

*The Board of Governors acknowledges and respects the Algonquin First Nation, on whose traditional territory the Carleton University campus is located.*

**Minutes of the 633<sup>rd</sup> Meeting of the  
Board of Governors**

**Tuesday, December 6, 2022 at 3:00 p.m.  
Richcraft Hall Room 2440R**

<b>PRESENT:</b>	G. Farrell (Chair)	A. Hamdani	B. O'Connor (Virtual)
	B. Creary (Vice-Chair)	L. Hayes	J. Ojangle
	B.A. Bacon	L. Honsberger (Virtual)	M. Porter
	A. Chan	N. Karhu	P. Smith (Virtual)
	P. Dabas	A. Keung (Virtual)	J. Taber
	P. Dion	A. Khoyani	C. Tessier
	K. von Finckenstein	D. Maseko (Virtual)	A. Tremblay
	M. Gillis	S. Mingie (late)	A. Ullett (Virtual)
	D. Greenberg (Virtual)	L. Newton Miller	P. Wolff
	L. Grussani		
<b>REGRETS:</b>	Y. Baltacioğlu	D. Fortin	M. Fraser
	K. Furlong		
<b>STAFF:</b>	N. Arnold	L. Dyke	S. Levitt
	N. Badiou	T. Frost (Virtual)	A. Marcotte (Virtual)
	S. Blanchard	A. Goth (R. Secretary)	B. Michaud (Virtual)
	M. Bright	R. Goubran	K. McKinley (Virtual)
	J. Conley	D. Hornsby	K. Solomon
	M. Dabros	C. Khordoc (late)	J. Tomberlin

**OPEN SESSION**

**1. CALL TO ORDER AND CHAIR'S REMARKS**

The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:00 pm and welcomed all governors and attendees to the Board of Governors meeting. The Vice-Chair acknowledged the Algonquin First Nation territory on which Carleton University is located and provided a personal land acknowledgement. She encouraged members to complete the Indigenous Learning Bundles available to Board. The Chair advised that December 6<sup>th</sup> is White Ribbon Day and reiterated

Carleton's commitment to ending gender-based violence. He reviewed the meeting protocols for those members attending in-person and remotely.

## **2. DECLARATION OF CONFLICT OF INTEREST**

The Chair asked for any declarations of conflict of interest from the members. None were declared.

## **3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The agenda was circulated in advance. It was moved by A. Tremblay and seconded by C. Tessier that the open agenda of the 633<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the Board of Governors be approved, as presented. The motion carried unanimously.

## **4. APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT AGENDA**

The following items were circulated in the open consent agenda for approval: Open Session Minutes from the 632<sup>nd</sup> Board Meeting, the Academic Governance of the University Joint Policy, Board of Governors Travel and Related Expense Policy, and the Founders Award Criteria.

The following items were circulated in the open consent agenda for information: University Committee Minutes from the September meetings of the Building Program, Finance, and Governance Committees, an overview of Governor Training and Onboarding, Emerging Themes from the Campus Master Plan Renewal, Update on the New Student Residence Construction, Strive for Sustainability Annual Report, Project Conclusion Report for the Engineering Student Design Centre, Ongoing Capital Projects Status Report and Capital Renewal Update, Update on the 2022/23 Operating Budget, Investment Committee Terms of Reference, Investment Report on the Endowment, Pension Plan Report, Student Governor Handbook and Election Process, Administrative Staff Governor Handbook and Election Process, and Minutes from Senate.

It was moved by N. Karhu and seconded by C. Tessier that the items in the open consent agenda be approved, as presented. The motion carried unanimously.

## **5. ITEMS FOR APPROVAL**

### **5.1 Framework for the 2023/2024 Operating Budget**

An executive summary and presentation were circulated in advance.

The Chair advised that Carleton's planning and budget framework is based on a five-year forecast reviewed and updated annually. The framework outlined the planning cycle which considers the overall financial situation at the University and the priorities as set out by the Strategic Integrated Plan (SIP).

P. Dion, Chair of the Finance Committee, introduced the 2023/24 Operating Budget Framework. He advised that the Committee was confident in the robust process outlined by J. Tomberlin, Provost and Vice-President (Academic), given the current economic climate and that the University remains in a solid financial position.

