



Canada's Capital University

The Board of Governors acknowledges and respects the Algonquin First Nation, on whose traditional territory the Carleton University campus is located.

**Minutes of the 618th Meeting of the
Board of Governors**

**Wednesday, December 4, 2019 at 3:00 p.m.
Room 2440R Richcraft Hall, Carleton University**

PRESENT:	Mr. D. Fortin (Chair) Ms. F. Afaq Dr. B.A. Bacon Mr. A. Alhaimi Ms. D. Alves Ms. T. Arnt Dr. C. Carruthers Ms. B. Creary Mr. P. Dion	Mr. K. Evans (phone) Mr. G. Farrell Mr. K. von Finckenstein Ms. J. Fullerton Ms. K. Furlong Ms. G. Garland Mr. D. Greenberg Ms. L. Honsberger Mr. O. Javanpour (phone)	Ms. N. Karhu Dr. J. Malloy Ms. B. O'Connor Dr. B. Ormeci Dr. E. Sloan Dr. P. Smith Ms. J. Taber Ms. A. Tremblay Mr. A. Ullett
REGRETS:	Ms. Y. Baltacioğlu Mr. J. Durrell	Ms. C. Gold Ms. L. Hayes	Mr. N. Nanos
STAFF:	Ms. S. Blanchard Mr. D. Cumming	Ms. A. Cunningham Ms. A. Goth (R. Secretary) Mr. S. Levitt	Mr. M. Piché Dr. R. Goubran Dr. J. Tomberlin
GUESTS:	Dr. B. Appel-Kuzmarov Dr. L. Dyke	Dr. K. Horn-Miller Mx. B. Michaud	Ms. C. Taylor Mr. J. Watson

OPEN SESSION

1. CALL TO ORDER AND CHAIR'S REMARKS

The Chair, Mr. Dan Fortin called the meeting to order at 3:00 pm. The Chair recognized the passing of Paul Labbé the mentor, friend and father-in-law of Board Chair Nik Nanos.

2. DECLARATION OF CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The Chair asked for any declarations of conflict of interest from the members. None were declared.

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The proposed agenda was circulated in advance. It was moved by Ms. Honsberger and seconded by Mr. Farrell that the open agenda of the 618th meeting of the Board of Governors be approved, as presented. The motion carried.

4. APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT AGENDA

The following items were circulated in the open consent agenda for approval: minutes of the previous meeting and the Board Travel and Related Expense Policy.

The following items were circulated in the open consent agenda for information: Project Planning Report - Engineering Student Design Centre, Investment Report for the Endowment, Pension Plan Report, Risk Management Policy and Enterprise Risk Management Q & A, minutes from the Building Program, Finance and Governance Committees and Minutes of September Senate.

Ms. Tremblay moved, and it was seconded by Dr. Malloy, that the items in the open consent agenda be approved, as presented. The motion carried.

5. PRESENTATION FROM THE MAYOR OF OTTAWA - JIM WATSON

The Chair introduced his Worship Mayor Jim Watson. Mr. Watson is a Carleton alum and served on the Board of Governors in the 80s, 90s, and the early 2000s.

The Mayor noted Carleton's growth and development as a modern and accessible campus that allows for collaboration and creativity that contributes to the City of Ottawa. The City is recognized as one of the best Canadian cities to live-in, which includes a nationally ranked tech hub, and a favourable environment for student housing and quality of life. The City has been a center of technology and entrepreneurship, and has the largest tech park in Canada, which includes: 1,900 knowledge-based businesses that employ 75,000 people in industries such as communications, defense, aerospace, life sciences, autonomous vehicles and clean-tech. Ottawa currently has a 30 year low in unemployment rates (at 4.2%).

The Mayor noted Ottawa has the highest number of residents with a post-secondary education in Canada, and more engineers, scientists and PhDs per capita than any other city in the country. The Mayor mentioned that retention of talent is a challenge for Ottawa, as the City needs to be a livable, exciting and welcoming for young people and new Canadians.

Working with economic development partners such as Invest Ottawa, the City is pursuing increased foreign investment and ways to grow the economy. This includes supporting local innovators, start-ups with tools and mentoring opportunities such as the Innovation Center at Bayview Yards, an incubation and acceleration hub for technology talent, capabilities and companies. Invest Ottawa has also launched a talent and retention program which is a proactive talent strategy including an international recruitment program. The City is making investments in the new Ottawa Art Gallery and new Central Library. In partnership with Ottawa Tourism, the City is engaged in attracting major tourism events using a strategy of bid more, win more and host more.

