

**PSCI 3312 (B)**  
**Enlightenment Political Thought**  
Mondays, 2:35 – 5:25pm  
(Please confirm location on Carleton Central)

Instructor: Marc Hanvelt  
Office: Loeb A625  
Office Hours: Wednesdays 1:35-2:25, or by appointment  
Phone: (613) 520-2600 x2959  
Email: marc.hanvelt@carleton.ca

---

**Course Overview**

Toleration is a central pillar of Western democracies. Was it always so? This course will focus on Enlightenment accounts of toleration. Following the bloody European conflicts of the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> centuries, and in the face of persisting religious schisms, toleration was on the minds of many Enlightenment thinkers. However, while toleration was to become a cardinal Enlightenment principle, it proved challenging to justify. Hume described it as a “paradoxical principle and salutary practice.” Voltaire remarked, “of all religions, the Christian should of course inspire the most tolerance, but until now Christians have been the most intolerant of all men.” After setting the stage with a study of toleration in the works of prominent 17<sup>th</sup>-century thinkers Locke and Bayle, we will explore influential 18<sup>th</sup>-century treatments drawn from Hume, Montesquieu, Voltaire, Kant, Franklin, Madison, Jefferson, and Paine. We will conclude with John Stuart Mill’s influential 19<sup>th</sup> century defense of toleration.

Over the course of the semester, we will read accounts of toleration as a moral, even religious obligation, as based on a principled separation of church and state, as grounded in a natural right to freedom of conscience and belief, as arising from the sceptical claim that persecutors can never be absolutely certain of their dogmas, and as a pragmatic principle for promoting political order. We will also look at how some Enlightenment thinkers sought to extend arguments for toleration beyond questions of religion. Through it all, you will recognise many debates that remain with us today.

**Course Requirements and Grading Scheme**

- |                                |                             |
|--------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| - Essay (max. 2000 words)      | 25% <b>(Due February 5)</b> |
| - Term Paper (max. 4000 words) | 45% <b>(Due April 9)</b>    |
| o Preliminary Bibliography     | 5% <b>(Due March 5)</b>     |
| o Term Paper Outline           | 5% <b>(Due March 19)</b>    |
| - Participation                | 20%                         |

## **Essay**

Each student will write one short essay (maximum 2000 words in length). The essays will be due at the beginning of lecture on February 5. The assignment, which will be distributed through cuLearn, will focus on the writings of Locke and Bayle. No supplementary research will be required for these essays.

## **Term Paper:**

Each student will submit one term paper (maximum 4000 words in length). The papers will be due at the beginning of lecture on April 9. This assignment, which will be distributed through cuLearn, will call for research beyond the assigned course readings. Students should arrange to meet with the professor by February 26<sup>th</sup> to discuss prospective paper topics. Each student will be required to submit a preliminary bibliography on March 5, and a term paper outline on March 19. These assignments will be discussed in greater detail in class.

## **Late Penalties:**

Students must submit a physical copy of their essay and their term paper directly to the professor. Email submissions will not be accepted.

Written assignments submitted after the due date will be subject to a penalty of one third of a letter grade per day (including Saturdays and Sundays).

Extensions will be granted at the discretion of the professor and only for serious and documented medical reasons or for other emergency personal circumstances. Requests for extensions submitted after the due date will usually not be considered. Except in extraordinary circumstances, extensions will not be granted retroactively.

## **Participation:**

Participation grades will be based on each student's attendance and on completion of their reading notebook (electronic). For each week's readings, students will write a short set of reflections. These can take the form of questions or reflections on the texts under study. Each entry need not be long. A single paragraph will sometimes suffice. However, students are welcome to write more if they wish to. The purpose of the notebook is for students to collect thoughts and/or questions that arise from their reading. These will be useful for raising questions and generating discussion in class, also for planning and writing essays and term papers. In order for the reading notebooks to serve their purpose, students cannot write them all at once, at the end of the term. It is essential that students write an entry each week, as they work through the week's readings. I will discuss the reading notebooks in greater detail during the January 8 lecture.

## **Readings:**

All readings for this course are available online.

