

NOTE ON SPROTT PhD/MSc PROCESS THESIS PREPARATION AND DEFENCE

*François Brouard, DBA, FCPA, FCA
in collaboration with Melissa Doric
Sprott School of Business, Carleton University*

Caution: The official Sprott and Carleton documents and web pages should be consulted to have the most up-to-date information. This guide is only a summary of some information for potential accounting students and is not an official guide.

A series of notes regarding the Sprott PhD/MSc process is available to help PhD/MSc students in their progress toward completion.

1. Note on Sprott PhD/MSc process Overview for Accounting students
2. Note on Sprott PhD/MSc process Coursework period
3. Note on Sprott PhD/MSc process Comprehensive examination
4. Note on Sprott PhD/MSc process Proposal
5. **Note on Sprott PhD/MSc process Thesis preparation and defence** (this note)

This note presents various steps and procedures for thesis preparation and defence in the PhD/MSc process.

Sprott PhD/MSc in Management

PhD		
Components	Cr	Courses
Thesis	5.0	BUSI6909 - PhD Thesis (including oral examination / defence) (monograph thesis or integrated articles (3-4))

MSc		
Components	Cr	Courses
Thesis	2.0	BUSI5989 - MSc Thesis (including oral examination / defence)

Steps and Procedures for PhD/ MSc Thesis

	Procedures	Stu	Sup	Sprott	FGPA
1	Preparation of thesis	X			
2	Comments by Supervisor on draft thesis		X		
3	Discussion between Student and Supervisor	X	X		
4	Make sure to follow all guidelines for preparation (formatting, including title page) Verify for accuracy and completeness	X			
5	Request an extension, if needed	X			
6	Approval of extension, if needed by Supervisor, Graduate Director and FGPA		X	X	X
7	Repeat previous steps until acceptable condition for examination	X	X		
8	Proposition of 2-3 potential External examiners for approval Graduate Director (8 weeks prior to Defence date)		X		
9	Information of the date intended to submit thesis to Supervisor and Graduate Director (2 weeks prior to Submission date)	X	x	x	
10 a	PhD - Finding all Examination Board members (similar to Proposal Examination Board) - Supervisor - Co-supervisor, if applicable - Faculty member from Sprott (in main area) - Faculty member from Sprott (from other area) Plus (Note A1 & A2) - External examiner (without conflict of interest) - Internal examiner from Carleton other than Sprott		X		
10 b	MSc - Finding all Examination Board members (similar to Proposal Examination Board) - Supervisor - Co-supervisor, if applicable - Faculty member from Sprott (in main area) - Internal examiner (Faculty member from Sprott (from other area) or from outside Sprott))		X		
11	Approval of External examiners by Graduate Director			X	
12	Written request of Committee members for approval by Graduate Director (If not similar to Proposal Examination Board)		X		

	Procedures	Stu	Sup	Sprott	FGPA
13	Approval of Committee members by Graduate Director (If not similar to Proposal Examination Board)			X	
14	Once approved, setting time and date with all Examination Board members	X	X		
15	Securing all Examination Board members availability (date and time)		X		
16	Ask Examination Board members if they require a hard copy (PDF available online) (1 for FGPA (and 1 for Graduate office?)) 4-6 copies : supervisor, co-supervisor, other 2 Faculty members, External examiner, Internal examiner)	X			
17	Suggestions: Circulate draft to Sprott faculty members to identify major issues and keep them in the loop at any stage.	X	X		
18 a	PhD - Fill out official form and Submission to Graduate Administrator PhD Thesis Examination Approval Form (student name, student number, student undergraduate degree (type, year, university), student graduate degree (type, year, university); proposed date, proposed time, title, external examiner (name, address, telephone), internal examiner (name, department), supervisor name, committee members' names, signature of supervisor (5 weeks prior to Defence date)	X	X		
18 b	MSc - Fill out official form and Submission to Graduate Administrator MSc Thesis Examination Approval Form (student name, student number, student undergraduate degree (type, year, university), student graduate degree (type, year, university); proposed date, proposed time, title, supervisor name, committee members' names, internal examiner , signature of supervisor (3 weeks prior to Defence date)	X	X		
19	Provide copies of thesis to Graduate Administrator (PDF and hard copies) (PhD = 5 weeks prior to Defence date) (MSc = 3 weeks prior to Defence date)	X			
20	Approval of Thesis Examination Approval Form by Graduate Director (PhD = 5 weeks prior to Defence date) (MSc = 3 weeks prior to Defence date)			X	

