



*Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.*

**Carleton University Senate  
Meeting of November 30, 2018, at 2:00 pm  
Senate Room, Robertson Hall**

## **MINUTES**

**Present:** F. Afagh, F. Afaq, S. Ajila, B.A. Bacon (Chair), S. Blanchard, A. Bowker, S. Boyle, A. Chandler, J. Coghill, , B. Creary, T. Di Leo Browne, C. Dion, A. Dodge, D. Dragunoiu, L. Dyke, J. Erochko, M. Esponda, P. Farrell, R. Goubran, E. Grant, N. Grasse, P. Gunupudi, H. Gupta, B. Hallgrimsson, A. Harrison, W. Horn, B. Hughes, C. Joslin, S. Klausen, J. Kovalio, S. Kroff, B. Kuzmarov (Clerk), E. Kwan, P. Lagasse, A. Maheshwari, R. Mckay, M. Neufang, D. Nussbaum, D. Oladejo, J. Paulson, M. Piché, A. Plourde, M. Qalinle, J. Ramasubramanyam, P. Rankin, M. Rooney, L. Schweitzer, W. Shi, S. Shires, A. Shotwell, D. Siddiqi, P. Smith, J. Stoner, T. Tandon, J. Tomberlin, C. Viju, K. von Finckenstein, J P. Watzlawik-Li, J. Wolfart

**Regrets:** C. Cruickshank, K. Evans, J. Hayes, W. Jones, C. Macdonald, H. Nemiroff, E. Sloan, J. Smith, C. Trudel

**Absent:** S. Angulo, J. Cheetham, F. Hosseinian, D. Howe, J. Liu, N. Nanos, B. Popplewell

**Recording Secretary:** K. McKinley

**Guests:** George Duimovich (Library)

---

The Chair opened the meeting at 2:02 p.m.

### **1. WELCOME & APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The Chair noted that Item 7c (Reports – Library Committee) should be struck from the agenda, as the Chair of the Library Committee is unable to attend this meeting.

It was **MOVED** (L. Schweitzer, E. Grant) that Senate approve the agenda of the Senate meeting on November 30, 2018 with this change.  
The motion **PASSED**.

## **2. MINUTES – OCT. 19, 2018 – Open Session**

It was **MOVED** (S. Blanchard, L. Dyke) that Senate approve the minutes of the Open Session of the Senate meeting on Oct. 19, 2018, as presented.  
The motion **PASSED**.

## **3. MATTERS ARISING**

- The Chair noted that the update requested from SCCASP regarding Calendar language will be brought to Senate at the next meeting, since the Chair of SCCASP is absent.
- The Chair also announced that the joint holiday reception with the Board of Governors has been postponed to Spring 2019.

## **4. CHAIR'S REMARKS**

The Chair presented the following updates of recent events and developments at Carleton:

- Fall Convocation on November 10:
  - Over 1,000 students graduated.
  - The President was installed at the morning ceremony.
  - A number of Indigenous elements were added and well received: Indigenous drumming to accompany the student procession, and an Eagle Feather Ceremony and Honour Song that were featured in the Installation.
- New and Recent Experiential Learning initiatives:
  - 200+ individuals participated in the Experiential Learning Symposium on October 23
  - A new CU Experiential Learning Fund was announced by the Provost
  - Spratt is expanding its Project-Based Learning Initiative
  - Stories North Program with Journalism Professor Kanina Holmes sent 21 students to the Yukon and Northern British Columbia to listen to and provide platforms for First-Nation stories.

- 25 Undergraduate Students from Carleton began biotechnology internships in collaboration with the National Research Council.
- Research Successes:
  - Chancellor's Professor Chris Burn received the Governor General's Canadian Polar Medal, for his outstanding work in the polar regions and Canada's North.
  - Carmen Robertson has been appointed Canada Research Chair in North American Indigenous Visual and Material Culture.
  - Manuella Vincter (Physics) has been inducted into the Royal Society of Canada.
  - Lenore Fahrig (Biology) received the prestigious Romanowski medal from the Royal Society of Canada.
  - Carleton will co-host the Royal Society Gala next year.
- Update on Searches:
  - The Provost Search is progressing well. The committee will review a long list of candidates in December, and will move to the short list and interviews in the winter term.
  - Three decanal searches, led by the Provost, are in progress.
- Recruitment Update:
  - Over 800 high schools have been visited by the Recruitment team
  - 2500 offers have been sent out already.
- The President and Provost have completed a tour of all of the Faculty Boards to answer questions about academics, research, infrastructure, budgets, technology, and other issues.

