

**PHIL 5350 TOPICS IN ETHICS OR POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY  
CARLETON UNIVERSITY  
WINTER 2019**

JANUARY 1, 2019

TERM: 2019 Winter  
 MEETINGS: Thursdays 11:30 to 2:30 p.m.  
 INSTRUCTOR: Jay Drydyk  
 OFFICE/HOURS: Wednesdays 2:00 to 4:00  
 PHONE: Please use email instead.  
 EMAIL: [jay.drydyk@carleton.ca](mailto:jay.drydyk@carleton.ca)

Would equality be morally unimportant if everyone just had enough? If so, what is enough? Harry Frankfurt began raising these questions in 1987, and the debate continues to this day. Readings in this seminar address questions like the following. Where do we draw the line, in principle, between what is enough and what is not? Is this a low threshold, below which life is bad? Or is it a high threshold, above which no one can reasonably complain about what they have? What is the right moral attitude towards having enough? Should it be a priority concern, or is it the only concern – making equality irrelevant? Critical discussion of Frankfurt’s arguments will be followed by weekly discussions of subsequent debates and a research paper on some aspect of these debates.

**LEARNING OUTCOMES.** This course will enable students to:

- (1) Understand a philosophical debate in recent philosophical literature – specifically, on sufficiency, as described above.
- (2) Conduct philosophical research on this literature including: the range of different positions within it, analysis of their strengths and weaknesses, and consideration of creative alternatives.
- (3) Develop a position within this debate from your own perspective, defend it against objections, and formulate this in a piece of writing that is appropriate to the literature.
- (4) Comment helpfully on the arguments and perspectives of other students.
- (5) Organize and lead a discussion by other students, on this topic.

<b>ASSIGNMENTS</b>	<b>WEIGHT</b>
<u>Oral presentation in class January 31</u> with outline handout. Discuss (for 5-10 minutes) a passage in Frankfurt’s text that raises questions for you, then <b>try to be more precise about</b> what the questions are and how you think they could be answered (either rejecting, defending, or modifying Frankfurt’s position). Circulate your <b>handout by Noon Wednesday, January 30</b> , via cuLearn (BOTH submit and email to the class).	5
<u>Literature review.</u> Identify some aspect of sufficientarianism that is debatable. Critically discuss up to five articles or chapters that are relevant to that debate. <b>Due 11:55 p.m. Sunday, March 3.</b>	10
<u>Short paper</u> (1000 words). Briefly present a debate about sufficiency, state a position you would take within that debate, and present your initial reasoning for it. This paper may include material from your literature review. <b>Due 11:55 p.m. on the Monday, March 24, for presentation in class Thursday, March 28.</b>	20
<u>Long paper</u> (target length 16 pages or 4000 words including reference list) <b>due April 27.</b> This paper may include material from your written review and your short paper.	40
<u>Participation</u> (includes regular attendance, plus leading discussion March 14 or 21)	25

**READINGS:** almost all are available in digital format on *Ares*. **IMPORTANT EXCEPTION:** *On Inequality*, by Harry Frankfurt, which is central to the course. MacOdrum Library has a digital copy that is available to only one person at a time. So everyone is strongly urged to buy a digital copy, which costs less than \$20. For everyone's convenience, we will expect any citations of Frankfurt's text to use page numbers from this book rather than the articles on which it was based.

‡ **SUPPLEMENTARY READINGS** are listed with this symbol in the course calendar, below.

