



*Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.*

**Carleton University Senate  
Meeting of April 30, 2021 at 2:00 pm  
Via Videoconference**

**MINUTES**

**Present:** A. Ahmad, S. Ajila, K. AlWazir, V. Asi, B.A. Bacon (Chair), M. Baez, M. Barbeau, O. Baysal, S. Blanchard, A. Bowker, D. Brown, J. Bruno, A. Chandler, M. Close, J. Dawson, D. Deugo, D. Dragunoiu, M. Gagne, K. Schwartz (proxy for R. Goubran), S. Gulati, M. Haines, B. Hallgrimsson, K. Hellemans, C. Joslin, J. Kovalio, B. A. Kuzmarov (Clerk), A. Lannon, C. Laurendeau, K. Lucas, A. Luko, M. Lundy, C. Macdonald, B. MacLeod, S. Maguire, R. McKay, H. Nemiroff, B. O'Neill, J. Paulson, M. Piché, B. Popplewell, P. Rankin, M. Rooney, D. Russell, S. Sadaf, J. Sinclair-Palm, S. Sivathayalan, E. Sloan, P. Smith, D. Sprague, N. Tilokani, J. Tomberlin, A. Tremblay, C. Trudel, L. Tsintsadze, C. Viju, K. von Finckenstein, J. Voordouw, J. Wallace, P. Wilson, J. Wolfart, P. Wolff,

**Regrets:** G. Garland, L. Kostiuik, E. Kwan, J. Milner, J. Taber,

**Absent:** N. Bruni, T. Daniels, C. Davis, D. Edi, P. Garcia, G. Garland, D. Gillberg, O. Hobbs, F. Hosseinian, J. Moore, J. Stoner, R. S. Sundarraj, K. Taylor, K. Weary, B. Wright, W. Ye

**Guests (Presenters):** L. Dyke, T. Frost

**Recording Secretary:** K. McKinley

---

## **1. Welcome & Approval of Agenda**

The Chair welcomed Senators to the meeting at 2:02 pm. He began by thanking all Senators for completing a successful academic year and for meeting the considerable challenges created by the pandemic.

The Chair noted that this would be the last Senate meeting for four student ex officio members: CASG President Matthew Gagne, CUSA President Kathleen Weary, GSA President Namrata Tilokani, and GSA Vice-President Academic Victoria Asi. The Chair thanked all for their service on Senate.

Senator Millie Close was recently honoured with the Board of Governors Award for Outstanding Community Achievement. This award recognizes student volunteerism and community contribution while at Carleton. The Chair congratulated Millie on this achievement.

In moving to the agenda, the Chair noted one small correction under Reports for Information – Senate Executive Minutes (Item 11a).

It was **MOVED** (N. Tilokani, A. Bowker) that Senate approve the agenda for the meeting of Senate on April 30, 2021, as amended.

The motion **PASSED**.

## **2. Minutes: March 26, 2021**

It was **MOVED** (J. Paulson, M. Close) that Senate approve the minutes of the Senate meeting of March 26, 2021, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

## **3. Matters Arising**

The Chair updated Senators on the case of Cihan Erdal, the Carleton PhD student who currently is imprisoned in Turkey. The Kobani Trial of 108 defendants, including Cihan, began on April 26<sup>th</sup>. Cihan has not yet been called, and the trial has been adjourned until May 3. Carleton is following the situation closely, along with the Canadian Embassy in Turkey and Global Affairs Canada.

The Chair also provided a brief update on Laurentian University, which was declared insolvent on February 1 and has filed for creditor protection. As part of the restructuring process, several programs have been cut, and some staff, managers and faculty members have lost their jobs. The provincial government has appointed an independent observer, Alan Harrison, who has been asked to produce a report. The Chair expressed his sympathies for faculty, staff and students at Laurentian in facing this difficult situation.

## **4. Chair's Remarks**

The Chair announced that beginning on May 5, 2021, Carleton's Health and Counselling Services will be offering appointments for AstraZeneca Covid-19 vaccinations to eligible people aged 40 and over. Priority will be given to: patients who are registered with the Health and Counselling clinic; faculty, staff and approved

contractors currently on campus; and faculty and staff who will be gradually returning to campus for the fall term beginning in August. The Chair thanked VP Students and Enrolment Suzanne Blanchard and Director of Health and Counselling Kristie Tousignant, for their work in making this opportunity possible. An official announcement to the community will be made on Monday. In response to a question from the floor it was noted that vaccines have been received and currently there are no supply issues at the clinic. In related news, the provincial government has announced that by the end of May 2021, all Ontario residents over the age of 18 will be eligible to receive vaccination.

