

## **PHIL 5000 Fall 2017**

### **Exploitation and Commodification: The Just Market**

Thursdays 2:30-5:30 Paterson 3A35

Professor Vida Panitch [vida.panitch@carleton.ca](mailto:vida.panitch@carleton.ca)

Office Hours Thursdays 1-2:30 Paterson 3A55

#### **Course Description:**

Anti-commodification theorists call out wholesale practices in which a good's social meaning or inherent value is degraded by its assignment of a price tag. In this course we will explore the arguments supplied by various contemporary moral and political philosophers as to why, and how, we should understand certain kinds of financial transactions as harmfully commodifying in an otherwise uncontested market economy. We will concentrate on how these arguments apply to financial transactions involving the sale of bodily goods and services specifically. Examples we will focus on will include health care, prostitution, surrogacy, and kidney sales.

#### **Course Assignments:**

**Reading responses: 4 x 10 = 40%.** These should be 3-4 pages double-spaced. You must submit 4 of these throughout the term, in hard copy at the beginning of class. You may submit them on days of your choosing but **you must submit at least one per month.** That is, at least one must be submitted in September, one in October, and one in November. You may focus on one claim or the general argument from one of the week's readings, or on themes that connect the week's readings. These responses must be both expository and evaluative in nature, and as they account for almost half your term mark must be taken seriously and will be marked accordingly

**Participation: 10%.** Students are expected to come to class, and to come prepared to discuss the readings. This is a seminar, not a lecture course.

**Take Home Exam: 50%.** This is effectively your term paper. A topic will be chosen by the student, and approved by the instructor. Individual meetings will be held with each student to discuss topics, additional research materials and a general outline for the paper. Length: 20 pages. Due on the last day of the December exam period.

#### **Course Readings:**

The articles for this course are posted as PDFs on CuLearn. One book, Debra Satz' *Why Some Things Should not be for Sale* is available from library reserves, as well as through amazon.com and other online booksellers.

## **Course Schedule:**

### **September 7** Introduction to the course

#### ***Suggested Background Reading***

Karl Marx, *Capital*, Volume 1 Part 1 Chapter 1, Section I and IV

<https://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1867-c1/ch01.htm#S1>

Aristotle, *Politics*, Book I, Chapters 8-10

<http://classics.mit.edu/Aristotle/politics.1.one.html>

*Nicomachean Ethics*, Book V, Chapters 3-5

<http://classics.mit.edu/Aristotle/nicomachaen.5.v.html>

### **September 14**

John Locke, *Second Treatise on Government*, Chapter 5

<http://www.constitution.org/jl/2ndtr05.htm>

Michael Sandel, "What Money Can't Buy: The Moral Limits of the Market," Tanner Lectures on Human Values 1998

### **September 21**

Michael Walzer, *Spheres of Justice*, (Basic Books: 1998) pp. 3-26, 64-67, 75-110

Ronald Dworkin, "To Each His Own," *NYT Review of Books* April 14, 2003

### **September 28**

Elizabeth Anderson, "Ethical Limitations of the Market," *Economics and Philosophy* 6(2) 1990: 179-205

Elizabeth Anderson, "Is Women's Labor a Commodity?" *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 19(1) 1990: 71-92

### **October 5**

Margaret Jane Radin, "Market Inalienability," *Harvard Law Review* 100(8) 1987: 1849-1937

### **October 12**

Anne Phillips, "It's my Body and I'll do What I Like with It: Bodies as Objects and Property," *Political Theory* 39(6) 2011: 724-748

Kimberly Krawiec, "A Woman's Worth," *North Carolina Law Review* 88 (2010) 1739-1769

### **October 19**

Janet Radcliffe Richards, "Nepharious Goings On: Kidney Sales and Moral Arguments," *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* 21(4) 1996: 375-426

Alvin Roth, "Repugnance as a Constraint on Markets," *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 21(3) 2007: 37-58

### **October 26 - Reading Break**

**November 2**

Vida Panitch and L. Chad Horne, “Commodification, Inequality, and Kidney Markets,”  
*draft*

Hallie Liberto, “Noxious Markets versus Noxious Gift Relationships,” *Social Theory and Practice* 39(2) 2013: 265-287

**November 9**

Debra Satz, *Why Some Things Should not be for Sale* (Oxford, 2010) ch 1, 3-4

**November 16**

Debra Satz, *Why Some Things Should not be for Sale* (Oxford, 2010) ch 5-6, 9

**November 23**

Jason Brennan and Peter Jaworski, “Markets Without Symbolic Limits” *Ethics* 125(4)  
2015: 1053-1077

