



Carleton  
UNIVERSITY

Canada's Capital University

M.A. PROSEMINAR (PHIL 5850F): PHILOSOPHICAL NATURALISM

Fall Term, 2013

Wednesdays, 2:35-5:25 p.m.

### *Instructor Information*

Dr. David Matheson  
Department of Philosophy, 3A45 Paterson Hall  
613-520-2600 ext. 1928  
david\_matheson@carleton.ca  
Office hours: Tuesdays & Thursdays, 11:35 a.m.-12:35 p.m.

### *Description & Objective*

As a philosophical movement, naturalism eschews the nonphysical and emphasizes scientifically respectable methods of inquiry. The objective of this seminar is to familiarize you with the roots and guises of contemporary philosophical naturalism and with its presence in three particular areas of philosophy--the philosophy of mind, ethics, and epistemology. Particular topics to be discussed include the American origins of contemporary naturalism, its ontological and methodological commitments, the causal closure of the physical domain, reductionist, nonreductionist, and eliminativist forms of physicalism about the mental, the relationship between metaethical realism and naturalism, the autonomy of normative philosophy, and whether a naturalized epistemology vitiates traditional epistemology's reliance on intuition and the *a priori*.

### *Readings*

There is no central text that you need to buy for this seminar. The seminar readings will consist of the following articles, which your instructor will make available to you:

- Armstrong, D. (1978). Naturalism, materialism, and first philosophy. *Philosophia: Philosophical Quarterly of Israel*, 78, 261-76.
- Bealer, G. (1992). The incoherence of empiricism. *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society, Supplementary Volumes*, 66, 99-143.
- Boyd, R. (1988). How to be a moral realist. In G. Sayre-McCord (Ed.), *Essays on moral realism*, pp. 181-228. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Churchland, P.M. (1981). Eliminative materialism and the propositional attitudes. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 78, 67-90.

- Davidson, D. (1970). Mental events. In L. Forester & J. Swanson (Eds.), *Experience and theory*, pp. 79-10. Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press. (Reprinted in Davison (1980), *Essays on actions and events*, pp. 207-27. Oxford: Clarendon Press.)
- Foley, R. (1994). Quine and naturalized epistemology. *Midwest Studies in Philosophy*, 19, 243-60.
- Goldman, A. & J. Pust. (1998). Philosophical theory and intuitional evidence. In M. DePaul & W. Ramsey (Eds.), *Rethinking intuition: The psychology of intuition and its role in philosophical inquiry*, pp. 179-97. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Hampton, J. (1999). Naturalism and moral reasons [Chapter 1]. In Hampton, *The authority of reason*, pp. 19-43. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Harman, G. (1977). Ethics and observation [Chapter 1]. In Harman, *The nature of morality*, pp. 3-10. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Kim, J. (2003). The American origins of philosophical naturalism. *The Journal of Philosophical Research*, 28 (Issue supplement: *Philosophy in America at the turn of the century*), 83-98.
- Kim, J. (2001). Lonely souls: Causality and substance dualism. In K. Corcoran (Ed.), *Soul, body, and survival*, pp. 30-43. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Kornblith, H. (2007). Naturalism and intuitions. In C. Beyer & A. Burri (Eds.), *Philosophical knowledge: Its possibility and scope (Grazer Philosophische Studien 74)*, pp. 27-49. Amsterdam: Rodopi.
- Lewis, D. (1966). An argument for the identity theory. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 63, 17-25.
- Mackie, J.L. (1977). The subjectivity of values [Chapter 1]. In Mackie, *Ethics: Inventing right and wrong*, pp. 15-49. London: Penguin Books.
- Nagel, J. (2007). Epistemic intuitions. *Philosophy Compass*, 2, 792-819. [philpapers.org/archive/NAGEI](http://philpapers.org/archive/NAGEI)
- Nagel, T. (1973). What is it like to be a bat? *The Philosophical Review*, 83, 435-50.
- Ney, A. (2008). Physicalism as an attitude. *Philosophical Studies*, 138, 1-15.
- Papineau, D. (2001). The rise of physicalism. In C. Gillet & B. Loewer (Eds.), *Physicalism and its discontents*, pp. 1-36. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. <http://www.kcl.ac.uk/ip/davidpapineau/Staff/Papineau/OnlinePapers/Risephys.html>
- Quine, W.V.O. (1969). Epistemology naturalized. In Quine, *Ontological relativity and other essays*, pp. 69-90. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Rachels, J. (2000). Naturalism. In H. LaFollette (Ed.), *The Blackwell guide to ethical theory*, pp. 74-91. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Weinberg, J., S. Nichols, & S. Stich. (2001). Normativity and epistemic intuitions. *Philosophical Topics*, 29, 429-60. <http://www.rci.rutgers.edu/~stich/Publications/Papers/NormativityAndEpistemicIntuitions.pdf>

### Evaluation

Participation (10% of overall grade): Your instructor will keep track of your participation by gauging your degree of preparation for, and willingness to contribute to (via comments and questions) the discussions of the weekly seminar meetings in which you are not giving a presentation.

Presentations (20%+30%=50% of overall grade): For each of two seminar meetings, you will be expected to provide an opening commentary on an assigned reading, and then lead the subsequent discussion in the remainder of that half of the meeting. Your opening commentary will be based on a 3-4 page (900-1,200 word) paper, which you will submit in hard-copy form to your instructor at the end of the seminar meeting.

Final paper (40% of overall grade): Ideally (but not necessarily) based on one of your presentations, your final paper for the seminar should be approximately 15 pages (4,500 words) in length. It will be due in hard-copy form on the final day of the fall term's examination period, December 22.