	Procedures	Stu	Sup	Sprott	FGPA
21	PhD only: Communication with External examiner			X	
22	Distribution of hard copies by Graduate Administrator			X	
23 a	Once Thesis Examination Approval Form submitted, automated email asking for submission of documents	x			X
23 b	Completion and submission of Agreements and License - Academic Integrity Statement - FIPPA Agreement - Carleton University Thesis Licence Agreement (via Electronic Thesis Deposit in Carleton Central) (Note: All 3 mandatory to proceed to thesis upload.)	X			
23 c	Completion and upload Examination copy of thesis - Thesis details (information) - PDF copy of thesis (max 40MB file) - supplementary files (max 2MB file) (via Electronic Thesis Deposit in Carleton Central)	X			
23 d	Completion and submission of Contributor Documents - Contributor information - Copyright authorization (for Integrated Thesis only and for each contributor) (via Electronic Thesis Deposit in Carleton Central)	X			
23 e	Submit Examination copy (Only once all documents are ready; will not be able to alter the uploaded documents after.) (via Electronic Thesis Deposit in Carleton Central) (<i>PhD = 4 weeks prior to Defence date</i>) (<i>MSc = 2 weeks prior to Defence date</i>)	X			
24	Once previous submission completed, request of authorization of thesis defence by: - Supervisor - Sprott Graduate Director (via Electronic Thesis Deposit in Carleton Central)		X	X	
25	Approval of Examination copy of thesis - Supervisor - Sprott Graduate Director - FGPA (PhD only) (via Electronic Thesis Deposit in Carleton Central)		X	X	X
26 a	PhD - FGPA will secure a Chairperson (not from Sprott for PhD)				X
26 b	MSc - Graduate Administrator will secure a Chairperson (from Sprott for MSc,)			X	

	Procedures	Stu	Sup	Sprott	FGPA
27	Graduate Administrator will book a room for the defence (with equipment)			X	
28 a	PhD - Confirm Examination Board for Notice of Thesis Examination candidate, chairperson, supervisor, co-supervisor, Sprott Faculty members (2) external examiner, internal examiner + ex officio member: Graduate Director + ex officio members: Dean Sprott, Dean FGPA	x	x	X x	 x
28 b	MSc - Confirm Examination Board for Notice of Thesis Examination candidate, chairperson, supervisor, co-supervisor, Sprott Faculty members, including Internal examiner (2) + ex officio members: Dean Sprott, Dean FGPA	x	x	X x	 x
28 c	Circulation of official Notice of Thesis Examination by Graduate Administrator - What (title of thesis) - When (date, time) and Where (location, room) - Who (Examination Board members and their role) <i>(PhD = 2 weeks prior to Defence date)</i> <i>(MSc = 2 weeks prior to Defence date)</i>	x	x	X x	 x
29	PhD only - Communication by Dean of FGPA to External examiner to review procedures followed in the defence, to outline judgments to be made and to ask that any major concerns be communicated in the report to be submitted at least 1 week before the examination				X
30	PhD only - Transmission of PowerPoint slides to Graduate Administrator for External examiner <i>(1 week prior to Defence date)</i>	X			
31	Transmission of PowerPoint slides to External examiner <i>(1 week prior to Defence date)</i>			X	
32	Information about participation of any member of the Examination Board via telephone, videoconference or any other medium (Skype) and technical arrangements <i>(1 week prior to Defence date)</i>			X	x
33	PhD only - Submission of written comments on the thesis by External examiner to Dean of FGPA (Note A3 & A4) <i>(1 week prior to Defence date)</i> (via Carleton Central)				X

	Procedures	Stu	Sup	Sprott	FGPA
34	Submission by each Examination Board member of the Committee Member Thesis Defence Authorization Form (1 week prior to Defence date) (note A4) (MSc only) (via Carleton Central)		X	X	x
35	Examination by FGPA and consultation, if - no positive recommendation by External examiner (PhD only) - serious reservations about the thesis		x	x	X
36	Observers permission (Note A5) (2 working days prior to Defence date for written questions)	X			chair
37	Thesis Defence (see details in other table) (Defence date)	X	X	X	
38	Decision following Defence				chair
	Pass	- Accepted - Acceptable after minor revisions - Acceptable after major revisions			
	Fail	- Rejected			
39	Reception of Examiners reports and revisions	X	X		
40	Completion of Examination Report Outcome (via Electronic Thesis Deposit in Carleton Central)				chair
41	Revisions on thesis, if any, with notes on changes	X	x		
42	Discussion between Student and Supervisor on revisions	X	X		
43	Preparation of document about revisions required (suggestions and responses)	X			
44	Submission of final version of thesis (via Electronic Thesis Deposit in Carleton Central)	X			
45	If major revisions, examination by Examination Board members and Signature Thesis Revisions Approval Form		X	X	X
46	Approval of final version of thesis - Supervisor - Sprott Graduate Director - FGPA (PhD only) (via Electronic Thesis Deposit in Carleton Central)		X	X	X
47	Fill out form and Submission to PhD administrator AACSB Assurance of Learning (AOL) Rubrics		X	X	
48	Recommendation of degree awarded by FGPA to Senate				X
49	Arrangement by FGPA for the e-thesis to the Library				X

