



Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.

**Carleton University Senate
Meeting of June 7, 2024 at 2:00 pm
PK608**

**OPEN SESSION
MINUTES**

Present in Person: S. Ajila (acting for L. Kostiuk), J. Armstrong, H. Babb, M. Barbeau, S. Blanchard, A. Bordeleau, A. Bowker, S. Burges, B. Campbell, E. Cyr, M. DeRosa, K. Graham, N. Hagigi, M. Haines, K. Hellemans, D. Hornsby, D. Howe, C. Khordoc (acting for P. Rankin), A. Lannon, A. MacDonald, B. MacLeod, L. Madokoro, L. Marshall, J. Mason, D. Mendeloff, J. Murray, R. Nelson, H. Nemiroff, A. North, B. O’Neill, M. Pearson, R. Renfroe, S. Seneviratne, O. Shafiq, D. Siddiqi, E. Sloan (Clerk), K. Taylor, J. Tomberlin (Chair), C. Trudel, C. Viau, G. Wainer, J. Wallace, P. Williams, P. Wolff

Present via Zoom: M. Abarghouei, M. Baez, H. Becker, F. Brouard, J.P. Corriveau, R. Gorelick, R. Goubran, S. Hawkins, M. Huckvale, J. Kundu, A. Marcotte (acting for L. Dyke), P. Mkandawire, B. O’Connor, A. Park, M. Rooney, C. Smelser, P. Smith, D. Sprague

Regrets: B. Albright-Peakall, J. Taber

Absent: A. Buri, D. Caratao, A. Clarke, S. El Fitori, S. Everts, Y. Gandhi, T. Haats, L. Moffitt, K. Moss, M. Taghavishavazi

Recording Secretary: K. McKinley

1. Welcome and Approval of Agenda

The meeting was called to order at 2:01 p.m.

Following a review of meeting protocols, the Chair began his opening remarks by reminding Senators that June is National Indigenous History Month, when we celebrate the contributions of First Nations, Inuit and Metis to our community. June is also Pride Month, a time to honour the struggles and triumphs of the 2SLGTBQIA community.

The Chair then acknowledged the passing of Morna Maxwell Parker, daughter of Maxwell MacOdrum, Carleton's second President, and the passing of Elizabeth (Betty) Zahalan, former Administrator of the School of Industrial Design. He offered condolences to their families and to those who knew and loved them.

The Chair also noted that June 6 marked 3 years since the act of terrorism in London Ontario that took the lives of four members of the Afzaal family. Green and purple ribbons were available at the Pigiarvik and Tory buildings for Carleton community members to wear in remembrance of this day, and the need to tackle Islamophobia and other forms of hate.

The Chair then reminded Senators that the Senate meeting would begin with a Closed Session to approve Carleton's Spring graduates.

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, J. Malloy) that Senate move into the closed Session of the meeting. The motion **PASSED**.

(See separate document for Closed Session Minutes.)

Continuation of Open Session minutes, following the end of the Closed Session:

The Chair noted the following amendments to the open session agenda:

- The order of SQAPC and SCCASP reports is to be reversed.
- The Faculty Gender Equity Report is to be omitted from the Reports for Information, as this report will be submitted in September.

It was **MOVED** (P. Wolff, L. Madokoro) that Senate approve the agenda for the open session of the meeting of Senate on June 7, 2024, as amended.

The motion **PASSED**.

2. Minutes: May 3, 2024

It was **MOVED** (C. Viau, M. Haines) that Senate approve the minutes of the Senate meeting on May 3, 2024 as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

3. Matters Arising

There were none.

4. Chair's Remarks

The Chair began his remarks by reporting on the success of the recent Carleton Challenge Conference, which was held on May 8th. The theme was Climate Solutions for a Sustainable Future, and featured a number of discussions, collaborative workshops and panel sessions led by a broad spectrum of thought leaders. The Chair thanked all who attended and participated in the conference.

The Chair next provided an update on the implementation of the Kinàmàgawin strategy, a commitment to learning together and building a supportive environment for Indigenous members of the community. Recent achievements this past year include enhancing support for Indigenous students through expanded educational spaces and programs, strengthening community engagement, and promotion of Indigenous ways of teaching and learning.

