

The Board of Governors acknowledges and respects the Algonquin First Nation, on whose traditional territory the Carleton University campus is located.

Minutes of the 639th Meeting of the Board of Governors
Wednesday, March 6th, 2024 at 3:00 p.m.
Richcraft Hall Room 2440R

PRESENT:	G. Farrell (Chair)	M. Gillis	J. Muthukumar (Virtual)
	B. Creary (Vice-Chair)	D. Greenberg	J. Nelson
	H. Babb	L. Grussani	B. O'Connor
	J. Camelon	A. Hamdani (Virtual)	J. Ojangole
	A. Chan	N. Karhu	P. Smith
	J. Devoe (Virtual)	A. Keung	J. Taber (Virtual)
	K. von Finckenstein (Virtual)	M. Main	C. Tessier
	D. Fortin (Virtual)	S. Mingie (Virtual)	J. Tomberlin
	K. Furlong (Virtual)	G. Morris (Virtual)	P. Wolff
REGRETS:	Y. Baltacioğlu	D. Maseko	A. Tremblay
	P. Dion	L. Newton Miller	
STAFF:	N. Afouxenidou	A. Goth (R. Secretary)	K. Mann
	B. Appel Kuzmarov	R. Goubran	K. McKinley (Virtual)
	S. Blanchard	L. Goudie	C. Moy
	J. Conley (Virtual)	C. Khordoc	G. Nower
	L. Dyke	A. Marcotte	P. Rankin
	T. Frost	N. MacDonald	K. Solomon

OPEN SESSION

1. CALL TO ORDER AND CHAIR'S REMARKS

The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:00 pm and welcomed governors and attendees to the meeting. The Chair acknowledged the Algonquin First Nation territory on which Carleton University is located. He recognized March 8th as International Women's Day. He stated that since October 7, there had been troubling reports about the rise in anti-Semitism across the country.

The Board of Governors strongly condemned the rise of anti-Semitism in Canada and Carleton strived to set an example of achieving an environment where all Jewish members of its community, as well as all members of any ethnic background, race,

religion, or gender identity, feel safe, welcomed, and respected. Carleton's established policies and procedures provide a framework to address conduct and protect its community from discrimination, violence, and harassment.

The Board joined the world in grieving the tremendous human suffering and loss of life resulting from the crisis in Israel and Gaza and offered its heartfelt condolences to all those who have been directly or indirectly affected by these horrendous events.

He reviewed the meeting protocols for members in person and attending virtually.

2. DECLARATION OF CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The Chair asked for any declarations of conflict of interest from the members. None were declared.

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The agenda was circulated in advance.

Item 5.1 Paterson Hall Renovations – the Capital Proposal Form was removed from the agenda at the request of management. The item would return at a later date to the Committees and Board with a revised cost estimate.

It was moved by A. Keung and seconded by M. Gillis that the open agenda of the 639th meeting of the Board of Governors be approved, as amended. The motion carried unanimously.

4. APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT AGENDA

The following items were circulated in the open consent agenda for approval: Open Session Minutes from the 638th Board Meeting.

The following items were circulated in the open consent agenda for information: Minutes of the Advancement and University Relations, Building Program, and Finance Committees, Carleton Energy Master Plan Update and Greenhouse Gas Update, Ongoing Capital and Deferred Maintenance Project Status Report, Investment Committee Membership Renewal, Infrastructure Investment Manager, Private Equity Investment Manager, Investment Report on the Endowment, Audited Financial Statements for the Carleton University Retirement Fund, Update on the 2023/2024 Operating Budget and Status of Reserves, and Minutes of Senate.

It was moved by M. Main and seconded by J. Camelon that the items in the open consent agenda be approved, as presented. The motion carried unanimously.

5. ITEMS FOR APPROVAL

5.1 P9 Parking Garage Decommissioning – Project Planning Report

An executive summary, presentation, and report were circulated in advance.

A. Hamdani, Chair of the Finance Committee advised that when the capital proposal form was brought to the Board for approval in April 2023, a total project cost was approved for \$5 million. Since that time, the cost was expected to increase to \$8 million due to work restrictions and requirements from the City of Ottawa in relation to the Light Rail Transit (LRT) system. The project would be funded through Parking Services which is part of the Ancillary Services Budget. The Committee unanimously recommends the project planning report.