<b>COURSE CALENDAR</b>	
Week 1 Jan 10	Introduction to the course. Sufficiency as a philosophical challenge. Richard Arneson, 'Egalitarianism' in <i>The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy</i> (Summer 2013 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <a href="https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2013/entries/egalitarianism/">https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2013/entries/egalitarianism/</a> , <b><u>The entire entry is useful, and sections 6, 6.1, 6.2 are especially relevant.</u></b>
<b>Note</b>	<b>Readings marked ‡ are supplementary.</b>
Week 2 Jan 17	Harry Frankfurt, 'Economic Equality as a Moral Ideal', <i>On Inequality</i> (Princeton UP, 2015), 1-61. ‡Liam Shields, 'Review of: On Inequality.' <i>Disputatio: International Journal of Philosophy</i> 7/42 (2016): 138-145.
Week 3 Jan 24	Harry Frankfurt, 'Equality and Respect,' in <i>On Inequality</i> (Princeton UP, 2015): 63-88. Paula Casal, 'Why Sufficiency Is Not Enough', <i>Ethics</i> 117 (2007): 296-326.
Week 4 Jan 31	Paula Casal, 'Why Sufficiency Is Not Enough', <i>Ethics</i> 117 (2007): 296-326. <b>Oral presentations (see ASSIGNMENTS, above)</b>
Week 5 Feb 7	Roger Crisp, 'Equality, Priority, and Compassion', <i>Ethics</i> 113 (2003): 745-763. ‡Derek Parfit, 'Equality and priority', <i>Ratio</i> , 3 (1997), 202-221. ‡Larry Temkin, 'Egalitarianism Defended', <i>Ethics</i> 113 (2003), pp. 764-82. Yitzhak Benbaji, 'The Doctrine of Sufficiency: A Defence', <i>Utilitas</i> , 17 (2005): 310-22.
Week 6 Feb 14	Robert Huseby, 'Sufficiency: Restated and Defended', <i>Journal of Political Philosophy</i> 18 (2010): 178-97. Karl Widerquist, 'How the Sufficiency Minimum Becomes a Social Maximum', <i>Utilitas</i> 22 (2010): 474-80.
<b>WINTER BREAK</b>	

<p>Week 7 Feb 28</p>	<p><u>Alert: more pages this week! Use the break to get a head start.</u></p> <p>Martha Nussbaum, <i>Women and Human Development: The Capabilities Approach</i> (New York: Cambridge UP, 2000): 70-86.</p> <p>Martha Nussbaum, <i>Frontiers of Justice: Disability, Nationality, Species Membership</i> (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2006): Ch 5 (iv), 'Equality and Adequacy', 291-95.</p> <p>Richard Arneson, 'Distributive Justice and Basic Capability Equality: "Good Enough" Is Not Good Enough', in <i>Capabilities Equality: Basic Issues and Problems</i>, ed. by Alexander Kaufman (Abingdon UK, and New York: Routledge, 2007): 17-43.</p> <p>‡Axelsen, David V., and Lasse Nielsen. 2015. "Sufficiency as Freedom from Duress." <i>Journal of Political Philosophy</i> 23 (4): 406-26.</p>
<p>Week 8 Mar 7</p>	<p>Liam Shields, 'The Prospects for Sufficiencyarianism', <i>Utilitas</i>, 24 (2012), 101-117.</p>
<p>Week 9 Mar 14</p>	<p>Annette Rid, 'Sufficiency, Health, and Health Care Justice: The State of the Debate', Chapter 2 in <i>What Is Enough? Sufficiency, Justice, and Health</i>, ed. Carina Fourie and Annette Rid (Oxford University Press, 2016): 30-47.</p> <p>‡Ram-Tiktin, Efrat, 'Basic Human Functional Capabilities as the Currency of Sufficiencyarian Distribution in Health Care', Chapter 8 in <i>What Is Enough? Sufficiency, Justice, and Health</i> (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016):144-163.</p> <p>‡Mitchell, Paul Mark, Tracy E. Roberts, Pelham M. Barton, and Joanna Coast, 'Applying the Capability Approach in Health Economic Evaluations: A Sufficient Solution', in <i>What Is Enough? Sufficiency, Justice, and Health</i> (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016): Chapter 15, 281-301</p> <p><b>MA students will lead this discussion.</b></p>
<p>Week 10 Mar 21</p>	<p>Laura Spengler, 'Two Types of "Enough": Sufficiency as Minimum and Maximum.' <i>Environmental Politics</i> 25 (2016): 921-40.</p> <p>‡Kanschik, Philipp Kanschik, 'Eco-Sufficiency and Distributive Sufficiencyarianism – Friends or Foes?' <i>Environmental Values</i> 25 (2016): 553-71.</p> <p><b>MA students will lead this discussion.</b></p>
<p>Week 11 Mar 28</p>	<p>Short paper presentations. <b>MA students will present on this day.</b></p>
<p>Week 12 April 4</p>	<p><b>Be prepared to comment</b> on short paper presentations.</p>
<p><b>April 27</b></p>	<p><b>Final deadline: long paper</b></p>

## **Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (Fall/Winter 2018-19)**

### **Assignments:**

Unless specifically told otherwise by their instructors, students:

- Must not use a plastic or cardboard cover or paper clips.
- Must staple the paper (there is a stapler on the essay box).
- Must include the following on the first page: student name and number; course name and number; instructor's name.
- No assignments will be accepted after the last day for handing in term work – see dates below.
- Assignments handed in through the essay box (just inside the glass doors, Paterson Hall, Floor 3A) must be dropped into the box by **4:15** on a regular business day in order to be date-stamped with that day's date. Assignments handed in after 4:15 or on a non-business day will be stamped as having been handed in on the next business day.
- Students are required to keep copies of their assignments. If your paper is lost at any point, you will be considered not to have submitted it if you cannot produce a copy immediately on request.

