

**PHIL/COMM/LING
2504A
Language and Communication**

Carleton University
Department of Philosophy

Term: Fall 2011
Meetings: Tuesdays, 6:05 – 8:55
Venue: 3380 MacKenzie
Instructor: Eros Corazza
Office: Paterson Hall 3A41
Office h.: by appointment
Phone: 520-2600 Ext: 2326
Email: eros_corazza@yahoo.com; eros_corazza@carleton.ca

Webpage: <http://eroscorazza.com>

- **The PowerPoint slides are posted on my webpage**

Course description:

We shall begin by discussing some central topics of Frege's philosophy of language. The main topics discussed will be: Frege's sense/reference distinction, Frege's theory of thought, Frege's anti-psychologism and Frege's theory of demonstratives. To understand the importance of Frege's contribution we will focus on Dummett's interpretation.

We shall then discuss some central topics from Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations* and the way they have been perceived within the philosophical community. Among these topics we shall discuss notions such as: language games, form of life, rule following, etc.

Finally, we shall look at the direct reference theory of proper names (Kripke, Donnellan, ...) and the direct reference theory of indexicals (Kaplan, Perry, ...). We shall pay particular attention to the notion of context and the way our linguistic interchange exploits it in order to single out objects of discourse. In so doing we shall see how direct reference deals with Frege's and Wittgenstein's conceptions of language.

Aims and Objectives:

The module aims to provide a general introduction to the development of some key notions pertaining to the philosophy of language. To do so we shall focus on some of Frege's and Wittgenstein's influential works and the way they have been perceived by the analytic philosophical community.

Learning Outcomes:

By the end of the module you should be able to:

- **Understand notions** such as: the sense/reference distinction, the linguistic turn, anti-psychologism, language game, rule following, etc. (see *Module Content* and *Topics to be Discussed*, for detailed information on the notions/topics we'll discuss).
- **Communication skills:** through essays writing and the feedback you will get on them you will further develop the capacity to present problems and propose solutions to them in a clear, precise and concise way. Through discussions you will also have the opportunity to develop the capacity to speak briefly and clearly on a given subject/problem, to ask questions and requests for clarification, and to contribute constructively to discussion.
- You will have lot of opportunities to **interact** with other students in discussing some of the issues we will be dealing with.

Requirements:

It is mandatory to have a Carleton student “connect” account and to register on WebCT.

Assignments:

One short essay and a final (2 h.) exam

- | | |
|-------------------------------------------------|-------------|
| • Attendance | Weight: 20% |
| • Short Essay (1500 words maximum) | Weight: 30% |
| • Final exam (answer 2 questions out of 5 or 6) | Weight: 50% |

Due Assignment

- Short Essay: **TBA**
- Final exam: **Exam Period (a 2 hours exam)**

Texts Recommended:

In bold characters the texts you *must* read. The other texts mentioned are extremely helpful in understanding and appreciating the text you must read.

- All the books should be on the short loan reserve in the library
- The books should also be available to buy at **Haven Books** (Sunnyside).

On Frege:**Martinich (ed.). 2009. The Philosophy of Language. Oxford UP**

- Frege’s 2 papers you have to read are also in:

Beaney, M. (ed.), 1997, *The Frege Reader*. Blackwell, “**On Sinn and Bedeutung**” (p.151-71) and “**Thought**” (p.325-345)

Dummett, M., 1973, *Frege Philosophy of Language*, Oxford UP, ch. 5, ch. 6, ch. 11

Dummett, M., 1981, *The Interpretation of Frege’s Philosophy of Language*, Oxford UP, ch. 6, ch. 10

Dummett, M., 1993, *The Origins of Analytical Philosophy*, Harvard UP, ch. 2, ch. 4, ch. 10, ch. 13

Perry, J., 1977, “Frege on Demonstratives”, in Perry, J., 1994, *The Problem of the Essential Indexical*, Oxford UP, ch. 1

On Wittgenstein:**Wittgenstein, L. Philosophical Investigations, Blackwell**

The *Philosophical Investigations (PI)* can be found on the net (with a commentary) on:

- <http://www.voidspace.org.uk/psychology/wittgenstein/one.shtml>

Marie McGinn, 1997, Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations, Routledge

Backer, G.P. & Hacker, P.M.S, 1980, *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Understanding Vol. 1*, Blackwell

Backer, G.P. & Hacker, P.M.S, 1985, *Wittgenstein: Rules, Grammar and Necessity Vol. 2*, Blackwell

Hacker, P.M.S, 1990, *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Mind Vol. 3*, Blackwell

Kripke, S. 1982. *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language*. Blackwell

On Direct Reference:

Corazza, E., 2004, *Reflecting the Mind*, Oxford UP, Oxford

Kaplan, D., 1977, "Demonstratives", in Almog, J. et als. (eds.), 1989, *Themes From Kaplan*, Oxford UP, pp. 481-563

Kaplan, D., 1989, "Afterthought", in Almog, J. et als. (eds.), 1989, *Themes From Kaplan*, Oxford UP, pp. 565-614

Perry, J., 2001, *Reference and Reflexivity*, CSLI Publications, Stanford

Essay Topics:

You should write one essay of 1500 words (or 6 typewritten double-spaced pages) *maximum* on one of the following five questions:

1. Is the following inference valid?
 Mary believes that Hesperus is a star
 Hesperus is Phosphorus
 So: Mary believes that Phosphorus is a star
 Why?
2. What's the difference between Frege and Dummett's Frege?
3. Explain and evaluate Frege's anti-psychologism.

