



Canada's Capital University

The Board of Governors acknowledges and respects the Algonquin First Nation, on whose traditional territory the Carleton University campus is located.

**Minutes of the 624th Meeting of the
Board of Governors**

**Thursday, March 11th, 2021 at 3:00 p.m.
Via Videoconference**

PRESENT:	Mr. D. Fortin (Chair)	Ms. F. Foroutan	Ms. B. O'Connor
	Dr. B.A. Bacon	Ms. K. Furlong	Dr. B. Örmeci
	Ms. D. Alves	Ms. G. Garland	Dr. E. Sloan
	Mr. N. Black	Ms. C. Gold	Dr. P. Smith
	Mr. T. Boswell	Mr. D. Greenberg	Ms. C. Terrier
	Ms. B. Creary	Ms. L. Honsberger	Ms. A. Tremblay
	Mr. P. Dion	Ms. N. Karhu	Mr. A. Ullett
	Mr. K. von Finckenstein	Dr. J. Malloy	
REGRETS:	Ms. Y. Baltacıoğlu	Mr. G. Farrell (Vice-Chair)	Mr. N. Nanos
	Ms. S. Davin	Ms. M. Fraser	Ms. J. Taber
	Mr. J. Durrell	Ms. W. Horn-Miller	
STAFF:	Ms. S. Blanchard	Dr. L. Dyke	Mr. S. Levitt
	Ms. J. Chandler	Mr. T. Frost	Ms. K. McKinley
	Ms. J. Conley	Ms. A. Goth	Mr. M. Piché
	Ms. R. Drodge (R. Secretary)	Dr. R. Goubran	Dr. J. Tomberlin

OPEN SESSION

1. CALL TO ORDER AND CHAIR'S REMARKS

The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:00 pm and welcomed all governors and attendees to the virtual Board of Governors meeting. The Chair acknowledged the Algonquin First Nation territory on which Carleton University is located.

On the National Day of Observance for COVID-19, the Chair also recognized those affected and lost due to the virus. On behalf of the Board, he thanked all those practicing physical distancing, and front-line workers who continue to work tirelessly to protect and support the community. He

thanked all students, staff and faculty for their perseverance and dedication shown throughout the pandemic.

2. DECLARATION OF CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The Chair asked for any declarations of conflict of interest from the members.

The President declared a conflict of interest with Item 5.2 - Advisory Committee on the President and Vice-Chancellor. Dr. Bacon departed for that portion of the meeting. No other conflicts were declared.

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The proposed agenda was circulated in advance. The Chair noted a correction to the title of Item 5.1 - Ancillary Budget 2021/2022. It was moved by Mr. Black and seconded by Ms. Creary that the open agenda of the 624th meeting of the Board of Governors be approved, as amended. The motion carried unanimously.

4. APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT AGENDA

The following items were circulated in the open consent agenda for approval: the minutes of the previous meeting and the Appointment Guidelines for Senior Administrative and Academic Positions. The following items were distributed for information: Carleton Energy Master Plan, Ongoing Capital Projects Status and Capital Renewal (Deferred Maintenance) Update, Update on 2020/2021 Operating Budget and Status of Reserves, committee minutes, and minutes from Senate.

It was moved by Ms. Tessier and seconded by Ms. Karhu, that the items in the open consent agenda be approved, as presented. The motion carried.

5. ITEMS FOR APPROVAL

5.1 Ancillary Budget 2021/2022

An executive summary, presentation and report entitled *Carleton University Ancillary Services 2021-22 Proposed Budget February 25, 2021* were circulated in advance.

Debra Alves, the Chair of the Finance Committee spoke to this item.

The 2021/'22 Ancillary Budget includes the financial outlook for Carleton's Housing, Conferencing and Dining, Physical Recreation and Athletics, Parking Services, Health and Counselling Services, the Printshop, the National Wildlife Research Centre Building, the University Centre, the Carleton Dominion Chalmers Centre, the Bookstore and the Ancillary

Capital Fund. Each budget was prepared by their respective ancillary unit and reviewed by the Provost Budget Working Group before presentation to the Finance Committee on February 25, 2021.