### **Evaluation:**

Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor subject to the approval of the Faculty Dean. This means that grades submitted by the instructor may be subject to revision. No grades are final until they have been approved by the Dean.

### **Deferrals for Final Exams:**

If you miss a final examination (formally scheduled or take-home) because of circumstances beyond your control, you may apply for a deferral. You must apply within 3 working days after the scheduled date of your formally scheduled exam or within 3 working days after the due date of a take-home exam. Visit the Registrar's Office for more information:

<http://calendar.carleton.ca/undergrad/regulations/academicregulationsoftheuniversity/acadregsuniv2/#2.5>

### **Plagiarism:**

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of 'plagiarism' as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students.

<https://carleton.ca/registrar/academic-integrity/>

### **Academic Accommodation:**

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

If you have a documented disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact the Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities (PMC) at 613-520-6608 or [pmc@carleton.ca](mailto:pmc@carleton.ca) for a formal evaluation or contact your PMC coordinator to send your instructor your Letter of Accommodation at the beginning of the term. You must also contact the PMC no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (if applicable). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with your instructor as soon as possible to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. [carleton.ca/pmc](http://carleton.ca/pmc)

**Pregnancy obligation:** write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

**Religious obligation:** write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

**Survivors of Sexual Violence:** as a community, Carleton University is committed to maintaining a positive learning, working and living environment where sexual violence will not be tolerated, and its survivors are supported through academic accommodations as per Carleton's Sexual Violence Policy. For more information about the services available at the university and to obtain information about sexual violence and/or support, visit: [carleton.ca/sexual-violence-support](http://carleton.ca/sexual-violence-support)

**Accommodation for Student Activities:** Carleton University recognizes the substantial benefits, both to the individual student and for the university, that result from a student participating in activities beyond the classroom experience. Reasonable accommodation must be provided to students who compete or perform at the national or international level. Please contact your instructor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist.

<https://carleton.ca/senate/wp-content/uploads/Accommodation-for-Student-Activities-1.pdf>

For more information on academic accommodation, please contact the departmental administrator or visit: [students.carleton.ca/course-outline](https://students.carleton.ca/course-outline)

**Important Dates:**

Sept. 5	Classes start.
Sept. 18	Last day for registration and course changes for fall term and fall/winter (two-term) courses.
Sept. 30	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from fall term or two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript.
Oct. 8	Statutory holiday. University closed.
Oct. 22-26	Fall Break – no classes.
Nov. 23	Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, before the official examination period.
Dec. 7	Last day of fall term classes. <b>Classes follow a Monday schedule.</b> Last day for academic withdrawal from fall term courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for a fall term course.
Dec. 9-21	Final examinations for fall term courses and mid-term examinations in two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.
Dec. 21	All take-home examinations are due.
Jan. 7	Classes begin.
Jan. 18	Last day for registration and course changes in the winter term.
Jan. 31	Last day for a full fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter term courses or from the winter portion of two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript.
Feb. 18	Statutory holiday. University closed.
Feb. 18-22	Winter Break – no classes.
Mar. 26	Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, in winter term or fall/winter courses before the official examination period.
Apr. 9	Last day of two-term and winter term classes. Last day for academic withdrawal from fall/winter and winter courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for two-term and for winter term courses.
Apr. 12-27	Final examinations for winter term and two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week.
Apr. 19-21	Statutory holiday. University closed. No examinations take place.
Apr. 27	All take-home examinations are due on this day.

**Addresses:**

Department of Philosophy:	3A35 Paterson Hall <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/philosophy">www.carleton.ca/philosophy</a> 520-2110
Registrar's Office:	300 Tory <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/registrar">www.carleton.ca/registrar</a> 520-3500
Academic Advising Centre:	302 Tory <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/academicadvising">www.carleton.ca/academicadvising</a> 520-7850
Writing Services:	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor, Library <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/csas/writing-services/">http://www.carleton.ca/csas/writing-services/</a> 520-3822
MacOdrum Library	<a href="http://www.library.carleton.ca/">http://www.library.carleton.ca/</a> 520-2735