C. Tessier, Chair of the Building Program Committee, advised P9 Parking Garage was 55 years old, had progressive deterioration and was no longer safe for parking. Maintaining the structure was cost-prohibitive and demolition was required to maintain safety on campus. The demolition was expected to start summer 2024.

L. Dyke, Vice-President (Finance and Administration), advised that in 2018, extensive cracking was observed in five beams of P9. The implications of maintaining the garage over an extended period of time would be cost prohibitive and the end result would still be an aging building in an advanced state of corrosion that would require demolition. Initial costs for demolition were estimated at \$5 million. Since the approval of the plan by the Board in April 2023, a more detailed estimate and meeting City of Ottawa requirements put the amount closer to \$8 million.

C. Moy, Assistant Director of Parking and Technical Services, provided a presentation advising that the P9 Parking Garage was built in 1969 and was exhibiting signs of significant structural deterioration and, in line with the 2018 Capital Plan Engineering Study, was reaching the end of its serviceable life. Carleton completed the final year of a five-year monitoring and repair program employed to maintain the parking structure until its planned decommissioning in spring 2024, with a previously approved budget of \$5 million. The project objectives were to eliminate the need for Carleton to spend money to maintain a deteriorating asset and to decommission P9 in a way that best supported the intended use of the site in the future.

G. Nower, Associate Vice-President (Facilities Management and Planning), advised that a Class “B” construction cost estimate of \$4,701,000 excluding taxes was received, topographical and environmental surveys were conducted, ITS identified two areas within the adjacent Pigiarvik building with concerns for vibration sensitivities and a consultant had been brought onboard. Carleton was working with the City of Ottawa due to the proximity of the O-Train Line to the demolition site and associated requirements.

There were a number of risks highlighted, such as the restrictions imposed by the City of Ottawa due to the proximity of the LRT. Portions of work would need to be completed during the “engineering hours” of 1:00 am to 5:00 am. Other risks included crossing and crane swing agreements, with additional legal fees, and insurance, as well as resources required to monitor the LRT, such as flaggers and spotters. The total project cost was estimated at \$5.9 million with an additional \$2 million in costs from the City of Ottawa requirements, for a total of \$7.9 million.

C. Moy reviewed the stakeholders that would be impacted, such as Parking Services, Facilities Management and Planning (FMP), the P9 permit holders, and the adjacent building occupants. Funding for the demolition would be from Parking Services. He reminded the Committee that the budget was previously approved by the Board in April 2023, but the increased costs required additional approval and the City of Ottawa requirements and restrictions posed significant risks to the project budget. The next step would be the approval of a Project Implementation Report in April 2024, demolition was planned for May with completion anticipated by fall 2024. After demolition, the site would be graded to meet adjacent boundaries and resurfaced.

A member asked what the plans were for the site, once P9 was demolished. L. Dyke responded that the Campus Master Plan included the location as a future development site. In the interim, it would either be grassed over or paved for short-term accessible parking.

A member asked how much of the demolition would take place during the narrowed hours required by the City of Ottawa. G. Nower responded that it was expected to be two weeks of the total time at the hours of 1:00 to 5:00 a.m.

On the recommendation of the Building Program and Finance Committees, it was moved by C. Tessier and seconded by A. Hamdani to approve the Project Planning Report and proceed to a Project Implementation Report for the decommissioning of P9 Parking Garage at a project cost not to exceed \$8 million, as presented. The motion carried unanimously.

5.2 2024/2025 Ancillary Budget

An executive summary, presentation, and report were circulated in advance.

A. Hamdani introduced the item advising that the Finance Committee reviewed and recommended the approval of the 2024/25 Ancillary Services budget, including increased rates and fees, expected revenue, anticipated operating costs, and capital reinvestment plans. The ancillary portfolio was expected to generate \$72.5 million revenue, surpassing the pre-pandemic level of \$69.5 million.

