

5000 Basic Income and Distributive Justice

Fall 2020 Online via ZOOM Wednesdays 11:35 am-2:35 pm - weekly meeting invitations will be sent by email, please inform me of your preferred email address for communication purposes. Vida Panitch vida.panitch@carleton.ca - virtual office hours by appointment.

Course Overview:

The topic of an Unconditional Basic Income (UBI) has recently become one of interest in both the public and political forum, all the more so as governments scramble to respond to rising unemployment due to the novel coronavirus. Yet philosophers have been debating the merits of a UBI for decades now, as part of a larger inquiry into the demands of distributive justice. We will be exploring these arguments and evaluating whether the weight of the reasons that have been supplied for a UBI could indeed ground a social policy likely to achieve the considerable goals its proponents endorse. We will explore varied and often competing arguments for a UBI, including those from egalitarian, libertarian, communitarian, feminist, labour activist, and environmentalist theorists, and look at basic income experiments both past and present.

Assignments:

Seminar Presentation (Nov 18-Dec 2): **30%**

Argument Reconstructions x 5 (Sept 16-Nov 11): **25%**

Take Home Exam (due on the last day of the exam period, Dec 23): **45%**

Seminar Presentation 30%: Students will present in groups of 2 on a basic income case study: a basic income policy that has been or is being implemented somewhere in the world, for example, in Manitoba, Ontario, California, Spain, Finland, Iran, Kenya, or elsewhere. *Students must select their group, case study, and presentations date no later than October 7.* Students must also choose 2 background readings to assign for their presentation. These must be circulated at least one week before the presentation. The readings may be policy pieces, journalistic articles, or brief philosophical papers. Students must also submit a 5-6 page report the day of their presentation, addressing the key points below. As this report is only required of MA students, they must work together on this assignment. The group will be responsible for running half the seminar on their presentation day.

During their presentation, and for their report, students should explore:

- a) The stated aims the policy was implemented to address and whether these draw from or conflict with the theoretical arguments we will have looked at;
- b) Whether the policy did or is proving successful with respect to the stated aims;
- c) What ongoing lessons and considerations can or should be drawn from the case with respect to basic income policy more broadly, as well as basic income philosophy.

Argument Reconstructions x 5 = 25%: Students will prepare argument reconstructions, at least once per month, and no more than once per week, for a total of 5 throughout the term. An argument reconstruction should be no less than one page and no longer than 2 pages. An

argument reconstruction identifies the central premises of a chosen article and the relevant supporting argumentation, while presenting them in a logical progression so as to arrive at the article's main claim(s) or conclusion(s). Students should submit their reconstructions an hour before class as they will be circulated to the other students at the beginning of the seminar.

Take Home Exam 45%: Students will choose a topic for their final paper in consultation with the instructor. Topics must be selected no later than November 15. Research materials may draw from, but should also expand beyond, both the theoretical and practical readings covered throughout the course. Papers must be between 15–18 pp. double-spaced.

Readings:

All readings are either linked from the syllabus or available as PDFs on CU Learn.

Course Schedule:

September 9: Introduction to the Course

- Annie Lowrey, "The Future of Not Working," *NYT Magazine* February 26, 2017. <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/02/23/magazine/universal-income-global-inequality.html>
- Philippe Van Parijs, "Competing Justifications of Basic Income," *Arguing for Basic Income: Ethical Foundations for a Radical Reform*, Philippe Van Parijs, ed. (Verso, 1992): 3-43.

September 16: Distributive Justice and the Welfare State

- John Rawls, *A Theory of Justice 2nd Edition* (Harvard, 1971/99): 3-19, 47-81, 102-135.
- Robert Nozick, *Anarchy, State, and Utopia* (Basic Books, 1974): 10-28, 101-119, 149-164.