### *Calendar*

Sept. 11	The roots & guises of contemporary naturalism	Armstrong (1978) Kim (2003)
Sept. 18		Ney (2008) Papineau (2001)
Sept. 25	Naturalism in the philosophy of mind	Kim (2001) Lewis (1966)
Oct. 2		Davidson (1970)
Oct. 9		Nagel (1973)
Oct. 16		Churchland (1981)
Oct. 23	Ethical naturalism	Hampton (1999) Mackie (1977)
Oct. 28-Nov. 1		Fall break
Nov. 6		Harman (1977) Rachels (2000)
Nov. 13		Boyd (1988)
Nov. 20	Epistemological naturalism	Foley (1994) Quine (1969)
Nov. 27		Bealer (1992) Goldman & Pust (1998)
Dec. 4		Kornblith (2007) Nagel (2007) Weinberg, Nichols & Stich (2001)
Dec. 11-22		Examination period

### *Department of Philosophy and University Policies*

#### *Assignments*

Unless specifically told otherwise by their instructors, students:

- must not use a plastic or cardboard cover or paper clips
- must staple the paper (there is a stapler on the essay box)
- must include the following in the lower right corner of the cover sheet:
  - student name
  - student number
  - course number and section
  - instructor's name

The Philosophy Department does not accept assignments by FAX. You may send them by courier, if necessary.

No assignments will be accepted after the last day for handing in term work – see dates below.

Assignments handed in through the essay box (just inside the glass doors, Paterson Hall, Floor 3A) must be dropped into the box by **4:15** on a regular business day in order to be date-stamped with that day's date. Assignments handed in after 4:15 or on a non-business day will be stamped as having been handed in on the next business day.

Students are required to keep copies of their assignments. If your paper is lost at any point, you will be considered not to have submitted it if you cannot produce a copy immediately on request.

### *Deferrals for Term Work*

If you miss a final examination and/or fail to submit a final assignment by the due date because of circumstances beyond your control, you may apply for a deferral of examination/assignment. For deferred examinations, you must apply within 5 working days after the scheduled date of your exam. To apply for deferral of a final assignment, you must apply within 5 working days of the last scheduled day of classes. Visit the Registrar's Office for more information.

### *Plagiarism*

It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of 'plagiarism' as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. (Undergraduate Calendar Academic Regulations, section 14.3, or [www4.carleton.ca/calendars//ugrad/current/regulations/acadregsuniv14.html#14.3](http://www4.carleton.ca/calendars//ugrad/current/regulations/acadregsuniv14.html#14.3))

### *Academic Accommodation*

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

**Pregnancy obligation:** write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: [www2.carleton.ca/equity/](http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/)

**Religious obligation:** write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: [www2.carleton.ca/equity/](http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/)

**Academic Accommodations for Students with Disabilities:** The **Paul Menton Centre** for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or [pmc@carleton.ca](mailto:pmc@carleton.ca) for a formal

evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send me your **Letter of Accommodation** at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (*if applicable*). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with me to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC website for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (*if applicable*) at [www2.carleton.ca/pmc/new-and-current-students/dates-and-deadlines/](http://www2.carleton.ca/pmc/new-and-current-students/dates-and-deadlines/)

You can visit the Equity Services website to view the policies and to obtain more detailed information on academic accommodation at [www2.carleton.ca/equity/](http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/)

### *Important Dates*

Sept. 5	Classes start (after Orientation events).
Sept. 18	Last day for registration and course changes in Fall and Fall/Winter courses.
Sept. 30	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from Fall term or two-term courses.
Oct. 11	University Day – no undergraduate classes.
Oct. 14	Thanksgiving Day – university closed.
Oct. 28–Nov. 1	Fall Break – no classes.
Nov. 25	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000-level before the Final Examination period.
Dec. 9	Last day of classes, Fall term. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for Fall term courses.
Dec. 9	Last day to withdraw from Fall term courses (academic purposes only).
Dec. 10	No classes or examinations take place. Review classes may be held, but no new material may be introduced.
Dec. 11-22	Final examinations for Fall courses, mid-terms for Fall/Winter courses.
Dec. 22	Take-home exams are due.
Jan. 6	Winter term classes begin.
Jan. 17	Last day for registration and course changes in Winter term classes.
Jan. 31	Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter courses or winter portion of two-term courses.
Feb. 17-21	Winter Break, classes suspended.
Mar. 25	Last day for tests or examinations in courses below 4000-level before the Final Examination period.
Apr. 8	Last day of Fall/Winter and Winter term classes. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for Fall/Winter and Winter term courses.
Apr. 8	Last day to withdraw from Fall/Winter and Winter term courses (academic purposes only).
Apr. 9-10	No classes or examinations take place. Review classes may be held, but no new material may be introduced.
Apr. 11-26	Final Examinations. Exams will not be held Apr. 18-20.
Apr. 18	Good Friday–university closed.
Apr. 26	Take-home exams are due.

*Addresses*

Department of Philosophy	3A35 Paterson Hall <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/philosophy">www.carleton.ca/philosophy</a> 520-2110
Registrar's Office	300 Tory <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/registrar">www.carleton.ca/registrar</a> 520-3500
Student Academic Success Centre	302 Tory <a href="http://www.carleton.ca/sasc">www.carleton.ca/sasc</a> 520-7850
Writing Tutorial Service	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor, Library <a href="http://www1.carleton.ca/sasc/writing-tutorial-service/">www1.carleton.ca/sasc/writing-tutorial-service/</a> 520-6632
MacOdrum Library	<a href="http://www.library.carleton.ca/">www.library.carleton.ca/</a> 520-273