S. Blanchard, Vice-President (Students and Enrolment), presented the 2024/25 Ancillary Budget. The ancillary services units include areas such as Housing, Residence Life, Dining Services, Athletics, Parking Services, The Print Shop, and the Carleton Dominion Chalmers Centre. Ancillaries are expected to generate sufficient revenue to fund the cost of providing their services. Overall, the performance of the ancillary portfolio remained strong, but there were some areas of concern that would need to be monitored. Through planning, most units were able to manage their facility costs through operating income.

The Ancillary units projected a budget surplus of \$4.3 million for 2023/24, with the positive variance driven by strong revenues in Athletics and Housing. For 2024/25, revenues were expected to exceed \$75 million but spending on deferred maintenance would draw down the surplus by \$7.8 million, creating a closing accumulated surplus of \$32 million. Details of each unit, in order of financial magnitude, were provided as follows:

- Housing, Residence Life, and Conference Services: For 2023/24, construction of the New Residence was underway and Conference services had a strong year. For 2024/25 there was a 3-year Capital Plan investment of \$14 million for deferred maintenance, and the creation of a business development and marketing plan;
- Dining Services: in 2023/24, retail had not yet returned to pre-pandemic levels, but there was a projected surplus of \$1.7 million. New retail operations included a Chatime Bubble Tea, the creation of a 24/7 autonomous store, a number of retail outlets would be renewed for 2024/25, the dining hall expansion would be completed in 2024;
- Athletics: summer camp enrolments, leagues, and programs were strong, but challenges existed in recruiting and retaining staff. Priorities for 2024/25 included capital investments to support facility renewal;
- Parking Services: in 2023/24 parking space utilization exceeded functional capacity which will worsen with the decommissioning of P9, but real-time parking availability mapping would be complete by the end of the year. In 2024/25, P9 would be decommissioned, and transit options would include OCTranspo, continued Flexible Work, and sourcing off-campus parking;
- Health and Counselling Services: in 2023/24 demand for health services continued to be strong at almost double the number of visits in 2018. A referendum would be held to support student mental health needs;
- The Print Shop: undertook restructuring, reduced its fleet of multi-functional devices by 20%, through changes and working with FMP, the Print Shop grew revenues by 60% in 2023/24;
- The Bookstore: revenues declined by 23% in 2023/24, expenses were increasing and its losses needed to be addressed. The Bookstore's operating agreement was set to expire in 2025;
- Carleton Dominion Chalmers Centre (CDCC): in 2023/24, the Hive Renovations were completed, but there were capital reinvestment requirements beyond what the CDCC could self-fund;

- Campus Card: moved to a contactless card on a two-year agreement with Procurement and will pilot Campus Card for use with OTranspo;
- National Wildlife Research Centre: lease with Environment Canada ends in 2027;
- Nideyinàn: a number of capital projects were planned for 2024/25 and the accumulated surplus would be eliminated to fund reinvestments; and
- Ancillary Strategic Fund: earns income from external leases and funding is available for small investments and commitments from the ancillaries.

Proposed fee increases for 2024/25 included a 4.6% accommodation rate increase for Residence, a 6.5% increase to the meal plan, 3.7% increase to the Student Athletic Fee, 3.7% increase to the Student Health Fee, and 10% increase to Parking fees. While the aggregate ancillary services portfolio was expected to return to its pre-pandemic financial position, there was a significant amount of deferred maintenance.

A member asked if the budget included the \$3 million for furnishing the new residence. S. Blanchard responded that it was included in the ancillary budget.

A member inquired about the options available for the CDCC and the future of the space if it is anticipating a \$500,000 deficit. S. Blanchard responded that discussions would need to take place, noting that the CDCC is not necessarily an ancillary unit as it is also an academic space (operational budget).

On the recommendation of the Finance Committee, it was moved by A. Hamdani and seconded by J. Nelson to approve Carleton's 2024/25 Ancillary Services Budget, as presented. The motion carried unanimously.

6. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

6.1 Research and International Update

Two presentations were circulated in advance.

J. Tomberlin, Interim President and Vice-Chancellor, introduced the Research and International update. He commented on the successes of research, one of Carleton's key pillars and drivers of reputation. Over the previous five years, Carleton's research funding, productivity, and impact had all increased. Carleton had an ambitious International Strategic Plan, working with staff, student, and researchers from around the globe. Carleton partners with universities, governments, and industry organizations to make Carleton a global hub.