Work is underway to make the City more accessible through LRT and bus improvements. Currently, LRT is from Clair to Tunney's Pasture with the O-train running from Bayview to Greenboro. Phase 2 will expand the LRT eastward from Blair to Trim Road, and westward from Tunney's Pasture to Moodie Drive with a line off to Baseline (Algonquin College). Phase 2 will also include an expansion south from Greenboro to the Airport and Riverside South. The Mayor advised that once completed, Ottawa's LRT network will span 64 km of rail and offer service at 42 stations with 77% of all residents living within 5 km of a station. Phase 3 will bring the LRT to Barrhaven, Kanata and Stittsville. The Mayor stated that Carleton will gain a pedestrian bridge across the Rideau River level to Vincent Massey Park.

The Board inquired about transit connectivity with Gatineau's system. The Mayor responded that he is working with the Mayor of Gatineau to increase connectivity through buses and the LRT system. The members also inquired about the development of Phase 2 toward Riverside South instead of Barrhaven. The Mayor responded that it was collaboration on funding between the Provincial government, Federal government and two large home builders that resulted in the extension of the LRT to Riverside South. The City owns the land, and the development of LRT means the City is being proactive in that area.

It was asked if the Mayor had any ideas to strengthen the civic mindedness of undergraduate students through a City of Ottawa programs similar to the Page Program. The Mayor responded that in the past there have been internship opportunities to work with a counsellor's office or the Mayor's Office.

The Board asked about proactive measures or lessons learned from extreme weather incidents such as the recent flooding on the Ottawa River. The Mayor responded that proactive infrastructure updates and mitigation measures are essential to acclimatize the city facilities. This will require partnership with the Provincial and Federal government for funding. At the municipal level, the City needs to do a better job of denying applications to build on floodplains.

6. ITEMS FOR APPROVAL

6.1 Framework for the 2020/2021 Operating Budget

An executive summary and presentation were circulated in advance.

Ms. Alves, Chair of the Finance Committee advised that the Framework for the 2020/2021 Operating Budget is under the Provost's portfolio and is prepared with the support of the Vice-President (Finance and Administration), the Office of Institutional Research and Planning, the Office of the Deputy Provost, Financial Services and the senior leadership team. The framework is being developed during a time of flux with the development of a new Strategic Integrated Plan and a Strategic Mandate Agreement being negotiated. The budget cycle began with the Board of Governors Planning Session in the Fall and key budget assumptions presented to the Finance Committee in November are in the framework.

Many of the budget assumptions are government mandated. The revenue assumptions presented include maintaining steady enrolment (1% growth in new first year students, 2% increase in international students), increasing international student tuition by 3 - 8%, frozen domestic tuition, government grants for undergraduates frozen at 2016-17 levels and graduate student enrolment grants frozen at 2019-20 levels. Expense assumptions include a 1% cap on salaries and benefits for newly negotiated collective agreements, operating expenses to grow by 3%, the introduction of the new federal carbon tax and the Pension Fund provision for adverse deviation (PfAD).

It was moved by Ms. Alves and seconded by Ms. Furlong, on the recommendation of the Finance Committee to approve the Framework for the 2020/2021 Operating Budget, as presented. The motion carried.

7. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

7.1 Carleton University Indigenous Strategic Initiatives Committee Calls to Action

The President thanked former board member, Peter Dinsdale for his advice and guidance on a process for meaningful engagement in response to the Truth and Reconciliation Commissions Calls to Action. The Carleton University Indigenous Strategic Initiatives Committee (CUISIC) builds on the strength of the 2010 Aboriginal Coordinated Strategy. The President acknowledged the leadership of the Board Chair Nik Nanos who pushed for significant movement on the Indigenous Initiatives on campus to respond to the TRC Calls to Action. The President then introduced Benny Michaud, Kahente Horn-Miller, Theresa Hendricks and Jerry Tomberlin who have been leading the process. It was noted that the Board and Senate both passed motions endorsing the work of CUISIC towards revitalizing Carleton's Indigenous strategy and relationship with Indigenous people on and off campus.

Formed in December 2018, CUISIC consists of thirty-six members from both on-campus and off-campus communities, including Indigenous communities. The co-chairs conducted more than

40 consultations - on and off campus - that included participation of more than 450 people. The 41 draft Carleton-specific Calls to Action are part of a response to the recommendations of the Truth and Reconciliation Commissions, are aspirational and have evolved throughout the consultative and iterative process.

The final CUISIC report will be finalized in early winter. An implementation committee will be formed to consider each recommendation, establish timelines and paths forward. The Calls to Action will provide a roadmap as Carleton revitalizes its Indigenous initiatives and its relationships with Indigenous Peoples on-and off-campus.

