# PHIL 3360-A
# Philosophy, Economics, and Public Policy:
# The Social Limits of Markets

Fall 2023 Thursdays 6:05-8:55 CB 2104
Professor Vida Panitch vida.panitch@carleton.ca
Office hours 4-5 pm Thursdays Paterson 3A55
**Note: minor changes to this syllabus may be made until september 7

## Official Calendar Description

PHIL 3360 [0.5 credit] Philosophy, Economics, and Public Policy
The course explores issues at the intersection of philosophy and economics, with a special focus on socially and politically relevant issues. Topics may include efficiency, cooperation, equity and distributive justice, commodification and the moral limits of markets. Prerequisite(s): third year standing or permission of the department. Lectures three hours a week.

## Course Description

Are there some things that money can't (or shouldn't) buy? Some goods are freely traded as commodities without any question or controversy. But for some other goods, their commodification – their being made available for sale, subject to market valuation and exchange – is hotly contested. In a market economy what distinguishes certain goods as non-commodifiable? And should the possible immorality of their commodification actually serve as grounds for restricting the market choices of rationally consenting parties to otherwise voluntary exchanges? In this course we will examine some of the leading arguments philosophers have offered for and against the sale of "contested commodities" pertaining to the human body and the public sphere.

## Course Evaluation

1. Weekly Discussion Questions 10%
2. Weekly Group Discussion Responses 20%
3. 2 Topic Responses 15% each for a total of 30%
4. Proposed Exam Question 5%
5. Oral Exam 20%
6. Exam Critical Response 15%

1. **Weekly Discussions Questions**: students will submit one question by email each week to the instructor by 2 pm on the day of class, pertaining that week's readings, from **September 14-November 23**. The question should be robust enough to generate group discussion, see below. Up to 1 mark will be allocated per weekly question, for a total of 10 marks.

2. **Group Discussion Responses**: the last third of our weekly classes will be devoted to group work in which students will answer one of the student discussion questions from that week, as selected by the instructor. Computers will not be permitted. Groups will submit their responses to the instructor at the end of each class from **September 14-November 23**. Up to 2 marks will be allocated per weekly responses, for a total of 20 marks.

3. **Topic Responses**: students will submit a 3-4 page topic response twice during the term - one before the end of reading break (**October 26**) and another before the in-class exams begin (**November 30**). It is the responsibility of the student to ensure these are submitted. These can be submitted by email to the instructor. Topic responses should focus on the readings assigned for one class and engage substantively and critically with one or both assigned readings for that class. Topic responses should address the following questions: what are the author(s) claiming with respect to the contested commodity under discussion, how do they defend their claims, and are their claims convincing in your view, why or why not?

4. **Proposed Exam Question**: students must submit by email on or before **November 23** a possible final oral exam question. It should be thematic and broad enough to serve as a comprehensive exam question. The instructor will post all of these submissions as study guides and will select from among them randomly during the oral exams.

5. **Oral Exam**: students will sign up for an exam slot on Brightspace for **November 30 or December 7**. They will be examined in groups of 3 for 45 minutes, and each individual student will be asked a different question from the posted list (see above). Students will be given the option of being asked a different question (once) and will also be given the chance to elaborate and dig deeper during their allotted time. An oral exam provides the opportunity for some back and forth, making it more like a discussion than an essay. The exam grade will depend on accuracy, understanding, critical reason, and clarity. No notes will be allowed during the exam, although students are welcome to submit any study notes they made in preparing for the exam.

6. **Exam Critical Response**: students should take notes while the other examinees in their session are being examined. They will then write a critical response, **due within a week of their own exam (December 7 or December 14)**, based on one of the other examinees answers to the question they were asked. The response should explain the other student's answer, identify its strengths, raise two potential follow-up questions, and suggest how these might best have been answered.

## Course Readings

All articles are available through the course Brightspace page, except for two that are chapters from books, pdfs of which can be requested through the Carleton library by searching the book title and clicking 'request pdf chapter'. These are the following:

- September 21: Debra Satz, *Why Some Things Should Not be For Sale*, Ch. 4 "Noxious Markets," pp. 91-114.
- September 28: Stephen Wilkinson, *Bodies for Sales: Ethics and Exploitation in the Human Body Trade*, Ch. 3, "Objectification, Exploitation, Commodification," pp. 27-55.

## Course Schedule

September 7: Introduction - What are Markets for and When do They go Wrong?

September 14: The Moral Limits of Markets

- Michael J. Sandel: *What Money Can't Buy: The Moral Limits of Markets.*
- Elizabeth Anderson: *The Ethical Limitations of the Market.*

September 21: The Political Limits of Markets

- Debra Satz: *Why Some Things Should Not be For Sale*, Ch. 4 "Noxious Markets."
- Vida Panitch: *Liberalism, Commodification, and Justice.*

September 28: Body Sales

- Anne Phillips, *It's my Body and I'll do what I like with It – Bodies as Objects and Property.*
- Stephen Wilkinson, *Bodies for Sales*, Ch. 3, "Objectification, Exploitation, Commodification."

October 5: Commercial Surrogacy

- Elizabeth Anderson, *Is Women's Labor A Commodity?*
- Debra Satz, *Markets in Women's Reproductive Labor.*

October 12: Sex Work

- Laurie Shrage, *Should Feminists Oppose Prostitution*?
- Martha C. Nussbaum, *From Reason or Prejudice – Taking Money for Sexual Services.*

October 19: Human Organs

- Simon Rippon, *Imposing Options on People in Poverty: The Harms of a Live Donor Organ Market*
- Vida Panitch and L. Chad Horne, *Commodification, Inequality, and Kidney Markets*

October 26: Reading Break - No Class

November 2: Water

Guest Lecture by Cameron Fioret, PhD, Policy Analyst, Canada Water Agency

- Cameron Fioret, "The Ethics of Water: From Commodification to Common Ownership," Chs. 2, 4, 5.

