# **PHIL 4330: Basic Income and Distributive Justice**

Fall 2024 Thursday 11:35 am-2:35 pm Paterson 3A35

Professor Vida Panitch [vida.panitch@carleton.ca](mailto:vida.panitch@carleton.ca)

Office Paterson 3A55 Wednesdays 4-5 or by appointment.

\*This course meets in person except on Sept 5, which will be online. See link below.

# **Course Overview:**

The topic of an Unconditional Basic Income (UBI) has recently become one of interest in the public forum, spurred on in part by the economic and public health pressures caused by the pandemic. But philosophers have been debating the merits of a UBI for decades now, as part of a larger inquiry into the demands of distributive justice. We will be exploring these arguments and evaluating whether the weight of the reasons that have been supplied for a UBI could indeed be expected to generate a social policy capable of achieve the lofty goals its proponents imagine. We will explore varied and often competing arguments for a UBI, including those from egalitarian, libertarian, communitarian, feminist, labour, and environmentalist theorists, and look at basic income experiments both past and present.

# **Assignments:**

**Group Presentation**: **30%**

**Argument Reconstructions x4:** **30%**

**Take Home Exam**: **40%**

**Seminar Presentation 30%:** Students will work in groups of 2 to present on a basic income case study: a basic income pilot that has been implemented somewhere in the world, for example, in Manitoba, Ontario, the United States, Spain, Finland, Iran, Kenya, etc. Students must select their case study no later than October 7. Students must choose 2 background readings to assign for their presentation. These must be circulated at least one week before the presentation. The readings must include a policy or empirical piece and a more normative analysis of the case or issues that it raised. Groups must submit a 5-page report on the day of their presentation, addressing the points below. Groups will have 35-40 minutes to present including discussion.

During their presentation, and for their report, students should explore:

* + 1. The stated aims the policy was implemented to address and whether these draw from or conflict with the theoretical arguments we will have looked at;
    2. Whether the policy did or is proving successful with respect to the stated aims;
    3. What ongoing lessons and considerations can or should be drawn from the case with respect to basic income policy more broadly, as well as basic income philosophy.

**Argument Reconstructions 4 x 7.5 = 30%:** Students will prepare argument reconstructions four times during the term. An argument reconstruction should be no less than one page and no longer than 2 pages and should identify the central premises of *one* assigned article and the supporting argumentation the author provides, while presenting them in a logical progression to arrive at the article’s main conclusion(s). Students should submit these by email two hours before class as they will be circulated prior to class. Students must submit at least one per month.

**Take Home Exam 40%:** Students will choose a paper topic for their final exam in consultation with the instructor. Topics must be selected no later than November 28. Research materials may draw from, but should also expand beyond, both the theoretical and practical readings covered throughout the course. Papers must be 10-12 pp. double-spaced and are due by 4 pm on the last day of the December exam period (Dec. 21).

**Course Schedule:**

All readings are either linked from the syllabus or available as PDFs on Brightspace.

**September 5:** **Introduction to the Course: ONLINE (today only)**

* Annie Lowrey, “The Future of Not Working, *NYT Magazine* February 26, 2017.

<https://www.nytimes.com/2017/02/23/magazine/universal-income-global-inequality.html>

**September 12: Distributive Justice and the Welfare State**

* Philippe Van Parijs, “Competing Justifications of Basic Income,” *Arguing for Basic Income: Ethical Foundations for a Radical Reform*, Philippe Van Parijs, ed. (Verso, 1992): 3-43.
* John Rawls, *A Theory of Justice 2nd Edition* (Harvard, 1971/99): 3-19, 47-81, 102-135.

**September 19: Basic Income, Freedom, and Self-Ownership**

* Philippe Van Parijs, “Why Surfers Should be Fed: The Liberal Case for an Unconditional Basic Income,” *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 20.2 (1991): 101-131.
* Philippe Van Parijs, *Real Freedom for All: What if Anything Can Justify Capitalism*? (Oxford, 1995): 5-45

**September 26: Basic Income, Efficiency, and Neutrality**

* Milton Friedman, “The Case for a Negative Income Tax: A View from the Right,” *Proceedings of the National Symposium on Guaranteed Income* (US Chamber of Commerce, December 1966): 49-55.
* Charles Murray, “Guaranteed Income as a Replacement for the Welfare State,” *Basic Income Studies* 3.2 (2008): 1-12.
* Joseph Heath and Vida Panitch, “How Cash Violates Neutrality,” *Basic Income Studies* 5.1 (2010): 1-26.