Topics to be discusses and suggestions for reading: Each topic will require a 3h class

1. Introduction: Terminological Remarks**2. Frege's Puzzles**

Primary reading: Frege. "Sense and Reference" in *The Frege Reader*

Secondary reading: Dummett, *Frege Philosophy of Language*. ch. 5, ch. 6

3. Fregean Thoughts

Primary reading: Frege. "Thought" in *The Frege Reader*

Secondary reading: Dummett, *Frege Philosophy of Language*. ch. 11

4. Dummett's Frege

Primary reading: Dummett, *Frege Philosophy of Language*. ch. 5, ch. 6, ch. 11

Secondary reading: Dummett, *The Interpretation of Frege's Philosophy of Language*. ch. 6, ch. 10

5. Frege's Anti-Psychologism

Primary reading: Frege. "Thought" in *The Frege Reader*

Primary reading: Dummett. *The Origins of Analytical Philosophy*. ch. 2, ch. 4, ch. 10, ch. 13

6. The Sense/Reference Distinction Revisited

Primary reading: Perry. "Frege on Demonstratives"

Secondary reading: Kaplan. "Demonstratives"

7. Wittgenstein's Methodology, the Augustinian Conception of Language, and Language qua Institution

Primary reading: Wittgenstein. *Philosophical Investigations (part 1)*

Secondary reading: Backer & Hacker. *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Understanding*

Secondary reading: McGinn. *Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations*

8. Ostensive Definitions, Indexicality, and the First Person

Primary reading: Wittgenstein. *Philosophical Investigations (part 1)*

Primary reading: Wittgenstein. *The Brown Book (first part)*

Secondary reading: Backer & Hacker. *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Understanding*

9. Meaning, Understanding, and Use

Primary reading: Wittgenstein. *Philosophical Investigations (part 1)*

Secondary reading: Backer & Hacker. *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Understanding*

Secondary reading: McGinn. *Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations*

10. Following a Rule

Primary reading: Kripke. *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language*

Secondary reading: Backer & Hacker. *Wittgenstein: Rules, Grammar and Necessity.*

Secondary reading: McGinn. *Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations*

11. The Private Language Argument and the Philosophy of Psychology

Primary reading: Wittgenstein. *Philosophical Investigations (part 2)*

Secondary reading: Kripke. *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language*

Secondary reading: Hacker. *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Mind*

12. Revision Class**Penalties:**

Essays are due by 4:00 p.m. on due dates. Essays received late will be penalized by one mark per day. (For instance, a short essay marked 24/30 on its merits will be reduced to 23/30 on the first day they are late and to 19/30 on the fifth day. University regulations forbid the instructor to accept term work for this course after December 5.

LIST OF EXAM QUESTIONS:

You'll be asked to answer 2 (and only 2) questions out of 5 questions of the following list:

1. What's the difference between Frege and Dummett's Frege?
2. What is the difference between " $a = a$ " and " $a = b$ "? What is wrong with Frege's *Begriffsschrift* solution? How does it differ from the solution proposed in *Ueber Sinn and Bedeutung*?
3. "The verbal expression of pain replaces crying and does not describe it." (*PI*: § 244) Explain and discuss.
4. Explain and evaluate Kripke's and Donnellan's arguments against Frege's semantics.
5. "This was our paradox: no course of action could be determined by a rule, because every course of action can be made out to accord with the rule." (*PI*: § 201) Explain and discuss.
6. "To Imagine a language is to imagine a form of life." (*PI*, § 7) Explain and discuss.
7. "If a lion could talk, we could not understand him." (*PI*: pg. 223) Explain and discuss.
8. Why does Frege introduced the sense/reference distinction?
9. "It comes to this: only of a living human being and what resembles (behaves like) a living human being can one say: it has sensations; it sees, is blind, hears; is deaf; is conscious or unconscious." (*PI*: § 281) Explain and discuss.
10. Explain Frege's anti-psychologism.
11. How Frege's theory deal with belief-ascriptions?
12. "If God had looked into our minds he would not have been able to see there whom we were speaking of." (*PI*: pg. 217). Explain and discuss.
13. Following Frege: What are the main features of a thought? and: Why does it need to possess these features?
14. What are the merits and/or defaults of Wittgenstein's discussion of ostensive definitions?
15. "In logic we must reject all distinctions that are made from a purely psychological point of view." (Frege; 1979: p.142) Explain and discuss.
16. Can there be a private language?
17. Discuss the Augustinian picture.
18. " $a = a$ and $a = b$ are obviously statements of different cognitive value." (Frege: 1892) Explain and discuss.
19. "An 'inner process' stands in need of outward criteria." (*PI*: § 580). Explain and discuss.
20. "Philosophy, as we use the word, is a fight against the fascination which forms of expression exert on us." (*BB*: 27). Explain and discuss.

Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies

Assignments:

Unless specifically told otherwise by their instructors, students:

- must not use a plastic or cardboard cover or paper clips
- must staple the paper (there is a stapler on the essay box)
- must include the following in the lower right corner of the cover sheet:
 - student name
 - student number
 - course number and section
 - instructor's name
- The Philosophy Department does not accept assignments by FAX. You may send them by courier, if necessary.
- No assignments will be accepted after the last day for handing in term work.
- Assignments handed in through the essay box (just inside the glass doors, Paterson Hall, Floor 3A) must be dropped into the box by 4:15 on a regular business day in order to be date-stamped with that day's date. Assignments handed in after 4:15 or on a non-business day will be stamped as having been handed in on the next business day.
- Students are required to keep copies of their assignments. If your paper is lost at any point, you will be considered not to have submitted it if you cannot produce a copy immediately on request.

Deferrals for Term Work:

If you miss a final examination and/or fail to submit a final assignment by the due date because of circumstances beyond your control, you may apply for a deferral of examination/assignment. For deferred examinations, you must apply within 5 working days after the scheduled date of your exam. To apply for deferral of a final assignment, you must apply within 5 working days of the last scheduled day of classes. Visit the Registrar's Office for more information.

Plagiarism:

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of 'plagiarism' as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. (Undergraduate Calendar Academic Regulations, section 14.3, or

<http://www4.carleton.ca/calendars//ugrad/current/regulations/acadregsuniv14.html#14.3>

Academic Accommodation:

For Students with Disabilities: Students with disabilities requiring academic accommodations in this course must register with the Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities (PMC) for a formal evaluation of disability-related needs. Documented disabilities include but are not limited to mobility/physical impairments, specific Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/psychological disabilities, sensory disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), and chronic medical conditions. Registered PMC students are required to contact the PMC every term to have a Letter of Accommodation sent to the Instructor by their Coordinator. In addition, students are expected to confirm their need for accommodation with the Instructor no later than two weeks before the first assignment is due or the first in-class test/midterm. If you require accommodations only for formally scheduled exam(s) in this course, you must request accommodations by the last official day to withdraw from classes in each term.

For Religious Observance: Students requesting academic accommodation on the basis of religious observance should make a formal, written request to their instructors for alternate dates and/or means of satisfying academic requirements. Such requests should be made during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist, but no later than two weeks before the compulsory academic event. Accommodation is to be worked out directly and on an individual basis between the student and the instructor(s) involved. Instructors will make accommodations in a way that avoids academic disadvantage to the student.

Students or instructors who have questions or want to confirm accommodation eligibility of a religious event or practice may refer to the Equity Services website:

<http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/accommodation/holy-days/>

For Pregnancy: Pregnant students requiring academic accommodations are encouraged to contact an Equity Advisor in Equity Services to complete a *letter of accommodation*. The student must then make an appointment to discuss her needs with the instructor at least two weeks prior to the first academic event in which it is anticipated the accommodation will be required.

Important Dates:

Sept. 8	Classes start (after Orientation events).
Sept. 21	Last day for registration and course changes in Fall term and two-term courses.
Sept. 30	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from fall term or two-term courses.
Oct. 7	University Day – no classes.
Oct. 10	Thanksgiving Day – university closed.
Nov. 21	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000 level before the Final Examination period.
Dec. 5	Last day of classes, Fall term. Last day for handing in term assignments, subject to any earlier course deadline.
Dec. 5	Last day to withdraw from Fall term courses (academic purposes only).
Dec. 8-21	Final examinations for Fall courses, mid-terms for Fall/Winter courses.
Jan. 4	Winter term classes begin.
Jan. 17	Last day for registration and course changes in Winter term classes.
Jan. 31	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter courses or winter portion of two-term courses.
Feb. 20	Family Day – university closed
Feb. 20-24	Winter Break, classes suspended.
Mar. 22	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000 level before the Final Examination period.
Apr. 5	Last day of Fall/Winter and Winter term classes. Last day for handing in term assignments, subject to any earlier course deadline.
Apr. 5	Last day to withdraw from Fall/Winter and Winter term courses (academic purposes only).
Apr. 6	Good Friday – university closed.
Apr. 11-24	Final Examinations.

Addresses:

Department of Philosophy:	3A46 Paterson Hall www.carleton.ca/philosophy 520-2110
Registrar's Office:	300 Tory www.carleton.ca/registrar 520-3500
Student Academic Success Centre:	302 Tory www.carleton.ca/sasc 520-7850
Paul Menton Centre:	500 University Centre www.carleton.ca/pmc 520-6608
Writing Tutorial Service:	4 th Floor, Library www.carleton.ca/wts 520-6632
MacOdrum Library	http://www.library.carleton.ca/ 520-2735