



**Canada's Capital University**

*The Board of Governors acknowledges and respects the Algonquin First Nation, on whose traditional territory the Carleton University campus is located.*

**Minutes of the 614<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the  
Board of Governors**

**Thursday, March 28, 2019 at 3:00 p.m.  
Room 2440R Richcraft Hall, Carleton University**

<b>PRESENT:</b>	Mr. D. Fortin (Vice-Chair)	Mr. J. Durrell (Phone)	Mr. O. Javanpour (Phone)
	Dr. B.A. Bacon (President)	Mr. K. Evans (Phone)	Dr. J. Malloy
	Ms. D. Alves	Mr. G. Farrell	Ms. Y. Osagie
	Mr. T. Arnt	Mr. K. Von Finckenstein	Dr. E. Sloan
	Dr. C. Carruthers	Ms. G. Garland (Phone)	Dr. P. Smith
	Mr. D. Craig	Ms. C. Gold (Phone)	Ms. A. Spiwak
	Ms. B. Creary	Ms. L. Honsberger	Mr. A. Ullett
	Mr. P. Dinsdale (Phone)	Ms. N. Karhu	Ms. E. Wohlbold
<b>REGRETS:</b>	Ms. Y. Baltacıoğlu	Dr. I. Lee	Mr. N. Nanos
	Mr. G. Courtland	Dr. P. Merchant	Mr. R. Wener
<b>STAFF:</b>	Mr. G. Aulenback	Mr. M. Charles	Mr. S. Levitt
	Dr. F. Afagh	Ms. J. Conley	Mr. M. Piché
	Dr. B. Appel Kuzmoarov	Mr. D. Cumming	Ms. B. Reid
	Ms. S. Blanchard	Ms. A. Goth	Dr. J. Tomberlin
	Ms. J. Chandler (Recording)	Dr. R. Goubran	
<b>GUESTS:</b>	Dr. P. Simpson		

---

**OPEN SESSION**

**1. CALL TO ORDER AND CHAIR'S REMARKS**

The Vice-Chair called the meeting to order at 3:01 p.m. All attendees, guests and observers were welcomed to the first meeting of 2019. The Chair expressed condolences on behalf of the Board for those lost in the Ethiopian Plane Crash of March 10<sup>th</sup>, 2019, including Prof. Pius Adesanmi, and Carleton alum Peter deMarsh.

**2. DECLARATION OF CONFLICT OF INTEREST**

The Chair asked for any declarations of conflict of interest from the members. There were none declared.

**3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The proposed agenda was circulated in advance. No additional items for discussion or questions came forward for consideration

It was moved by Dr. Malloy, and seconded by Mr. Ullett, that the open agenda of the 614<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Board of Governors be approved, as presented. The motion carried.

**4. APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT AGENDA**

The following items were circulated in the open consent agenda for approval: open session minutes of the 613<sup>th</sup> meeting on November 29, 2019, Capital Debt Policy, the Audit and Risk Committee Terms of Reference.

The following items were circulated in the open consent agenda for information: the Audited Financial Statements for the Pension Fund and the Report for the Year-Ended June 30, 2018, the Talk Exchange Report, the Building Program Committee minutes from October 15, 2018, Community Relations and Advancement Committee minutes from October 3, 2018, Finance Committee Minutes from November 8, 2018, Governance Committee minutes from October 4, 2018, the October 19, 2018, November 30, 2018 and January 25, 2019 Senate minutes.

Ms. Honsberger moved, and it was seconded by Dr. Sloan, that the items in the open consent agenda with the exception of the Audit and Risk Committee terms of reference be approved. The motion carried.

Section A of the Audit and Risk Terms of Reference in respect to the engagement of the External Auditor's firm for non-audit work was discussed. The Vice-Chair of the Audit Committee expressed that the external auditors should be considered for other audit related and non-audit work but should not be considered for assignments, the results of which may be subject of future audit examinations. Management, the Audit Committee and the external auditors developed a protocol for approving other work (outlined in Annex A) that requires the external auditors to confirm their independence and disclose all fees earned from the client in addition to audit fees.