**October 3 Basic Income, Reciprocity, and Exploitation**

* Brian Barry, “Basic Income and the Work Ethic,” *Boston Review*, October 1, 2000.

<http://bostonreview.net/forum/basic-income-all/brian-barry-ubi-and-work-ethic>

* Elizabeth Anderson, “Optional Freedoms,” *Boston Review*, October 1, 2000.

<http://bostonreview.net/forum/basic-income-all/elizabeth-anderson-optional-freedoms>

* Stuart White, “Liberal Equality, Exploitation, and the Case for an Unconditional Basic Income, *Political Studies* 45.2 (1997): 312-326.
* Phillipe Van Parijs, “Reciprocity and the Justification of an Unconditional Basic Income: Reply to Stuart White,” *Political Studies* 45.2 (1997): 327-330.

**October 10: Basic Income, Reciprocity, and Exploitation cont.**

* Michael W. Howard, “Exploitation, Labor, and Basic Income,” *Analyse & Kritik* 37.1-2 (2015): 281-303.
* Shlomi Segall, “Unconditional Welfare Benefits and the Principle of Reciprocity,” *Politics, Philosophy, and Economics* 4.3 (2005): 331-354.
* Cartriona McKinnon, “Basic Income, Self-Respect and Reciprocity,” *Journal of Applied Philosophy* 20.2 (2003): 143-158.

**October 17: Basic Income, Post-Productivism, and Democracy**

* Robert Goodin, “Work and Welfare: Towards a Post-Productivist Welfare Regime,” *British Journal of Political Science* 31.1 (2001): 13-39.
* Vida Panitch, “Basic Income, Decommodification, and the Welfare State,” *Philosophy and Social Criticism* 37.8 (2010): 935-945.
* Carole Pateman, “Democratizing Citizenship: Some Advantages of a Basic Income,” *Politics & Society* 32.1 (2004): 89-105.

**October 31: Guest Lecture**

* Readings TBD

**November 7: Basic Income, Feminism, and Women’s Unpaid Labour**

* Julieta Elgarte, “Basic Income and the Gendered Division of Labour,” *Basic Income Studies* 3.3 (2008): 1-7.
* Ingrid Robeyns, “Will a Basic Income do Justice to Women?” *Analyse & Kritik* 23.1 (2001): 88-105.
* Ailsa McKay, “Rethinking Work and Income Maintenance Policy: Promoting Gender Equality Through a Citizens’ Basic Income,” *Feminist Economics* 7.1 (2001): 97-118.

**November 14: Basic Income, Ecology, and Automation**

* Jan Otto Anderson, “Basic Income from an Ecological Perspective,” *Basic Income Studies* 4.2 (2009): 1-8.
* Yannick Vanderbrought, “Why Trade Unions Oppose Basic Income” *Basic Income Studies* 1.1 (2006): 1-20.
* Ville-Veike Pulkka, “A Free Lunch with Robots – Can a Basic Income Stabilize the Digital Economy?” *Transfer: European Review of Labour and Research* 23.3 (2017): 295-311.

**November 21: Case Study Presentations**

**Case Study #1: TBD**

Students: MA 1

Reading 1:

Reading 2:

**Case Study #2: TBD**

Students: MA 2

Reading 1:

Reading 2:

**November 28: Case Study Presentations**

**Case Study #3: TBD**

Students: UG group 1

Reading 1:

Reading 2:

**Case Study #4: TBD**

Students: UG group 2

Reading 1:

Reading 2:

**Case Study #5: TBD**

Students: UG group 3

Reading 1:

Reading 2:

**Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (Fall/Winter 2024-25)**

**Assignments:**

Please follow your professor’s instructions on how assignments will be handled electronically. There will be NO hard copies placed in the essay box this coming year.

**Evaluation:**

Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor subject to the approval of the Faculty Dean. This means that grades submitted by the instructor may be subject to revision. No grades are final until they have been approved by the Dean.