B.A. Bacon, President and Vice-Chancellor, provided broader context to the sector-wide fiscal pressures impacting Ontario universities. A large share of university revenues are government controlled with grants have been frozen and universities are heading into a fifth year of a tuition decrease. At this time, Carleton is planning towards a balanced budget but if the fiscal pressures continue a small deficit may be the necessary course of action.

J. Tomberlin, advised that the framework for the 2023/24 Operating Budget is based on analysis of the University's financial situation, including enrolments. Everything is based on the Strategic Integrated Plan (SIP) and allocations that have previously been agreed upon with the Provincial government in the Strategic Mandate Agreement (SMA3) and its metric targets. The Resource Planning Committees (RPCs), (the budget groups within the University), are working on their plans which will create the 2023/24 Operating Budget that will be presented to the Board of Governors in April 2023.

He reviewed the Carleton Planning Framework which begins with the Strategic Integrated Planning Committee (SIPC) Forum. The framework was approved by the Finance Committee on November 17, 2022. A SIPC Planning retreat will take place in January 2023 and will focus on recruitment and program renewal. Budget preparation will begin in February 2023 and the RPCs will present their budgets to the Provost's Budget Working Group (PBWG) in March 2023. The domestic Tuition Framework and Operating Budget will be brought to the Board of Governors in April 2023. The SIPC Forum will meet again in June 2023 to share budgets and plans.

P. Dion advised that the fastidiousness of the process is reflected in the dates for the planning process and the stability of the results.

The 18-year-old population in Ontario is projected to increase (1 - 2%) with immigration. He noted that annual Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) enrolment is flattening. By moving to the corridor model, the Provincial government stopped funding undergraduate enrolment growth in 2016/17. The 10% Tuition Fee reduction was introduced in 2019/20 and the complete corridor model was introduced for graduate students in 2020/21. A peak in enrolment in 2020/21 resulted from the decision to not de-register students for lack of payment of fees and due to the pandemic-related enrolment over the summer. Conservative estimates of undergraduate growth will be 1% in domestic and 2% international enrolment after 2023/24.

Preliminary 2023/24 Budget Assumptions are based on a five-year financial plan. Revenues are anticipated to be stable over the planning horizon. International student

tuition fees are projected to increase based on the current framework, and frozen government funding is assumed over the planning horizon.

Expenses (salaries and benefits) are anticipated to increase due to the University exiting the restrictions due to Bill 124, increased infrastructure costs for assets such as the IT infrastructure renewal programs, deferred maintenance, and general administrative expense increases of 3%.

There are a number of challenges in maintaining a balanced operating budget. These include the tuition freeze, ongoing international student visa delays, changes in enrolment patterns, the SMA corridor model, and the Provincial Government deficit. Other pressures include deferred building and infrastructure maintenance issues, rising capital project costs, information technology needs, increasing university budgets, recurring fiscal-only investments, and indirect costs of research.

Opportunities include the return to in-person recruitment and the Ontario University Fair, reputational enhancement, internationalization, program innovation and renewal, and the appropriated reserves. At this time, a 2% base expenditure budget cut is planned for 2023/24.

The 2023/24 Planning Priorities are the three key pillars of the SIP: share knowledge shape future, serve Ottawa, serve the world, and strive for wellness strive for sustainability. The University will be looking at innovation in recruitment, retention, programming, and curriculum.

On the recommendation of the Finance Committee, it was moved by P. Dion and seconded by A. Tremblay to approve Carleton's planning framework for fiscal year 2023-24, as presented. The motion carried unanimously.

## **6. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION**

### **6.1 Digital Strategy**

An executive summary and strategy were circulated in advance.

The Chair welcomed M. Dabros, Assistant Vice-President (ITS) and Chief Information Officer, N. Arnold, Director, Office of Quality Initiatives, and D. Hornsby, Associate Vice-President (Teaching and Learning).

L. Dyke, Vice-President (Finance and Administration) advised that universities as a sector are looking to the future of digital strategy. Carleton's team has done an excellent job of balancing high-level principles with a roadmap that will get the University on the necessary path forward.

