper names (Kripke, Donnellan, …) and the direct reference theory of indexicals (Kaplan, Perry, …). We shall pay particular attention to the notion of context and the way our linguistic interchange exploits it in order to single out objects of discourse. In so doing we shall see how direct reference deals with Frege’s and Wittgenstein’s conceptions of language.

**Diversity Statement**

Carleton University supports an inclusive learning environment where diverse communities and perspectives are recognized and respected. Our goal as a community is to always ensure a safe learning environment that welcomes open and honest dialogue. We do not allow any form of discrimination, including but not limited to those based on color, age, race, religion, disability, gender, gender identity, gender expression and sexual orientation. Faculty and students are expected to commit to creating a learning environment that encourages inquiry and self-expression, while also demonstrating diligence in respecting how other students may have different viewpoints than their own.

**Land Acknowledgment**

Carleton University acknowledges the location of its campus on the traditional, unceded territories of the Algonquin nation.

**COVID-19 and The Classroom**

All members of the Carleton community are required to follow COVID-19 prevention measures and all mandatory public health requirements. For the most recent information about Carleton’s COVID-19 response and required measures, please see the [University’s COVID-19 webpage](https://carleton.ca/covid19/)and review the [Frequently Asked Questions (FAQs).](https://carleton.ca/covid19/faq/) Should you have additional questions after reviewing, please contact [covidinfo@carleton.ca](file:///C:\Users\gigue\AppData\Roaming\Microsoft\Word\covidinfo@carleton.ca). Please note that Carleton University requirements may be more stringent than those established by the province. In such cases, all Carleton employees, students, and visitors are required to adhere to university regulations and requirements.

It is important to remember that COVID is still present in Ottawa. The situation can change at any time and the risks of new variants and outbreaks are very real. There are [a number of actions you can take](https://carleton.ca/covid19/health-and-safety/reducing-your-risks/) to lower your risk and the risk you pose to those around you including being vaccinated, wearing a mask, staying home when you’re sick, washing your hands and maintaining proper respiratory and cough etiquette.

**Feeling sick?**Remaining vigilant and not attending work or school when sick or with symptoms is critically important. If you feel ill or exhibit COVID-19 symptoms do not come to class or campus. If you feel ill or exhibit symptoms while on campus or in class, please leave campus immediately. In all situations, you must follow Carleton’s [symptom reporting protocols](https://carleton.ca/covid19/covid-19-symptom-reporting/).

**Masks:**In light of the recent announcements from Ontario’s Chief Medical Officer of Health and the evolving recommendations from Ottawa Public Health, **Carleton has paused its mandatory mask mandate as of June 25, 2022.**Even though masks will no longer be mandatory, **we continue to strongly recommend masking when indoors**, particularly if physical distancing cannot be maintained.

**Aims and Objectives**

The module aims to provide a general introduction to the development of some key notions pertaining to the philosophy of language. To do so we shall focus on some of Frege’s and Wittgenstein’s influential works and the way they have been perceived by the analytic philosophical community.

**Learning Outcomes**

By the end of the module you should be able to:

* **Understand notions** such as: the sense/reference distinction, the linguistic turn, anti-psychologism, language game, rule following, etc. (see *Module Content* and *Topics to be Discussed*, for detailed information on the notions/topics we’ll discuss).
* **Communication skills**: through essays writing and the feedback you will get on them you will further develop the capacity to present problems and propose solutions to them in a clear, precise and concise way. Through discussions you will also have the opportunity to develop the capacity to speak briefly and clearly on a given subject/problem, to ask questions and requests for clarification, and to contribute constructively to discussion.
* You will have lot of opportunities to **interact** with other students in discussing some of the issues we will be dealing with.

# Requirements

It is mandatory to access Brightspace for this course.

**Assignments**

Two short essays and a final (2 h.) exam

* Short Essay 1 (400 words maximum) weight: 30%
* Short Essay 2 (400 words maximum) weight: 30%
* Final Exam (answer 2 questions out of 5) weight: 40%

**Due Assignment**

See date posted with assignments questions

# Texts Recommended

# In bold characters the texts you *must* read. The other texts mentioned are extremely helpful in understanding and appreciating the text you must read.

