



Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.

Carleton University Senate
Meeting of March 23, 2018 at 2:00 p.m.
Senate Room, Robertson Hall

MINUTES

Attending: F. Afagh, S. Blanchard, A. Bowker, D. Buss, L. Callaghan, A. Chan (acting Vice-Provost), A. Chandler, J. Cheetham, Z. Clayden, W. Clement, J. Debanné, D. Deugo, T. Di Leo Browne, C. Dion, A. Dodge, D. Dogan, L. Dyke (acting Provost), J. Erochko, M. Esponda, P. Farrell, R. Goubran, E. Grant, N. Grasse, P. Gunupudi, B. Hallgrimsson, A. Hassan, O. Javanpour, W. Jones, C. Joslin, S. Klausen, J. Kovalio, J. Liu, D. Long, K. Lumsden, A. Maheshwari, H. Nemiroff, M. Neufang, D. Nussbaum, Z. Parkkari, J. Paulson, M. Piché, A. Plourde, J. C. Prent, M. Rooney, D. Russell (Clerk), L. Schweitzer, A. Shotwell, D. Siddiqi, E. Sloan, P. Smith, S. Taylor, J. Tomberlin (Chair), C. Viju, J. Wolfart, C. Young.

Regrets: S. Ajila, A. Barclay, C. Carruthers, J. Coghill, K. Evans, J. Green, J. Hayes, E. Hitsman, W. Horn, F. Hosseinian, D. Howe, B. Hughes, H. Jay, E. Kwan, P. Lagasse, Z. Masjedee, C. Miller, J. Miller, J. Ramasubramanyam, J. Shields, J. Smith, J. Stoner, A. Summerlee, P. Watzlawik-Li,

Recording Secretary: Kathy McKinley

Welcome – Smudging

The Chair began the meeting at 2:02 pm, by introducing Zoyer Clayden, an Anishinaabe Senator, who performed a smudging ceremony for all Senators present.

At the conclusion of the ceremony, Senate moved into Closed Session briefly, for confidential business.

Open Session:

1. Welcome (Chair)

Non-Senators were welcomed back into the chamber.

2. Approval of Agenda (open)

It was **MOVED** (D. Russell, D. Deugo) that Senate approve the open agenda for the meeting of Senate on March 23, 2018, with the change to move Item 8.a. (SAPC Report) to immediately follow Item 3 (Minutes).

The motion **PASSED**.

3. Minutes: February 16, 2018 (open session)

It was **MOVED** (E. Grant, Z. Parkkari) that Senate approve the minutes of the open session of the Senate meeting of February 16, 2018, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

4. Matters Arising:

There were none.

8. Reports:

a. Senate Academic Program Committee (SAPC)

The Vice-Provost and Associate VP Academic briefly introduced the proposed new BSc in Interdisciplinary Science and Practice, a 20-credit honours and 15-credit general program with emphasis on interdisciplinarity and collaboration.

It was **MOVED** (L. Dyke, P. Smith) that Senate approve the proposed BSc in Interdisciplinary Science and Practice program to commence with effect from Fall 2019.

The motion **PASSED**.

5. Chair's Remarks

The Chair began by thanking Senator Clayden for the smudging ceremony at the beginning of the Senate meeting. Moving forward, Senate will hold a smudging ceremony once per academic year, normally at the beginning of the year. The Senate Office will consult with the Indigenous Education Council and Equity Services to ensure that proper procedures are followed and that an Indigenous Elder is engaged to perform the ceremony.

6. Question Period

Several questions were submitted in advance regarding the CUPE 2424 Support Staff strike.

Submission #1

What are the administration's plans for ensuring the continuity of academic affairs during the strike (e.g. how will exams be affected)?

Response from the Chair:

An Academic Continuity Committee meets three times a week to discuss academic affairs during the labour disruption. The meeting is led by the Vice-Provost and Associate Vice-President (Academic) and involves the Deans, the Associate Vice President (Teaching and Learning) and the Vice-President (Students and Enrolment). The Committee works together to find solutions to academic issues arising from the labour disruption. Exams will be addressed in another question below.

