



Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.

**Carleton University Senate
Meeting of January 31, 2020 at 2:00 pm
Senate Room, Robertson Hall**

MINUTES – OPEN SESSION

Present: S. Ajila, B.A. Bacon (Chair), M. Barbeau, S. Blanchard, A. Bowker, D. Brown, J. Bruno, N. Cappuccino, A. Chandler, J. Cheetham, C. Cruickshank, T. Daniels, J. Deaville, D. Deugo, D. Dragunoiu, K. Evans, P. Farrell, D. Gillberg, R. Goubran, P. Gunupudi, M. Haines, B. Hallgrimsson, O. Hobbs, B. Hughes, K. Hellemans, C. Joslin, L. Kostiuik, Z. Kryworuchka, E. Kwan, B. A. Kuzmarov (Clerk), A. Lannon, J. Liu, C. Macdonald, H. Nemiroff, D. Nussbaum, S. Parathundiyil, J. Paulson, M. Piché, B. Popplewell, D. Mendeloff (proxy for A. Plourde), M. Rooney, D. Siddiqi, S. Sivathayalan, P. Smith, J. Tomberlin, A. Tremblay, C. Trudel, J. Voordouw, P. Wilson, J. Wolfart,

Regrets: O. Baysal, T. Boswell, S. Boyle, T. Di Leo Browne, C. Dion, P. Dion, P. Lagasse, P. Rankin, W. Shi, S. Shires, A. Shotwell, E. Sloan, C. Viju, C. Warner, P. Wolff, W. Ye

Absent: A. Ahmad, L. Akagbosu, M. Close, A. Courchene, H. Gupta, F. Hosseinian, J. Kovalio, R. McKay, S. Moran, S. Srinivasan, J. Stoner, K. von Finckenstein

Open Session:

1. Welcome (Chair)

The Chair welcomed Senators to a new year and introduced three new members: Barry Wright (FPA), Julia Sinclair-Palm (FASS) and Amber Lannon (Interim Librarian). The Chair noted the tragic loss of 2 members of the Carleton community, who were among the 176 passengers lost as a result of the crash of a Ukrainian passenger plane in Iran on January 8th. Senators were asked to observe a moment of silence to honour the memory of PhD student Fareed Arasteh and alumnus Mansour Pourjam.

2. Approval of Agenda

It was **MOVED** (A. Bowker, D. Deugo) that Senate approve the Open Session agenda for the meeting of Senate on January 31, 2020, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

3. Minutes: November 29, 2019 (open session)

It was **MOVED** (A. Bowker, H. Nemiroff) that Senate approve the minutes of the Open Session on November 29, 2019, as presented.

Two minor corrections were made in the minutes.

The motion **PASSED** with these corrections.

4. Matters Arising

There were none.

5. Chair's Remarks

The Chair highlighted the following recent events of note to Senators:

- The Chair congratulated Suzanne Blanchard on her reappointed as the Vice-President, Students and Enrolment. The reappointment advisory committee voted unanimously to confirm her reappointment.
- 2019's Giving Tuesday in early December was the most successful fundraising day in Carleton's history. With the 1-to-1 matching, Carleton raised over \$2Million for projects led by members of Carleton's community. The Chair thanked all involved in this initiative.
- Carleton University has ranked second in Canada and 35th in the world in the prestigious UI Green Metrics international ranking system for campus sustainability.
- The Canadian Accessibility Network was launched in December, building on Carleton's strength in accessibility research and practice.
- On January 21 and 22, Carleton's *Initiative for Parliamentary and Diplomatic Engagement* held a two-day Orientation for New Parliamentarians.
- Results of the 2019 *Canadian Graduate and Professional Students Survey* (CGPSS) show that Carleton has higher than average Ontario ratings for student life experience, quality of teaching, support from non-academic staff and opportunities for interdisciplinary work. The Chair congratulated Dean Patrice Smith, the team at FGPA and everyone involved in graduate education for this achievement.

- Carleton made a significant contribution to the 2019 United Way Campaign and raised \$100,000 towards youth mental health and community in Ottawa.
- The *Bell Let's Talk* event on campus featured Juno award winning artist and Carleton alumna Kelly Lee Evans who performed and spoke about her mental health journey.
- The Senate Office has launched a Senate Intranet page as a new and secure document and information sharing platform.
- February 2020 marks the launch of Carleton's new *Raven* magazine, a platform to showcase impactful work of Carleton's faculty, students, and staff.