# All the books should be on the short loan reserve in the library

# The *Stanford Encyclopaedia of Philosophy* is a valuable source

*On Frege:*

**Martinich (ed.). 2012. The Philosophy of Language. Oxford UP**

* Frege’s 2 papers you have to read are also in:

Beaney, M. (ed.), 1997, *The Frege Reader*. Blackwell, “**On Sinn und Bedeutung**” (p.151-71) and “**Thought**” (p.325-345)

Dummett, M., 1973, *Frege Philosophy of Language*, Oxford UP, ch. 5, ch. 6, ch. 11

Dummett, M., 1981, *The Interpretation of Frege’s Philosophy of Language*, Oxford UP, ch. 6, ch. 10

Dummett, M., 1993, *The Origins of Analytical Philosophy*, Harvard UP, ch. 2, ch. 4, ch. 10, ch. 13

Perry, J., 1977, “Frege on Demonstratives”, in Perry, J., 1994, *The Problem of the Essential Indexical*, Oxford UP, ch. 1

*On Wittgenstein:*

**Wittgenstein, L. *Philosophical Investigations*, Blackwell**

**Marie McGinn, 1997, *Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations*, Routledge**

Backer, G.P. & Hacker, P.M.S, 1980, *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Understanding Vol. 1*, Blackwell

Backer, G.P. & Hacker, P.M.S, 1985, *Wittgenstein: Rules, Grammar and Necessity Vol. 2*, Blackwell

Hacker, P.M.S, 1990, *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Mind Vol. 3*, Blackwell

Kripke, S. 1982. *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language*. Blackwell

*On Direct Reference:*

Corazza, E., 2004, *Reflecting the Mind*, Oxford UP, Oxford

Kaplan, D., 1977, “Demonstratives”, in Almog, J. et als. (eds.), 1989, *Themes From Kaplan*, Oxford UP, pp. 481-563

Kaplan, D, 1989, “Afterthought”, in Almog, J. et als. (eds.), 1989, *Themes From Kaplan*, Oxford UP, pp. 565-614

Perry, J., 2001/12, *Reference and Reflexivity*, CSLI Publications, Stanford

**Essay Topic****s**

You should write two essays of 400 words ***maximum***.

Essay 1. (deadline: February 1)

Is the following inference valid?

Mary believes that Hesperus is a star

Hesperus is Phosphorus

So: Mary believes that Phosphorus is a star

Why?

Essay 2. (deadline: March 1)

What’s the difference between Frege and Dummett’s Frege?

Final 2 h Exam

Answer 2 questions out of 5

**Topics to be discusses and suggestions for reading**

One topic per week

1. **Introduction: Terminological Remarks**
2. **Frege’s Puzzles**

Primary reading: Frege. “Sense and Reference”

Secondary reading: Dummett, *Frege Philosophy of Language*. ch. 5, ch. 6

1. **Fregean Thoughts**

Primary reading: Frege. “Thought”

Secondary reading: Dummett, *Frege Philosophy of Language*. ch. 11

1. **Dummett’s Frege**

Primary reading: Dummett, *Frege Philosophy of Language*. ch. 5, ch. 6, ch. 11

Secondary reading: Dummett, *The Interpretation of Frege’s Philosophy of Language*. ch. 6, ch. 10

1. **Frege’s Anti-Psychologism**

Primary reading: Frege. “Thought”

Primary reading: Dummett. *The Origins of Analytical Philosophy*. ch. 2, ch. 4, ch. 10, ch. 13

1. **The Sense/Reference Distinction Revisited**

Primary reading: Perry. “Frege on Demonstratives”

Secondary reading: Kaplan. “Demonstratives”

1. **Wittgenstein’s Methodology, the Augustinian Conception of Language, and Language *qua* Institution**

Primary reading: Wittgenstein. *Philosophical Investigations (part 1)*

Secondary reading: Backer & Hacker. *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Understanding*

Secondary reading: McGinn. *Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations*

1. **Ostensive Definitions, Indexicality, and the First Person**

Primary reading: Wittgenstein. *Philosophical Investigations (part 1)*

Primary reading: Wittgenstein. *The Brown Book (first part)*

Secondary reading: Backer & Hacker. *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Understanding*