N. Arnold presented Carleton's first digital strategy: Shaping the Digital Future. The project was co-led by her with M. Dabros and D. Hornsby, with the aim of determining the role of digital technologies in achieving the Strategic Integrated Plan (SIP). The aspiration of the strategy is to leverage digital technology to empower its collective capabilities to be a force for good in the community. The guiding principles include being user-focused, inclusive, collaborative, responsible, and agile.

D. Hornsby advised that the process for developing the framework and roadmap were highly consultative with more than 1,000 faculty, staff, and students participated in consultations through 2021 and 2022. The strategy reflects what was heard throughout the consultation process. The strategic priorities were shaped collaboratively with guidance from an advisory committee. A digital roadmap was developed for a clear and concrete path forward for implementation.

The framework outlined two deliverables: the Digital Strategy and the Digital Roadmap. The Digital Strategy articulates the broader vision and strategic priorities which support the four mission pillars for the University: student experience, research, teaching & learning, and organizational excellence. The Digital Roadmap addresses the 'what' and 'how' of the strategy and identifies initiatives and projects within the Roadmap over 12-18-month period.

M. Dabros outlined the main contributions that the Digital Strategy is expected to make for Carleton in the areas of governance, culture, and renewal. Carleton is renewing and strengthening the existing IT governance committee and decision-making process. The plan is for a more flexible approach and shortened planning horizons for strategic, planning, and organizational initiatives. The goal is to shift the culture to a more holistic and transparent University-wide approach to digital investment.

The update to the IT governance includes a streamlined digital steering committee. Supporting the steering committee will be a committee for teaching, research, digital learning, and administrative systems which will be responsible for policy recommendations, planning, and prioritization of future needs in their respective areas. The Digital Roadmap aligns with the annual digital planning and alignment process that integrates into the broader University planning and budgeting cycle with predictable 12 to 18-month planning horizons.

A member inquired how IT accessibility and security are being addressed. M. Dabros responded that accessibility and security are front of mind across the organization. He advised that there is a Security Director in ITS and elements of the roadmap speak directly to security issues. Carleton is well-connected within the University community through a number of councils and also uses funding available from the government. He recognized the need to balance security with the ability of the University to complete its mission. There is a digital component to the accessibility strategy and ITS are looking for areas for improvement. He noted that the web development team has accessibility front and centre for websites with a content management system that is fully accessible. ITS

works with Procurement to ensure that software tools being purchased have accessibility, and privacy and security considerations included in the assessment of the tool.

## 6.2 Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion Action Plan: Progress and Update

An executive summary and presentation were circulated in advance.

The Chair welcomed Noël Badiou, Assistant Vice-President, Equity and Inclusive Communities (EIC), who joined Carleton in August 2022.

J. Tomberlin, Provost and Vice-President (Academic), noted that Carleton's Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion (EDI) Action Plan was launched in March 2021. Progress had been made since N. Badiou joined the University in August 2022. A formal report on the EDI action plan will be provided before the end of the academic year.

N. Badiou provided a presentation on the EDI action plan, a five-year plan that proposes an operational framework to advance EDI and anti-racism on campus. It outlines the ways to reimagine curricular and pedagogical practices and commits to further enhancing student supports, research infrastructure, leadership development for academic and non-academic staff, and organizational culture. The recommendations are structured along ten interconnected strategic actions, each addressing a core organizational facet. The EDI action plan is complementary to the Kinàmàgawin Indigenous Strategy and Carleton's Coordinated Accessibility Strategy. N. Badiou detailed the 10 strategic actions described in of the EDI Action Plan.

A member noted that this is the first of two phases for the EDI action plan and asked about community engagement in the second phase. N. Badiou responded that EDI is a continual dialogue with the community to ensure that the proposed actions meet the needs of those involved. In the next few months, the dialogue will continue on what is currently being done, what can be achieved, and how that can align with the EDI Action Plan. Proposed survey questions will be brought to the community for feedback and for support in terms of implementation. The EDI Action Plan is a living document with continued consultation.

A member asked if when this item returns to the Board if data comparing Carleton to the rest of the Ontario institutions could be provided. N. Badiou responded that he sits on the EDI working group for the Council of Ontario Universities (COU) and there is work being done in terms of determining appropriate metrics.