Submission #2

With regards to the ongoing strike, I'm wondering if we can get updates on the following practical matters:

Students in courses experiencing disruption: some students are in courses that rely on the work of CUPE 2424 staff to function. These include lab courses in the sciences and engineering, studio courses in programs such as journalism, project-based courses in history that require students to produce documentaries with the aid of IMS staff, and so on. What will the university do for the students in those courses? Will they earn their credit without completing these core components? Or have (a portion of) their tuition reimbursed? Or will their term time be extended until after the strike has been resolved? Or is there some other plan?

Response from the Chair:

Classes will continue on the normal schedule throughout the labour disruption. There is no intention to extend the term or otherwise inhibit students' ability to complete their term.

While there are some elements of course delivery that have been curtailed or adjusted in the absence of CUPE 2424 staff - such as some labs in Science and Engineering - there are alternate methods of achieving the intended learning outcomes. Our calendar descriptions and curriculum maps specify the learning outcomes - not the pedagogical methods. It is often the case that pedagogical methods differ by faculty member and over time.

One example of this type of adaptation in the current situation is in journalism. Journalism students are completing their video journalism assignments using their smartphones rather than the department's camera equipment. The students are still learning the key elements of journalistic visual storytelling but using a different method.

For courses where a portion of the grade has been allocated to affected activities such as labs in Science, the overall lab grade will be pro-rated based on the labs completed. These adjustments will be finalized by faculty at the end of the term.

Final exams for the Winter term: SES has provided updates recently regarding procedures for submitting exams, but can SES tell us if the normal services professors rely on during exams will still be in place if the strike continues into the exam period? For instance, will copies of the exams be produced and brought to the exam site for instructors? And will the routine scheduling of exam locations go forward as normal?

Response from the Chair:

Scheduling and Examination Services (SES) has communicated their processes to instructors and can resend the email to anyone who did not receive it. SES will produce copies of the exams and deliver them to the exam site provided the copy of the exam is submitted before the stated deadlines as per our regular processes. All April 2018 examinations will continue as scheduled. The locations for formally scheduled exams were posted on Friday, March 16, 2018. Questions about exam locations can be emailed to examinations@carleton.ca. There is no change to the process for proctor allocation.

Graduation applications: students must apply to graduate, and presumably that means we have staff who review transcripts and so on, confirm completion of the degree, and then authorize graduation, all of which requires staff to process. Can we get an update on this matter? Does the RO anticipate 'business as usual' in this regard, or will there be disruptions? If the latter, what is our plan to address those disruptions?

Response from the Chair:

Graduation will not be affected. The bulk of graduation preparation occurs during the month of May. We have sufficient management staff in the RO and FGPA who can review audits for graduation if that becomes necessary. In the meantime, transcripts are still being produced in a timely fashion and acknowledgement emails have been sent to students who have applied to graduate. If anyone has any questions or concerns, they can email the registrar's office.

Academic Integrity violations: I was informed that academic integrity violations will not be processed until this strike is over. This means I have students with assignments that I can't assign a grade to. How to discuss this matter with them, and how to instruct them to do engage with sources responsibly on future assignments, without raising the

accusation of plagiarism, is a tricky question. Do we have a policy for this situation? What will happen to those students who have AI violation cases pending for weeks after the term is done and their grade remains "GNA"? Presumably our associate deans will have a significant backlog to process, and that will take time. In the meantime, students will want to know 1) if they have earned the credit for the winter or fall/winter course in question and 2) if they ought to register for a summer course.

Response from the Chair:

The RO continues to process paperwork arising from academic integrity violations. Investigations of violations are proceeding through the Dean's offices as usual.

Discussion: Several Senators disputed the Chair's response and indicated that, according to their Associate Deans, the Academic Integrity process in FASS is on hold and will not be processed until after the strike. Dean Clement responded that Academic Integrity cases are being processed and they are prioritizing those that require a timely response. An update will be provided at the next Senate meeting.