1. **Meaning, Understanding, and Use**

Primary reading: Wittgenstein. *Philosophical Investigations (part 1)*

Secondary reading: Backer & Hacker. *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Understanding*

Secondary reading: McGinn. *Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations*

1. **Following a Rule**

Primary reading: Kripke. *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language*

Secondary reading: Backer & Hacker. *Wittgenstein: Rules, Grammar and Necessity.*

Secondary reading: McGinn. *Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations*

1. **The Private Language Argument and the Philosophy of Psychology**

Primary reading: Wittgenstein. *Philosophical Investigations (part 2)*

Secondary reading: Kripke. *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language*

Secondary reading: Hacker. *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Mind*

1. **Revision Class**

### Suggestions for Writing an Essay

### Source: *Episteme Links*

### *http://www.epistemelinks.com/index.aspx*

### Cf. G. J Mattey:

### http://philosophy.ucdavis.edu/mattey/phi22n/paphints.html

**Don't** bring in extraneous details about the context in which the works were written. Your paper assigments are focussed on a specific topic. Your paper must stick to that topic. For example, "Descartes was a philosopher who was born in France, lived in the Netherlands, and died in Sweden."

**Do** frame the nature of the philosophical problem clearly. For example, "Is it possible to demonstrate the existence of God using no other information except about what it is to be God?"

**Don't** go off on a tangent. "Some philosophers have tried to prove that God exists by claiming that the order of nature requires an intelligent designer. Others have thought that the world does not necessarily exist, and if so, then there must be a God which necessarily exists and explains why the world exists. The first kind of argument is called the 'argument from design' and the second kind is called the 'cosmological argument.'"

**Do** stick to the issues mentioned in the paper assignment.

**Don't** throw out opinions casually. Example. "How could anybody prove that God exists? That is the kind of things human beings are just incapable of knowing."

**Do** give reasons for any opinion you express. "Descartes claimed that there is a nature of God. But what evidence is there that there really is such a thing as a nature of God, rather than just a concept of God that we mak up ourselves?"

**Don't** make undocumented claims about what any of the authors wrote.

**Do** back up your description of the philosopher's position by use of quotations from the text. Parenthetical page references to the text are sufficient in lieu of footnotes. For example, "According to Descartes, God has a nature and this nature includes existence. He claims that his idea of God's nature is different from a false idea he made up himself, like a four-sided figure that is not a square but is inscribed in a circle. 'For there are a great many ways in which I understand that this idea is not an invention that is dependent on my thought, but is an image of a true and immutable nature' (p. 47)."

**Don't** use the words of others without quotation. This is plagiarism, which is a punishable academic offence. Your reader will be watching out for plagiarism. One good way to recognize when you are plagiarizing is to notice any change of style, say some sentences which use a lot of words you do not use ordinarily, or whose grammatical structure is very different from your own.

**Do** use your own words to paraphrase what an author says.

**Don't** neglect to address all points in the paper topic in detail.

**Do** provide sufficient detail on all points, so that the grader can recognize your mastery of them.

**Don't** pad your paper or eliminate vital parts to get it to the suggested length.

**Do** write economically. Make the paper just long enough to complete the required tasks and no longer. If you deviate significantly from the suggested length, consider whether you have said too much or left something out.

**Don't** simply write down a bunch of logically unconnected statements or assertions. For example, "Descartes tried to prove that God exists in a couple of ways. Spinoza tried to do the same thing, but he did it differently. Descartes just makes a lot of things up, and Spinoza does too."

**Do** present the material in the form of arguments. One way of looking at an argument is as the defense of a conclusion by appeal to premises which are acceptable to anyone who considers them objectively, such as that it impossible to think of God except as existing. "From the fact that I cannot think of God except as existing, it follows that existence is inseparable form God, and that for this reason he really exists" (p. 46).

**Don't** use colloquial language to make a point. For example, "Descartes's second attempt to prove God's existence was totally lame."

**Do** use standard language.

**Don't** confuse technical language with ordinary language. For example, Descartes's use of 'nature' is sometimes different from ordinary uses, such as 'part of the earth that is not developed by humans.'