November 9: Health Care and Education

- L. Chad Horne, "Health Care Commodification."
- Harry Brighouse, "Education: Commodification and Schools."

November 16: Votes and Citizenship

- Christopher Freiman, "Vote Markets."
- Javier Hidalgo, "Selling Citizenship."

November 23: Culture and Security

- Michael J. Kessler, "Cultural Commodification and Cultural Appropriation."
- Jonathan Peterson, "Prisons and Security."

November 30: Oral Exams

- 4 sessions of 45 minutes, 3 students examined per session.
- Attendance encouraged but not mandatory for non-examinees.

December 7: Oral Exams

- 4 sessions of 45 minutes, 3 students examined per session.
- Attendance encouraged but not mandatory for non-examinees.

# Department of Philosophy and Carleton University Policies (Fall/Winter 2023-24)

**Assignments:**
Please follow your professor's instructions on how assignments will be handled electronically. There will be NO hard copies placed in the essay box this coming year.

**Evaluation:**
Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor subject to the approval of the Faculty Dean. This means that grades submitted by the instructor may be subject to revision. No grades are final until they have been approved by the Dean.

**Deferrals for Term Work:**
If students are unable to complete term work because of illness or other circumstances beyond their control, they should contact their course instructor no later than *three working days* of the due date. Normally, any deferred term work will be completed by the last day of the term. Term work cannot be deferred by the Registrar.

**Deferrals for Final Exams:**
Students are expected to be available for the duration of a course including the examination period. Occasionally, students encounter circumstances beyond their control where they may not be able to write a final examination or submit a take-home examination. Examples of this would be a serious illness or the death of a family member. If you miss a final examination and/or fail to submit a take-home examination by the due date, you may apply for a deferral no later than *three working days* after the original due date (as per the University Regulations in Section 4.3 of the Undergraduate Calendar). Visit the Registrar's Office for further information.

**Plagiarism:**
It is the responsibility of each student to understand the meaning of 'plagiarism' as defined in the Undergraduate or Graduate Calendars, and to avoid both committing plagiarism and aiding or abetting plagiarism by other students. (Section 10.1 of the Undergraduate Calendar Academic Regulations)

**Academic Accommodation:**
You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term:

- *Pregnancy or religious obligation*: write to your professor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the EDC website.
- *Academic accommodations for students with disabilities:* The Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or pmc@carleton.ca for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send your Letter of Accommodation at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class test or exam requiring accommodation. After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with your professor to ensure accommodation arrangements are made.
- *Survivors of Sexual Violence*: As a community, Carleton University is committed to maintaining a positive learning, working and living environment where sexual violence will not be tolerated, and where survivors are supported through academic accommodations as per Carleton's Sexual Violence Policy.
- *Accommodation for Student Activities:* Carleton University recognizes the substantial benefits, both to the individual student and for the university, that result from a student participating in activities beyond the classroom experience. Reasonable accommodation must be provided to students who compete or perform at the national or international level. Please contact your instructor with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist.

**Important Dates:**

| | |
|---|---|
| Sept. 6 | Classes start. |
| Sept. 19 | Last day for registration and course changes for fall term and fall/winter (two-term) courses. |
| Sept. 30 | Last day for entire fee adjustment when withdrawing from fall term or two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript. |
| Oct. 9 | Statutory holiday. University closed. |
| Oct. 23-27 | Fall Break – no classes. |
| Nov. 24 | Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, before the official examination period. |
| Dec. 8 | Last day of fall term classes. ***Classes follow a Monday schedule***. Last day for academic withdrawal from fall term courses. Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for term work for a fall term course. |
| Dec. 10-22 | Final examinations for fall term courses and mid-term examinations in two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week. |
| Dec. 22 | All take-home examinations are due. |
| | |
| Jan. 8 | Classes begin. |
| Jan. 19 | Last day for registration and course changes in the winter term. |
| Jan. 31 | Last day for a full fee adjustment when withdrawing from winter term courses or from the winter portion of two-term courses. Withdrawals after this date will result in a permanent notation of WDN on the official transcript. |
| Feb. 19 | Statutory holiday. University closed. |
| Feb. 19-23 | Winter Break – no classes. |
| Mar. 15 | Last day for academic withdrawal from fall/winter and winter courses. |
| Mar. 27 | Last day for summative tests or examinations, or formative tests or examinations totaling more than 15% of the final grade, in winter term or fall/winter courses before the official examination period. |
| Mar. 29 | Statutory holiday. University closed. |
| Apr. 10 | Last day of two-term and winter term classes. ***Classes follow a Friday schedule.*** Last day for handing in term work and the last day that can be specified by a course instructor as a due date for two-term and for winter term courses. |
| Apr. 11-12 | No classes or examinations take place. |
| Apr. 13-25 | Final examinations for winter term and two-term courses. Examinations are normally held all seven days of the week. |
| Apr. 25 | All take-home examinations are due. |

**Addresses:**

Department of Philosophy: www.carleton.ca/philosophy 520-2110

Registrar's Office: www.carleton.ca/registrar 520-3500

Academic Advising Centre: www.carleton.ca/academicadvising 520-7850

Writing Services: http://www.carleton.ca/csas/writing-services/ 520-3822

MacOdrum Library : http://www.library.carleton.ca/ 520-2735