September 23: Basic Income, Freedom, and Self-Ownership

- Philippe Van Parijs, "Why Surfers Should be Fed: The Liberal Case for an Unconditional Basic Income," *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 20.2 (1991): 101-131.
- Philippe Van Parijs, *Real Freedom for All: What if Anything Can Justify Capitalism?* (Oxford, 1995): 5-45

September 30: Basic Income, Efficiency, and Neutrality

- Milton Friedman, "The Case for a Negative Income Tax: A View from the Right," *Proceedings of the National Symposium on Guaranteed Income* (US Chamber of Commerce, December 1966): 49-55.
- Charles Murray, "Guaranteed Income as a Replacement for the Welfare State," *Basic Income Studies* 3.2 (2008): 1-12.
- Joseph Heath and Vida Panitch, "How Cash Violates Neutrality," *Basic Income Studies* 5.1 (2010): 1-26.

October 7: Basic Income, Reciprocity, and Exploitation

- Brian Barry, "Basic Income and the Work Ethic," *Boston Review*, October 1, 2000. <http://bostonreview.net/forum/basic-income-all/brian-barry-ubi-and-work-ethic>
- Elizabeth Anderson, "Optional Freedoms," *Boston Review*, October 1, 2000. <http://bostonreview.net/forum/basic-income-all/elizabeth-anderson-optional-freedoms>
- Stuart White, "Liberal Equality, Exploitation, and the Case for an Unconditional Basic Income," *Political Studies* 45.2 (1997): 312-326.
- Phillipe Van Parijs, "Reciprocity and the Justification of an Unconditional Basic Income: Reply to Stuart White," *Political Studies* 45.2 (1997): 327-330.

October 14: Basic Income, Reciprocity, and Exploitation cont.

- Michael W. Howard, "Exploitation, Labor, and Basic Income," *Analyse & Kritik* 37.1-2 (2015): 281-303.
- Shlomi Segall, "Unconditional Welfare Benefits and the Principle of Reciprocity," *Politics, Philosophy, and Economics* 4.3 (2005): 331-354.
- Cartriona McKinnon, "Basic Income, Self-Respect and Reciprocity," *Journal of Applied Philosophy* 20.2 (2003): 143-158.

October 21: Basic Income, Post-Productivism, and Democracy

- Robert Goodin, "Work and Welfare: Towards a Post-Productivist Welfare Regime," *British Journal of Political Science* 31.1 (2001): 13-39.
- Vida Panitch, "Basic Income, Decommodification, and the Welfare State," *Philosophy and Social Criticism* 37.8 (2010): 935-945.
- Carole Pateman, "Democratizing Citizenship: Some Advantages of a Basic Income," *Politics & Society* 32.1 (2004): 89-105.

November 4: Basic Income, Feminism, and Women's Unpaid Labour

- Julieta Elgarte, "Basic Income and the Gendered Division of Labour," *Basic Income Studies* 3.3 (2008): 1-7.
- Ingrid Robeyns, "Will a Basic Income do Justice to Women?" *Analyse & Kritik* 23.1 (2001): 88-105.
- Ailsa McKay, "Rethinking Work and Income Maintenance Policy: Promoting Gender Equality Through a Citizens' Basic Income," *Feminist Economics* 7.1 (2001): 97-118.

November 11: Basic Income, Ecology, and Automation

- Jan Otto Anderson, "Basic Income from an Ecological Perspective," *Basic Income Studies* 4.2 (2009): 1-8.
- Yannick Vanderbrought, "Why Trade Unions Oppose Basic Income" *Basic Income Studies* 1.1 (2006): 1-20.
- Ville-Veike Pulkka, "A Free Lunch with Robots – Can a Basic Income Stabilize the Digital Economy?" *Transfer: European Review of Labour and Research* 23.3 (2017): 295-311.

November 18: Case Studies

Case Study #1: TBD

Students:
Reading 1:
Reading 2:

Case Study #2: TBD

Students:
Reading 1:
Reading 2:

November 25: Case Studies

Case Study #3: TBD

Students:
Reading 1:
Reading 2:

Case Study #4: TBD

Students:
Reading 1:
Reading 2:

December 2: Case Studies

Case Study #5: TBD

Students:
Reading 1:
Reading 2:

Case Study #6: TBD

Students:
Reading 1:
Reading 2:

December 9: Make up class (if needed) or virtual office hours

Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (Fall/Winter 2020-21)

Assignments:

Please follow your professor's instructions on how assignments will be handled electronically. There will be NO hard copies placed in the essay box this coming year.