**Do** explain any technical terms when you introduce them. For example, "The 'ontological argument' is an attempt to prove that God exists simply from the definition, or nature, or idea of God."

**Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (Fall/Winter 2022-23)**

**Assignments:**

Please follow your professor’s instructions on how assignments will be handled electronically. There will be NO hard copies placed in the essay box this coming year.

**Evaluation:**

Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor subject to the approval of the Faculty Dean. This means that grades submitted by the instructor may be subject to revision. No grades are final until they have been approved by the Dean.

**Deferrals for Term Work:**

If students are unable to complete term work because of illness or other circumstances beyond their control, they should contact their course instructor no later than *three working days* of the due date. Normally, any deferred term work will be completed by the last day of the term. Term work cannot be deferred by the Registrar.

**Deferrals for Final Exams:**

Students are expected to be available for the duration of a course including the examination period. Occasionally, students encounter circumstances beyond their control where they may not be able to write a final examination or submit a take-home examination. Examples of this would be a serious illness or the death of a family member. If you miss a final examination and/or fail to submit a take-home examination by the due date, you may apply for a deferral no later than *three working days* after the original due date (as per the University Regulations in [Section 4.3 of the Undergraduate Calendar](https://calendar.carleton.ca/undergrad/regulations/academicregulationsoftheuniversity/examinations/#deferred-final-exams)). Visit the [Registrar’s Office](https://carleton.ca/registrar/special-requests/) for further information.

## Statement on Plagiarism

Please be careful to avoid plagiarism and other Academic Integrity violations. The Carleton University Senate defines plagiarism as “presenting, whether intentionally or not, the ideas, expression of ideas, or work of others as one’s own”. Please follow program and class policies as well as Carleton’s [Academic Integrity Policy.](https://carleton.ca/registrar/wp-content/uploads/Academic-Integrity-policy-June-2021.pdf)

Examples of plagiarism can include the following:

• Reproducing or paraphrasing portions of someone else’s published or unpublished material, regardless of the source, and presenting these as one’s own without proper citation or reference to the source.

• Submitting a take-home examination, essay, laboratory report or other assignment written, in whole or in part, by someone else.

• Using ideas or direct, verbatim quotations, or paraphrased material, concepts, or ideas without appropriate acknowledgment in any academic assignment.

• Using another’s data or research findings.

• Failing to acknowledge sources using proper citations when using another’s works and/or failing to use quotation marks.

Approval of final grades

Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor subject to the approval of the Faculty Dean. This means that grades submitted by an instructor may be subject to revision. No grades are final until they have been approved by the Dean.

The system of grades used, with corresponding grade points is as follows.

| **Percentage** | **Letter grade** | **12-point scale** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 90-100 | A+ | 12 |
| 85-89 | A | 11 |
| 80-84 | A- | 10 |
| 77-79 | B+ | 9 |
| 73-76 | B | 8 |
| 70-72 | B- | 7 |
| 67-69 | C+ | 6 |
| 63-66 | C | 5 |
| 60-62 | C- | 4 |
| 57-59 | D+ | 3 |
| 53-56 | D | 2 |
| 50-52 | D- | 1 |

Academic Accommodation  
You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. Please visit the [process for academic accommodation requests](https://students.carleton.ca/course-outline/) website for more information.

For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

Pregnancy obligation:

write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the  
first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For accommodation regarding a formally-scheduled final exam, you must complete the [Pregnancy Accommodation Form](https://carleton.ca/equity/contact/form-pregnancy-accommodation/).

Religious obligation:

write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the  
first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details [click here](https://carleton.ca/equity/focus/discrimination-harassment/religious-spiritual-observances/).

### Academic Accommodations for Students with Disabilities:

The Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities ([PMC](https://carleton.ca/pmc/)) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or pmc@carleton.ca for a formal evaluation. If you are already  
registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send me your Letter of  
Accommodation at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (if applicable). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with me to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC website for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (if applicable).