Ms. Honsberger moved, and it was seconded by Mr. Evans, to approve the Audit and Risk Committee terms of reference be approved, as presented. The motion carried.

## **5. PRESENTATION ON COLLECTIVE BARGAINING**

Peter Simpson, the Director General of the Federal Mediation and Conciliation Service in the federal Labour Program was welcomed to the Board meeting. Prior to joining the federal government Peter was the Assistant Deputy Minister for Labour Relations Solutions and the Director of Dispute Resolution Services in Ontario's Ministry of Labour where he mediated several challenging rounds of collective bargaining, including several in the post-secondary and secondary education sectors. Prior to joining the Ministry, Peter worked as a lead negotiator and negotiations policy point-person for the Canadian Association of University Teachers.

Mr. Simpson spoke to the Board about collective bargaining, the roles of unions and employers in a university sector suggesting that collective bargaining should be done frequently. When using a more recurrent approach for Labour Relations, items are dealt with sooner, and are therefore less overwhelming. Additionally, Mr. Simpson spoke to the importance of approaching collective agreements with a solution-oriented frame of mind.

## **6. ITEM(S) FOR APPROVAL**

### **6.1 Carleton University General Operating By-law No.1**

An executive summary, special resolution, and by-laws with track changes were circulated in advance.

Mr. Levitt, General Counsel outlined that the amendments to the General Operating By-laws reflect complimentary modifications in the Academic Governance of the University Policy, which is a joint document reviewed and approved in 2018 by the Board of Governors and Senate. Dr. Appel Kuzmoarov, Clerk of Senate, confirmed that the General Operating By-laws as proposed were provided to Senate for their information. Additionally, the General Operating By-laws have been reviewed and are recommended for approval by the Governance Committee.

Mr. Evans moved, and it was seconded by Mr. Von Finckenstein, to approve the amendments to section 9 and 10 of the General Operating By-law NO.1 effective immediately, as presented by special resolution. The motion carried unanimously.

### **6.2 Engineering Student Design Centre**

An executive summary, memo, feasibility report and cost summary were circulated in advance.

Mr. Craig, Chair of the Building Committee introduced this item indicating that the Engineering Student Design Centre was reviewed and is recommended to the Board for approval by both the Building Program Committee and the Finance Committee.

Dr. Afagh, Interim Dean, Faculty of Engineering and Design (FED), outlined the importance of the addition to the MacKenzie Complex, which is student centered project to provide FED students design work space for fourth year capstone projects, which was identified as a current gap (for recruitment and retention) in the experience of engineering students at Carleton. Additionally, the proposed design space is in line with the university's principles of experiential learning and modern pedagogy.

With due considerations given to the Campus Master Plan, the green space next to parking lot R4 (on Library Road) was selected as an appropriate site to add an Engineering Student Design Centre as an extension to the northern face of 3rd block of Mackenzie Engineering complex. The addition will be visible from Colonel By Drive.

The architecture firm Perkins and Will were retained after a competitive RFP process, which involved developing a concept design study to create a model for an Engineering Student Design space. The project budget is based on a class D cost estimate of \$11M including all fees, and contingencies. Funding for this project is coming from FED's budget carry-over. The FED chairs and technicians were consulted during the design concept development. Estimated occupancy is projected for September 2020.

There was a preliminary discussion regarding Phase 2 of the project with a new Engineering Building. The proposed space for this project is across from the Student Design Centre on Library Road beside the residence complexes. The project budget for the Student Design Centre includes costs for the conceptual design of Phase 2.

It was moved by Mr. Ullett, and it was seconded by Dr. Smith, to approve the design and construction of the Engineering Student Design Centre addition at a cost not to exceed \$11M. The motion carried.

### 6.3 2019/ 2020 Ancillary Budget

An executive summary and report were circulated in advance.

Ms. Alves, Vice-Chair of the Finance Committee introduced the proposed 2019/20 ancillary budget which provides a total revenue of \$69.1M, operating expenses of \$46.7M, \$21M in renovations/debt reductions. Of the net operating surplus of \$1.4M, it is proposed that \$1M be transferred from the Ancillary Capital Fund to the University's operating fund to help address external fiscal challenges/pressures. This \$1 million will be invested into student success, which is in line with the core mission of the university.