The Chair concluded by thanking his team, the Board of Governors, and the Senate for a successful and enjoyable transition period. A special thank-you was offered to Senate and the Senate Task Force for the progress made on the Freedom of Speech Policy. Finally, the Chair wished all student Senators the best of luck with their exams.

## 5. QUESTION PERIOD

No questions were submitted in advance.

## 6. SENATE ADMINISTRATION

### a) Senate and Senate Committee Membership Ratification

The Clerk presented the list of new Senate and Senate committee nominees, and noted that all proper procedures were followed in bringing the names to Senate.

It was **MOVED** (B. Kuzmarov, C. Dion) that Senate ratify the new Senate and Senate Committee appointments, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

### b) Senate Committee Review

The Clerk of Senate announced that the Senate Office is beginning a comprehensive review of Senate Standing Committees. It is believed the last review of Senate committees was undertaken by the Clerk of Senate in 2011-12. The process will begin with a benchmarking study of Senate committee structures at other Ontario universities, and an archival review of the history of Carleton's current committees. An update on this research will be provided to Senate in January.

## 7. REPORTS

### a) Senate Academic Program Committee (SAPC) (J. Tomberlin)

Four major modifications to Graduate programs were brought to Senate plus two Final Assessment Reports for cyclical reviews.

Major Modifications - Individual Motions:

It was **MOVED** that Senate approve the major modifications to the Master of Social Work program as presented with effect from Fall 2019.

It was **MOVED** that Senate approve the introduction of the specialization in Digital Humanities to the Master of Cognitive Science program as presented with effect from Fall 2019.

It was **MOVED** that Senate approve the introduction of the specialization in Data Science to the Master of Arts in Geography program as presented with effect from Fall 2019.

It was **MOVED** that Senate approve the deletion of the Master of Business Administration with concentration in International Development Management and specialization in African Studies program, as presented with effect from Fall 2019.

Major Modifications - Omnibus Motion:

The modifications were combined into a single omnibus motion.

It was **MOVED** (J. Tomberlin, F. Afagh) that Senate approve the major modifications above as presented with effect from Fall 2019. The motion **PASSED**.

#### Final Assessment Reports

It was **MOVED** (J. Tomberlin, A. Plourde) that Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the undergraduate programs in Criminology & Criminal Justice. The motion **PASSED**.

It was **MOVED** (J. Tomberlin, A. Plourde) that Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the Master of Political Management.

Discussion: A Senator noted an item in the Action Plan regarding the MPM Donor Advisory Committee and asked for clarification of the committee's role in the academic program. The Dean of FPA responded that this committee ensures that the provisions of the donor are met but has no direct role in the academic program. It was further noted that this provision was included in the quality assurance documentation at the request of the external reviewers.

The motion **PASSED**.

#### **b) Senate Academic Governance Committee**

The Carleton Academic Student Government (CASG) is proposing a number of changes to its constitution. The Senate Academic Governance Committee has reviewed these changes and is presenting them to Senate for approval.

A document with tracked changes and a concordance detailing the changes were circulated in advance to Senators.

The President of CASG noted that in addition to a number of language updates and grammatical changes, new provisions were added to allow for more Senate oversight.

It was **MOVED** (B. Kuzmarov, E. Grant) that Senate approve the changes to the Constitution of the Carleton Academic Student Government, as presented.

Discussion: A Senator commended CASG for the detailed explanation of changes, but asked for clarification of how Senate would be able to oversee the activities of CASG. The President of CASG noted in response that there is overlapping membership between the two bodies: Senate representation on CASG exists, and student representatives on Senate are also CASG members. It was also noted that increased Senate oversight provides CASG with greater accountability and transparency.

The motion **PASSED**.

## **8. TASK FORCE ON FREE SPEECH POLICY (Chair, Clerk)**

The Chair thanked all members of the Task Force for their time, energy and thoughtful collegial work on the policy. The Chair also thanked Senate for electing a strong and effective Task Force and for providing them with clear direction and feedback.

The Clerk thanked the President for entrusting Senate with this important task. The Clerk provided an overview of the process and an update on the progress of the Task Force:

- On August 30, 2018, the Premier's Office issued a statement advising all Ontario colleges and universities to develop a Free Speech Policy and to post it publicly by January 1, 2019.
- The statement from the Premier's Office contained 8 points to be included in the policy, and stated that universities not in compliance with the directive could face funding cuts.
- Senate discussed the issue on September 28, 2018, and established a Task Force comprised of two student members, three faculty members, 1 contract instructor and the Clerk of Senate, to draft the policy.