Ms. Alves noted that ancillary services are expected to generate sufficient revenue to fund the costs of providing services, as well as accumulate funds to cover capital and deferred maintenance projects. Due to the in-person nature of ancillary services, COVID-19 has had a significant negative financial impact on these services. The services most impacted were Housing, Conferencing and Dining, Parking Services, and Physical Recreation and Athletics. After a thorough discussion at the Finance Committee, the members were reassured by senior management that costs were reduced where possible. It was noted that most costs, such as facility operations and maintenance, debt servicing costs, permanent staffing and planned renovations are fixed.

Updated financial projections for 2020/'21 indicated that ancillary services will end the current fiscal year with a deficit of \$32.5M, which will be funded with existing ancillary accumulated surpluses of \$42.5M.

For the 2021/'22 ancillary budget, two scenarios were considered: an optimistic scenario where the university returns to normal activities in the fall 2021 and incurs a \$11.4M deficit by year-end, and a pessimistic scenario where the university remains subject to restrictions similar to the current year, incurring a deficit of \$29.8M by the year-end.

Management has proposed a one-time transfer of \$22.5M from the university's Capital Reserve Fund to cover deferred maintenance and capital projects of the ancillaries. Ms. Alves noted that the university's Capital Reserve Fund is primarily accumulated from investment income and other types of revenue and does not include funds from student tuition or government grants. The Finance Committee recognized the importance of supporting and investing in ancillary services as they are critical for student experience and the overall campus community.

The President noted that investing to preserve deferred maintenance and other capital projects is integral to the university and that the Capital Reserve Fund was destined for such investments. He clarified that the money will not be spent until an appropriate time has been identified.

A member asked if any consideration has been given to environmental impacts of investing such funds into the ancillary services. Ms. Alves noted that the key principle of Carleton's Responsible Investing Policy is that environmental, social and governance (ESG) factors be considered as part of the investment process. All of Carleton's investment managers are required to be signatories to the United Nations Principles for Responsible Investment, which also requires considering and incorporating ESG into investment decisions.

In follow-up question, concern was raised towards the university's financial priorities as it relates to students and student support. Ms. Alves noted that a great deal of funds are spent on student support, along with maintaining the infrastructure and safety of campus. She reminded the committee that this one-time transfer of \$22.5M will be not be coming from student tuition

funds. The President noted that the financial aid offered to students annually (scholarships, bursaries, etc.) is significantly greater than \$22.5M. Despite a loss of \$30M, Carleton has been able to increase the amount of student support throughout the pandemic. He stressed the importance of access to education, student support and highlighted a number of ways in which Carleton has worked to increase student support for Carleton students. The President noted the importance of supporting students of the future, which includes campus and facility maintenance. He reminded the Board that the \$22.5M will be set aside for appropriate, future use.

Michel Piché, Vice-President (Finance and Administration), highlighted that some ancillary fees are optional for students. He noted that the revenue generated to fund such operations come from individuals that get the services in return (e.g. parking fees to use of campus parking).

On the recommendation of the Finance Committee, it was moved by Ms. Alves and seconded by Ms. Gold that the Board of Governors approve Carleton's 2021-22 Ancillary Services Budget including a one-time transfer of \$22.5M from the University's Capital Reserve Fund to cover deferred maintenance and capital projects of the ancillaries for the years 2020-21 and 2021-22, as presented. The motion carried with one opposition.

5.2 Advisory Committee on the President and Vice-Chancellor

A memo was circulated in advance.

The Chair outlined the membership status of the Advisory Committee of the President and Vice-Chancellor. Four Board members were proposed to serve on the committee alongside other members chosen by Senate and the Vice-President Academic and Research Committee.

On the recommendation of the Executive Committee, it was moved by Mr. Fortin and seconded by Ms. Tremblay that the Board of Governors approve Art Ullett, Debra Alves, Jane Taber, and Patrick Dion as the Board of Governors representatives for the Advisory Committee on the President and Vice-Chancellor, as presented. The motion carried with four abstentions.

6. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

6.1 Carleton Research Update

A presentation was circulated in advance. The Chair welcomed the President to introduce Vice-President (Research and International), Dr. Rafik Goubran.

The President stressed the importance of providing an update on research to the Board, as much has changed over the past three years. He acknowledged the outstanding work of Dr. Goubran, which included developing a multifaceted Research Strategy around research support, multidisciplinary projects and developing the industry partnerships strategy. He noted the value of Board members being equipped and able to speak to Carleton's research initiatives within their networks.