Ancillary fees are reviewed annually to ensure they are competitive, and compliance with the ancillary fee protocol. Fee increases are based on the consumer price index.

Dominion Chalmers Centre (DCC) revenues and expenses are lower than expected for 2018/19. Management advised that the DCC operation is sustainable and will reach its anticipated goals, albeit on a longer timeline than originally anticipated.

The proposed 10% increase in parking rates for 2019/20 were discussed. The overall transportation strategy is currently under consideration, including a long-term pricing strategy. Carleton's parking rates are currently lower than the market. Parking rates are determined through a number of factors. The increase would allow for the accumulation of a reserve to fund a future parking structure when P9 is no longer functional in approximately five years.

It was moved by Ms. Alves, and it was seconded by Ms. Honsberger, to approve the 2019/20 Ancillary Budget, as presented. The motion carried.

#### 6.4 2019/2020 Tuition Fees & Miscellaneous Fees

An executive summary and presentation were circulated in advance.

The domestic student fees are fully regulated by the provincial government under the Tuition Fee Framework, and Carleton is required to reduce domestic tuition fees by 10% in 2019-20, relative to the 2018-19 levels.

International fees are not regulated and are set using long-term strategy based on competitive market analysis and demand. There is a proposed increase of international fees by 3 – 8%.

Miscellaneous fees were proposed to follow the Consumer Price Index of 2.5% increase with the exception of the Graduate Application Fee, which was proposed to increase by \$10 which is matched by uOttawa and has not been increased for over 10 years.

It was moved by Ms. Alves, and it was seconded by Mr. Farrell, to approve the University's 2019/20 domestic and international tuition fees, in line with the new government tuition fees framework, and the miscellaneous administrative fees, as presented. The motion carried.

#### 6.5 Board Award for Outstanding Community Achievement

A memo was circulated in advance.

Ms. Elinor Sloan, Vice-Chair of the Community Relations and Advancement Committee brought forward the recommendation from the Board Award Jury for the 2018/19 Board

Award recipient. The Jury had a very strong field of candidates with 20 nominations received. The jury sought an individual who engaged in longstanding volunteerism with an emphasis on service to others.

Ms. Frohan Foroutan was recommended for the award based on her passion for volunteerism. She has mentored a variety of demographics on campus, including: mature learners, students with disabilities, and international students. For the better part of a decade, she has guided peers in various capacities such as a Bounce-Back Mentor, First Year Connections' Mentor, Enriched Support Program Facilitator, Paul Menton Centre Tutor and Mentor, and as a teaching assistant and in various roles at the Carleton Undergraduate Economics Society.

It was moved by Ms. Sloan, and it was seconded by Ms. Spiwak, to approve Frohan Foroutan as the recipient for the 2018/19 Board of Governors Award for Outstanding Community Achievement, as presented. The motion carried.

## **7. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION**

### **7.1 Free Speech Policy**

On Aug. 30, 2018 the Premier's office issued a statement advising all Ontario colleges and Universities to develop and post publicly a free speech policy by Jan. 1, 2019. This statement contained eight minimum standards that should appear in the policy. Universities not in compliance were advised they could face budget cuts.

Professor Betina Appel Kuzmoarov, Clerk of Senate was tasked with coordinating an ad hoc task force to draft this statement. The task force consisted of two students, three faculty members, and one contract instructor. Once the draft was created, the policy was open for comments and review by the Carleton community. The policy received 135 comments, an open letter, and a petition.

The Free Speech Policy passed unanimously in Senate at the November 30<sup>th</sup>, 2018, meeting the Provincial Government's requirements and timelines.

There was a discussion regarding how Carleton's Free Speech Policy compared with other universities policies. A question was asked why Ontario Colleges were able to make a homogenous statement, while each Ontario University created a policy distinct to themselves. Based on each Universities autonomy, distinct history, different policy frameworks and in some cases already existing Free Speech Policies, it was decided that a unique policy was the best course of action was for each Ontario University but a general approach and set of principles were followed.