	Procedures	Stu	Sup	Sprott	FGPA
50	Apply to graduate through Carleton Central March 1 for Spring Convocation (May) September 1 for Fall Convocation (November) December 1 for Winter Convocation (with Spring)	X			
51	Convocation (Spring or Fall)	X			

Note: Stu = Student; Sup = Supervisor (and Co-supervisor); Sprott = Sprott PhD/MSc Program office (Graduate Director (PhD/MSc), Graduate Administrator (PhD/MSc)); FGPA = Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs

Notes

- A1: The External examiner from outside Carleton University should be an impartial scholar who is a recognized authority in the subject of the thesis and who be at arm's length from the candidate, from the supervisor(s) and from the university.
- Conditions to avoid conflict of interest (in the preceding six years) (indication):
- should have no family ties or close business ties or close professional ties to the candidate or the supervisor(s);
 - should have neither held an appointment at Carleton University nor be a member of the joint institutes with University of Ottawa;
 - should have no prior supervisory relationship with the candidate or with the supervisor(s);
 - should not have been a principal co-author or close research collaborator with the candidate or with the supervisor(s).
- A2: The Internal examiner from Carleton University outside the student's unit or program and who has be at arm's length from the thesis research.
- A3: Normally, the thesis defence will not proceed without receipt of the report of the External examiner one week in advance of the date of the defence.
- A4: If the External examiner's report does not recommend that the thesis proceed to defence, consultation by Dean of FGPA of Graduate Director and/or Supervisor
- After consultation the Dean may recommend to postpone the defence.
- In such instances, the External examiner will be asked for permission to release her/his report to the student and the thesis supervisor for review.
- If any examiner has serious reservations regarding the thesis, consultation by Graduate Administrator of Supervisor and Student to determine whether the examination will be deferred.
- If the examination is deferred, the Graduate Director will inform FGPA. consultation by Graduate Administrator of Supervisor and Student to determine whether the examination will be deferred.
- The student has the option to accept the Dean's recommendation for postponement or to proceed with the defence as planned. In either case, the examining committee shall remain the same.
- A5: Observers:
- Any faculty member from within the University may attend the examination as an observer. Other observers may also attend the examination provided they have obtained the permission of the candidate and the chair of the examination board. Observers are not permitted to ask questions during the examination or participate in any other way and may not leave the examination until the Chair has adjourned the proceedings.
 - Faculty members other than those on the examination board may be granted the privilege of asking questions during the examination if they have provided a written submission containing the examination questions at least 2 working days in advance of the examination to the chair of the examination board.

	Procedures	Stu	Chair	Members	
8 b	MSc - Round 1: one-on-one questioning - Internal examiner (not area) (15-20 minutes) - Member committee (area) (15-20 minutes) - Co-supervisor; Supervisor (15-20 minutes)			X	
9	Round 2: general questioning and general discussion			X	
10	Opportunity for the candidate to make a closing statement		X		
11	Candidate's closing statement, if needed	X			
12	Candidate withdraws	X			
13	Deliberation by Examination Board				
	Chair polls the members of the Examination Board to determine if the candidate passes or fails and the extent of required revisions.		X		
	Decision following Defence (Note B2)			X	
	Acceptability	- Accepted - Acceptable after minor revisions* - Acceptable after major revisions* (* need to specify in writing in both cases) - Rejected (not acceptable)			
	Thesis grade	- Satisfactory - Unsatisfactory			X
	Status of thesis defence	- Satisfactory - Unsatisfactory			X
	Medal	Recommendation for a medal? (Note B3)			X
14	Signature of Yellow Examination Report Form		X	X	
15	The Chair of the Examination Board records in writing all required revisions, major or minor, agreed to by the board and make sure it is signed by all members. (Note B4)		X		
16	Candidate returns to examination room	X			
17	Announcement of results		X		
18	Congratulate candidate (depending on outcome)		X	X	
19	Reception of Examiners reports and revisions	X			
20	Adjournment of the Examination Board		X		

Note: Stu = Student; Members = Examination Board members; Chair = Chairperson of Examination Board