Registration for summer courses: Registration for courses opens next week. Can we get an update on plans for summer registration? Will registration proceed as normal? One related matter: in my department, we depend on staff to help us promote summer courses, which typically have lower enrolment than our fall/winter courses. Without such advertisement, I worry that some of our courses might not meet the minimum enrolment number usually required of us (typically 17 or 20). I myself am scheduled to teach a summer course, and I have a syllabus ready to share, as well as posters ready to promote the course, but our CUPE 2424 staff members in the department are the gatekeepers of our WordPress page and our Twitter account. With the strike making online advertisement practically impossible, will our deans hold us to the same enrolment standard as always for summer courses?

Response from the Chair:

Summer registration is underway. Students are directed to email or visit the RO for questions relating to course registration. There is some processing work that needs to be done such as course overrides. The RO and the Deans are working collaboratively to ensure appropriate decisions are communicated to students through the regular channels. Response times may be longer than usual.

The Deans will work with instructors and departments on a case-by-case basis regarding minimum enrolment numbers in summer courses.

Undergraduate/graduate admissions offers and responses: A number of members of the Carleton community have raised this concern, since everyone understands that our jobs are tied to student enrolment. Can we get an update from someone from Admissions and FGPA regarding how our enrolment numbers are doing for this coming year, both undergraduate and graduate, and how they compare with prior years at this same time? Are admission offers still being sent out and processed? Graduate supervisors in my faculty tell me, for instance, that they can't see who has been sent an offer or its status (i.e., if it's been accepted or not). Do we have a clear picture at the

present time of our current enrolment landscape for 2018-2019 at the undergraduate and graduate levels?

Response from the Chair:

At the undergraduate level, offers are continuing to be processed. However, there is a small lag in the number of offers overall compared to last year. The management team in the admission office is reviewing areas of concern and continuing to review applications and process offers of admissions.

At the graduate level, the offers are at a similar level compared to previous years overall. The Dean of FGPA is working closely with the academic units to continue to process offers of admission.

Response from VP Students and Enrolment: For Undergraduate applications from Ontario High School students, grades are in and are being assessed. Offers are continuing to be sent out.

Response from Dean of FGPA: There is little fluctuation for PhD admissions compared to last year. We are 6.5% behind in outgoing offers of admission to our domestic Masters' applicants, but we are ahead of last year on accepted offers.

RACER access: I wrote to the library to get my access to RACER addressed, at which point I was informed that RACER has in fact been shut down for the duration of the strike. This development impacts a lot of people on this campus. As an instructor, it means I can't get access to a particular set of articles I'm looking for to develop a series of upcoming lectures. For our permanent faculty, I imagine this development represents a major disruption to their research activities. The same must be true of our students, especially at the graduate level, who are expected to engage in the kind of higher-level research that scholars must do. Can the library give us an update on this situation? Is there some plan in place to assist students and instructors who find themselves unable to access the materials they need for their lectures/research projects/assignments?

Response from University Librarian: 75 of the 105 staff normally employed at the MacOdrum Library are out on strike, including all of the staff assigned to Inter-Library Loans. 25 librarians along with 5 – 10 administrators are working to maintain services to students and faculty as best they can. At this time of year, the ILL receives between 100 and 200 requests per day. RACER is back online, but the service is reduced and staff are triaging requests. Any requests that were submitted before the strike have been rolling out. Strategies to improve service for urgent requests include:

- Purchasing books via Amazon
- Referring students to the University of Ottawa
- Securing materials from Canadian sources
- Not lending materials to other libraries, to prioritize and manage workload

The Library website has been updated to reflect these changes.

Discussion:

A Senator asked if the library will be using the regular books budget for these special purchases from Amazon. The answer was yes.

A Senator asked if ARES would be affected for the upcoming Summer semester. The University Librarian responded that reserves will be operational for summer courses.

A Senator asked if Library hours would be affected by the strike, particularly during exam period. The librarian responded that the library will be open 24/7 during exam period, as usual.