The Chair provided the following updates on recent events and activities:

- On March 30<sup>th</sup>, the Faculty of Science and the Institute for Data Science hosted the 7<sup>th</sup> annual Data Day Conference. Carleton welcomed researchers, industry experts and panelists to showcase new developments in data science. A highlight of the event was the announcement of a partnership with IBM Canada, one of the sponsors of the event.
- Carleton's fourth annual Life Sciences Day was held on April 6<sup>th</sup>. This year's virtual event brought together academic, government and industry sectors and focussed heavily on mental health.
- On April 29<sup>th</sup>, Carleton announced a research partnership on embedded software systems with BlackBerry QNX.

The Chair extended congratulations to the following Carleton individuals for their achievements:

- Chancellor's Professor Lenore Fahrig has been awarded a prestigious Guggenheim Fellowship for her ground-breaking research in biodiversity conservation.
- Carleton alumna Helen Thai has received one of only 20 McCall MacBain Scholarships for graduate studies. She plans to use the scholarship to study Clinical Psychology at McGill University.
- Sociology undergraduate student Felicity Hauwert is one of just 10 students in Canada to receive the 2021 3M National Student Fellowship Award, for outstanding leadership.

Finally, the Chair congratulated all recent recipients of the Carleton Achievement Awards, including Senator Shazia Sadaf, who received a professional achievement award for professional librarians and instructors. The Achievement Awards are presented annually to members of Carleton's academic staff in recognition of research and teaching distinction.

In response to a question from the floor, the Chair confirmed that Contract Instructors would be eligible to receive the AstraZeneca vaccines at Health and Counselling Services on campus. Priority will be given first to older members of our community, but by the end of May all members of the Carleton community returning to campus will be able to book an appointment.

## 5. Question Period

Two questions regarding the CUSP recommendations for Fall 2021 were submitted in advance by Senator Morgan Rooney. The Chair noted that Senator Rooney agreed to allow these questions to be addressed during the CUSP discussion/presentation later in the agenda.

## 6. Administration (Clerk)

### a) Senate membership ratifications

The Clerk presented a memo to ratify four new faculty members from FASS and one undergraduate student as new Senators, beginning July 1, 2021.

It was **MOVED** (P. Rankin, J. Paulson) that Senate ratify the following new Senate appointments, as presented, for terms beginning July 1, 2021.

The motion **PASSED**.

### b) Senate Survey Final Appeal

The Clerk encouraged members who have not responded to the 2021 Senate Survey to do so at their earliest convenience. The survey closes at midnight on April 30, 2021. The Clerk also noted that a Senate Committee survey will be launched in early May; Senators serving on committees are encouraged to respond to this inaugural survey.

### c) Call for annual committee reports

Senate committee Chairs were reminded that committee annual reports are due for the next Senate meeting on May 28, 2021.

## 7. Reports

### a) SCCASP (H. Nemiroff)

The Chair of SCCASP presented two items for approval and three items for information. A memo was circulated in advance.

#### Items for Approval:

Both items pertain to admissions language associated with programs previously approved by Senate.

R-ADM-Program-C. Science Policy

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, P. Wolff) that Senate approves the regulations for R-ADM Certificate in Science Policy effective for the 2021/22 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

R-ADM-Program-B. Com

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, E. Sloan) that Senate approves the revisions to regulations R-ADM-Program-B. Com effective for the 2021/22 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Items for Information:

- Minor modifications to course programs (April 2021)
- Modifications to the Academic Year Winter 2022 – Social Work deadline
- Update to glossary definition of Honours Bachelor Program and Bachelor Program

There were no questions or comments from Senators for these items.

**b) SQAPC (D. Deugo)**

The committee Chair presented two major modifications and one new program for Senate approval.

Major Modifications:

The Chair combined the two major modifications into one omnibus motion.

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, M. Close) that Senate approve the major modifications as presented below with effect from Fall 2022.

The motion **PASSED**.

Individual Motions:

MOTION: That Senate approve the introduction of the Artificial Intelligence and Machine Learning Stream to the BCS Honours program as presented with effect from Fall 2022.