6. Question Period

Three questions were submitted in advance.

Question from D. Siddiqi

We've been made aware through many venues that Carleton has reorganized new hires into one big pool (where Deans compete for new and replacement hires), rather than replacement hires remaining with the Faculties, as was past policy. Even though the apportionment of faculty lines clearly falls under the jurisdiction of the Provost and the Board, this redistribution of resources will have profound Academic effects. It seems that these academic consequences fall into Senate's purview, so maybe this policy change should be brought to Senate for discussion or referral to SQAPC, which seems to have faculty reorganization in its oversight purview?

For example, it seems that Load Measure is the primary means through which the reallocation of resources is going to be arbitrated. Again the design of Load Measure seems to be an Academic issue, so it seems like its design is something that Senate should be involved in. If Load Measure is going to be used to reallocate resources from one Faculty to another, and Load Measure itself seems designed to be a zero sum game, the Academic body with oversight over that process seems to be Senate, and Senate seems to have an interest in its design. Some examples (which I have culled to keep this question reasonable in size):

1) To what extent does Load Measure incentivize very large classes? For example how does Load Measure know the value difference between a 900-student online course and a 25-student first year seminar? Can Load Measure tell the difference between a second year large methodology lecture and a fourth-year seminar? Does it incentivize the latter?

2) To what extent does Load Measure incentivize a department with a lot of 0% appointments sharing in the burden of supervision and disincentivize those departments that "donate" supervision?

3) To what extent does Load Measure incentivize large classes with assessments that can all be automated via Scantron over small classes with large experiential or writing components which are relatively inefficient uses of instructor time but come with significant pedagogical value?

These seem like exactly the kinds of questions that are normally discussed in the Quality Assurance process (which includes Senate), but this discussion bypassed that process.

Response from Provost J. Tomberlin:

The Provost noted that load measure is just one of many factors involved in making decisions regarding faculty allocations. In accordance with standard practice, allocations involve discussions between the Provost and the Dean(s).

Question from M. Rooney

Could the Clerk update Senate on the status of the following commitments that were made in the last 12 months?:

- *Academic Integrity issues at Carleton: During the June 2019 meeting of Senate, SAIAC provided Senate with a detailed report on the issue of Academic Integrity. At the time, Senators expressed both appreciation for the work of SAIAC as well as concern at the substance of the committee's report. The minutes for this meeting record that the Clerk had "noted these responses would be taken to the appropriate Senate committee(s) for development before returning to Senate for discussion and approval(s)" (p.11). Are there any updates on this front? If not, when can we expect that the issue will next be brought back to Senate?*

- *Senate Representation: During the September 2019 meeting, two separate Senators asked Senate to consider expanding its membership to include 1) more Contract Instructors and 2) an Indigenous graduate student. The minutes from the meeting (not available online at the time of writing this) note that "both of these questions regarding representation will be taken to the Senate Academic Governance Committee for review and discussion" (p.4). Has SAGC provided any updates for Senate on these requests? If not, when can we expect that the issue will be brought back to Senate?*

*I would also like to inquire about arrangements/timelines for the election of Contract Instructor (CI) Senators. I had planned (in the first question) to ask the Clerk to report back on whether the arrangements agreed to in the February 2019 Senate meeting had been made, which would see elections for CI Senators follow the same timeline as those for Student Senators, but in discussing the matter with the Assistant University Secretary recently, I learned that this question raised other issues. **Article 3.3.3 of the AGU** notes that CI Senators must teach "at least 0.5 credits in the academic year (July 1 – June 30) in which the election takes place." How does the Clerk interpret the meaning of that regulation? The Assistant University Secretary's reading of the clause left her to conclude that elections couldn't be held until course allocations for CIs for the next year could be made; to my mind, however, that clause merely says that, to be eligible for nomination, a CI needs to have taught a course during the same academic year as the election. If the former is true, then we need to hold elections in early September, so that CIs have their course allocations and so that elected CIs can join Senate for its first meeting of the year at the end of September; if the latter is true, then we could easily hold elections in the spring of this year.*