Survivors of Sexual Violence  
As a community, Carleton University is committed to maintaining a positive learning, working and living environment where sexual violence will not be tolerated, and where survivors are supported through academic accommodations as per Carleton’s Sexual Violence Policy. For more information about the services available at the university and to obtain information about sexual violence and/or support, visit: <https://carleton.ca/equity/focus/sexual-violence-prevention-survivor-support/>

Accommodation for Student Activities  
Carleton University recognizes the substantial benefits, both to the individual student and for the university, that result from a student participating in activities beyond the classroom experience. Reasonable accommodation will be provided to students who compete or perform at the national or international level. Write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. <https://carleton.ca/senate/wp-content/uploads/Accommodation-for-Student-Activities-1.pdf>

## Student Supports and Resources

* [The Centre for Student Academic Support (CSAS)](https://carleton.ca/csas/)
  + 613-520-3822
* [Carleton Health and Counselling Services](https://carleton.ca/health/)
  + 613-520-6674
* [International Students Support Office (ISSO)](https://carleton.ca/isso/)
  + 613-520-6600
* [Centre for Indigenous Initiatives](https://carleton.ca/indigenous/policies-procedures/algonquin-territory-acknowledgment/)
  + Indigenous@carleton.ca
* [Ojigkwanong Indigenous Student Centre](https://carleton.ca/indigenous/students/ojigkwanong-indigenous-student-centre/)
  + Indigenous@carleton.ca
* [Equity and Inclusive Communities (EIC)](https://carleton.ca/equity/)
  + 613-520-2600 X5622
* [Trans Resource Hub](https://carleton.ca/trans/pronouns/)
  + 613-520-2600 X5622
* [Accessibility Supports](https://carleton.ca/accessibility/)
  + 613-520-2600 X7323
* [Campus Safety](https://carleton.ca/safety/)
  + Emergency: 613-520-4444
* [Paul Menton Centre](https://carleton.ca/pmc/)
  + 613-520-6608
* Coalition for a Carleton Sexual Assault Centre Peer Support Line
  + 613-620-1030
* CUSA Gender and Sexuality Resource Centre
  + @CUSA\_GSRC
  + 613-560-2600 X3723
* CUSA Womyn’s Centre
  + @Womyn’s\_Centre
  + 613-560-2600 X2712
* CUSA Foot Patrol
  + 613-520-4066
* **Carleton Communications Student Society**
  + @cucomssociety

**Important Dates:**

Sept. 7 Classes start.

Sept. 20 Last day for registration and course changes for fall term and fall/winter (two-term) courses.

Sept. 30 Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from fall term or two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript.

Oct. 10 Statutory holiday. University closed.

Oct. 24-28 Fall Break – no classes.

Nov. 25 Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, before the official examination period.

Dec. 9 Last day of fall term classes. ***Classes follow a Monday schedule***. Last day for academic withdrawal from fall term courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for a fall term course.

Dec. 10-22 Final examinations for fall term courses and mid-term examinations in two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.

Dec. 22 All take-home examinations are due.

Jan. 9 Classes begin.

Jan. 20 Last day for registration and course changes in the winter term.

Jan. 31 Last day for a full fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter term courses or from the winter portion of two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript.

Feb. 20 Statutory holiday. University closed.

Feb. 20-24 Winter Break – no classes.

Mar. 29 Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, in winter term or fall/winter courses before the official examination period.

Apr. 7 Statutory holiday. University closed.

Apr. 12 Last day of two-term and winter term classes. ***Classes follow a Friday schedule.*** Last day for academic withdrawal from fall/winter and winter courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for two-term and for winter term courses.

Apr. 13-14 No classes or examinations take place.

Apr. 15-27 Final examinations for winter term and two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.

Apr. 27 All take-home examinations are due.

**Addresses:**

Department of Philosophy:

[www.carleton.ca/philosophy](http://www.carleton.ca/philosophy)

520-2110

Registrar’s Office:

[www.carleton.ca/registrar](http://www.carleton.ca/registrar)

520-3500

Academic Advising Centre:

[www.carleton.ca/academicadvising](http://www.carleton.ca/academicadvising)

520-7850

Writing Services:

<http://www.carleton.ca/csas/writing-services/>

520-3822

MacOdrum Library

<http://www.library.carleton.ca/>

520-2735