The Chair announced that Senator Anne Bowker has been appointed Dean of the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences (FASS) effective July 1, 2024. Senator Bowker has been serving as Interim Dean since August 2023, and has already made impactful strides in strategic planning for the Faculty. Senators congratulated her with a round of applause.

Finally, the Chair informed Senators that Carleton's Faculty of Engineering and Design has been chosen to host the prestigious 2026 Ontario Engineering Competition, one of the largest and most eagerly anticipated engineering contests in the nation. The Chair added that Carleton's 2024 undergraduate team achieved remarkable success, placing in 5 of the 8 categories at this year's competition.

There was no follow-up discussion and no questions were asked.

5. Question Period

No questions were submitted in advance.

6. Administration

a. VPFA Advisory Committee

The Clerk reported on the Senate-elected membership of the Vice-President Finance & Administration Advisory Committee. In early May the Senate office circulated a Call for Nominations for 2 academic staff positions and 2 student

positions (one undergraduate and one graduate) on the VPFA Advisory Committee. The student positions were contested and an election was held on May 21 -22. The academic staff positions were acclaimed. A memo containing the members elected by Senate was circulated for information in the meeting binder.

The Chair remarked that the current VP of Finance & Administration, Lorraine Dyke, was not able to attend the Senate meeting due to illness. As this would have been her last Senate meeting, the Chair called for a motion of thanks on behalf of Senate, for her service to the university in this role.

It was **MOVED** (K. Hellemans, H. Nemiroff) that Senate thank Senator Lorraine Dyke for her service to Carleton University, as Vice-President Finance & Administration.

The motion **PASSED**.

b. Faculty Board Constitution Template

The Clerk reminded Senators that due to the restructuring of the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs, Faculty Board Constitutions for the line Faculties needed to be revised, in accordance with the recommendations within the Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Graduate Academic Governance. To align the constitutions in terms of format, a template was developed during the Winter 2024 semester by the University Secretariat. This template, which has been included in the Senate binder for information, was approved by SAGC, then distributed to the individuals within the Faculties responsible for writing/editing their constitutions. Revised Faculty Board Constitutions in the new template will be presented to Senate for approval during the 2024/25 academic year.

7. Reports

a. Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee (SQAPC)

Committee Chair David Hornsby presented one cyclical review, four major modifications, five new programs and two governance changes for Senate approval. To commemorate the occasion of the approval of these new programs, the Committee Chair composed a Sonnet for Senate, which he read to Senators:

Upon these halls of eager minds and light,
Carleton casts new visions vast and bright:
Three major changes to our curricula we bring,

To tune our song so future birds may sing.

Behold, a School of Nursing rises proud,
Where care and science meet 'neath learning's cloud;
An Institute of Data Science, too,
Explores the vast digital seas to chart anew.

Five programs we unveil with great delight:
In Nursing, hands that heal and hearts that fight;
In Data Science, minds that sift and weave,
And Cybersecurity's shield, which none deceive.

Mechatronics blends gear with electron's dance,
While the Online BA offers all a chance.
Thus, Carleton shapes its morrow with these tools,
For wisdom's garden thrives where knowledge rules.

Senators responded with a round of applause.

Cyclical Review: Undergraduate Programs in Health Sciences

It was **MOVED** (D. Hornsby, M. DeRosa) that Senate approve the Final Assessment Reports and Executive Summaries arising from the Cyclical Review of the Undergraduate programs in Health Sciences.

The motion **PASSED**.

Major Modifications:

An omnibus motion was presented to expedite business.

It was **MOVED** (D. Hornsby, A. Bowker) that Senate approve the major modifications and governance change, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Individual motions from the Omnibus:

- THAT Senate approve the change in degree name from the M.Eng. in Technology Innovation Management to the M.Tech. in Technology Innovation Management, as presented with effect in Fall 2025.
- THAT Senate approve the major modification to the Bachelor of Health Sciences (Hons) with concentration program as presented with effect from Fall 2025.

- THAT Senate approve the introduction of the Concentration in Environmental Geosciences as presented with effect from Fall 2025.
- THAT Senate approve that the governance of the programs in Latin American and Caribbean Studies be moved from the Department of History to the Institute of Interdisciplinary Studies as presented with effect from Fall 2024.

New Program Approvals:

It was **MOVED** (M. Barbeau, M. DeRosa) that Senate approve the proposed Bachelor of Data Science program as presented to commence in Fall 2025.

