

# **PHIL 5000: Markets and Morals**

Fall 2013 Thursdays 2:30-5:30 Paterson 3A36

Professor Vida Panitch [vida.panitch@carleton.ca](mailto:vida.panitch@carleton.ca)

Office: Paterson 3A55 Tuesday 5-6 and Thursday 1-2

## **Course Description:**

Are there some things that should not be for sale? Are certain goods of intrinsic value, which their sale corrupts, or too closely linked to personhood to be evaluated in monetary terms? This course examines the moral and political arguments for so-called “blocked exchanges,” or the prevention of transactions among consenting parties that involve the sale of contested commodities. In particular we will look at the moral and political arguments for and against the commodification of the human body, and of transactions involving the sale of physical goods and services.

## **Course Assignments:**

- First Paper: 20%. A topic will be assigned pertaining to course material. Students will be expected to exposit, evaluate and apply one or two views on a particular contested commodity. Length 10 pp. Due October 24<sup>th</sup>.
- Take Home Exam: 40%. This is effectively your term paper. A topic will be chosen by the student, and approved by the instructor. Individual meetings will be held with each student to discuss topics, additional research materials and a general outline for the paper. Length: 15 pages. Due December 22<sup>nd</sup>
- Presentations: 10% x 2 = 20%. Students will lead a 15-20 minute discussion twice during the term in which they will introduce the class to a ‘contested commodity’ that is (or in their view ought to be) a matter of public/moral concern. Students will explain how the author(s) under discussion in that day’s class would view the contested commodity, and will argue either with or against the author(s) as to the moral/political permissibility of the item’s exchange for money. There will be 3 presentations per week, beginning on September 26<sup>th</sup>. Sign up required on CULearn by September 19<sup>th</sup>.
- Weekly discussion questions: 10%. Students must email me a one-paragraph reading response/discussion question every Thursday by 1 pm.
- Participation: 10%. Students are expected to come to class, and to come prepared to discuss the readings. This is a seminar, not a lecture course.

## **Course Readings:**

Most of the readings are available online, linked from the course outline, or available in the library’s electronic journal database. The Walzer, Titmuss, and Fabre readings will be available on the course website. The Satz books will be available on short

term loan at the library, but can also be purchased (new or used) through any number of online book agents.

### **Course Schedule:**

#### **September 5**

Introduction to the course

#### **September 12**

Karl Marx, *Capital*, Volume 1 Part 1 Chapter 1

<http://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1867-c1/>

#### **September 19**

Michael Sandel, "What Money Can't Buy: The Moral Limits of the Market," Tanner Lectures on Human Values (link may fail, in which case, ignore)

[http://baihua.org/user\\_image2/2011/11/1320205825\\_1.pdf](http://baihua.org/user_image2/2011/11/1320205825_1.pdf)

Michael Sandel, "What Money Shouldn't Buy"

<http://www.iasc-culture.org/THR/archives/Commodification/5.2HSandel.pdf>

Michael Sandel, "What Isn't For Sale," *The Atlantic*, April 2012

[www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2012/04/what-isnt-for-sale/308902/](http://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2012/04/what-isnt-for-sale/308902/)

#### **September 26**

Michael Walzer, *Spheres of Justice*, (Basic Books: 1998) pp. 3-26, 64-67, 75-110

#### **October 3**

Richard Titmuss, *The Gift Relationship* (New Press, 1998; original: Allen & Unwin, 1970) pp. 219-232, 260-273, 289-314

Joseph Heath, "Health Care as a Commodity"

<http://homes.chass.utoronto.ca/~jheath/health.pdf>

#### **October 10**

Elizabeth Anderson, "Ethical Limitations of the Market," *Economics and Philosophy* 6(2) 1990: 179-205

Elizabeth Anderson, "Is Women's Labor a Commodity?" *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 19(1) 1990: 71-92

#### **October 17**

Margaret Jane Radin, "Market Inalienability," *Harvard Law Review* 100(8) 1987: 1849-1937

#### **October 24**

Margaret Jane Radin, "Market Inalienability," *Harvard Law Review* 100(8) 1987: 1849-1937

Elizabeth Anderson, "Contested Commodities," *Ethics* 109(4) 1999: 914-917

**October 31** - Reading Break

**November 7**

Debra Satz, *Why Some Things Should not be For Sale* (Oxford, 2010) ch 1-3

**November 14**

Debra Satz, *Why Some Things Should not be For Sale* (Oxford, 2010) ch 4-6

**November 21**

Anne Phillips, "It's my Body and I'll do What I Like with It: Bodies as Objects and Property," *Political Theory* 39(6) 2011: 724-748

Kimberly Krawiec, A Woman's Worth, *North Carolina Law Review* 88 (2010) 1739-1769