For those students who would like to purchase physical copies of the texts, the following is a list of recommended editions. There are other excellent editions of some of these texts. If you have any questions about particular editions, please feel free to ask the professor.

Recommended Editions of the Texts:

- Bayle, Pierre. *A Philosophical Commentary on These Words of the Gospel, Luke 14:23, "Compel them to Come In, That My House May Be Full,"* ed. John Kilcullen and Chandran Kukathas (Indianapolis, IN.: Liberty Fund, 2005).
- Locke, John. *Locke on Toleration*, ed. Richard Vernon (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010).
- Hume, David.  
*Essays, Moral, Political, and Literary*, ed. Eugene F. Miller (Indianapolis, IN.: Liberty Fund, 1987).  
*The History of England from the Invasion of Julius Caesar to The Revolution of 1688*, 6 vols. (1778; reprint, Indianapolis, IN.: Liberty Fund, 1983).  
*A Dissertation on the Passions The Natural History of Religion*, ed. Tom L. Beauchamp (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2013).
- Montesquieu. *The Spirit of the Laws*, ed. and trans. Anne M. Cohler, Basia Carolyn Miller, and Harold Samuel Stone (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010).
- Voltaire. *Treatise on Tolerance*, ed. Simon Harvey (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000).
- Kant, Immanuel. *Perpetual Peace and Other Essays*, trans. Ted Humphrey (Indianapolis, IN: Hackett, 1983).
- Paine, Thomas. *Rights of Man*, ed. Gregory Claeys (Indianapolis, IN: Hackett, 1992).
- Mill, John Stuart. *On Liberty*, ed. Elizabeth Rapaport (Indianapolis, IN: Hackett, 1978).

**Course Schedule**

**Week 1 (Jan.8): Introduction to the Course**

**Week 2 (Jan.15): Locke on the Principled Separation of Church and State**

- Reading: John Locke, *A Letter concerning Toleration*

- Available online at: <http://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/locke-a-letter-concerning-toleration-and-other-writings>

### **Week 3 (Jan.22): Bayle on the Rights of Erroneous Conscience**

- Reading: Pierre Bayle, *Philosophical Commentary* (Part 2, chapters 8-11)
  - Available online at: <http://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/bayle-a-philosophical-commentary-on-these-words-of-the-gospel>

### **Week 4 (Jan.29): Hume on a Paradoxical Principle and Salutary Practice**

- Readings:
  - David Hume, *Essays Moral, Political, and Literary*:
    - “Of Parties in General”
    - “Of Superstition and Enthusiasm”
    - “Of the Liberty of the Press.”
      - Please read the original conclusion to this essay (printed at pages 604-5 under “Variant Readings”).
    - Readings from Hume’s *Essays* are available online at: <http://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/hume-essays-moral-political-literary-lf-ed>
  - David Hume, *The History of England*:
    - Volume II: chapter XXIII
      - “Thus have we pursued the history of England” to “the complicated fabric of the most perfect government.”
        - Facsimile PDF: pages 518-525.
        - Ebook PDF: pages 333-338.
    - Volume III: chapter XXXII
      - “State of Affairs in Scotland”
        - Facsimile PDF: pages 280-283.
        - Ebook PDF: pages 185-187.
    - Volume III: chapter XXXVII
      - “Reasons for and Against Toleration”
        - Facsimile PDF: pages 430-443.
        - Ebook PDF: pages 282-285.
    - Volume V: Appendix IV (Appendix to the Reign of James I)
      - “Ecclesiastical Government”
        - Facsimile PDF: pages 129-132.
        - Ebook PDF: pages 85-87.