A Senator asked if the title (Bachelor of Data Science) might imply that there is no data in Chemistry, Physics, etc., They also wondered whether the hybrid and online format proposed for this program might encourage academic integrity violations.

In response to the first question, it was noted that the name of the field (Data Science) implies reviewing large data sets that require machine learning and artificial intelligence, and thus the name of the program is appropriate.

The committee Chair responded to the second concern noting that there is no significant correlation between online learning and an increase in academic integrity violations. With proper course design, and careful choice of the types of assessments, it can be even more difficult to cheat in an online course.

The motion **PASSED**.

It was **MOVED** (M. DeRosa, J. Wallace) that Senate approve the proposed Bachelor of Science in Nursing program as presented to commence in Fall 2025.

The following additional information was provided in response to a number of questions from Senators:

- While nursing programs are very prescriptive, concentrations create the potential for partnerships, which could be explored in the future.
- Some of the larger theory courses could be open to non-Nursing students, but due to the prerequisite course tree and experiential

learning components, the core courses need to be restricted to B. Science in Nursing students at this time.

- Health Sciences, Neuroscience, Psychology and others could potentially support the demand for TAs. Additionally, a graduate program in nursing is on the horizon and will be leveraged to support the TA assignments.
- While the partnership is with the Queensway-Carleton Hospital, clinical placements could include Montfort and other regional hospitals.

The motion **PASSED**.

It was **MOVED** (A. Bowker, B. O'Neill) that Senate approve the proposed Bachelor of Arts in General Studies program as presented to commence in Fall 2025.

It was noted that the degree is a collaboration between FASS and FPA; additionally, the program does not require ministry approval.

In response to a question regarding the efficacy of online programs, the Chair of SQAPC noted that Teaching and Learning is constantly monitoring these courses to find new engagement tactics and to determine student success rates. In their experience, student engagement is not determined by modality but by pedagogy. A Senator requested for follow-up (Matters Arising) that the summary information on these findings be shared with Senators. The Chair agreed to bring this to the next Senate meeting under Matters Arising.

The motion **PASSED**.

It was **MOVED** (O. Shafiq, S. Ajila (for L. Kostiuk)) that Senate approve the proposed B.Eng. in Mechatronics Engineering program as presented to commence in Fall 2025.

The motion **PASSED**.

It was **MOVED** (D. Howe, M. Barbeau) that Senate approve the proposed Bachelor of Cybersecurity program as presented to commence in Fall 2025.

The motion **PASSED**.

The Chair expressed thanks to all who worked on preparing these proposals for Senate.

Governance Changes: Creation of new bodies to house the Nursing and Data Science programs.

It was **MOVED** (M. DeRosa, K. Hellemans) that Senate recommends to the Board of Governors the approval of the creation of the School of Nursing as presented. The motion **PASSED**.

It was **MOVED** (M. Barbeau, M. DeRosa) that Senate recommends to the Board of Governors the approval of the creation of the Institute of Data Science as presented. The motion **PASSED**.

The committee Chair thanked colleagues in the Associate Vice-Provost office, specifically Christina Noja, Hashmat Khan and Dwight Deugo for their efforts in shepherding the new programs through.

b. Senate Committee on Curriculum Admissions and Studies Policy (SCCASP)

SCCASP Chair Dan Siddiqi presented 7 items for approval and 3 items for information. He noted that motion #7, an omnibus motion, was circulated to Senators without the list of its component motions. The full motion was shown to Senators on the screen, and the Committee Chair asked Senate to waive the notice of motion for the complete omnibus (with component parts).

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, D. Mendeloff) that Senate waive the notice of motion for the complete omnibus motion, as presented. The motion **PASSED** with 2/3 majority.

Items for Approval:

SCCASP Chair Siddiqi noted that more minor modifications associated with the new program approvals will be coming to Senate via SCCASP in the fall.

Admission Requirements for new Nursing program

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, M. DeRosa) that Senate approves the revisions to Regulation TBD-2262 R-ADM-Program-BScN effective for the 2025/26 Undergraduate Calendar as presented. The motion **PASSED**.