*Reviewing the language about CI Senators in the AGU raised other issues that, I think, Senate should be aware of. **Article 4.3.1**, for instance, specifies that, in order "to serve the full [3-year] term, contract instructors must continue to teach at least 0.5 credits at Carleton for each academic year (July 1 – June 30) they serve on Senate." (**Article 4.4.4** says something to similar effect.) Considering that no CI can ever say with confidence that s/he will teach courses*

beyond a 4- or 8-month window at the uppermost, and that whether or not s/he is offered a course to teach is beyond his/her control, I'm wondering if my colleagues in Senate view these stipulations as reasonable, and if the members of Senate would really like to see CI Senators stripped of an elected post on this basis of factors they can't control. I recognize that such changes cannot be accomplished quickly, but will Senate make a recommendation to have the relevant body review and revise the language about CI Senators in the AGU – preferably with meaningful input from CIs themselves – with an eye toward resolving these issues during the 2020-2021 academic year?

Response from Clerk of Senate:

- The questions and suggestions raised in the *Academic Integrity Appeals Committee Report* have been referred to the *Senate Committee on Curriculum, Admissions and Studies Policy (SCCASP)* for consideration and addition to their work plan as appropriate.
- Questions regarding changing Contract Instructor membership representation on Senate will be referred to the *Senate Academic Governance Committee* for review and discussion before coming back to Senate.
- The Clerk noted that section 3.3.3 of the AGU refers to the eligibility of the voters (electoral pool) and section 4.4.4 outlines eligibility requirements of Contract Instructor nominees. Contract Instructor elections for Senate positions must be scheduled after teaching assignments are finalized, which does not generally occur until the summer months. It was noted that optimal election period would likely be in September, to ensure that Contract Instructors are on campus and available to participate. Any changes in the timeline as set out in the AGU can be discussed at SAGC with the other membership changes.

Question from A. Shotwell

Could Senate have an update on the progress of the Parental Leave Policy implementation? I was co-chair with Paul Keen of the committee that was formulating this at the grad faculty board level, and I know it has been in process with Suzanne Blanchard's office at the university level, but wonder about the timing for an actual roll-out for it.

Response from VP, Students & Enrolment:

A communications plan and implementation plan are being developed for this new policy. It should be ready for roll-out in the summer or fall of this year (2020).

7. Administration (Clerk)

a. Senate & Senate Committee membership ratifications

The Clerk presented nominees for positions on the *Senate Academic Integrity Appeals Committee*, *Senate Committee on Student Awards*, and *Senate Honorary Degrees Committee*.

It was **MOVED** (B. Kuzmarov, M. Haines) that Senate ratify the new Senate committee appointments, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

b. 2020/21 Membership Renewal Process – Senate and Senate Committees

The Clerk outlined the process and timeline for membership renewal on Senate and Senate Committees, for the term beginning July 1, 2020:

- February 4 – 27, 2020: Nomination period for upcoming faculty and student vacancies on Senate
- First week of March 2020: Elections for Senate positions
- March 5 – 26, 2020: Nomination period for upcoming faculty and student positions on Senate standing committees
- April 24, 2020: Ratification of Senate and Senate committee appointments for the period beginning July 1, 2020.

c. Appointments made Contrary to Policy

One appointment was made in the School for Industrial Design for an Instructor to fill a vacancy caused by a reduced time appointment and sabbatical leave.

8. Reports:

a. Senate Committee on Curriculum, Admissions and Studies Policy (SCCASP)

The Chair of SCCASP presented three items for Senate approval and two items for information.

Items for approval:

- Proposed change lowering GPA to make transfer to B. H. Sc. Honours more accessible, and clarifying admission to the General program.

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, C. Macdonald) that Senate approve the revisions to regulation TBD 1367 R-ADM-Program_B.H.Sc. for the 2020-21 Undergraduate calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

- Reducing credit requirement for Co-op in BSc Food Science to increase access:

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, C. Macdonald) that Senate approve the revisions to regulation TBD 1758 R UG COOP BSc Food Science Co-op Admission Requirements for the 2020-21 Undergraduate calendar, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

- Senate Policy on Academic Accommodations during Labour Disputes

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, A. Bowker) that Senate approve the Senate Policy on Labour Disputes, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**, with one abstention.

Items for Information:

- Minor modifications (89 pages; all faculties)
- Simultaneous and subsequent degrees – to add items missing from list.

There was no discussion.

b. Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee - SQAPC

The Chair of the committee (Dwight Deugo) presented one cyclical review, a change in program governance, and 31 major modifications for Senate approval.