Dr. Goubran noted that research is central to Carleton's mission. Research attracts top faculty members, students and has a measured impact on reputation, which is an essential factor in determining ranking. He outlined that research has been and continues to be funded by external sources, such as the Tri-Agencies (SSHRC, NSERC, CIHR), federal and provincial governments, corporations, international sources and foundations.

Dr. Goubran advised that external funding is used to pay graduate students (e.g. research assistants), researchers and postdoctoral fellows, creating and maintaining research labs, cover costs of publications and knowledge dissemination, costs of conference registrations, travel and workshops. He noted that, Tri-Agency funding is directly correlated to support central research infrastructure in the form of Research Support Funds (RSF) and Incremental Project Grants (IPG), the number of Canada Research Chairs (CRCs), the funding envelope from Canada Foundation for Innovation (CFI), some scholarships and funding from other agencies. He highlighted the significant achievement Carleton has obtained by receiving tri-agency funding.

Carleton's research strengths consist of many disciplines, including Physics, Public Affairs and Policy, Information and Communication Technology, Aerospace, Indigenous Studies, Conservation Biology and Forensic Psychology. Dr. Goubran noted that Carleton is known for its multidisciplinary research clusters in areas such as wellness, sustainability, accessibility, remote patient monitoring and Big Data. The impact on society has been significant in a variety of areas, including Equity, Diversity and Inclusion.

Dr. Goubran outlined Carleton's research performance metrics. It was noted that each research field has its own research impact metrics, which have the ultimate goal of knowledge creation and knowledge translation. The most common research performance metrics used by granting agencies, governments and ranking agencies were noted to be external research funding (e.g. tri-agencies, government, corporate), publications and the impact on the field (e.g. citations) and society.

Dr. Goubran reviewed Carleton's research performance, including Carleton's overall increase in external research revenue, Tri-agency Funding, Research Support Fund (RSF), revenue due to industry partnerships, and number of research publications. Carleton's research revenue for 2019/'20, according to the Council of Ontario Finance Officers, was reported to be \$86.5M, which is an increase from \$81.8M in 2018/'19. Carleton's Tri-Agency funding was reported to be \$30.9M in 2019/'20, which is an increase from \$26.8M in 2018/1'9. Funding received for the Research Support Funds and Incremental Project Grants was reported to be \$5.3M for 2020/'21, which is an increase from \$5.1M in 2019/'20. It was estimated that this number will increase to \$5.5M for 2021/'22. A \$2.9M increase was also seen in 2019/'20 from 2018/'19 in research revenue due to industry partnerships and funding. An increase of 146 publications was seen in 2019 from 2018. An increase of approximately 119 publications was estimated for 2020 from 2019.

Key priorities for research throughout 2021/2022 include: increased research productivity in terms of sustained external research funding, publications and citations, expand industry partnerships through the Holistic Integrated Patronships (HIP) initiative with Advancement and

build on early success with Ericsson, promote and celebrate Carleton's research success externally and internally, build reputation (rankings, nominations for awards and prizes), strengthen "Carleton International" and implement the new strategic plan, empower strategic multidisciplinary research clusters and work toward exceeding the Strategic Mandate Agreement research excellence and impact metrics.

The Chair thanked Dr. Goubran for his detailed presentation. He applauded Dr. Goubran's efforts and significant achievements in elevating research at Carleton since he began his term as Vice-President (Research and International) in 2016/2017.

A member asked Dr. Goubran to share some challenges experienced alongside this growth in research. Dr. Goubran applauded the efforts of the faculty and researchers who are integral to this progress. He noted that his team's main role is to create the right environment for researchers to thrive and continue with their passions in research. He noted the challenges of keeping up with research needs as research continues to grow, such as increasing research financial services, IT support for research, and post-award facilitation. Without such support and infrastructure, which Carleton now has, he noted that growth in research would not continue to the same extent.

A member asked if metrics exist to determine the amount of funding going directly to research, versus being used for various other administrative processes and services related to research funding. Dr. Goubran noted the benefits of attracting external research funding, such as the Research Support Funds, the IPG. This past year, over \$500M was given to Carleton by the government to support research infrastructure, and approximately over \$2.7M has been used for research overhead. He noted that it is typical to account for about 20-25% overhead.