MOTION: That Senate approve the introduction of the Certificate in Science Communication as presented with effect from Fall 2022.

New Program Approval:

The new programs in Building Engineering will include a Master of Applied Science, a Master of Engineering and a PhD. All three will offer optional concentrations in Building Performance, Fire Safety, and Heritage Conservation. The new programs will address perceived gaps in training opportunities and anticipated employer needs.

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, S. Sivathayalan) that Senate approve the proposed graduate programs in Building Engineering.

The motion **PASSED**.

**c) SAGC (B. Kuzmarov)**

At its meeting on April 16, 2021, the Senate Academic Governance Committee reviewed a number of nominations for Senate committees from both faculty and students. A memo was circulated in advance with a list of 19 new Senate committee appointments recommended by SAGC.

It was **MOVED** (S. Ajila, N. Tilokani) that Senate ratify the following new Senate committee appointments, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

The Clerk also reminded Senators that vacancies remain on several Senate committees, including some that must be filled by Senators. She encouraged Senators to apply.

The Senate Academic Governance Committee also reviewed a number of Senate policies, including the *Senate Policy on Hosting Student Elections*. SAGC members recommend that this policy be transferred to the Office of the Secretariat, since the responsibilities outlined in the policy pertain to administrative duties within the Secretariat. In response to a question, the Clerk noted that changes to the policy moving forward would continue to be managed within the Secretariat Office, as per current practice. She also remarked that the Senate Office is not mandated to run student elections and performs this service for student academic societies as a courtesy; the policy outlines primarily who is eligible for this service and what the Senate Office needs from societies in order to run their elections.

It was **MOVED** (B. Kuzmarov, M. Close) that Senate approve the transfer of the Senate Policy on Hosting Student Elections to the Office of the Secretariat.

The motion **PASSED**.

## 8. Carleton University Scenario Planning (CUSP) Recommendations for Fall 2021

The Chair introduced this item and briefly summarized the CUSP Working Group's progress over the past few months. CUSP Chair Lorraine Dyke then provided a brief summary of the CUSP recommendations for Fall 2021 to Senate. A full CUSP report (Planning for Fall 2021: A Gradual and Safe Return to Campus) and memo were circulated to Senators in advance.

In developing the recommendations, CUSP considered five key factors:

- COVID case trends
- Vaccination progress
- Public health restrictions
- Travel restrictions
- Students' willingness to continue online education

For Fall 2021, it is likely that increasing rates of vaccinations will result in a decrease in cases, hospitalizations and deaths. As a result, public health restrictions should be lifted gradually and progressively, which will allow for a significant return to on-campus activity. By Winter 2022, vaccination programs should be completed which will allow for normal campus activity. However, since international students still may not be able to participate in face-to-face activities, online options will be necessary to accommodate them for both Fall 2021 and Winter 2022 semesters.

In considering all of these factors, and following extensive consultations with various stakeholder groups, the CUSP Working Group developed the following set of recommendations for academic planning in Fall of 2021:

- Both face-to-face and online learning opportunities should be available at all levels of every program.
- Classroom capacities should be in line with physical distancing requirements; sections with more than 60 students should use online delivery.
- Face-to-face delivery should be prioritized for courses based on learning outcomes, pedagogy and students' choice.
- Individual faculty and staff should be provided with reasonable accommodations were needed for medical, family status, or other human rights grounds.

In addition to the recommendations from the CUSP Working Group, the Return to Campus Committee and the Carleton University Flexibility Arrangements Working Group have been developing guidelines for the transition back to campus post-

pandemic. All three groups are working in close collaboration to ensure that the transition back to campus is safe and successful.

Questions / Discussion:

Senator Rooney submitted two questions in advance related to the CUSP recommendations. The first question asked whether "*as a matter of uniform policy Carleton management will accept employees' concerns about their and/or their family members' incomplete vaccination status as grounds for granting all requests for accommodation to continue working remotely.*" Dr. Dyke noted that accommodations must be addressed on a case-by-case basis and that Carleton is obligated by law to take into consideration individual circumstances. She also noted that the vaccine timetable on which the question is predicated has been updated. Adults 18+ will be able to book their first shot by the end of May, and Health and Counselling Services will be booking vaccination appointments for the campus community beginning the first week in May. In addition, recent federal modelling suggests that once 75% of adults have received their first dose, and 25% have received the second dose of the vaccine, a resurgence of the virus should be prevented. The Chief Public Health Officer of Canada has indicated that this situation should be achieved sometime this summer, and possibly by the end of June. Even with this improved outlook, public health guidelines will continue to be followed to protect those who are returning to campus this fall, whether or not they have been fully vaccinated.