R. Goubran, Vice-President (Research and International), provided a presentation advising that Research was central to the University, impacting its reputation, ranking, ability to attract top faculty members, students, and staff, and generates resources. There

were multidisciplinary research strengths in the areas of entrepreneurship, equity, diversity, and inclusion (EDI), and reconciliation with Indigenous peoples.

Carleton had core research strength and international recognition in areas including physics, international affairs, and data studies. Each research field had its own research impact metrics with the ultimate goals of knowledge creation, knowledge mobilization, and impact on society. The most common research metrics were external research funding, such as a tri-agency, government, publications such as impact on field through citations, or the San Francisco Declaration on Research Assessment. External research funding was used to pay graduate students and researchers, data collection, cover the cost of publications, conferences, and knowledge dissemination. He highlighted a number of awards won by Carleton researchers over the past year.

Publications are a widely used metric for an institutions success in research and Carleton had continuous growth in this area. Similarly, citations are used as a metric for impact and Carleton also had continuous growth in the number of times a paper is cited by other researchers. The three-year average of external research revenue is used as a proxy for research activities. Carleton's research revenue doubled over the past six years and topped \$100 million in 2022/23. Tri-Agency funding (NSERC, SSHRC, and CIHR) increased, impacting the number of Canada Research Chairs allocated to Carleton, and the research Support Funds and Incremental Project Grants from the Province. In 2022/23, industry funding increased to \$6.3 million, up from \$5.0 million the previous year, attributed to the Holistic Integrated Partnership (HIP) initiative with organizations such as the highlighted Ericsson collaboration. There were indirect costs associated with research, such as overhead, which were also increasing to support research activities.

In 2024, two new government mandates came into effect. The first was a Commercialization Mandate Policy Framework, requiring each university to create a well-defined commercialization policy to improve its commercialization outcomes and realized net benefits to Ontario. A yearly detailed commercialization plan including metrics must be generated. The second was safeguarding research, where the Federal and Provincial Governments required universities to assess external research funding applications for national security risks. Carleton was awarded \$271,000 per year for five years to administer this new program and a Director, Research Security Risk had been hired.

The key priorities for 2024/25 were shared, including to sustain the increase in research productivity and external research funding, build reputation, expand community engagement and partnerships, support multidisciplinary collaboration, and to promote Carleton's core values across all of its activities.

B. Appel Kuzmarov, Associate Vice-President (International), provided a presentation on Carleton's International Strategic Plan. Carleton International is responsible for international partnerships, outreach, and research facilitation. The vision of Carleton International is to "Serve the World, Nurture Global Citizens", to enhance the

University's international reputation, respond to the needs of current society, and increase the capacity of students, faculty, and staff to engage in international initiatives.

In 2024, Carleton had more than 177,000 alumni worldwide, 4,251 international undergraduate and graduate students, as well as 61 active memorandums of understanding and 114 student exchange agreements. Carleton International's goals were shared with the Board as follows:

- Goal 1 - Research and Funding: increasing both funding awards and projects between 2022/23 and 2023/24, noting that the office had an 82% success rate from funding proposals;
- Goal 2 - Students: in 2023/24 there were students on campus from 142 countries, with 2,937 international undergraduate and 1,314 international graduate students, noting current geopolitical challenges;
- Goal 3 - Teaching: Since 2000, Carleton had hosted researchers from over 80 different countries and 740 institutions supporting knowledge and skill transfers. In 2023/24, there were 16 students placed for in-person internships and 61 students placed for virtual internships;
- Goal 4 - Reduce Barriers: increasing international mobility and experiential learning opportunities, improvements to both inward and outward mobility since the COVID-19 pandemic; and
- Goal 5 - Internationalization at Home: Carleton's national capital advantage, able to engage with 82 embassies and high commission-related meetings and events in 2023, doubling the outreach from the previous year.