A board member asked about indigenous representation selection process for the Board of Governors, and how it is being addressed. The Chair commented that the Governance Committee met in November to discuss the skills, expertise and experience required by the Board. Indigenous representation on the Board was a topic of discussion including the importance of equity, diversity and inclusion on the Board as recognized by the Board's Diversity Statement.

A member inquired how the University will continue to engage with the community long-term. Dr. Horn-Miller responded that a number of the Calls to Actions ensure the continuing engagement with the community, including the creation of the appropriate senior administrative position that would assist with feedback and consultation with the community. Additionally, the Indigenous Education Council will include membership from the three local indigenous communities where progress reporting would occur.

On the recommendation of the Executive Committee, it was moved by Ms. Arnt and seconded by Ms. Alves that the Board receive the Carleton University Indigenous Strategic Initiatives Committee (CUISIC) Calls to Action, understanding that any action under the purview of the board will in due course be brought back to the Board for approval, and that the Board thank the members of the CUISIC for their work on this important initiative. The motion carried unanimously.

7.2 Strategic Integrated Plan Process Update

The President was introduced to provide an update. He reminded the Board that the strategic integrated planning process launched on September 5th with guest speaker Ken Steele. The President noted that Sheldon Levy's presentation and the co-chairs summary at the Board Planning Session was the start of various themes emerging. The importance of a Strategic Plan being a reputation building plan and that the plans aspirations should be greater than the university. For example, it was stressed how Carleton could take on initiatives to help the greater Ottawa community as well. The task force has been working to distill the essence of the consultation to create a strategic and reputational plan for the University.

Dr. Lorraine Dyke then provided a summary of the consultation process and activities including a SIP Speaker Series (8 events, 13 speakers and 600 attendees), open consultations (40 meetings, 1,000 attendees and 200 online submissions), and themed consultations (150 attendees). These consultations have led to four mission pillars and eight emerging potential strategic theme

directions being identified. The four mission pillars identified are research, teaching and learning, student experience and organizational excellence. The emerging potential strategic themes identified are leadership in sustainability; access, equity, diversity and inclusion; healthy environments (physical, social, culture, and professional); internationalization; campus-community engagement, real-world/social impact beyond disciplinary boundaries, innovation and indigenous initiatives. It was noted that the themes continue to be redefined. Ideas will be shaped and refocused to be strategic in nature.

The next steps in the process were then outlined and include publishing a summary document, drafting and reviewing the SIP, a consultation on the draft SIP and presentation to and seeking approval of the Board in June 2020.

A member asked if there are specific criteria that will be used to reduce the eight emerging strategic themes down to approximately three strategic themes. Dr. Dyke responded that many of the emerging themes are interrelated and/or impact each other and the task force will be considering all feedback quantitatively and qualitatively. The President responded that all of the emerging themes will continue to progress, but it is important that the SIP define what Carleton is willing to stake its reputation on.

The Board provided feedback that Carleton's location in Ottawa should be incorporated into the SIP including: links to technology sector and the federal government. Carleton's origin story should be considered and incorporated into the SIP as Carleton originated from the community and specifically in Ottawa.

It was asked if the academic strengths will be a focus for the SIP. Dr. Dyke responded that the focus of the SIP is to find themes that will cross academic disciplines instead of defining programming strengths. The President commented that the SIP will be told in a story-telling fashion with strong symbols and metaphors with new and vibrant language that Carleton can own. It was noted Carleton's success requires a powerful, engaging and memorable SIP.

7.3 Strategic Mandate Agreement Update

The Strategic Mandate Agreement (SMA) is negotiated between the Ministry of Colleges and Universities and each of Ontario's 45 publicly-assisted colleges and universities. The SMA describes how each institution will build on its current strengths to achieve its vision and help drive system-wide objectives and government priorities. The Ministry has defined ten specific and measurable metrics. The process and outcomes of the SMA and SIP are different but linked.

The SMA3 process timeline was outlined as beginning in September 2019 with the finalization on March 31, 2020. The President commented that it likely that Carleton will want to weight all ten metrics equally.

The ten metrics and narrative provided to the Ministry at the November meeting with Carleton were outlined as:

- Graduate Employment – proportion of graduates employed full-time in a related or partially-related field.
- Institutional Strength/Focus – proportion of enrolment in identified areas of strength.
- Graduation Rate – undergraduate programs.
- Research Funding and Capacity – federal Tri-agency funding secured.
- Community/Local impact – institutional enrolment as a proportion of local population.
- Institution-specific metric on economic impact – from a list of possible economic impact metrics.
- Graduate earnings – earning of university graduates (2 and 5 years after graduation).
- Experiential Learning – number and proportion of undergraduate graduates in courses with experiential learning.
- Innovation – research revenue attracted from Private Sector Sources..
- Skills and Competencies – to be confirmed by the Ministry.

