**PHIL 4100 Health Justice - Winter 2022**

Professor Vida Panitch

vida.panitch@carleton.ca

Wednesdays 2:35-5:25

Virtual Meetings: <https://carleton-ca.zoom.us/j/98325050020>

In Person Meetings: Residence Commons 210

Email for appointments

**Course Outline:**

This course addresses two key questions of health as a matter of distributive justice. The first is whether the body is suitably the subject of market exchange; that is, whether bodily goods pertinent to health and well-being should be allocated through market mechanisms, and thus on the basis of ability to pay rather than, say, on the basis of need. The second is whether the principles typically thought appropriate to governing the allocation of scarce health-related goods have been revealed to be morally arbitrary, or worse, morally unjust, by allocative practices in the time of COVID-19. In sum, the first part of the course will look at the justifiability of bodily commodification as a question of health justice, and the second part will look at inequality in access to life saving treatments and inequalities in the social determinants of health as questions of health justice.

**Course Readings:**

All readings are available as PDFs on the course webpage.

**Course Assignments:**

For the first part of this course, you will write two “referee reports” of 3 pages each, critically assessing the novelty, strength of argumentation, and relevance to the field of research of the assigned readings. You must select two papers on which to write your reports from those assigned in the first part of the course (aside from the Daniels and Heath readings assigned for January 19). One must be submitted by email no later than February 2nd and the other by email no later than February 23rd. You will also write a final take home exam of 10-12 pages weighted heavily towards topics covered in the second half of the course. Questions will be assigned and discussed on the last day of class, and the exam will be due by email at 4 pm on the last day of the spring exam period, April 28th.

Referee Report 1: 17.5% (by February 2)

Referee Report 2: 17.5% (by February 23)

Course Participation: 10%

Take Home Exam: 55% (by April 28)

**Course Schedule:**

**Part 1: Bodily Commodification and Health Justice**

January 12: Online

* Introduction to the Course: No Readings

January 19: Online

* Health Care Needs and Distributive Justice, Norman Daniels

pp 146-160 required, pp 160-179 recommended

* Health Care as a Commodity, Joseph Heath
* Commodifying Health Care, L. Chad Horne

January 26: Online

* The Commodification of Organs, James Stacey Taylor
* If You’re Such an Altruist, Why Don’t you Sell Your Plasma? Peter M. Jaworski

February 2: Online TBD

* Gametes and Markets, Kimberley Krawiec
* Commercial Surrogacy, Stephen Wilkinson

February 9: Online TBD

* Contract Sex, Laurie Shrage
* Care Work as a Commodity, Jennifer Nedelsky

February 16: Online

* Guest Lecture: Juliana Bidadanure, Philosophy, Stanford University.
* Readings forthcoming

February 23: Winter Break

**Part 2: Health Justice in a Pandemic**

March 2: In-Person TBD

* Health Care and Equality of Opportunity, Gopal Sreenivasan
* Fair Allocation of Scarce Medical Resources in the Time of Covid-19, EJ Emanuel et al
* Predictable Inequalities of COVID 19 in the U.S., Sean A. Valles

March 9: In-Person TBD

* Long term Care for the Elderly: Whose Responsibility Is It? Rosemary Tong
* For-Profit Long Term Care Homes and The Risk of Covid Outbreaks, Nathan M Stall et al
* Why Lockdown of the Elderly is Not Ageist, Julian Savulescu and James Cameron
* Why I Support Age-Related Rationing of Ventilators for COVID Patients, Franklin Miller

March 16: In-Person TBD

* Black Lives in a Pandemic: Implications of Systemic Injustice for End-of-Life Care, Alan Elbaum
* Truth and Reconciliation of Racial and Ethnic Disparities: A Case Study of Covid 19, Alice Popejoy
* Race, Racism, and Structural Injustice: Equitable Allocation and Distribution of Vaccines for COVID 19, Helen Gayle and James Childress
* COVID-19 Vaccine Acceptance and Beliefs Among Black and Hispanic Americans, Katherine Kricorian and Karin Turner

March 23: In-Person TBD

* COVID-19, Gender Inequality, and the Responsibility of the State, Nikki Fortier
* COVID-19 Highlighting Inequalities in Access to Healthcare in England: A Case Study of Ethnic and Migrant Women, Sabrina Germain and Adrienne Yong
* COVID-19 and Trans Healthcare, Gen Eckers
* The Shadow Pandemic in India, Sanghmitra Acharya et al

March 30: In-Person TBD

* Responsibility for Poverty-Related Ill Health, Thomas Pogge
* An Ethical Framework for Global Vaccine Allocation, Ezekiel Emanuel et al
* Allocating Vaccines in a World of Competing Obligations, Kyle Ferguson and Arthur Caplan
* Against Vaccine Nationalism, Nicole Hassoun

April 6: Online and Optional

* Course conclusion and take-home exam discussion

**Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (Fall/Winter 2021-22)**

**Assignments:**

Please follow your professor’s instructions on how assignments will be handled electronically. There will be NO hard copies placed in the essay box this coming year.