The second question submitted by Senator Rooney asked if the commitment to accommodating faculty members extends to Contract Instructors, and whether CIs, in consultation with their Chairs would be able to change the modality of a course from F2F to online (and vice versa) after May 24<sup>th</sup>. In response, Dr. Dyke indicated that Chairs are encouraged to accommodate instructor preference for course modality where these preferences can be aligned with program delivery requirements. The primary consideration for course delivery format, within capacity restraints, should be learning outcomes, pedagogy and choice for students. Units have known since early April which courses they plan to offer online and which courses they expect to be able to hold on campus, so CIs should be aware of the expected mode of delivery when they apply for these opportunities. Finally, Dr. Dyke noted that the burden of responsibility for face-to-face delivery is slightly more heavily weighted to full-time faculty rather than Contract Instructors. The Chair affirmed that Carleton will continue to adopt a flexible and responsive mindset in managing the transition, including requests from individual instructors.

Another Senator expressed concern over the mandate for both F2F and online options to be available at all levels of all programs. This could be challenging for small programs and lean units to implement. In response it was noted that not all courses will



be available online, but enough courses should be available for students to make progress in their programs should they not be able to return to campus. The expectation is that students who are able to, should be prepared to come to campus and that there will be options in every program for face-to-face course delivery.

A Senator asked about the data regarding international students and whether this total might be greater than the 15% stated in the presentation, given the growth in international enrolment over the past decade. Dr. Dyke responded that this figure has been provided by OIRP, but that the percentage will differ across the university according to the individual program.

A Senator expressed some concern over the assumption that faculty members would feel safe returning to campus after receiving just one dose of the vaccine. Dr. Dyke agreed that 100% immunity does not exist, even after two doses of the vaccine, but research indicates substantial immunity is achieved after just one dose. She cited the data from the United Kingdom, where Covid-19 cases dropped significantly once approximately 40% of the population received just one dose. Canadian federal government modelling indicates that community transmission (and hence risk) will drop precipitously once 75% of the population has received a single dose of the vaccine and 20% have received two doses. However, whether or not instructors have received one or two doses of the vaccine, Carleton will continue to rely on public health guidelines to protect the community in the back-to-campus transition.

More questions related to modes of course delivery were raised by Senators. One Senator asked if faculty members would be expected to offer both online and face-to-face delivery simultaneously, for the same course. Another Senator asked about the role of CUOL, which has been used in the past for distance learning. Dr. Dyke noted that the Hyflex model allows for simultaneous F2F and online delivery, and that this capacity will be available for some courses, but its use is optional and will be up to the discretion of the instructor. CUOL is not recommended as the most effective model for online courses, since it results in long recordings which are less engaging for students. Other options including blended learning or a cohort approach are being considered. As of now, there is no campus-wide recommendation or directive for a blended approach.

In response to a question about residences, it was noted that no final decision has been on the number of students who will be housed on campus, but that residences will not be filled to capacity. The goal is to have enough space for first year students to satisfy the first-year residence guarantee, and that there would be space for upper year students who are already admitted.

The Chair thanked Vice-Provost Lorraine Dyke and her team at CUSP for their diligent work and all of the supporting teams for their leadership in designing a course schedule in this complex environment. The Chair emphasized that the situation, in particular with regards to vaccination, is still evolving, and let Senators know that there will be opportunities to further discuss matters related to a safe and gradual return to campus at the next Senate meeting.

It was **MOVED** (J. Tomberlin, J. Paulson) that Senate confirm that Fall 2021 courses at Carleton be offered through a mix of face-to-face and online delivery in line with the recommendations of the Carleton University Scenario Planning Working Group. The motion **PASSED**.

## 9. 2021-22 Operating Budget Presentation

Provost Jerry Tomberlin presented a report for Senate on the 2021-22 Operating Budget. He noted that the budget was approved by the Board of Governors on April 29, 2021, and that the full report to the Board is available on the Board of Governors website for Senators to review.

The Provost began by reviewing the planning cycle, planning principles and prioritization process involved in drafting the annual operating budget. The planning process for 2021-22 also incorporated scenario planning, since the full impact of the pandemic on the university's budget is not yet known.