Students applying to graduate and other programs: I have seen students complaining on social media that they aren't able to get copies of their official Carleton transcripts, which they need to apply to graduate and other programs, whether internal or external to Carleton. Can the RO provide us with an update on this situation? Are student orders for transcripts being processed at this time? If not, do we have a plan in place to address this situation? Program applications are time-sensitive matters: while graduate programs are Carleton (for instance) can extend their deadlines, we have no control over application closure dates at all the other institutions Carleton's graduates might be applying to.

Response from the Chair:

There has been no impact on the processing time for transcripts. Official transcripts are being produced within 24-48 hours of a student's request through Carleton Central.

Violence/assault on the picket lines: There have been numerous reports of people on the picket lines who have been assaulted or threatened with assault by people waiting in their cars (i.e., people getting out of cars to shove/hit picketers, cars that bump into picketers, cars that swerve out into oncoming traffic and put the lives of the picketers, the private investigators who are observing the picket line, and the people in the other lanes at risk). What is the university currently doing to ensure the safety of people (commuters, picketers, pedestrians, etc.) at the entrance gates during this time? And do we have plans to change/update our security measures in light of these developments, and if so, what are they?

Response from the Chair:

The primary role of Department of University Safety officers is to ensure the safety of everyone (staff, students, and visitors). The university continues to remind students, staff and faculty to exercise patience while passing through the picket lines.

In addition to having DUS officers monitoring picket lines on an ongoing basis, the university has hired an external security firm to provide trained, provincially certified security officers. These officers are stationed in proximity to the picket lines, and are responsible for monitoring and recording picket line activity. DUS and Ottawa Police Service are constantly reviewing picket line activity and reports and deploying staffing where and when needed. One of the concerns recently identified relates to the number of incidents reported after 6:00 p.m. As a result, security staffing at the picket lines has been increased from 6:00 pm to 10:00 pm to better monitor and respond to incidents.

When an incident occurs, DUS and/or the Ottawa Police Service are notified. The circumstances are reviewed, and follow-up action is taken when required. DUS checks in regularly with picket captains and campus safety officers for any concerns or issues that they might have. CCTV camera coverage of the entrances to campus is reviewed regularly to assist in ensuring the safety of all.

Discussion:

In response to a question from the floor, the VP Finance and Administration replied that there were fewer than 6 assault incidents reported.

Submission #3

Given that the Carleton University Act states:

3. The objects and purposes of the University are:

- (a) The advancement of learning.
- (b) The dissemination of knowledge.
- (c) The intellectual, social, moral and physical development of its members, and the betterment of its community.

The current CUPE 2424 strike and the university administration's resistance to return to the bargaining table are impeding these objects and purposes. Several of my students have expressed concern that the current labour disruptions are impeding the advancement of their learning. My students, and I, would like answers to the following questions?

How does Dr. Summerlee and the administration expect students to be successful if support staff are taking legal strike action?

Response from the Chair:

The university's priority is to focus on ensuring that classes continue as scheduled and that students receive support. Their success is our highest priority.

Our student service and support offices on campus remain open to provide **core** service and support to students during this difficult time. This includes the undergraduate and graduate Registrar's Offices. The Centre for Student Academic Support (CSAS) continues to provide all services including Writing Tutorial Service and Skills Development Workshops. Health and Counselling Services remains open and our family doctors, GP psychotherapists and psychiatrists continue to provide mental health services and medical care. Walk-in appointments are available each afternoon with priority given to people with urgent mental health issues on a first-come, first-served basis. Complete information regarding reduced hours of operation and service levels for offices across the university is available on the student website.

The Library returned to regular hours as of Tuesday. Plans are in place to keep the Library open 24/7 effective April 2 in order to support students throughout the exam period.

What actual steps is the administration taking to make all support staff feel welcome and valued in the Carleton community?

Reponse from the Chair:

This is a very difficult time for the Carleton community. It is unfortunate that we are in a current labour dispute. CUPE 2424 members are highly valued and respected members of the university community, by both the administration and the greater Carleton community. We are looking forward to having the CUPE2424 staff come back to work.

Our primary efforts remain the support for our students, and their success.

I have also attached an open letter that my student, Barâa Arar, sent to Dr. Summerlee last week.

