

Bioethics PHIL 2408

Fall 2019 Lectures M 2:35-4:25 ME3275

Professor Vida Panitch vida.panitch@carleton.ca

Office: Paterson Hall 3A55 Mondays 5:00-6:00 pm

PHIL 2408 [0.5 credit]

Bioethics

Ethical and political issues in medicine, public health, biotechnology, and the life sciences. Topics may include reproductive ethics, research on human subjects, animal research and treatment, justice and health care, physician-patient relationships, death and the end of life, and genetic engineering.

Precludes additional credit for PHIL 3408.

Prerequisite(s): a course in philosophy or second-year standing.

Lectures three hours a week.

Course Description:

This course introduces students to central debates in medical ethics. It begins with a discussion of the philosophical principles that inform bioethical reasoning, and proceeds to address the topics of public health care, research on human subjects, physician assisted death, reproductive ethics, and genetic enhancement.

Course Readings:

There will be an average of 4 readings per week, typically 2 for lecture and 2 for tutorial. Lecture readings are all available as PDFs on Cu Learn, unless otherwise indicated in the course schedule below. Tutorial case study readings are all available from the textbook *Well and Good, 4th edition*, by Thomas, Waluchow, & Gedge, unless otherwise indicated in the course schedule below. The textbook is available from the Carleton bookstore, in print or as an e-book.

Course Evaluation:

Case Study Commentaries: 3 x 15% for a total of 45%

- Each commentary should be 4 pages in length double-spaced. In these commentaries, students must present the key ethical issues raised by the case they have chosen and offer their own critical assessment thereof. The presentation of the details of the case should substantiate less than one half of each commentary, while the student's own evaluation of the case should substantiate more than one half. The student's assessment should contain a conclusion in favour of a particular resolution to the case, and an argument supporting this conclusion. Students may draw on readings from lecture or tutorial in constructing their argument. Commentaries are due at the beginning of lecture on the dates indicated in the course schedule below. Students must identify themselves and their TA on their commentary when they submit.

Tutorial attendance: 10%

Take Home Exam: 45%

- The take home exam will be assigned on the last day of class, and due on the last day of the exam period. Questions will be primarily essay-based and will require a careful analysis of the readings assigned for lectures.

Course Schedule:

Week 1: Introduction

Lecture Sept 9:

- Ethical Resources for Decision-Making, *Well and Good*, 13-27

Tutorial Sept 9 or 13:

- No tutorials will be held this week

Week 2: Public vs. Private Health Care

Lecture Sept 16:

- Norman Daniels, "Health Care Needs and Distributive Justice" (146-160 only)
- Gopal Sreenivasan, "Health Care and Equality of Opportunity"

Tutorial Sept 16 or 20:

- Case 2.2 *Social Determinants of Health*, 99-102
- Discussion of case study commentary assignments

Week 3: Health Resource Allocation

Lecture Sept 23:

- Joseph Heath, "Health Care as a Commodity"
- Ronald Dworkin, "Justice and the High Cost of Health"
- Alexander Cappelin and Ole Norheim, "Responsibility in Health Care"

Tutorial Sept 23 or 27:

- Case 2.3 *An Artificial heart: Allocating Health Care Funding*, 102-107
- Case 8.1 *Dialysis Machine Shortages: Who Shall Live?* 261-266

Week 4: Global Health Ethics

Lecture Sept 30:

- Elizabeth Fenton and John Arras, "Bioethics and Human Rights: Access to Health-Related Goods"
- Thomas Pogge, "Responsibilities for Poverty Related Ill-health"

Tutorial Sept 30 or Oct 4:

- Case 8.2 *Ethics and Humanitarian Aid: Vertical Aid Programs*, 267-268
- Is it Ethical to Buy Kidneys from the World's Poor?
<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1621090/>

Week 5: Research Ethics

Lecture Oct 7: 1st Case Commentary Due Today (on **one** case discussed so far)