There were a number of externally driven challenges in 2022/23 for internationalization, including geopolitical instability, changes to immigration policy, and concerns for research security. Carleton International addressed these concerns through enhanced risk assessments with regular geopolitical briefings and established trusted new partnerships, such as the Horizon Europe research funding program.

Carleton International was heading into the final year of its Strategic Plan, which ends in 2025. In preparation for the next iteration of the plan, they have engaged in benchmarking of Carleton's international operations to gather data and are looking to build a geopolitical risk framework.

A member asked about the change in Carleton's ratio of external to Tri-Council funding and how it compares to peer institutions. R. Goubran responded that both types of funding have grown, with more growth from industry funding, which was also matched from other sources.

A member asked about commercialization and Carleton's plan for addressing the Provincial mandate. R. Goubran responded that the Province of Ontario was requiring each university to have a policy on commercialization. Carleton is unique in that that intellectual property belongs to the researcher rather than the institution. Carleton's

collective agreement included details for commercialization and intellectual property (IP), which was reiterated in the Policy. The Province of Ontario had not finalized the metrics for tracking progress on commercialization. The member followed up asking about the reaction from faculty on the shift to outcomes being tied to research funding. R. Goubran responded that it was field-specific as some areas lean more towards results that generative IP. The additional requirements from the Province of Ontario will not be done by all faculty members, rather just those who work on projects with more tangible outcomes.

A member asked what Board members and the Committees could do to help move forward the work being done by Research and International. R. Goubran responded that Carleton was known for interdisciplinary research through partnerships and community engagement, so having more contacts with the community would support research. Partners included industry, embassies, government, or hospitals. The success of research should be measured by its positive impact on society.

A member asked about the current international climate, with particular concerns for national security, and its impact on research at Carleton. R. Goubran responded that it presents a challenge in terms of interference and restrictions on activities. Carleton is always looking for new markets and diversify research partners and was pursuing multi-year agreements to help ensure the continuity of funding.

A member asked about federal resources and, with Carleton's presence in Ottawa, if the University can leverage connections for support. B. Appel Kuzmarov responded that with respect to the Horizon Europe Program, it engages industry and partnerships academically across the world. The Office of the Vice-President (Research and International) is always looking for new opportunities and engagements.

6.2 Report from the Chair

The Chair advised that applications for the Board Award for Outstanding Community Achievement and the Founders Award were open and asked members to consider putting forward a nomination and sharing the criteria with their networks. He provided an update on the Presidential Search, reminding the Board that prior to the break, the Advisory Committee has concluded the community consultations, which equipped the committee with a deeper appreciation of Carleton's leadership needs and a comprehensive framework to assess candidates.

The search firm, Boyden, was instrumental in seeking out candidate interest and referrals. Over January the committee reviewed applications and completed longlist interviews in February. Over March they will complete short-list interviews with the aim to have a recommendation to the Board by April 2024.

6.3 Report from the President

A written report was circulated in advance.

J. Tomberlin, Interim President and Vice-Chancellor, advised that since the Board last met, Carleton was recognized as one of Canada's Top 100 Employers, was named a Top Employer in the National Capital Region for the tenth year in a row, and for the second year in a row, named as a Top Family-Friendly Employer. On December 28, 2023, four distinguished members of the Carleton University community were honoured with the Order of Canada, including former Board Chair N. Nanos. Other recent research highlights included:

- R. Goubran was honoured with the 2023 AGE-WELL Honorary Fellow Award;
- 85 Carleton researchers made the 2022 Stanford Elsevier list of world's most-cited scholars, ranking in the top 2% of most-cited scientists;
- C. Cruickshank (Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering) received the Ontario Building Envelope Council Rising Star Award;
- P. Kariouk (Azrieli School of Architecture and Urbanism) was recognized with an American Institute of Architects New York Design Award;
- F. Taylor (Geography and Environmental Studies) was named as an Officer of the Order of Canada;
- H. Yanikomeroğlu (Systems and Computer Engineering) was named a fellow of the Asia-Pacific Artificial Intelligence Association;
- Future Learning Innovation Fellowships were awarded to S. Bucking and J. Drake;
- the Future Skills Innovation Network (FUSION) received \$2.8 million funding in part by the Government of Canada's Skills for Success Program; and
- J. Milner, Associate Professor (Political Science) was appointed as co-chair of the Global Academic Interdisciplinary Network (GAIN).