The scenario planning began with an environmental scan that considered the following elements:

- Large provincial government deficits that will continue moving forward
- Family and Student government support from the Federal Government, which has been generous
- OSAP and Tuition Fee Framework (assuming tuition fees will remain frozen)
- Corridor Funding Model, which is anticipated to continue (i.e. no provincial funding for growth)
- Performance-based provincial funding, which currently is on hold
- COVID related constraints, particularly those pertaining to international travel

Total enrolment numbers for the 2020-21 academic year were strong, despite some effects from the pandemic on new first-year undergraduate enrolment. At 32,116, the total student enrolment numbers for the 2020-21 academic year were the largest ever in Carleton's history.

First-year applicant numbers for 2021-22 have declined, by 4.7%. However, applications locally from Ottawa are up by 5.2% and the conversion rate (registrations as

percentage of applications) in Ottawa is 40% compared to 17% in Ontario and 9% outside of Ontario. Approvals also show an increase over last year's numbers.

Taking all of these factors into consideration, the budget planning group developed three scenarios for 2021-22:

- Optimistic: intake levels are the same or better than 2020-21, and growth returns in subsequent years
- Cautious: 3% intake decline from 2020-21 levels in UG domestic and international enrolment, with growth returning in subsequent years
- Pessimistic: 5% intake decline from 2020-21 levels in UG domestic and international enrolment, with growth returning in subsequent years.

The elements of the cautious scenario seem most likely with a continuation of the corridor funding model, frozen tuition fees, and a modest undergraduate application decline for 2021-22. International enrolment would continue to be impacted in 2021-22, but would rebound eventually.

To mitigate financial risk moving forward, the university is proposing the following strategy:

- Base budget allocations will be conservative
- RPCs will be encouraged to use existing carry forward.
- New positions (staff, faculty) will be supported by fiscal funding only upon hire.
- The university will set aside \$6.8M for future strategic allocations.
- The university will continue to set aside a COVID-related contingency.

Operating Budget:

The revenue and expenses of the 2021-22 operating budget are \$515M, which is an increase of \$13M from 2020-21. Government grants account for approximately 34% of revenues. Domestic tuition contributes 36% and international tuition fees represent 24% of revenues. Approximately 70% of expenses are devoted to salaries and benefits, with an additional 11% for infrastructure and 8% for student support.

Allocations of \$19.6M in base and \$37M in fiscal are recommended for RPCs, university budgets and contingencies. The Provost provided an extensive and detailed breakdown of budget priorities for these allocations.

A Senator asked if the budget can be revised if, for example, the provincial government ends the freeze on tuition. The Chair responded, indicating that although the scenario named is unlikely, it would be possible to take a revised budget to the Board if necessary.

In response to another question, it was indicated that research revenue, ancillaries and fundraising revenue are not reflected in the operating budget.

The Provost indicated that the slides from the presentation will be shared with Senators. The Chair thanked the Provost and his team for their work on the budget.

## 10. Reputational Enhancement Project Update

Due to time constraints, the Chair suggested that this item be tabled until the June 18<sup>th</sup> meeting.

It was **MOVED** (D. Dragunoiu, J. Wolfart) that Senate table this motion to the next Senate meeting on May 28, 2021.

The motion **PASSED**.

## 11. Reports for Information

- a) Senate Executive Minutes (March 16, 2021)
- b) Faculty Gender Equity Report
- c) Academic Colleague Report

A Senator asked if any effort was made to include trans and non-binary persons in the Gender Equity Report. The Provost responded that this data has not been tracked but the OIRP is investigating ways to make this report a more fulsome and inclusive account of gender identity at the faculty level.

## 12. Other Business

A Senator asked if guidance could be provided for compassionate grading at the graduate level. The Dean of FGPA indicated that this will be discussed at the next graduate faculty board meeting and a report will be brought back to Senate at the next meeting.

A Senator asked if the increase in tuition fees for international students, as seen in the university's budget, might be harmful to Carleton's reputation abroad. The Chair first clarified that the international tuition fee framework was approved over a year ago and that the 2021-22 budget does not include any new approvals of tuition increases. He added that the university is considering a number of factors in establishing international tuition fees, including recruitment considerations, market comparators, and the financial circumstances of international students.

### **13. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:02 pm.