7.4 Report from the Chair

The Chair, Mr. Fortin congratulated Dr. Jonathan Malloy on his appointment as the Honourable Dick and Ruth Bell Chair for the Study of Canadian Parliamentary Democracy. The Chair reminded the Board of the December 10th Holiday Concert at the Carleton Dominion Chalmers Center.

7.5 Report from the President

The President's Report to the Board of Governors December 4, 2019 was circulated in advance. The President expressed his gratitude to the community for their donations on Giving Tuesday which raised \$1 million with matching funds provided by the University for a total of \$2 million for projects led by members of the Carleton community through FutureFunder.

The President highlighted reputation building including recent recognition of Carleton as ranking within the Top 5 for Canadian Comprehensive Universities in MacLean's and as ranking 3rd in the subcategory of Student Satisfaction. Carleton ranked first among comprehensive and medical universities in research income growth from 2017 to 2018, experiencing a 29.3 per cent increase in funding. At the Excellence Canada Summit on November 5, Carleton became the first post-secondary institution to reach Gold Level certification in Mental Health at Work and received a Bronze Level certification in Excellence, Innovation and Wellness for the Students and Enrolment division.

The President remarked on the success of Fall Convocation on November 9th, with more than 1,300 graduates and nearly 550 graduate students being awarded with degrees as well as an honorary doctorate to Mary Ellen Turpel-Lafond. The President thanked board members who participated.

Carleton's research continues to garner momentum and highlighted that Carleton University, University of Ottawa and National Research Council co-hosted the Royal

Society of Canada's 2019 Celebration of Excellence and Engagement on Nov. 21 to 22, 2019. Four Carleton professors joined the ranks of the Royal Society Fellows.

The President highlighted that Carleton and TVO's Ontario Hubs launched the new TVO Indigenous Hub at Carleton's School of Journalism and Communication on November 29th. The hub and its TVO journalist in residence, Shelby Lisk, will amplify Indigenous voices that are under-represented in today's current affairs stories and analysis.

The Raven's men's soccer team won the OUA Championships at the OUA Final 4. Head coach Kwesi Loney was named the OUA East Division Coach of the Year and U SPORTS Coach of the Year. The Men's and Women's Basketball teams are off to a strong season as well as the Men's Hockey Team.

The Ontario Universities' Fair was a big success. Carleton saw an increase in attendance at its booth and presentation room. More than 130 faculty, staff and students travelled to Toronto to answer questions from prospective students about Carleton. Highschool visits nationally and internationally were held over the Fall. Carleton also hosted 100 guidance counsellors on campus in the Fall to answer questions and featured the new Dean of Business.

7.6 Committee Chair Updates

a) Building Program Committee

Mr. Farrell, Chair of the Building Program Committee provided an update from the committees' meeting on November 21, 2019.

The architects from Diamond Schmitt Architects and KWC provided an update on the conceptual design of the new residence building. The architects presented options for two different room layouts - single and double as well as shared and communal spaces. The location of the building is at the T-intersection of University Dr. and Campus Ave. The tunnel connection for the building and the P18 parking was also discussed.

The Project Planning Report for the Engineering Student Design Centre was received by the committee. The building will provide design studio space required for fourth-year Engineering Capstone projects. The project has an estimated cost of \$11 million. The next approval stage of the project is the Project Implementation Report which will be presented to the Finance and Building Program Committee in early 2020. Class D cost estimates have been prepared and the hard-costs of the project is estimated at \$7.7 million and with related soft-costs and contingency. It is projected that project will finish on or below budget. Some additional storm and sanitary infrastructure damage in the area intended for construction was found. FMP will be providing additional maintenance financial resources to rectify the issues through the upcoming construction to minimize the overall cost to the university. The project has an ambitious schedule with a completion date of September 2020. To mitigate the risk, it has been recognized and accepted by the Faculty that occupancy is not likely to occur until January 2021.

A Capital Project Status Report was provided to the committee. The total capital projects currently underway total \$237.8 million and as of October 28, 2019 the total expenditures incurred and value of work completed totaled \$164.5 million. The projects underway include the Health Sciences Building, ARISE Building, Cogeneration facility and the Nicol Building,

The Health Sciences Building animal facility has been occupied since August 2019. Work remains to re-design and replace failed exhaust fans with expected completion by March 2020.