Edit to admission regulation for BIT

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, O. Shafiq) that Senate approves the revisions to Regulation TBD-1371 R-ADM-BIT effective for the 2025/26 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Program regulations for new Nursing program

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, J. Wallace) that Senate approves the revisions to Regulation TBD-2267 R-UG-Nursing effective for the 2025/26 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Admission regulation for new Cybersecurity program

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, M. Barbeau) that Senate approves the revisions to Regulation TBD-2259 R-ADM-Program-BCSec effective for the 2025/26 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

The Committee Chair noted that the shortened name of the program has since been revised to BCyber.

Co-op admission and continuation requirements for new Cybersecurity program

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, M. Barbeau) that Senate approves the revisions to Regulation TBD-2261 R-UG-COOP-BCSec Adm and Cont Requirements effective for the 2025/26 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Admission regulation for new Data Science program

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, M. Barbeau) that Senate approves the revisions to Regulation TBD-2269 R-ADM-Program-BDS effective for the 2025/26 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Updates to various graduate regulations, due to changes to graduate governance (omnibus motion includes 6 motions, a through f)

Omnibus Moton:

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, H. Nemiroff) that Senate approves the revisions to Regulations within the Graduate Calendar as presented.

Motions within the Omnibus:

- a. MOTION: That Senate approves the revisions to Regulation R-GR-General Regulations 1. Administration of Regulations effective for the 2024/25 Graduate Calendar as presented. (replacing reference to FGPA with Graduate Studies)
- b. MOTION: That Senate approves the revisions to Regulation R-GR-3.6 Proficiency in English effective for the 2024/25 Graduate Calendar as presented. (update to admissions requirements for students coming from English-speaking universities)
- c. MOTION: That Senate approves the revisions to Regulation R-GR-7.11 Off-Campus Research effective for the 2024/25 Graduate Calendar as presented. (approvals for off-campus research now provided by Faculties instead of FGPA)
- d. MOTION: That Senate approves the revisions to Regulation R-GR-9.3 Examinations and Termwork effective for the 2024/25 Graduate Calendar as presented. (aligned to match current practice and to include line Faculties and academic units)
- e. MOTION: That Senate approves the revisions to Regulation R-GR-13.4 Leave of Absence effective for the 2024/25 Graduate Calendar as presented. (renames section to match current usage)
- f. MOTION: That Senate approves the revisions to Regulation R-GR-15 Academic Petitions and Appeals effective for the 2024/25 Graduate Calendar as presented. (changing title from Grade Review to Academic Petitions and Appeals)

A Senator requested that item (d) within the omnibus motion be pulled out. The omnibus motion without item (d) was **PASSED**.

Item (d) from the Omnibus:

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, H. Nemiroff) that Senate approves the revisions to Regulation R-GR-9.3 Examinations and Term work effective for the 2024/25 Graduate Calendar as presented.

A Senator noted that the original language of this item within the calendar referred only to delayed term work. The new language, which includes deferred exams as well, implies that the Instructor is solely responsible for reviewing and approving student requests for deferred exams. With the increase in professional

programs at the graduate level, the number of requests for these deferred exams has grown, placing additional burdens on Instructors, particularly Contract Instructors who would be responsible for proctoring and grading these exams without compensation. The Senator asked that this item be returned to SCCASP for further discussion regarding additional supports that could be provided for Instructors, or alternately, how this work could be centralized as it is for undergraduate deferred exams.

It was **MOVED** (M. Rooney, J. Mason) that revisions to Regulation R-GR-9.3 Examinations and Term work (Item (d) of omnibus motion) be returned to SCCASP for further discussion.

The Chair of SCCASP confirmed that graduate deferred exams do not follow the same system as those for undergraduate students, and that it has always been the responsibility of the Instructor to handle requests for deferred exams. He acknowledged that requests for graduate deferred exams are increasing and noted that a system will be developed as the FGPA restructuring moves into Phase 2 in 2024/25. He stated that, for the 2024/25 academic year, it is important to include in the regulations guidance for graduate students who need to apply for a deferred exam.

The motion to refer item (d) to SCCASP was **DEFEATED**.

The motion for item (d) **PASSED**.

Minor Modifications:

The committee Chair noted the following three items for information:

- Minor Modifications for Nursing program
- Change to first year grading policy
- Minor modifications for Mechatronics

c. Senate Academic Governance Committee (SAGC)

Committee Chair and Clerk of Senate Elinor Sloan presented for Senate approval 12 student nominations for 7 Senate committees, for service beginning July 1st.