Discussion: A Senator from FASS reported that the strike is adversely affecting students and faculty in her department. A major 4th year undergraduate conference has been cancelled, a history documentary film course was cancelled, and many other events have either been cancelled or poorly attended. Some students are not having a successful term. The Chair agreed that the situation is not normal but students are being supported as much as possible. Faculty should fulfill their responsibilities to deliver their course materials. Some activities will not take place, but the core learning objectives should be covered.

Another Senator rose to echo the concern of the first Senator, asking how we define “core services.” For example, the Health & Counselling doors might be open, but are there any nurses or counsellors available to students? There have been reports of students not able to receive injections and other medical services. Counselling appointments and nursing services are cancelled according to the Health & Counselling website.

Response from VP Students & Enrolment: Appointments were cancelled. Rebooking and other options have been explored and implemented. Student may not be able to see their regular counsellors, but counsellors are available every afternoon for walk-in appointments. The website will be updated to reflect this.

Discussion:

A Senator asked for more information on the **Academic Continuity Committee**, mentioned by the Chair at the beginning of the Question Period. The Chair responded that the Academic Continuity Committee is advisory to the Provost’s office, and is not a committee of Senate. The Senator asked about the role of this committee vs. the role of Senate, and whether ensuring academic continuity is not the responsibility of Senate. The Clerk responded that Senate’s role is the academic governance of the university and the Administration has the responsibility of making that happen. The Chair confirmed that recommendations from the Academic Continuity Committee that are in the purview of Senate would be referred to Senate for decision.

Several Senators asked if external **accreditation** of programs will be an issue because of the strike. The Dean of Engineering responded that experiments and labs have been cancelled, but students are analyzing data from other sources and completing the course requirements in this way. The situation is being monitored to ensure that there will be no accreditation issues.

Paul Menton Centre accommodations was also a concern raised by Senators. Some instructors maintain that PMC is not updating instructors, and instructors are not receiving information about upcoming exam accommodations. There is a concern that the students needing these accommodations will not be properly supported. The VP Students & Enrolment responded that although the number of coordinators at the PMC is reduced, the accommodations for students

already enrolled should be in the system, and the PMC should be able to coordinate the exams for these students.

A Senator asked for an update on **graduate admissions**. The Dean of the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs responded that they are continuing to work on and monitor admissions. As an example, they are currently 6.5% behind on outgoing offers of admission to domestic Master's applicants compared to this time last year, but 17.6% ahead on accepted offers. In response to a question regarding matching offers, the Dean responded that the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs will work with graduate units to match, if deemed appropriate, competing offers from other institutions.

Another Senator noted that services are not being covered evenly from department to department. Some professors are refusing to cover duties normally assigned to a CUPE 2424 staff member. Graduate students are concerned about issues with scheduling thesis defenses.

A Senator requested that the agenda be changed to allow Other Business to be heard immediately following the Question Period.

It was **MOVED** (A. Shotwell, S. Kaussen) that the agenda be amended to move Other Business to follow immediately after Question Period, in order to consider a motion to adopt a policy on academic amnesty for students in the event of a labour disruption.

The motion required a 2/3 majority to pass.

For: 25

Against: 19

The motion was **DEFEATED**.

7. Administration (Clerk)

a. Nominations to Senate and Senate Committees

It was **MOVED** (D. Russell, J.C. Prent) that Senate ratify the new Senate and Senate Committee appointments, as presented.
The motion **PASSED**.

b. Senate Appointment to CUSA Awards Committee

It was **MOVED** (D. Russell, E. Grant) that Senate approve J. C. Wolfart as the Senate faculty member to serve on the CUSA Awards Committee.
The motion **PASSED**.

c. Ratification of CUCQA Nominees

It was **MOVED** (D. Russell, L. Dyke) that Senate ratify the 2017-18 membership of the Carleton University Committee on Quality Assurance, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

d. Review of Nomination Procedures for 2018-19

The Clerk presented an outline of the procedures that Senate follows for nominating and electing members to Senate and Senate Standing Committees.