- Volume VI: chapter LXVI
  - “State of Affairs in Scotland”
    - Facsimile PDF: pages 321-331.
    - Ebook PDF: pages 214-221.
- Readings from Hume’s *History* are available online at: <http://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/hume-the-history-of-england-6-vols>)

**Week 5 (Feb.5): Hume on the Natural History of Religion**

- Reading: David Hume, *The Natural History of Religion*
  - Available online at: <http://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/hume-the-natural-history-of-religion>
- **ESSAYS DUE**

**Week 6 (Feb.12): Montesquieu on the Nature and Principle of Different Regimes**

- Readings: Montesquieu, *The Spirit of the Laws* (Books 1-5, Book 8).
  - Available online at: <http://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/montesquieu-complete-works-vol-1-the-spirit-of-laws>

**Week 7 (Feb.19): No Lecture (Winter Break)**

**Week 8: (Feb.26): Montesquieu on Liberty and Religion**

- Readings: Montesquieu, *The Spirit of the Laws* (Book 11: chs.1-7; Book 12: chs.1-13, 25, 27; Book 19; Books 24-26)
  - Available online at: <http://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/montesquieu-complete-works-vol-1-the-spirit-of-laws>

**Week 9 (March 5): Voltaire on Reason, Scepticism, and Toleration**

- Reading: Voltaire, *Treatise on Tolerance*
  - Available online at: <http://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/voltaire-toleration-and-other-essays>
- **TERM PAPER PRELIMINARY BIBLIOGRAPHY DUE**

**Week 10 (March 12): Kant on the Free Use of Reason**

- Readings:

- Immanuel Kant “An Answer to the Question: What is Enlightenment?”
  - Available online at: <http://www.columbia.edu/acis/ets/CCREAD/etscc/kant.html>
- Immanuel Kant, “To Perpetual Peace: A Philosophical Sketch”
  - Available online at: [http://www.earlymoderntexts.com/assets/pdfs/kant1795\\_1.pdf](http://www.earlymoderntexts.com/assets/pdfs/kant1795_1.pdf)

### **Week 11 (March 19): Toleration in Early America**

- Readings:
  - Constitution of the United States (Preamble; Articles 1-7)
    - Available online at: <https://www.archives.gov/founding-docs/constitution-transcript>
- The following readings from *The Founders’ Constitution* are all available online at: [http://press-pubs.uchicago.edu/founders/tocs/amendI\\_religion.html](http://press-pubs.uchicago.edu/founders/tocs/amendI_religion.html)
  - U.S. Bill of Rights, Amendment I (Religion)
  - Benjamin Franklin:
    - 14. Letter to the London Packet (3, June 1772)
  - James Madison:
    - 43. Memorial and Remonstrance Against Religious Assessments (1785)
    - 16. James Madison to William Bradford (24 January 1774)
    - 17. William Bradford to James Madison (4 March 1774)
    - 18. James Madison to William Bradford (1 April 1774)
    - 64. Detached Memoranda (1817)
  - Thomas Jefferson:
    - 37. A Bill for Establishing Religious Freedom (12 June 1779)
    - 40. Notes on the State of Virginia, Query 17, 157—61
- **TERM PAPER OUTLINE DUE**

### **Week 12 (March 26): Paine on the Universal Right of Conscience**

- Reading: Thomas Paine, *Rights of Man*
  - Available online at: <http://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/paine-the-rights-of-man-part-i-1791-ed>
    - Read up to “universal right of citizenship.” (Ebook PDF: page 40.)

### **Week 13 (April 2): Defending Toleration in the 19<sup>th</sup> century**

- Reading: John Stuart Mill, *On Liberty* (chapters 1-2)
  - o Available online at:  
[http://www.earlymoderntexts.com/assets/pdfs/mill1859\\_1.pdf](http://www.earlymoderntexts.com/assets/pdfs/mill1859_1.pdf)

### **Week 14 (April 9): Defending Toleration in the 19<sup>th</sup> century**

- John Stuart Mill, *On Liberty* (chapters 3-4)
    - o Available online at:  
[http://www.earlymoderntexts.com/assets/pdfs/mill1859\\_1.pdf](http://www.earlymoderntexts.com/assets/pdfs/mill1859_1.pdf)
  - **TERM PAPERS DUE**
- 

### **Academic Accommodations**

---

The Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or [pmc@carleton.ca](mailto:pmc@carleton.ca) for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send me your **Letter of Accommodation** at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (*if applicable*). After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with me to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC website for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (*if applicable*).