It was moved by Dr. Sloan, and it was seconded by Ms. Creary, to endorse the Free Speech Policy, as presented. The motion carried unanimously.

## 7.2 Annual Report on Sexual Violence:

Ms. Bailey Reid, Coordinator of Sexual Assault Services and Equity Advisor was welcomed to the meeting. It was noted that President Bacon and the Chair of the Board, have received the Sexual Violence Prevention and Response Training facilitated by Ms. Reid.

Ms. Reid delivered a presentation regarding the statistics of Sexual Violence disclosures, formal investigations, and training that took place on campus in 2018. The amount of disclosures received in the office of Equity Services rose from 61 to 168 in 2018. Formal investigations rose from 3 to 5. Additionally, there was a total of 125 hours of training provided on the topic of Sexual Violence.

Of the 168 disclosures made to Equity Services this year, 68 happened within one year of disclosing, 36 happened on campus, and 50 involved a respondent from Carleton. Approximately 70% of these incidents fell under the sexual assault and harassment umbrella as opposed to voyeurism, indecent exposure, sexual exploitation, and stalking. Largely, the increase of disclosures is seen as a positive statistic, as it means that individuals on campus are aware and feel comfortable using the services available.

Ms. Reid provided an overview of the training delivered on campus, which included but was not limited to: consent training for every student living in residence, training for all varsity athletes, and conjoined training between the Ottawa Police Service and Campus Safety for responding to disclosures. In 2019, there are plans to have a responding to disclosures 2.0 training, as well as an alternative resolution model, and a document titled campus strategy on sexual violence prevention – which will be a living document that everyone on campus can contribute to.

The discrepancies between the disclosures reported by Equity Services and a recent Ontario wide survey published in the Ottawa Citizen were brought to the Board's attention. Ms. Reid stated that the number of disclosures she reported were strictly based on the students who visited the Equity Services Office, and therefore did not account for those who may have disclosed to other campus members or to off campus services.

Ms. Reid was thanked for her work on prevention, training and support for survivors.

## 7.3 Report from the Chair

Mr. D. Fortin, Vice-Chair, congratulated Ms. Jennifer Conley, Chief Advancement Officer and the advancement team on reaching their \$300 million goal in the Collaborate Campaign. Additionally, Mr. Fortin thanked the three University Presidents who worked for Carleton throughout the duration of the campaign, including: Dr. Roseann Runte, Dr. Alastair Summerlee, and Dr. Benoit-Antoine Bacon.

#### 7.4 Report from the President

Dr. Benoit-Antoine Bacon shared his condolences on behalf of the Carleton community to the victims of Ethiopian plane crash that took place on March 10<sup>th</sup>, including Carleton alum Peter deMarsh, and the Director of African Studies and member of the Department of English Language and Literature, Dr. Pius Adesanmi.

Dr. Bacon congratulated Jerry Tomberlin, Dana Brown, Larry Kostiuk, and Patrice Smith for their appointments as Provost and Vice-President (Academic), Dean of the Sprott School of Business, Dean of the Faculty of Engineering and Design, and Dean of the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs respectively. Additionally, faculty member Sarah Todd in the School of Social work was recognized for her 3M teaching fellowship, which is the highest attainable honour for teaching at a University.

Both the Men's Basketball Team and the Men's Curling Team were congratulated for their National Championship Title. It is the Men's Basketball Teams 14<sup>th</sup> title, and the first title for Men's Curling.

The partnership between Dominion Chalmers Centre (DCC) and the Ottawa Symphony Orchestra was celebrated with an inaugural event of the collaboration on April 1<sup>st</sup>, 2019. The academic planning associated with DCC has been coordinated by Pauline Rankin, Dean of the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, who has made the decision to postpone any academic activity until Fall 2019. The focus for the DCC for the winter and summer terms will be conferences and special events.

#### 7.5 Update on the Comprehensive Campaign

Ms. Jennifer Conley, Chief Advancement Officer thanked the Board of Governors for their support throughout the Here for Good campaign which reached its fundraising goal in February 2019. The celebration to commend this achievement will take place on April 17, 2019. A full Campaign Completion Report will be brought forward to the Board in June 2019.