- The Task Force met on October 5 and 12 to establish a general direction for the policy, and to review, line by line, a rough draft.
- The draft policy was circulated to Senate in advance of the October 19 meeting, when Senate was asked to move the draft forward to the consultation phase.
- The draft was made public on October 23, and a forum for comments was included on the website. The Carleton community was invited to provide commentary on the draft between October 23 and November 6.
- The Task Force reconstituted on November 9 and 16, where comments were reviewed, and general directions for revisions were suggested. A revised draft was created and a response document to the main themes identified in the comments was also prepared.
- The revised draft and response document have been circulated to Senate for review in advance of this meeting.

Feedback received included 136 written comments. The general consensus in the feedback was that the policy was on the right track. Common themes and concerns expressed in the comments have been addressed in the response document, which explains the choices made in revising the policy. The Clerk stressed that this policy is a framework document designed to enhance Carleton's strong structure of existing policies that manage free speech issues.

A member of the Free Speech Task Force noted that the policy demonstrates that freedom of speech is valued at Carleton, including the freedom to disagree and dissent. In approving this policy, Senate is also approving a process by which diverse stakeholders came together in an inclusive way, examined diverse viewpoints, and were able to work to craft a policy within a tight timeline.

It was **MOVED** (B. Kuzmarov, K. von Finckenstein) that Senate approve the Freedom of Speech policy, as presented.

Discussion: A Senator noted that the policy specified student compliance in several sections; she asked why students seem to be singled out in this way. The responder noted that student groups were mentioned in the policy to meet the specific criteria of the provincial mandate, which included a focus on students and student groups.

Another Senator pointed out that according to the Freedom of Speech policy, student organizations that do not comply with the policy would lose financial support or recognition. It was noted, however, that this provision already exists in the Student Organization Accreditation Policy, which specifies the university's

right to revoke accreditation to any student group on campus in violation of a given policy on campus. The Vice-President of Students & Enrolment added that there are mechanisms in place currently for student groups and clubs to discuss these issues with the Director of Student Affairs and to resolve any potential complaints in a collaborative process, without the need to move to de-accreditation.

A Senator asked how this policy might reflect the relationship between Carleton University and the provincial government. In response, it was noted that universities are not historically creatures of the government, even though they are publically funded. The Task Force on the advice of legal counsel suggested that the best practice is not to anchor the policy in the government directive, which could result in ancillary legal effects in the years to come. Instead, the policy references the Carleton Act itself, which reflects Carleton's historic and ongoing approach to these issues.

Senators also discussed the issue of academic freedom and its relationship to the policy. It was noted that whether or not they are referenced in the policy, collective agreements with CUASA and CUPE 4600 guarantee the protection of academic freedom to instructors in those unions. The policy does not take away that freedom. The Freedom of Speech policy is designed to mesh with and support existing policies on campus, including collective agreements.

A Senator cited specific examples of problematic speakers at US campuses that directly endangered students and mobilized racist sentiments; she asked how Carleton would use this policy to respond in a similar case. Respondents noted that comparisons to situations on campuses in the United States is problematic, as Ontario campuses operate under a different legal framework grounded in Ontario Human Rights law, and there are different levels of protection for speech in Canada. The policy is designed as a framework to support the decision-making process in individual cases, by engaging with the existing policies relevant to that situation, such as the Human Rights Policy, Booking Space on Campus Policy, or campus safety regulations. Free speech must always be balanced against safety and security, and cannot jeopardize the operations of the university.

In response to another question, the Clerk noted that any speech tied to Carleton University in a meaningful way would still be subject to the same limits under Ontario Human Rights Law, whether or not that speech occurs in physical or digital space.



Finally, it was noted that the reporting process has yet to be finalized as guidelines have not been released by the government.

The motion **PASSED**, with 0 opposed, and 2 abstentions.

## **9. REPORTS FOR INFORMATION**

The following items were circulated to Senators for information:

- a) Senate Executive Minutes: October 9, 2018
- b) Revised Carleton University Bylaws  
Revisions to the Bylaws were made to reflect changes to the AGU, which came through Senate in 2017-18, and to make the Bylaws in agreement with the AGU. These revisions will be presented to the Board of Governors for approval in March of 2019.
- c) Dominican University College - Minor Modifications
- d) Calendar language for Graduate programs in Migration and Diaspora Studies
- e) Calendar language for Graduate programs in Linguistics, Documentation, and Revitalization

The CourseLeaf entries were omitted from the SAPC memos circulated for the October Senate meeting. They are included here for information only, since the calendar language for the new programs has been approved.

There was no discussion.

## **10. OTHER BUSINESS**

There was none.

## **11. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned (M. Qalinle, E. Grant) at 3:45 pm.