**Evaluation:**

Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor subject to the approval of the Faculty Dean. This means that grades submitted by the instructor may be subject to revision. No grades are final until they have been approved by the Dean.

**Deferrals for Term Work:**

If students are unable to complete term work because of illness or other circumstances beyond their control, they should contact their course instructor no later than *three working days* of the due date. Normally, any deferred term work will be completed by the last day of the term. Term work cannot be deferred by the Registrar.

**Deferrals for Final Exams:**

Students are expected to be available for the duration of a course including the examination period. Occasionally, students encounter circumstances beyond their control where they may not be able to write a final examination or submit a take-home examination. Examples of this would be a serious illness or the death of a family member. If you miss a final examination and/or fail to submit a take-home examination by the due date, you may apply for a deferral no later than *three working days* after the original due date (as per the University Regulations in [Section 4.3 of the Undergraduate Calendar](https://calendar.carleton.ca/undergrad/regulations/academicregulationsoftheuniversity/examinations/#deferred-final-exams)). Visit the [Registrar’s Office](https://carleton.ca/registrar/special-requests/) for further information.

**Plagiarism:**

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of ‘plagiarism’ as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. ([Section 10.1 of the Undergraduate Calendar Academic Regulations](https://calendar.carleton.ca/undergrad/regulations/academicregulationsoftheuniversity/academic-integrity-and-offenses-of-conduct/#academic-integrity-policy))

**Academic Accommodation:**

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term:

* *Pregnancy or religious obligation*: write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the [EDC](https://carleton.ca/edc/teachingresources/administrative-pedagogy/academic-accommodations/) website.
* *Academic accommodations for students with disabilities:* The [Paul Menton Centre](https://carleton.ca/pmc/) for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or [pmc@carleton.ca](mailto:pmc@carleton.ca) for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send your Letter of Accommodation at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class test or exam requiring accommodation. After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with your professor to ensure accommodation arrangements are made.
* *Survivors of Sexual Violence*: As a community, Carleton University is committed to maintaining a positive learning, working and living environment where sexual violence will not be tolerated, and where survivors are supported through academic accommodations as per [Carleton’s Sexual Violence Policy](https://carleton.ca/sexual-violence-support/).
* *Accommodation for* [*Student Activities*](https://carleton.ca/senate/wp-content/uploads/Accommodation-for-Student-Activities-1.pdf)*:* Carleton University recognizes the substantial benefits, both to the individual student and for the university, that result from a student participating in activities beyond the classroom experience. Reasonable accommodation must be provided to students who compete or perform at the national or international level. Please contact your instructor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist.

**Important Dates:**

Sept. 8 Classes start.

Sept. 22 Last day for registration and course changes for fall term and fall/winter (two-term) courses.

Sept. 30 Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from fall term or two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript.

Oct. 11 Statutory holiday. University closed.

Oct. 25-29 Fall Break – no classes.

Nov. 26 Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, before the official examination period.

Dec. 10 Last day of fall term classes. ***Classes follow a Monday schedule***. Last day for academic withdrawal from fall term courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for a fall term course.

Dec. 11-23 Final examinations for fall term courses and mid-term examinations in two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.

Dec. 23 All take-home examinations are due.

Jan. 10 Classes begin.

Jan. 24 Last day for registration and course changes in the winter term.

Jan. 31 Last day for a full fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter term courses or from the winter portion of two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript.

Feb. 21 Statutory holiday. University closed.

Feb. 22-25 Winter Break – no classes.

Mar. 29 Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, in winter term or fall/winter courses before the official examination period.

Apr. 12 Last day of two-term and winter term classes. ***Classes follow a Friday schedule.*** Last day for academic withdrawal from fall/winter and winter courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for two-term and for winter term courses.

Apr. 13 No classes or examinations take place.

Apr. 14-28 Final examinations for winter term and two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.

Apr. 15 Statutory holiday. University closed.

Apr. 28 All take-home examinations are due.

**Addresses:**

Department of Philosophy:

[www.carleton.ca/philosophy](http://www.carleton.ca/philosophy)

520-2110

Registrar’s Office:

[www.carleton.ca/registrar](http://www.carleton.ca/registrar)

520-3500

Academic Advising Centre:

[www.carleton.ca/academicadvising](http://www.carleton.ca/academicadvising)

520-7850

Writing Services:

<http://www.carleton.ca/csas/writing-services/>

520-3822

MacOdrum Library

<http://www.library.carleton.ca/>

520-2735