#### 7.6 Committee Chair Report

##### *a) Building Program Committee*

Mr. D. Craig provided an updated from the March 6<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Building Program Committee. The committee endorsed the Capital Planning Process Policy, which was created to ensure an efficient process for major capital projects from concept to implementation. Additionally, the plan for the Engineering Student Design Centre was discussed and recommended for approval. The audit recommendations from the Capital Planning Internal Audit were reviewed, and it was reported that all items have



been completed with the exceptions of the Project Management Framework and the Health and Safety Oversight, which were scheduled to be completed in March of 2019.

The Major Capital projects and Deferred Maintenance update reported:

- The ARISE Building phase 2 (fit up) is on schedule. The project overall is over budget due to site conditions.
- The Co-Generation plant is behind schedule but on budget.
- The Nicol Building is proceeding on schedule and on budget. Work on Level 2 has started.
- Athletics is completing an extensive consultation process to see how best to update the facilities.
- The expansion of P18 has been deferred.

Mr. Craig also mentioned the potential merger of the Building and Finance Committees in the upcoming year, which will be further reviewed at the Governance Committee.

Finally, members thanked Ms. Lesley Watson, former member of the Building Program Committee for her service on the Board of Governors.

*b) Community Relations and Advancement*

Dr. Elinor Sloan, Vice-Chair of the Community Relations and Advancement Committee provided an update from the February 20<sup>th</sup> meeting. The committee discussed the Board Award recommendation, where Ms. Frohan Foroutan was approved to be recommended to the Board of Governors as the recipient.

Additionally, the committee discussed the major projects that the Department of University Communications is currently engaged in upon campus, including: reputation research, senior leadership announcements, the President as keynote speaker at the Mayor's Breakfast, Carleton University Indigenous Strategic Initiatives Committee, and a number of events taking place at Dominion Chalmers Centre.

The committee received an update on student enrolment, which is presently seeing considerable growth as compared to last year. The committee also received an update on the Student Mental Health Initiatives Framework 2.0, which among other improvements, includes additional counselors and psychiatrists to eliminate wait times on campus.

The committee also made the decision to eliminate their Talk Exchange Events due to limited attendance, and instead encouraged Board Members to engage with the Carleton community through a variety of events.

*c) Finance Committee*

Ms. Debra Alves, Vice-Chair of the Finance Committee provided a brief overview of the March 6<sup>th</sup> meeting. The committee reviewed the Engineering Student Design Centre addition, and the 2019-20 Ancillary Budget and Tuition Fees and Miscellaneous Fees which were subsequently recommended to the Board of Governors for approval. Additionally, the committee received an update on the planning framework for the 2019-20 Operating Budget, the current Operating Budget was reviewed (currently forecasting a \$2.2 million shortfall, largely based on lower than budgeted tuition fees).

*d) Governance Committee*

The Chair of the Governance Committee, Mr. Ken Evans, a summary of the March 6<sup>th</sup> meeting. The committee discussed the Draft Sexual Violence Policy. Mr. Evans stressed the complexity of the document and stated that more user-friendly versions and attachments to the document are currently in the works, including an index and a flowchart. The Capital Debt Policy was also reviewed at the March meeting, which was subsequently recommended to the Board of Governors for approval. Additionally, the Governance Committee confirmed that the Board of Governors will be using the same self-assessment questionnaire as last year for reasons of consistency. Mr. Evans also described the potential merging of committees, including: Governance and Nominating, Building and Finance, and folding the HR subcommittee into Executive. Less standing committees is the most efficient practice, however there is still much work to be done on this issue before it can be implemented. Finally, the best practices review was discussed. Of the 26 best practices outlined in the report, 10 are completed, 9 are in progress, 5 are on hold, and 2 will be implemented in September 2019.

**8. OPEN- OTHER BUSINESS**

There was no other business to be addressed.

**9. OPEN-QUESTION PERIOD**

There was no other questions.

**10. END OF OPEN SESSION AND BRIEF NETWORKING BREAK**

There being no further business, it was moved by Mr. Craig, seconded by Ms. Yvonne to adjourn the Open Session of the Board of Governors at approximately 5:26 p.m.