It was **MOVED** (E. Sloan, N. Hagigi) that Senate ratify the nominees for Senate committees, as presented, for service beginning July 1, 2024.

The motion **PASSED**.

The Clerk next presented revised Senate Rules of Order for Senate approval. The current revision combined two older documents (Rules of Order and Annex to Rules of Order) and reorganized the content for clarity. A memo outlining changes made was circulated in advance.

The committee Chair highlighted the following major changes:

- New Quorum rule (2) – from 25% of members to 28 members, which works out to 1/3rd of membership. This is in line with practice at several other Ontario universities, and parallels the quorum at Carleton’s Board of Governors.
- Proxy vote clarified (11.2) – Proxies are not allowed, but if an individual is acting for an ex officio member of Senate, they may attend Senate in the member’s stead as a voting member.
- Online voting (11.4) – language clarified to emphasize openness and transparency in voting whether in-person or virtual.

It was **MOVED** (E. Sloan, K. Graham) that Senate approve the revised Senate Rules of Order, as presented.

Discussion:

A Senator noted that the motion regarding friendly amendments (12.2.1.3) is not in line with the definitions provided in Roberts Rules of Order or the American Institute of Parliamentarians Standard Code of Parliamentary Procedure (AIP), which both specify that the friendly amendment belongs to the floor and therefore Senate must vote on it. The Assistant University Secretary agreed that the Senate Rules of Order do not align with the AIP or Roberts Rules in this case. As the AIP acts as a guide to Senate, Senate is free occasionally to devise its own interpretations of rules of procedure. In this case, Senate has previously approved its own version of the friendly amendment rule, which is included in the current document.

Another Senator asked whether the wording of Rule 11.4 could be changed to specify that the virtual voting protocol should distinguish clearly between votes in favour and those opposed, since the raised hand option online for both in-favour

and opposed voting can be confusing and time-consuming. The Assistant University Secretary noted that Senate can pass a motion to specify an online voting protocol, without having to change the rule.

A Senator asked whether “emergency motions” or motions that are brought to Senate bypassing the normal approval process via Faculty Boards can be addressed in the Rules of Order. It was suggested that these motions should be subjected to the 2/3 majority vote that is used for motions that suspend the normal rules of order (e.g. restricting/closing debate). The Chair of SAGC responded that Senate can, in these circumstances, request that the emergency motion be sent to a committee. The Clerk agreed and added that SAGC members discussed this issue and decided that no revision of the rules to include emergency motions was required at this time.

The motion **PASSED**.

8. Motion from Senator Nir Hagigi

Senator Nir Hagigi presented a motion cited as the *Investment Review and Transparency Motion*. This motion was circulated in advance to Senators.

The Chair noted that additional materials external to the meeting binder had been circulated to Senators prior to the meeting and that these materials were not distributed by the Senate Office. Subsequently, Senators were advised not to comment on or refer to these materials.

Senator Hagigi introduced the motion. He began by providing some political context related to the conflict in Gaza. Senator Hagigi’s opening remarks focused on the destruction and loss of life experienced by Palestinians in Gaza, and specifically emphasized the destruction of Palestinian educational institutions and resources, and the killing, injuring and incarceration of Palestinian educators. He then read the motion.

Motion:

WHEREAS a global movement calling for divestment from entities complicit in human rights violations against Palestinians exists, with participation from students, faculty, and staff.

WHEREAS at least 95 academics, 5,497 students, 261 educators have been killed, and at least 625,000 school-aged children have been denied access to education for several months.

WHEREAS the Carleton University Students' Association (CUSA) and the Graduate Students' Association (GSA) have passed motions urging the University to take action regarding concerns about the University's investments.

WHEREAS a coalition of students, faculty, and other campus organizations, called *Carleton4Palestine*, has publicly issued the following demands to the University administration:

- 1. Full Disclosure of Investments:** Immediate publication of all the university's financial investments, encompassing both endowed and non-endowed funds. Going forward, the university must update and publish a list of all current investments, no later than February 1st of each year.
- 2. Immediate Divestment:** The complete divestment from corporations and entities that are complicit in human rights violations, particularly those profiting from the exploitation, surveillance, and murder of the Palestinian people.
- 3. Academic Boycott:** A separation from institutions and entities that support, participate in, or benefit from the Israeli occupation, oppression, discrimination, and genocide of Palestinians. The university should foster relationships with Palestinian educational institutions through inter-institutional cooperation, including student exchanges, infrastructure support, and library sharing. Moreover, the university must commit to establishing scholarships, fellowships, and placements for Palestinian students through programs such as *Palestinian Students & Scholars at Risk*.