Jason Brennan and Peter Jaworksi, *Markets Without Limits: Moral Virtues and Commercial Interests* (Routledge, 2016) Part 1

**November 30**

John Rawls, *Political Liberalism* (Columbia, 1996) pp 3-34, 48-58

Vida Panitch, “Liberalism, Commodification and Justice” *draft*

## Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (Fall/Winter 2017-18)

### **Assignments:**

Unless specifically told otherwise by their instructors, students:

- must not use a plastic or cardboard cover or paper clips
- must staple the paper (there is a stapler on the essay box)
- must include the following:
  - student name
  - student number
  - course number and section
  - instructor's name
- No assignments will be accepted after the last day for handing in term work – see dates in next column.
- Assignments handed in through the essay box (just inside the glass doors, Paterson Hall, Floor 3A) must be dropped into the box by **4:15** on a regular business day in order to be date-stamped with that day's date. Assignments handed in after 4:15 or on a non-business day will be stamped as having been handed in on the next business day.
- Students are required to keep copies of their assignments. If your paper is lost at any point, you will be considered not to have submitted it if you cannot produce a copy immediately on request.

### **Deferrals for Final Exams:**

If you miss a final examination (formally scheduled or take-home) because of circumstances beyond your control, you may apply for a deferral. You must apply within 3 working days after the scheduled date of your formally scheduled exam or within 3 working days after the due date of a take-home exam. Visit the Registrar's Office for more information:

<http://calendar.carleton.ca/undergrad/regulations/academicregulationsoftheuniversity/acadregsuniv2/#2.5>

### **Plagiarism:**

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of 'plagiarism' as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. <https://carleton.ca/registrar/academic-integrity/>

### **Academic Accommodation:**

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

**Pregnancy obligation:** write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

**Religious obligation:** write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

**Academic Accommodations for Students with Disabilities:** The **Paul Menton Centre** for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or [pmc@carleton.ca](mailto:pmc@carleton.ca) for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send your **Letter of Accommodation** at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (*if applicable*). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with your professor to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC

website for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (*if applicable*) at <http://www2.carleton.ca/pmc/new-and-current-students/dates-and-deadlines/>

You can visit the Equity Services website to view the policies and to obtain more detailed information on academic accommodation at <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

### **Important Dates:**

Sept. 6	Classes start.
Sept. 19	Last day for registration and course changes for Fall term and Fall/Winter (two-term) courses.
Sept. 30	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from Fall term or two-term courses.
Oct. 9	Statutory holiday. University closed.
Oct. 23-27	Fall Break – no classes.
Nov. 24	Last day for summative or final examinations in Fall term courses before the official examination period.
Dec. 8	Last day of Fall term classes. <b>Classes follow a Monday schedule.</b> Last day for academic withdrawal from Fall term courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for a Fall term course.
Dec. 10-22	Final examinations for Fall term courses and mid-term examinations in two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.
Dec. 22	All take-home examinations are due.
Jan. 8	Classes begin.
Jan. 19	Last day for registration and course changes in the Winter term.
Jan. 31	Last day for a full fee adjustment when withdrawing from Winter term courses or from the Winter portion of two-term courses.
Feb. 19	Statutory holiday. University closed.
Feb. 19-23	Winter Break – no classes.
Mar. 27	Last day for summative or final examinations in Winter term or two-term courses before the official examination period.
Mar. 30	Statutory holiday. University closed.
Apr. 11	Last day of two-term and Winter term classes. <b>Classes follow a Friday schedule.</b> Last day for academic withdrawal from Fall/Winter and Winter courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for two-term and for Winter term courses.
Apr. 14-26	Final examinations for Winter term and two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.
Apr. 26	All take home examinations are due on this day.

### **Addresses:**

Department of Philosophy:	3A35 Paterson Hall <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/philosophy">www.carleton.ca/philosophy</a> 520-2110
Registrar's Office:	300 Tory <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/registrar">www.carleton.ca/registrar</a> 520-3500
Academic Advising Centre:	302 Tory <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/academicadvising">www.carleton.ca/academicadvising</a> 520-7850
Writing Services:	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor, Library <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/csas/writing-services/">http://www.carleton.ca/csas/writing-services/</a> 520-3822
MacOdrum Library	<a href="http://www.library.carleton.ca/">http://www.library.carleton.ca/</a> 520-2735