See attached document: Senate Nominations Process.

A Senator asked if there could be nominations from the floor, and how contested positions are decided. The Clerk responded that, according to the Academic Governance of the University, the Senate Executive Committee decides on contested positions and brings forward a single nominee to Senate for approval/ratification.

Other Senators noted that members of a Faculty are not always notified after a faculty member has been chosen to serve on Senate or a Senate Committee. The Clerk agreed to propose a procedure for this at the next meeting.

8. Reports:

b. Senate Committee on Curriculum Admission and Studies Policy (SCCASP)

The Chair of SCCASP introduced 7 motions for Senate and one item for information.

1) Revisions of R-UG-2.2. The Chair noted that the document circulated to Senators for this item has been amended. The second sentence of Section 2.2 which reads:

The course outline must be made available to all Carleton students on or before the required date found in the schedule for The Academic Year, normally one week prior to the start of term.

Should read as:

*The course outline must be made available to all Carleton students **registered in that course** on or before the required date found in the schedule for The Academic Year, normally one week prior to the start of term.*

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, E. Grant) that Senate approve the amendment to R-UG-2.2 for the 2018/19 Calendar as amended. The motion **PASSED**.

2) Revisions of R-UG-2.5 Deferral of Final Examinations
This motion was WITHDRAWN.

3) BJ/BJHum program changes; update to regulations

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, W. Clement) that Senate approve the amendment to BJ/BJHum regulations for the 2018/19 Calendar as presented. The motion **PASSED**.

4) Revisions of R-UG-1.4 Withdrawal

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, E. Sloan) that Senate approve the amendment to R-UG-1.4 for the 2018/19 Calendar as presented. The motion **PASSED**.

5) Revision of Admissions requirements for B.Math

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, D. Deugo) that Senate approve the amendment to R ADM program BMath for the 2018/19 Calendar as presented. The motion **PASSED**.

8-Reports:

6) Coop regulations for B. Media Production and Design

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, A. Plourde) that Senate approve the addition of Coop regulations for BMPD for the 2018/19 Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

7) Coop regulations for Computer Systems Engineering

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, S. Blanchard) that Senate approve the amendment to Coop regulations for Computer Systems Engineering for the 2018/19 Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

8) Minor Modifications to 2018/19 Calendar were circulated to Senators for information only.

8-Reports (cont'd)

c. Senate Academic Governance Committee (Clerk)

The Senate Academic Governance Committee has outlined a policy, to clarify when and how Senate can and should use electronic voting to conduct business.

It was **MOVED** (D. Russell, Z. Clayden) that Senate approve the inclusion in the Academic Governance Document the policy on electronic voting at Senate, as presented.

Discussion:

One Senator questioned the validity of e-votes in general, as they do not allow for debate, which should be possible for every motion. The Senator asked how debate can happen, if necessary, during

an e-vote. The Clerk responded that e-voting would only be used for routine business for which there is no anticipated discussion or debate. However, if just one Senator has a substantive objection to the e-vote and feels that debate is necessary, the vote will be stopped and the matter referred to a regular Senate meeting.

Another Senator rose to publicly thank the Clerk for his work on this and other Senate governance issues over the past term. The Clerk received a round of applause from the floor.

The motion **PASSED**.

9. Reports for Information:

- a.** Academic Colleague (Jeff Smith)
There were no questions.

- b.** Senate Executive Minutes (January 16, 2018 and February 6, 2018)
There were no questions.

- c.** Election Process for Clerk of Senate (Senate Executive Committee)
There were no questions.

- d.** University Committee Membership Report (UPC)
There were no questions.

10. Other Business

Senator Shotwell asked for a motion to be added to the agenda. She noted that since 1999, York University has implemented a policy of academic amnesty for students who do not wish to cross picket lines in the event of labour disruptions at university. The proposed motion would offer something similar to students at Carleton University.

Senate voted on whether to consider this motion:

For: 24

Against: 19

Since it did not achieve 2/3 majority, Senate voted not to consider the motion.

11. Adjournment

The meeting was ADJOURNED at approximately 4:30 pm.