**Deferrals for Term Work:**

If students are unable to complete term work because of illness or other circumstances beyond their control, they should contact their course instructor no later than *three working days* of the due date. Normally, any deferred term work will be completed by the last day of the term. Term work cannot be deferred by the Registrar.

**Deferrals for Final Exams:**

Students are expected to be available for the duration of a course including the examination period. Occasionally, students encounter circumstances beyond their control where they may not be able to write a final examination or submit a take-home examination. Examples of this would be a serious illness or the death of a family member. If you miss a final examination and/or fail to submit a take-home examination by the due date, you may apply for a deferral no later than *three working days* after the original due date (as per the University Regulations in [Section 4.3 of the Undergraduate Calendar](https://calendar.carleton.ca/undergrad/regulations/academicregulationsoftheuniversity/examinations/#deferred-final-exams)). Visit the [Registrar’s Office](https://carleton.ca/registrar/special-requests/) for further information.

**Plagiarism:**

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of ‘plagiarism’ as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. ([Section 10.1 of the Undergraduate Calendar Academic Regulations](https://calendar.carleton.ca/undergrad/regulations/academicregulationsoftheuniversity/academic-integrity-and-offenses-of-conduct/#academic-integrity-policy))

**Academic Accommodation:**

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term:

* *Pregnancy or religious obligation*: write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the [EDC](https://carleton.ca/edc/teachingresources/administrative-pedagogy/academic-accommodations/) website.
* *Academic accommodations for students with disabilities:* The [Paul Menton Centre](https://carleton.ca/pmc/) for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or [pmc@carleton.ca](mailto:pmc@carleton.ca) for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send your Letter of Accommodation at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class test or exam requiring accommodation. After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with your professor to ensure accommodation arrangements are made.
* *Survivors of Sexual Violence*: As a community, Carleton University is committed to maintaining a positive learning, working and living environment where sexual violence will not be tolerated, and where survivors are supported through academic accommodations as per [Carleton’s Sexual Violence Policy](https://carleton.ca/sexual-violence-support/).
* *Accommodation for* [Student Activities](https://carleton.ca/senate/wp-content/uploads/Accommodation-for-Student-Activities-1.pdf)*:* Carleton University recognizes the substantial benefits, both to the individual student and for the university, that result from a student participating in activities beyond the classroom experience. Reasonable accommodation must be provided to students who compete or perform at the national or international level. Please contact your instructor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist.

**Important Dates:**

Sept. 4 Classes start.

Sept. 17 Last day for registration and course changes for fall term and fall/winter (two-term) courses.

Sept. 30 Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from fall term or two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript.

Oct. 14 Statutory holiday. University closed.

Oct. 21-25 Fall Break – no classes.

Nov. 22 Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, before the official examination period.

Dec. 6 Last day of fall term classes. ***Classes follow a Monday schedule***. Last day for academic withdrawal from fall term courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for a fall term course.

Dec. 9-21 Final examinations for fall term courses and mid-term examinations in two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.

Dec. 21 All take-home examinations are due.

Jan. 6 Classes begin.

Jan. 17 Last day for registration and course changes in the winter term.

Jan. 31 Last day for a full fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter term courses or from the winter portion of two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript.

Feb. 17 Statutory holiday. University closed.

Feb. 17-21 Winter Break – no classes.

Mar. 15 Last day for academic withdrawal from fall/winter and winter courses.

Mar. 25 Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, in winter term or fall/winter courses before the official examination period.

Apr. 8 Last day of two-term and winter term classes.Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for two-term and for winter term courses.

Apr. 9-10 No classes or examinations take place.

Apr. 11-26 Final examinations for winter term and two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.

Apr. 18 Statutory holiday. University closed.

Apr. 26 All take-home examinations are due.

**Addresses:**

Department of Philosophy:[www.carleton.ca/philosophy](http://www.carleton.ca/philosophy) 520-2110

Registrar’s Office:[www.carleton.ca/registrar](http://www.carleton.ca/registrar) 520-3500

Academic Advising Centre: [www.carleton.ca/academicadvising](http://www.carleton.ca/academicadvising) 520-7850

Writing Services: <http://www.carleton.ca/csas/writing-services/> 520-3822

MacOdrum Library <http://www.library.carleton.ca/> 520-2735