WHEREAS the University of Ontario Institute of Technology, California State University Sacramento, and dozens of other institutions around the world have agreed to initiate a process to divest their funds from companies that are profiting from violations of international law.

WHEREAS Carleton University abides by a public commitment to Responsible Investment principles which outlines that:

“Managers are expected to consider all material environmental, social, and governance (ESG) factors and be mindful of the interplay between those factors when analyzing

investments. While all relevant ESG factors should be considered in investment decision-making, the following are some of the important strategic priorities for the University:

- Climate Change
- Indigenous Rights
- Human Rights, including Accessibility and LGBTQ2S+ Rights
- Diversity, Equity and Inclusion
- Mental Health and Wellness”

WHEREAS members of the Carleton University community have been personally affected by the ongoing human rights violations perpetrated against Palestinians, partly funded by Carleton University’s investments.

AND WHEREAS many members of the Carleton University community, including students, faculty, and staff, have expressed a strong interest in the transparency of the University's investment practices.

BE IT THEREFORE MOVED (N. Hagigi, L. Madokoro) that Senate:

1. Recommends the Board of Governors, Pension Committee, Pension Fund Management Office, Investment Committee, and all other relevant entities assess Carleton's investments regarding potential human rights violations against Palestinians.

2. Recommends the aforementioned entities divest from companies that are found to:

- a) Provide products or services that contribute to the maintenance of the occupation of Gaza and the West Bank, including East Jerusalem, as well as the Syrian Golan Heights;
- b) Provide products or services that contribute to the maintenance and expansion of settlements in the occupied Palestinian territories;
- c) Establish facilities or operations in Israeli settlements in the occupied Palestinian territories;
- d) Provide products or services that contribute to the maintenance and construction of the separation wall;
- e) Provide products or services that contribute to violent acts that target civilians.

3-Recommends the establishment of a transparent and accountable process for future investment decisions that abide by clear ESG criteria, including consideration around human rights violations perpetrated against Palestinians.

4-Recommends the immediate publication of all the university's financial investments, encompassing both endowed and non-endowed funds.

5-Recommends the university update and publish a list of all current investments, no later than February 1st of each year.

Discussion:

The Chair first explained the ruling on why this motion, which is not in the purview of Senate, was allowed to come to Senate. Referring to Article 22 within the Carleton University Act, which outlines the responsibilities of Senate, the Chair noted that subsection (i) allows Senate to “make such recommendations as may be deemed proper for achieving the objects and purposes of the University” which, according to Article 3 of the Act include “the advancement of learning; the dissemination of knowledge; the intellectual, social moral and physical development of its members; and the betterment of its community...” Under this broad interpretation of Senate’s responsibilities, the Chair and Senate Executive Committee ruled that the motion could come to Senate, while acknowledging that the actions being recommended in the motion are not in the purview of Senate.

The Chair also reported that he received a request from a representative of the Jewish Issues Committee to make a statement to provide additional information to Senators, and that he had granted permission for this request. Professor Shawna Dolansky, who is a subject matter expert on the history of religion within the Middle East, joined the meeting online.

Professor Dolansky provided some religious and historical context for the motion. She also spoke more specifically against the motion, noting that:

- the motion does not respect Carleton’s bicameral governance as it deals with operational and financial matters which are the purview of the Board of Governors.
- The motion potentially threatens research partnerships in the Middle East and the academic freedom of Carleton researchers; and.

- The divestment called for in the motion would include the NASDAQ and large sectors involved in AI, machine learning, and cybersecurity which are areas of interest for several of Carleton's new programs (Bachelor of Data Science, Bachelor of Cybersecurity).