ARISE Building Phase 1 achieved substantial completion in November 2018. A detailed review of the construction phase is underway including more than \$3 million in change orders. It is estimated that construction phase will be over budget by \$1.54 million. A detailed accounting and close-out report will be provided to the Finance and Building Program Committees in March 2020.

The Cogeneration facility has had the high voltage switchgear installed in the Bronson substation. There are ongoing discussions with the contractor regarding their responsibility to correct the deficiencies that are noted by Hydro Ottawa to energize the equipment. The building is expected to be operational in November, with commissioning expected to proceed as soon as the deficiencies related to the switchgear are resolved.

The Nicol Building's concrete structure is finished and the steel structure is at 70% completion. The contractor provided a revised schedule on August 8th with a forecast of substantial completion by October 30, 2020. However, the contractor is currently reporting that work is approximately two weeks behind the revised schedule. The project is expected to remain on budget and is currently underbudget by \$1.8 million.

It was questioned if an engineering building is still being designed to support continued growth. Mr. Piché responded that an Energy Sustainability Research Building will have a strong Engineering program component, and is currently in preliminary development to be ready for funding opportunities as they become available.

b) Finance Committee

Ms. Alves, Chair of the Finance Committee provided an update from the committees' meeting on November 21, 2019.

The finance committee received a report on Investment Fund for the Endowment which is comprised of three subsidiary funds, the General Endowment which holds most of the donations to the University and two small single manager funds - the Sprott Bursary and the Jarislowsky Chair in Water and Global Health. The market value of the combined endowment at September 30, 2019 was \$304.8M. The objective of the Fund is to achieve returns that will allow annual distributions of 4% based on a moving four-year average

while preserving the Fund in perpetuity. In fiscal year 2019, the annual distribution of the Endowment fund was \$10.7M providing \$3M for scholarships and awards, \$3.2M in bursaries and \$4.5M in support to other academic and student service initiatives. The current asset mix is 28% in Canadian fixed income, 24.1% in Canadian equities, 45.4% in global equities and 2.5% in infrastructure. With the exception of an underweighting in infrastructure (due the timing for capital calls) and overweight within global equities, weightings for all asset classes are within the 10% ranges permitted under policy.

The committee also received the annual Pension Plan Report. The financial position of the Pension Plan is based on the most recent actuarial valuation as at July 1, 2016. The going-concern valuation was a 93% funded ratio as at July 1, 2016. The solvency valuation (hypothetical windup) was 83.1% funded ratio as at July 1, 2016. For the 2019 valuation, preliminary analysis shows that the solvency deficit will have improved from \$224M in 2016 to under \$150M in 2019. The improvement is due to an increase in the solvency discount rates and the investment returns of 24.4% (cumulative) in the three years since the last valuation. The market value of the Pension Fund at September 30, 2019 was \$1.33 billion. The total employer contributions for special payments of \$28M reflect a third round of Provincial solvency funding relief. It was noted that contributions to the minimum guarantee fund are expected to increase and there is a new provision for adverse deviations (PfAD) which will fall under the new funding rules (as of May 1, 2018). The funding rules include reduced solvency funding requirements. Solvency valuations are required, but solvency funding is only required when the funded status falls below 85%. The PfAD may be amortized over ten years, and the annual contribution is estimated to be in the \$10-20M range. The new regulations also include an increase to the Pension Benefits Guarantee Fund (PBGF) assessment. The PBGF is expected to increase from \$1.3M in 2018 to \$2.5M in 2019.

An update on the 2019/2020 Operating Budget indicating that both expenses and revenues are on track with student enrolment tracking well with an increase of 1 to 1.5%.

c) Governance Committee

Ms. Creary, Vice-Chair of the Governance Committee provided an update from the committees' meeting on November 25, 2019. The committee reviewed the 2019/20 board self-assessment survey and the Board Travel and Related Expenses Policy. The committee also considered the approach for community-at-large recruitment for 2020/21 and reviewed a number of documents including the value proposition for serving on the board, a description of the role of the chair of the board as well as a guideline for the standing committee member assignment. The committee instructed the secretariat to complete a best practice review on in-camera session at the committee level.

The committee also discussed recruitment consistent with the Board's Diversity statement. The committee decided that individuals with CPA designations, expertise in the technology, innovation and entrepreneurship should be recruited for 2020/21. Board members were asked to encourage others to apply.

8. OPEN-OTHER BUSINESS

No additional business was raised.

9. OPEN-QUESTION PERIOD

No additional questions were raised.

10. END OF OPEN SESSION AND BRIEF NETWORKING BREAK

There being no further business, it was moved by Dr. Sloan, seconded by Dr. Smith to adjourn the Open Session of the Board of Governors at approximately 5:34 pm. The motion carried.