A member asked for a brief explanation on the steps Carleton is taking to expand the scope of research and to support research opportunities more inclusively on campus. Dr. Goubran noted that both direct and indirect support are offered to the Carleton community. The granting agencies require that grant applications include a section on EDI. It was noted that this section could include information related to structure of the research team, or the impact of the research being conducted. Some internal funding has been provided by Carleton to some groups in order to promote EDI. He noted the importance of addressing and respecting EDI in research.

6.2 Report from the Chair

The Chair congratulated the President for his Inspiration Award in the Transformational Leader category from The Royal Ottawa Foundation for Mental Health. He also congratulated Charlotte Smith, a master's student in Sociology (Arts), who is to be awarded the Personal Leader for Mental Health Award for her research efforts addressing youth homelessness. He congratulated Ms. Jennifer Conley for her recognition of Businesswoman of the Year in the category of organizations.

The Chair announced that all Board nomination processes held to nominate the students, faculty and staff for vacant positions have successfully completed. He congratulated all successful individuals and thanked all candidates for putting their names forward. It was noted that the

names of the nominated individuals will come forward for Board approval at the June 2021 Board meeting.

6.3 Report from the President

A written report was circulated in advance.

The President commented briefly on the financial stability of Ontario universities. He reassured the Board that Carleton, like other large urban universities, is in a more positive financial situation. Carleton is committed to balanced budgets and does not have any significant debts or deficits. Carleton's enrolment numbers were noted to be strong, which provides some hope for the upcoming year. Deferred campus maintenance was noted to be one of Carleton's largest exposures.

The President acknowledged the difficulties the Carleton community has faced over the last year. He extended his thoughts to all those impacted by COVID-19. He commended the creativity, flexibility and compassion shown by the community in light of the extended public health crisis and rapid transition to online operations and learning. With new variants at play, he hopes that the vaccine roll-out will positively impact Carleton beyond the summer term.

Due to the ongoing public health crisis, June 2021 convocation has been postponed. Carleton released a statement noting that the university is preparing for a safe and gradual return to campus in the fall with a flexible, mixed-model of course delivery. All decisions remain subject to health and safety and public health guidelines. He acknowledged the psychological impact that the pandemic has had on the community, which may make the return to campus challenging for some. The health and safety of the community continues to be Carleton's top priority. The Carleton University Scenario Planning Committee has engaged the entire community in consultations and will continue to do so in developing the fall timetable.

The President highlighted Black History Month and acknowledged Carleton's celebrations and activities throughout the month, which included guest speaker Martin Luther King III at the 2021 SOAR Student Leadership Conference.

After an extensive consultation process, Carleton's new Equity, Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) Action Plan was approved in December. He noted that plans for a launch are scheduled to take place at the end of March. He encouraged the Board to attend.

The second Kinàmàgawin Symposium was noted to be a great success, which saw over 500 virtual attendees.

Carleton's Sexual Assault Awareness week was hosted by Equity and Inclusive Communities alongside the campus community. Workshops and activities were offered to bring about awareness and facilitate conversation.

The President referred the Board to his written report for more information and highlights on academics, research, student initiatives and community engagement.

A member asked if there is potential for a bailout by the province offered to schools, in light of the “bailout funding” announced for municipalities. The President noted he is uncertain this will happen, and that Carleton has planned budgets with the assumption of no additional funds from the government.

A member asked about Carleton’s commitment to EDI and anti-racism. The President highlighted Carleton’s commitment to EDI, which flows through the new Strategic Integrated Plan, Carleton’s new EDI Action Plan and the Kinàmàgawin Report. He noted his trust in the implementation of these plans and that they are priorities of the university.

6.4 Committee Chair Updates

6.4.1 Advancement and University Relations Committee Report

Patrick Dion, Chair of the Committee, reported on the January 25th Advancement and University Relations Committee meeting.

James Langley of Langley Innovations, a US based consultant, provided the committee with a presentation on Advancement in Higher Education.