Senate engaged in a discussion in which the following points were made:

- The motion provides an opportunity to consider the issue of ethical and responsible investments;
- It was asked if the motion could be revised to deal only with a review of Carleton's investments under the responsible investments policy, without specific reference to the conflict in Gaza;
- It was noted that the calls for divestment in the motion target the pension fund, however, the University does not own the pension fund, and as a result does not have the authority or means to implement the motion;
- The Chair confirmed that the pension fund belongs to plan members (retirees and full-time employees of the university), those who contribute their current or past earnings to the plan;
- The university administers the pension fund, and the retirement plan is governed through the pension committee which reports to the Board of Governors;
- Endowment funds do belong to the University but are restricted and are not within the purview of Senate to govern.
- The Chair added that the university has responsible investing policies for the endowment investments and the retirement fund that incorporate environmental social and governance (ESG) factors and a report on Carleton's responsible investing practices is presented to the Board of Governors annually. This is a public document available on Carleton's website and can be circulated directly to Senators.
- A Senator added that pensioners also receive technical information annually and are advised on how investments within the pension fund fit within the responsible investing strategy;
- A Senator questioned whether universities should be making statements and recommendations on global conflicts. By focusing on one conflict, Carleton is elevating it above any of the other conflicts occurring globally.

A Senator asked if the motion could be divided, so that Senators could vote on each recommendation in turn rather than the entire list of recommendations. Other Senators remarked that although they respect the care with which the motion has been prepared and acknowledge the importance of the issues raised, they do not have the expertise that would allow them to vote confidently on this motion or fully understand its implications. The Chair responded that that expertise on investments does exist at Carleton, and suggested that these experts be invited to the next Senate meeting to provide a technical briefing. A Senator then brought forward a motion to postpone consideration of Senator Hagigi's motion until the next Senate meeting, when Senators could receive more information from subject matter experts on Carleton's investments.

It was **MOVED** (M. DeRosa, M. Barbeau) that Senate postpone the motion to a specific time, bringing it back to Senate in September 2024.

The motion **PASSED**.

The following Senators wished their abstentions to this motion to be recorded in the minutes: J. Armstrong, A. Bordeleau, L. Madokoro, H. Nemiroff, M. Pearson, M. Rooney.

9. Reports for Information

a) Senate Executive Committee Minutes (April 23, 2024)

b) COU Academic Colleague Report

10. Other Business

Senator Nir requested a waiver of the Notice of Motion for a motion to Senate. The Clerk noted that, according to the Senate Rules of Order, a motion must satisfy all of the following requirements to be eligible for a waiver of notice:

- The motion has been received by the Clerk at or before the start of the meeting;
- The motion responds to circumstances that developed after the date for proper notice;
- The action specified in the motion cannot be delayed to permit consideration at the next meeting of Senate;
- The motion addresses an issue of importance to the University; and
- A 2/3 majority of those present agrees to waive the requirement for notice after hearing the motion read.

The Chair clarified for the benefit of Senators that the motion deals with definitions of anti-Palestinian racism and anti-Semitism to be adopted by Senate. The Chair noted that these definitions are within the purview of the Human Rights Policy of the University. The Chair then invited Noël Badiou, Associate Vice-President, Equity and Inclusive Communities, who was in attendance at the meeting, to provide information on the process for revising this policy and the definitions therein. AVP Badiou stated that the Department of Equity and Inclusive Communities is revising the Human Rights Policy, and will be reviewing definitions within the policy within the next year. He added that the department will need to consult broadly with the community regarding these definitions, and Senate will be consulted as part of the review process.

The Chair ruled the request for waiver of notice of motion as out of order, since the action can and should be delayed in order to allow Senators to have more time to consider the motion.

Senator Hagigi, then provided notice of motion for the following motion:

MOTION: that Senate recommends the immediate review and amendment of existing anti-racism policies to reflect the aforementioned definitions and to reaffirm Carleton University’s commitment to protecting students, faculty, and staff from all forms of racism and prejudice; including anti-Palestinian racism and antisemitism.

The two definitions referred to in the motion were also provided:

WHEREAS The Arab Canadian Lawyers’ Association’s Description of Anti-Palestinian racism (Version 2, April 2022) states that it is “a form of anti-Arab racism that silences, excludes, erases, stereotypes, defames, or dehumanizes Palestinians or their narratives.”

AND WHEREAS The Van Leer Jerusalem Institute’s Declaration on Antisemitism states that it is “discrimination, prejudice, hostility or violence against Jews as Jews (or Jewish institutions as Jewish).”

11. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned (C. Viau, K. Taylor) at 5:00 p.m.