A member noted that under Strategic Action 5 – Leadership Development (Non-Academic) that the focus appeared to be on Campus Safety Services and wondered if there were initiatives that should be outlined that are occurring in other non-academic departments. N. Badiou responded that there are additional initiatives such as in Human Resources and Faculty Relations that will be included in a future report.

### 6.3 Report from the Chair

A verbal report was provided.

The Chair reminded the Committee that applications for the Board Award for Outstanding Community Achievement and the Founders Award are open. Members were asked to share the information with their colleagues and consider bringing forward a nomination. The call for expressions of interest for student governors goes out on January 9, 2023 and he asked that everyone, particularly current student governors, share the details with their networks. A call for expressions of interest for administrative staff governors goes out on February 1, 2023.

### 6.4 Report from the President

A written report was circulated in advance.

B.A. Bacon commented that the end of Fall 2022 semester was nearing with the last week of classes. It was great to be fully back on campus, to see people on a daily basis and highlighted a number of events from the term:

- Community breakfast with 800 attendees;
- Official opening of the Nicol Building;
- Orange Shirt Day;
- Pride Festival Week;
- Mental Health Awareness Week;
- Opening of the Eriksson Lab;
- Fourth Annual Inclusion Week;
- Launch of the Community Engagement Strategic Plan; and
- In-person Remembrance Day Celebration.

He noted approximately 15% of incoming international students experienced delays in receiving their student visas, which is a sector-wide issue. Universities Canada is lobbying the Federal Government to remedy this situation as soon as possible. The Nicol Building was officially opened and the Engineering Design Centre was opened. Fall Convocation was held on November 12, 2022 with 1,271 new graduates bringing the total for the class of 2022 to more than 6,700. On December 5, 2022, the Minister of Foreign Affairs, Mélanie Joly, was on campus along with the former Minister of Foreign Affairs, Lloyd Axworthy to commemorate the 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the International Treaty banning landmines. He noted that December 6<sup>th</sup> is White Ribbon Day which honours the 14 women murdered at École Polytechnique in 1989.

Other highlights from the President's Report to the Board included Carleton maintaining its top five ranking in comprehensive universities from Maclean's and ranking number one in the category for research in the Humanities and Social Sciences. For the first time, Carleton was ranked one of the top 100 employers in Canada. He advised that the

Herzberg prize, the largest prize in Canada, was awarded to Dr. Lenore Fahrig, Chancellor's Professor in the Department of Biology, for her work on conservation and biodiversity. In addition, Sonia Chiasson from the School of Computer Science was presented with an Art McDonald Fellowship, three faculty members were elected to the Royal Society of Canada, and Maeve Collin-Tobin has become Carleton's seventh Rhodes Scholar.

B.A. Bacon noted that it was the season of giving with the Carleton United Way Campaign where he participated in the annual Polar Bear Dip and the University surpassed the goal of raising \$80,000. Giving Tuesday was on November 29<sup>th</sup> which was an opportunity to give to student, faculty, staff, and friends-led projects across all aspects of the University's mission and \$1.24 million was raised within 24 hours.

The Chair thanked all the members that donated and helped make Giving Tuesday a success and took a moment to recognize management, senior executive, and staff for all of the achievements highlighted.

A member asked about the of international students that were unable to receive their visas. B.A. Bacon responded that if the University can welcome those students, it will, but noted that the students may not wait if they have options in other countries. S. Blanchard, Vice-President (Students and Enrolment), advised that at Carleton, their applications are automatically deferred but that the student needs to reapply for their visas for the new term. She added that the university sector has met with the Minister for Immigration, Simon Fraser, who was positive that they are working through the backlog of applications. J. Tomberlin added that some students accepted for the Fall Semester are anticipating starting in January 2023 but it is hard to tell how many will receive a visa in time.

A member asked how many international students are affected. S. Blanchard responded the visa issues are impacting approximately 150 students.

M. Gillis provided an update on student involvement on the Carleton Brand Enhancement campaign. She reached out to T. Frost, Chief Communications Officer and Associate Vice-President (Communications and Public Affairs) and his Team to discuss student consultation. She advised that the Department of University Communications has created a Social Media Ambassador program in which she will be assisting and participating. The program involves students creating organic content for their own social media pages as well as specific content for the University.