- Nuremberg Code <https://history.nih.gov/research/downloads/nuremberg.pdf>
- Allan Brandt, "Racism and Research: The Case of the Tuskegee Syphilis Study"
- Samuel Hellman and Deborah Hellman, "Of Mice but Not Men"

Tutorial Oct 7 or 11:

- Case 3.1 *Research Involving Alzheimer Patients*, 116-123
- Case 7.3 *Who Owns the Research? The Case of the HeLa Cells*, 254-256

Week 6: Thanksgiving

- No lecture or tutorial will be held this week due to Thanksgiving

Week 7: Reading Break

- No lecture or tutorial will be held this week due to Reading Break

Week 8: Global Research Ethics

Lecture Oct 28:

- Peter Lurie and Sydney Wolf, "Unethical Trials of Intervention to Reduce Perinatal Transmission of HIV in Developing Countries"
- Maged El Satouhy et al., "Moral Standards for Research in Developing Countries"

Tutorial Oct 28 or Nov 1:

- The Havrix Trial and the Surfaxin Trial, 52-62 - PDF on Cu Learn

Week 9: Competence and The Right to Refuse Treatment

Lecture Nov 4:

- Dan Brock and Allen Buchanan, "Deciding for Others"
- Daniel Slotnik, "Dax Cowart, Who Suffered for Patient's Rights, dies at 71"
<https://www.nytimes.com/2019/05/15/obituaries/dax-cowart-dead.html>
- Medical Assistance in Dying in Canada <https://www.canada.ca/en/health-canada/services/medical-assistance-dying.html>

Tutorial Nov 4 or 8:

- Case 6.1 a) and b) *Two Different Requests to be Left to Die*, 208-214

Week 10: Medical Assistance in Dying

Lecture Nov 11: 2nd Case Commentary Due Today (on **one** case discussed since Oct 7)

- Judith Jarvis Thomson, "Physician Assisted Suicide: Two Moral Arguments"
- Dan Brock, "Voluntary Active Euthanasia"

Tutorial Nov 11 or 15:

- Case 6.2 *Sue Rodriguez: Please Help Me Die*, 214-222
- Case 6.3 *Tracy and Robert Latimer: "It was Right to Kill my Daughter"* 222-228

Week 11: Reproductive Ethics

Lecture Nov 18:

- Mary Anne Warren, "On the Moral and Legal Status of Abortion"
- Judith Jarvis Thomson, "A Defense of Abortion"

Tutorial Nov 18 or 22:

- Case 4.5 *Fetal Tissue Transplantation*, 167-174
- Case 5.2 *Sex Selection for Non-Medical Reasons*, 192-196

Week 12: Genetic Selection

Lecture Nov 25:

- Bonnie Steinbock, "Disability, Prenatal Testing, Selective Abortion,"
- Julian Savulescu, "Procreative Beneficence: Why We Should Select the Best Children"

Tutorial Nov 25 or 29:

- Case 5.3 *Should Fetuses with Milder Disabilities be Aborted?* 196-201
- Case 5.5 *Savior Siblings*, 205-207

Week 13: Human Enhancement

Lecture Dec 2: 3rd Case Commentary Due Today (on **one** case discussed since Nov 11)

- Norman Daniels, "Normal Functioning and the Treatment-Enhancement Distinction"
- Michael Sandel, "The Case Against Perfection,"
<http://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2004/04/the-case-against-perfection/302927/>

Tutorial Dec 2 or 6:

- Case 9.2 *Enhancement and Sport*, 292-294

Lecture Dec 6 (regular room/time):

- Exam review and discussion - optional

Final Take Home Exam Due December 21

Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (Fall/Winter 2019-20)

Assignments:

Unless specifically told otherwise by their instructors, students:

- Must not use a plastic or cardboard cover or paper clips.
- Must staple the paper (there is a stapler on the essay box).
- Must include the following on the first page: student name and number; course name and number; instructor's name.
- No assignments will be accepted after the last day for handing in term work – see dates below.
- Assignments handed in through the essay box (just inside the glass doors, Paterson Hall, Floor 3A) must be dropped into the box by **4:15** on a regular business day in order to be date-stamped with that day's date. Assignments handed in after 4:15 or on a non-business day will be stamped as having been handed in on the next business day.
- Students are required to keep copies of their assignments. If your paper is lost at any point, you will be considered not to have submitted it if you cannot produce a copy immediately on request.