Notes

- B1: In case of Thesis by articles (Integrated thesis), should the supervisor or any other member of the advisory committee be one of the principal authors or a co-authored article included in the thesis, this member will be allowed only limited participation in the defence.
During his/her turn in the first round of questioning, the member may be allowed by the Chair to provide points of clarification on the thesis and reformulate questions for the candidate, but may not address critical and substantive issues. Furthermore, this member will not be allowed to participate actively in the deliberation after the defence.
- B2: Decision may be arrived at by consensus or by formal vote; if formal vote, a simple majority is required.
For PhD, the External examiner must have voted with the majority for the thesis to be accepted.
For MSc, the Internal examiner must have voted with the majority for the thesis to be accepted.
- Thesis Defence Possible Decisions
(Source: Carleton U, FGPA (2015). Thesis Examination Policy, Appendix B-3, C-4)
- Accepted
Used where only a few typographical or stylistic changes are required.
 - Acceptable after minor revisions
Used where a large number of typographical errors exist, or where other changes are required which do not affect the basic tenets of the research or its findings and do not call for alteration to the basic structure of the thesis.
These changes should be clearly specified in writing and are subject only to the approval of the thesis supervisor before the thesis is finally accepted for deposit.
 - Acceptable after major revisions
Used where, in the judgment of the examiners, changes of a substantive nature which call for re-writing of parts of the thesis are required.
These changes should be clearly specified in writing and are subject to the approval of the thesis board, or a designated committee, before the thesis is finally accepted for deposit.
 - Rejected
Used where, in the judgment of the examiners, the thesis is unacceptable on substantive grounds.
- B3: PhD: If yes, need additional report from External examiner in advance (No participation of Supervisor)
MSc: Decision may be arrived at by consensus or by formal vote by members without participation of the Supervisor in the discussion to determine if the thesis is judge outstanding.
- B4: Special procedures, if unsatisfactory.

Resources Available for the Sprott PhD/MSc in Management

(See all links at Francois Brouard Supervision page)

<http://sprott.carleton.ca/profbrouard/supervision>

Carleton University, Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs (FGPA)

- Carleton U., FGPA. Thesis Requirements.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/thesis-requirements/>
- Carleton U., FGPA. Thesis Formatting Guidelines.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/thesis-requirements/formatting-guidelines/>
- Carleton U., FGPA. Thesis Template (Word).
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/wp-content/uploads/CU-thesis-template.docx>
- Carleton U., FGPA. Thesis Title Page Sample, 1p.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/wp-content/uploads/Sample-Thesis-Title-Page.pdf>
- Carleton U., FGPA. Thesis Title Page Template, 1p.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/wp-content/uploads/Thesis-Title-Page-template.pdf>
- Carleton U., FGPA. Sample Letter for Copyright, 1p.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/wp-content/uploads/Sample-letter-for-copyright.pdf>
- Carleton U., FGPA. Thesis Checklist.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/thesis-requirements/thesis-checklist/>
- Carleton U., FGPA. Private and Personal Information in Your Thesis.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/thesis-requirements/privacy-and-personal-information-in-your-thesis/>
- Carleton U., FGPA. Electronic Thesis Deposit.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/thesis-requirements/electronic/>
- Carleton U., FGPA. E-Thesis Documentation, 13 July 2015, 54p.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/wp-content/uploads/E-Thesis-Documentation.pdf>
- Carleton U., FGPA. Copyright & Intellectual Property.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/thesis-requirements/copyright/>
- Carleton U., FGPA. Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act and Graduate Students (FIPPA), 1p.
http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/wp-content/uploads/fippa_and_grad_students.pdf
- Library and Archives Canada. Thesis Non-exclusive Licence, 1p.
<http://www.collectionscanada.gc.ca/obj/s4/f2/frm-nl59-2.pdf>
- Carleton U., FGPA. Thesis Examination Policy (Master's and PhD), September 2015, 13p.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/wp-content/uploads/Thesis-Examination-Policy.pdf>
- Carleton U., FGPA. Thesis Examination Policy (Master's and PhD) - Appendices, 13p.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/wp-content/uploads/Thesis-Policy-Forms.Updated-25-July-2013.pdf>
- Carleton U., FGPA. Master's Thesis Examination Report, 1p.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/wp-content/uploads/Thesis-Examination-Report-Masters-Revised.pdf>
- Carleton U., FGPA. PhD Thesis Examination Report, 1p.
<http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/wp-content/uploads/Thesis-Examination-Report-PHD-Revised-January-2016.pdf>
- Carleton U. Senate Medals Policy, 30 March 2012, 9p.
http://gradstudents.carleton.ca/wp-content/uploads/Medals_Policy_FINAL_Senate-Approved.pdf