**November 28**

Debra Satz, *Why Some Things Should not be For Sale* (Oxford, 2010) ch. 9

Cecile Fabre, *Whose Body is it Anyway: Justice and the Integrity of the Person* (Oxford, 2006) pp 109-152

**December 5**

Alvin Roth, "Repugnance as a Constraint on Markets," *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 21(3) 2007: 37-58

Janet Radcliffe Richards, "Nepharious Goings On: Kidney Sales and Moral Arguments," *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* 21(4) 1996: 375-426

## Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (2013-14)

### **Assignments:**

Unless specifically told otherwise by their instructors, students:

- must not use a plastic or cardboard cover or paper clips
- must staple the paper (there is a stapler on the essay box)
- must include the following in the lower right corner of the cover sheet:
  - student name
  - student number
  - course number and section
  - instructor's name
- The Philosophy Department does not accept assignments by FAX. You may send them by courier, if necessary.
- No assignments will be accepted after the last day for handing in term work – see dates in next column.
- Assignments handed in through the essay box (just inside the glass doors, Paterson Hall, Floor 3A) must be dropped into the box by **4:15** on a regular business day in order to be date-stamped with that day's date. Assignments handed in after 4:15 or on a non-business day will be stamped as having been handed in on the next business day.
- Students are required to keep copies of their assignments. If your paper is lost at any point, you will be considered not to have submitted it if you cannot produce a copy immediately on request.

### **Deferrals for Term Work:**

If you miss a final examination and/or fail to submit a final assignment by the due date because of circumstances beyond your control, you may apply for a deferral of examination/assignment. For deferred examinations, you must apply within 5 working days after the scheduled date of your exam. To apply for deferral of a final assignment, you must apply within 5 working days of the last scheduled day of classes. Visit the Registrar's Office for more information.

### **Plagiarism:**

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of 'plagiarism' as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. (Undergraduate Calendar Academic Regulations, section 14.3, or <http://www4.carleton.ca/calendars//ugrad/current/regulations/academicuniv14.html#14.3>)

### **Academic Accommodation:**

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

**Pregnancy obligation:** write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

**Religious obligation:** write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

**Academic Accommodations for Students with Disabilities:** The Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or [pmc@carleton.ca](mailto:pmc@carleton.ca) for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send me your **Letter of Accommodation** at the beginning of the term, and no

later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (*if applicable*). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with me to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC website for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (*if applicable*) at <http://www2.carleton.ca/pmc/new-and-current-students/dates-and-deadlines/>

You can visit the Equity Services website to view the policies and to obtain more detailed information on academic accommodation at <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

### **Important Dates:**

Sept. 5	Classes start (after Orientation events).
Sept. 18	Last day for registration and course changes in Fall and Fall/Winter courses.
Sept. 30	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from Fall term or two-term courses.
Oct. 11	University Day – no undergraduate classes.
Oct. 14	Thanksgiving Day – university closed.
Oct. 28 –	
Nov. 1	Fall Break – no classes.
Nov. 25	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000-level before the Final Examination period.
Dec. 9	Last day of classes, Fall term. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for Fall term courses.
Dec. 9	Last day to withdraw from Fall term courses (academic purposes only).
Dec. 10	No classes or examinations take place. Review classes may be held, but no new material may be introduced.
Dec. 11-22	Final examinations for Fall courses, mid-terms for Fall/Winter courses.
Dec. 22	Take-home exams are due.
Jan. 6	Winter term classes begin.
Jan. 17	Last day for registration and course changes in Winter term classes.
Jan. 31	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter courses or winter portion of two-term courses.
Feb. 17-21	Winter Break, classes suspended.
Mar. 25	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000-level before the Final Examination period.
Apr. 8	Last day of Fall/Winter and Winter term classes. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for Fall/Winter and Winter term courses.
Apr. 8	Last day to withdraw from Fall/Winter and Winter term courses (academic purposes only).
Apr. 9-10	No classes or examinations take place. Review classes may be held, but no new material may be introduced.
Apr. 11-26	Final Examinations. Exams will not be held Apr. 18-20.
Apr. 18	Good Friday – university closed.
Apr. 26	Take-home exams are due.

### **Addresses:**

Department of Philosophy:	3A35 Paterson Hall <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/philosophy">www.carleton.ca/philosophy</a> 520-2110
Registrar's Office:	300 Tory <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/registrar">www.carleton.ca/registrar</a> 520-3500
Student Academic Success Centre:	302 Tory <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/sasc">www.carleton.ca/sasc</a> 520-7850
Writing Tutorial Service:	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor, Library <a href="http://www1.carleton.ca/sasc/writing-tutorial-service/">http://www1.carleton.ca/sasc/writing-tutorial-service/</a> 520-6632
MacOdrum Library	<a href="http://www.library.carleton.ca/">http://www.library.carleton.ca/</a> 520-2735