Evaluation:

Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor subject to the approval of the Faculty Dean. This means that grades submitted by the instructor may be subject to revision. No grades are final until they have been approved by the Dean.

Deferrals for Final Exams:

If you miss a final examination (formally scheduled or take-home) because of circumstances beyond your control, you may apply for a deferral. You must apply within 3 working days after the scheduled date of your formally scheduled exam or within 3 working days after the due date of a take-home exam. Visit the Registrar's Office for more information:

<http://calendar.carleton.ca/undergrad/regulations/academicregulationsoftheuniversity/acadregsuniv2/#2.5>

Plagiarism:

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of 'plagiarism' as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. <https://carleton.ca/registrar/academic-integrity/>

Academic Accommodation:

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

If you have a documented disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact the Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities (PMC) at 613-520-6608 or pmc@carleton.ca for a formal evaluation or contact your PMC coordinator to send your instructor your Letter of Accommodation at the beginning of the term. You must also contact the PMC no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (if applicable). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with your instructor as soon as possible to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. carleton.ca/pmc

Pregnancy obligation: write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

Religious obligation: write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

Survivors of Sexual Violence: as a community, Carleton University is committed to maintaining a positive learning, working and living environment where sexual violence will not be tolerated, and is survivors are supported through academic accommodations as per Carleton's Sexual Violence Policy. For more information about the services available at the university and to obtain information about sexual violence and/or support, visit: carleton.ca/sexual-violence-support

Accommodation for Student Activities: Carleton University recognizes the substantial benefits, both to the individual student and for the university, that result from a student participating in activities beyond the classroom experience. Reasonable accommodation must be provided to students who compete or perform at the national or international level. Please contact your instructor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. <https://carleton.ca/senate/wp-content/uploads/Accommodation-for-Student-Activities-1.pdf>

For more information on academic accommodation, please contact the departmental administrator or visit: students.carleton.ca/course-outline

Important Dates:

Sept. 4	Classes start.
Sept. 17	Last day for registration and course changes for fall term and fall/winter (two-term) courses.
Sept. 30	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from fall term or two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript.
Oct. 14	Statutory holiday. University closed.
Oct. 21-25	Fall Break – no classes.
Nov. 22	Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, before the official examination period.
Dec. 6	Last day of fall term classes. Classes follow a Monday schedule. Last day for academic withdrawal from fall term courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for a fall term course.
Dec. 9-21	Final examinations for fall term courses and mid-term examinations in two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.
Dec. 21	All take-home examinations are due.
Jan. 6	Classes begin.
Jan. 17	Last day for registration and course changes in the winter term.
Jan. 31	Last day for a full fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter term courses or from the winter portion of two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript.
Feb. 17	Statutory holiday. University closed.
Feb. 17-21	Winter Break – no classes.
Mar. 24	Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, in winter term or fall/winter courses before the official examination period.
Apr. 7	Last day of two-term and winter term classes. Last day for academic withdrawal from fall/winter and winter courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for two-term and for winter term courses.
Apr. 10	Statutory holiday. University closed.

Apr. 13-25 Final examinations for winter term and two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.

Apr. 25 All take-home examinations are due on this day.

Addresses:

Department of Philosophy: 3A35 Paterson Hall
www.carleton.ca/philosophy
520-2110

Registrar's Office: 300 Tory
www.carleton.ca/registrar
520-3500

Academic Advising Centre: 302 Tory
www.carleton.ca/academicadvising
520-7850

Writing Services: 4th Floor, Library
<http://www.carleton.ca/csas/writing-services/>
520-3822

MacOdrum Library <http://www.library.carleton.ca/>
520-2735