Carleton's Women's Basketball team won the 2024 Capital Hoops Classic in February 2024. A number of upcoming events were highlighted including the Annual Florence Bird Lecture, Data Day on March 26, and International Women's Day on March 8. Past events included the 2023 Service Excellence Awards, the fifth annual Kinàmàgawin Symposium, and Black History Month events included a lecture with Fulbright Scholar Dr. Michele K. Lewis.

A member asked about enrolment numbers for Fall 2024. S. Blanchard responded that Ontario high school applicants were up 11.8% for first choice, with many of those applicants in the Ottawa area, increasing the likelihood that they will select Carleton; however, there were anticipated difficulties for undergraduate international students.

6.4 Committee Chair Updates

6.4.1 Advancement and University Relations

D. Greenberg, Chair of the Advancement and University Relations Committee, advised that the Committee met on January 30, 2024 and received three presentations for information.

The first was a presentation from C. Trudel, Director of the Centre for Community Engagement, with an update on the four recent projects including placement information for students, the City of Ottawa partnership ‘Citystudio’, working with the World Health Organization to develop capacity to react during emergencies, and the workshops the Centre has done for the government on community engagement.

The second was a presentation from T. Frost, Associate Vice-President (Communications and Public Affairs), with an update on Carleton’s brand campaign, results for engagement, the second annual Challenge Conference taking place on May 8, 2024, and website update.

The third presentation was a joint effort from R. Goubran and J. Conley, Chief Advancement Officer, on the Holistic Integrated Partnership (HIP) Initiative. The HIP approach creates a win-win relationship for the University and external partners through a number of initiatives, such as the 550 co-op positions generated by the partnership with Ericsson.

6.4.2 Building Program

C. Tessier, Chair of the Building Program Committee, advised that the Committee met on February 15, 2024, and considered four items for information and discussion: An update on the Carleton Energy Master Plan was received with its original goals to reduce the direct and indirect emissions by 50% by 2030 and achieve carbon neutrality by 2050 maintained but the approach has evolved through various funding opportunities and retro-fits. The Committee also received the Ongoing Capital and Deferred Maintenance Projects Status Report which outlined the projects underway which totaled around \$214 million.

6.4.3 Finance

A. Hamdani, Chair of the Finance Committee, advised that the Committee met on February 15, 2024 and received the updated Pension Plan Text as recommended by the Pension Committee. The Finance Committee approved on the recommendation of the Pension Committee the allocation of \$50 million to Antin Infrastructure Partners Fund V for the Carleton University Retirement Plan as well as \$30 million to New Mountain Partners VII which was in line with the allocation for infrastructure, real estate and private equity in the Statement of Investment Policies and Procedures.

The Committee also received an update on the University's Endowment Fund's performance report which focused on its investment returns and asset mix for periods ending September 30, 2023. An update on the current year operating budget and status of reserves was received and a balanced operating budget was expected to be achieved, with no significant variances anticipated. Units continue to use reserves to help meeting strategic objectives and overall balances remain healthy in the near term.

6.4.4 Governance

B. O'Connor, Chair of the Governance Committee, advised that the Committee met on February 27, 2024 to receive an update on the student governor election and the administrative staff election. In June 2024, a full slate of new governors would be brought forward to the Board and the following individuals have been nominated through election; J. Simpson, administrative staff, M. Gillis, graduate student, G. Morris, graduate student, Y. Bizuneh, undergraduate student and L. Breen, undergraduate student.

The Committee also discussed Community-at-Large recruitment and short-list of candidates were selected for interviews which will be conducted over March.

In addition to its nominating function, the Committee also discussed the senior executive appointment guidelines and continued its review of the guidelines which would be brought forward for the Board's consideration in June.

7. OPEN-OTHER BUSINESS

No other business was brought forward.

8. OPEN-QUESTION PERIOD

No additional questions were brought forward.

9. END OF OPEN SESSION AND BRIEF NETWORKING BREAK

There being no further business, the Open Session of the Board of Governors was adjourned at approximately 4:31 p.m.