**For Religious Observance:** Students requesting accommodation for religious observances should apply in writing to their instructor for alternate dates and/or means of satisfying academic requirements. Such requests should be made during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist, but no later than two weeks before the compulsory academic event. Accommodation is to be worked out directly and on an individual basis between the student and the instructor(s) involved. Instructors will make accommodations in a way that avoids academic disadvantage to the student. Instructors and students may contact an Equity Services Advisor for assistance ([www.carleton.ca/equity](http://www.carleton.ca/equity)).

**For Pregnancy:** Pregnant students requiring academic accommodations are encouraged to contact an Equity Advisor in Equity Services to complete a *letter of accommodation*. Then, make an appointment to discuss your needs with the instructor at least two weeks prior to the first academic event in which it is anticipated the accommodation will be required.

**Plagiarism:** The University Senate defines plagiarism as “presenting, whether intentional or not, the ideas, expression of ideas or work of others as one’s own.” This can include:

- reproducing or paraphrasing portions of someone else’s published or unpublished material, regardless of the source, and presenting these as one’s own without proper citation or reference to the original source;
- submitting a take-home examination, essay, laboratory report or other assignment written, in whole or in part, by someone else;
- using ideas or direct, verbatim quotations, or paraphrased material, concepts, or ideas without appropriate acknowledgment in any academic assignment;
- using another’s data or research findings;
- failing to acknowledge sources through the use of proper citations when using another’s works and/or failing to use quotation marks;
- handing in "substantially the same piece of work for academic credit more than once without prior written permission of the course instructor in which the submission occurs.

Plagiarism is a serious offence which cannot be resolved directly with the course’s instructor. The Associate Deans of the Faculty conduct a rigorous investigation, including an interview with the student, when an instructor suspects a piece of work has been plagiarized. Penalties are not trivial. They may include a mark of zero for the plagiarized work or a final grade of "F" for the course.

Student or professor materials created for this course (including presentations and posted notes, labs, case studies, assignments and exams) remain the intellectual property of the author(s). They are intended for personal use and may not be reproduced or redistributed without prior written consent of the author(s).

**Submission and Return of Term Work:** Papers must be submitted directly to the instructor according to the instructions in the course outline and will not be date-stamped in the departmental office. Late assignments may be submitted to the drop box in the corridor outside B640 Loeb. Assignments will be retrieved every business day at **4 p.m.**, stamped with that day's date, and then distributed to the instructor. For essays not returned in class please attach a **stamped, self-addressed envelope** if you wish to have your assignment returned by mail. Final exams are intended solely for the purpose of evaluation and will not be returned.

**Grading:** Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor, subject to the approval of the faculty Dean. Final standing in courses will be shown by alphabetical grades. The system of grades used, with corresponding grade points is:

Percentage	Letter grade	12-point scale	Percentage	Letter grade	12-point scale
90-100	A+	12	67-69	C+	6
85-89	A	11	63-66	C	5
80-84	A-	10	60-62	C-	4

77-79	B+	9	57-59	D+	3
73-76	B	8	53-56	D	2
70-72	B-	7	50-52	D-	1

**Approval of final grades:** Standing in a course is determined by the course instructor subject to the approval of the Faculty Dean. This means that grades submitted by an instructor may be subject to revision. No grades are final until they have been approved by the Dean.

**Carleton E-mail Accounts:** All email communication to students from the Department of Political Science will be via official Carleton university e-mail accounts and/or cuLearn. As important course and University information is distributed this way, it is the student's responsibility to monitor their Carleton and cuLearn accounts.

**Carleton Political Science Society:** The Carleton Political Science Society (CPSS) has made its mission to provide a social environment for politically inclined students and faculty. Holding social events, debates, and panel discussions, CPSS aims to involve all political science students at Carleton University. Our mandate is to arrange social and academic activities in order to instill a sense of belonging within the Department and the larger University community. Members can benefit through numerous opportunities which will complement both academic and social life at Carleton University. To find out more, visit <https://www.facebook.com/groups/politicalsciencesociety/> or come to our office in Loeb D688.

**Official Course Outline:** The course outline posted to the Political Science website is the official course outline.

---