Evaluation:

Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor subject to the approval of the Faculty Dean. This means that grades submitted by the instructor may be subject to revision. No grades are final until they have been approved by the Dean.

Deferrals for Term Work:

If students are unable to complete term work because of illness or other circumstances beyond their control, they should contact their course instructor no later than *three working days* of the due date. Normally, any deferred term work will be completed by the last day of the term. Term work cannot be deferred by the Registrar.

Deferrals for Final Exams:

Students are expected to be available for the duration of a course including the examination period. Occasionally, students encounter circumstances beyond their control where they may not be able to write a final examination or submit a take-home examination. Examples of this would be a serious illness or the death of a family member. If you miss a final examination and/or fail to submit a take-home examination by the due date, you may apply for a deferral no later than *three working days* after the original due date (as per the University Regulations in [Section 4.3 of the Undergraduate Calendar](#)). Visit the [Registrar's Office](#) for further information.

Plagiarism:

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of 'plagiarism' as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. ([Section 10.1 of the Undergraduate Calendar Academic Regulations](#))

Academic Accommodation:

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term:

- *Pregnancy or religious obligation:* write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the [EDC](#) website.
- *Academic accommodations for students with disabilities:* The [Paul Menton Centre](#) for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or pmc@carleton.ca for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send your Letter of Accommodation at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class test or exam requiring accommodation. After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with your professor to ensure accommodation arrangements are made.
- *Survivors of Sexual Violence:* As a community, Carleton University is committed to maintaining a positive learning, working and living environment where sexual violence will not be tolerated, and where survivors are supported through academic accommodations as per [Carleton's Sexual Violence Policy](#).
- *Accommodation for Student Activities:* Carleton University recognizes the substantial benefits, both to the individual student and for the university, that result from a student participating in activities beyond the classroom experience. Reasonable accommodation must be provided to students who compete or perform at the national or international level. Please contact your instructor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist.

Important Dates:

Sept. 9	Classes start.
Sept. 23	Last day for registration and course changes for fall term and fall/winter (two-term) courses.
Sept. 30	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from fall term or two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript.
Oct. 12	Statutory holiday. University closed.
Oct. 26-30	Fall Break – no classes.
Nov. 27	Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, before the official examination period.
Dec. 11	Last day of fall term classes. <i>Classes follow a Monday schedule.</i> Last day for academic withdrawal from fall term courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for a fall term course.
Dec. 12-23	Final examinations for fall term courses and mid-term examinations in two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.
Dec. 23	All take-home examinations are due.
Jan. 6	Classes begin.
Jan. 20	Last day for registration and course changes in the winter term.
Jan. 31	Last day for a full fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter term courses or from the winter portion of two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript.
Feb. 15	Statutory holiday. University closed.
Feb. 15-19	Winter Break – no classes.
Mar. 26	Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, in winter term or fall/winter courses before the official examination period.
Apr. 2	Statutory holiday. University closed.
Apr. 9	Last day of two-term and winter term classes. Last day for academic withdrawal from fall/winter and winter courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for two-term and for winter term courses.
Apr. 10	No classes or examinations take place.
Apr. 11-23	Final examinations for winter term and two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.
Apr. 23	All take-home examinations are due.

Addresses:

Department of Philosophy:
www.carleton.ca/philosophy
520-2110

Registrar's Office:
www.carleton.ca/registrar
520-3500

Academic Advising Centre:
www.carleton.ca/academicadvising
520-7850

Writing Services:
<http://www.carleton.ca/csas/writing-services/>
520-3822

MacOdrum Library
<http://www.library.carleton.ca/>
520-2735