She provided a brief overview of a personal project where she contacted the Student Affairs Office concerning free and accessible menstrual hygiene product dispensers across campus. These items are currently available in the residence commons washrooms and she is hoping to continue the project to at least one more building.



## 6.5 Committee Chair Updates

### 6.5.1 Building Program

A. Tremblay, Chair of the Building Program Committee advised that the Committee met on November 17, 2022. The Committee received a presentation from Brook McIlroy (BMI), the architectural firm assisting in the renewal of the Campus Master Plan. The process has moved to Phase 3, the development stage. Since April 2022, BMI has hosted several consultation opportunities with the campus community. The draft plan is expected to come to the Building Program Committee in February 2023 with the final report to be provided in April 2023.

The Committee received an update on the new Student Residence Building. Due to increases in materials costs, inflation, and supply chain issues a revised budget will come to the Committee for approval in February and then to the Board in March 2023. The delay in the approval of the increased budget is not expected to increase the timeline of the project with the anticipated completion to be in late 2024 or early 2025.

The Committee received the annual Strive for Sustainability Annual Report which included highlights such as Carleton becoming a signatory to climate change commitments, the new Responsible Investment policy, receiving a gold certification from the Association for the Advancement of Sustainability in Higher Education (AASHE). Next steps involve developing baseline data to ensure that Carleton is moving towards its emissions targets of carbon neutrality by 2050 and a 50% reduction by 2030.

A project close-out report was received on the Engineering and Design Centre (EDC) noting that the project is substantially complete, with a few outstanding items such as performance of the mechanical and electrical systems as well as some deficiencies with final completion anticipated for January 2023. With respect to major capital projects, renewal, and deferred maintenance, projects are totaling \$185 million are currently under way. The value of work completed to September 2022 was \$57 million with a forecasted expenditure of \$128 million.

### 6.5.2 Finance

P. Dion, Chair of the Finance Committee, advised that the Committee met on November 17, 2022. He advised that the Investment Committee brought forward a revised Terms of Reference. A. Urquhart, Executive Director of Pension Fund Management, provided reports on the pension plan and investment report on the endowment. The pension plan fiscal year end resulted in a decrease of 6.4% as of June 2022 due to the challenging global markets, supply chain issues, and elevated inflation. Notwithstanding these issues, Carleton remains in a healthy financial position and the pension plan has a just under \$1.5 billion market value. The Endowment Fund showed a small erosion in real value but remained in a healthy position with \$339 million as of June 2022.

He commented on the issues related to international student visas which has had contributed to a \$13.5 million shortfall in the 2022/23 operating budget. A. Marcotte, Associate Vice-President (Financial Services), outlined the steps management will take to make up the shortfall and deliver a balanced operating budget. Lastly, the Committee received a report on the new student residence, to ensure the quality of the building, the Committee agreed that should a contingency be required to deliver the project, that it would be supported by the Finance Committee.

### 6.5.3 Governance

B. O'Connor, Chair of the Governance Committee, advised that the Committee met on November 22, 2022 and reviewed two policies that were included in the open consent agenda. The first was the Academic Governance of the University Joint Policy, which is a joint document of the Board of Governors and Senate. A few minor amendments were made and the Committee recommended the policy to the Board for approval. The second approval was for the Board of Governors Travel and Related Expenses policy, which included the removal of car rentals and a few other minor changes to bring it in line with the broader University Travel and Related Expenses Policy. The Committee reviewed the Student Governor and Academic Staff Governor handbooks and election processes. There was a discussion around the Board Self-Assessment survey and filling the upcoming Community-at-Large vacancies with strategic financial and technology and entrepreneurship expertise.

## **7. OPEN-OTHER BUSINESS**

No additional business was brought forward.

## **8. OPEN-QUESTION PERIOD**

No additional questions were brought forward.

## **9. END OF OPEN SESSION AND BRIEF NETWORKING BREAK**

There being no further business, the Open Session of the Board of Governors was adjourned at approximately 4:46 p.m.