Ms. Jennifer Conley provided the committee with an update on Advancement. She highlighted commitment to maintaining the three-year rolling average of a \$25M per annum raise. It was noted that new measures are being put into place to adapt to the ever-changing environment. The success of Carleton’s 2020 Giving Tuesday was highlighted, as it was the most successful in Carleton’s history having raised \$1.194M in one day.

Mr. Dion highlighted the change in administration of the Founder’s Award, which pays tribute to those individuals who have made a significant contribution to the Carleton community. It was noted that the Board is now fully responsible for the administration of this award.

A presentation was received by Banfield and IPSOS, updating the committee on Carleton’s reputational enhancement initiatives. It was noted that great progress is being made by both the President and CIO, Mr. Tony Frost.

One item was deferred to the next meeting of the committee related to Carnegie Classification, due to time constraints.

Mr. Dion informed the Board that the Board Award Jury is scheduled to meet later in March to begin deliberations on choosing a Board Award recipient for 2020/’21.

A member, again, asked about the university’s commitment to EDI and anti-racism. Mr. Dion noted that the answer provided earlier by the President was an adequate and fair response.

6.4.2 Building Program Committee Report

Beth Creary, Chair of the Building Program Committee, reported on the February 25th meeting.

A presentation was received for the review of the Campus Master Plan, which is required to be undertaken every five years. It was noted that this review will commence in 2021 and finish in 2022. Two Board members on the Building Program Committee volunteered to represent the committee on the Campus Master Plan project. It was noted that the committee will receive regular updates throughout the year on this process.

The committee received a presentation on the updated Energy Master Plan, which is a strategy that provides a framework for Carleton to become a carbon-neutral campus by 2050 and compliments the Sustainability Plan. A summary report of this plan, the methodology and analysis of the options considered were circulated in the consent materials. Mr. Gary Nower, Assistant-Vice President (Facilities Management and Planning), and his team reported that while Carleton is a leader in energy management, the team is now looking at building systems on campus to work to achieve energy targets for 2030 and 2050. The plan will be reviewed and updated every five years to incorporate changing needs and technologies.

A report was received on on-going capital projects and deferred maintenance. The executive summary and report for this was included in the consent materials. It was noted that capital projects total \$147.9M and the value of work done as of January 31st was at \$90.2M. Ms. Creary noted that the Nicol Building is anticipated to have an occupancy permit in early May 2021. She noted that the Engineering Design Centre, which is an addition to the Mackenzie Building, is under construction with a scheduled completion for Fall 2021. It was highlighted that backflow preventors are being installed in all buildings across campus to conform with bylaws and to protect drinking water quality. A complete study of all the underground systems to create a replacement plan has begun, as the campus sanitary sewer/storm sewer and water main infrastructure is at risk in some areas.

The committee commended Mr. Piché, Mr. Nower and the entire Facilities Management and Planning team for their advancement in Carleton's strategic planning, capital projects and deferred maintenance, despite the ongoing public health crisis without any significant delays or abnormal expenses.

6.4.3 Finance Committee Report

Debra Alves, Chair of the Finance Committee, reported on the February 25, 2021 meeting.

In addition to the 2020/'21 Ancillary Budget, the committee also received an update on the 2020/'21 Operating Budget and the status of reserves. For the current year, revenues have been forecasted to be slightly higher due to increased summer enrolment, but offset by the loss of certain fees waived during the year, and higher expenses due to additional

student support and rising accrued leave. It was noted that the final number is also dependent on investment income, which is conservatively forecasted to be on budget by fiscal year end.

Internally Restricted Net Assets have been projected to decline by \$52M compared to the prior year, with most significant changes related to the forecast of a \$32M reduction in the Ancillaries accumulated surplus due to the pandemic, and by \$20M as funds earmarked for the Nicol Building construction expense.

A verbal update was received on the status of next year's operating budget process, which is proceeding as per the timeline outlined in the approved framework. A verbal update was also received on management's next steps in the exploration of new ways to fund capital projects.

7. OPEN-OTHER BUSINESS

No additional items were brought forward.

8. OPEN-QUESTION PERIOD

No additional questions were brought forward.

9. END OF OPEN SESSION AND BRIEF BREAK

There being no further business, it was moved by Ms. Garland and seconded by Mr. Greenberg to adjourn the Open Session of the Board of Governors at approximately 4:31 p.m. The motion carried with one opposition.