Major Modifications:

Omnibus Motion:

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, J. Tomberlin) that Senate approve the major modifications as presented below with effect from Fall 2020.

A Senator requested the following modifications to be removed from the omnibus motion and considered separately:

- #12 – PhD History & PhD History with Specialization in Political Economy
- #13 – PhD English
- #30 – MA in Music and Culture

With these modifications removed, Senators voted on the remainder of the modifications in the omnibus motion.

The motion **PASSED**.

Senate then considered the three modifications that were pulled:

#12 – PhD History and PhD History with Specialization in Political Economy

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, A. Bowker) that Senate approve the major modifications to the PhD in History and PhD in History with a specialization in Political Economy programs as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

Discussion: A Senator objected to this modification, stating that professional development projects should be “add-ons” and should not replace 1.0 credits of substantial coursework. In response it was noted that there is no objection to this type of change if the substitution is reasonable and does not impact the overall program in a substantive way.

The motion **PASSED**, with 1 opposed and 1 abstaining.

#13 – PhD English

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, J. Paulson) that Senate approve the major modification to the PhD in English as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

Discussion: A Senator expressed support for the modification, which restructures the second language requirement instead of removing it.

The motion **PASSED**.

#30 – MA in Music and Culture

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, A. Bowker) that Senate approve the major modifications to the MA in Music and Culture program as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

Discussion: A Senator asked why the second language requirement is being removed from this degree. In response, it was noted that it is an MA program, not a PhD program; additionally, the second language requirement is an impediment for recruiting, as other universities do not require it.

The motion **PASSED**, with 1 opposed.

List of Major Modifications from the Omnibus Motion:

- GDip in Health Policy

THAT Senate approve the deletion of the Graduate Diploma in Health Policy as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- GDip in Public Management

THAT Senate approve the deletion of the Graduate Diploma in Public Management as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- GDip in Sustainable Development

THAT Senate approve the deletion of the Graduate Diploma in Sustainable Development as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- Master of Public Policy and Administration

THAT Senate approve the addition of the specialization in Data Science to the Master of Public Policy and Administration program as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- Master of Science in Chemistry, concentration in Food Science

THAT Senate approve the major modification to the Master of Science in Chemistry, concentration in Food Science program as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- PHD in Chemistry, concentration in Food Science

THAT Senate approve the major modification to the PHD in Chemistry, concentration in Food Science program as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- MA in Psychology, concentration in Mental Health and Well-Being

THAT Senate approve the introduction of the concentration in Mental Health and Well-being to the Master of Arts in Psychology program as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- Minor in Performance in the Public Sphere

THAT Senate approve the introduction of the in Minor in Performance in the Public Sphere as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- Minor in Quebec Studies

THAT Senate approve the introduction of the in Minor in Quebec Studies as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- Post-Baccalaureate Diploma in Women's and Gender Studies

THAT Senate approve the deletion of the Post Baccalaureate Diploma in Women's and Gender Studies as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- Collaborative MA Specialization in Latin American and Caribbean Studies

THAT Senate approve the introduction of the collaborative specialization in Latin American and Caribbean Studies as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- M.Sc. Physics, Medical Physics Stream with Specialization in Data Science

THAT Senate approve the addition of the specialization in Data Science to the Master of Science in Physics (Medical Physics) as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- M.Sc. Physics, Particle Physics Stream with Specialization in Data Science

THAT Senate approve the addition of the specialization in Data Science to the Master of Science in Physics (Particle Physics) as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- Applied Linguistic and Discourse Studies (ALDS 4307: Practicum in Teaching English as a Foreign Language)

THAT Senate approve the deletion of ALDS 4307 as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- Archeology Fieldwork Course

THAT Senate approve ARCY 3000, 3301, 4000 & 4100 as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- Minor in Criminology and Criminal Justice

THAT Senate approve the introduction of the minor in Criminology and Criminal Justice as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- SAO Study Abroad

THAT Senate approve the deletion of the Study Abroad Option with Sheffield Hallam University as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- MA Political Economy concentration in Work and Labour

THAT Senate approve the introduction of the concentration in Work and Labour to the Master of Arts in Political Economy as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- PhD International Affairs

THAT Senate approve the major modification to the PHD in International Affairs as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- MEng Sustainable Energy, Co-op

THAT Senate approve the major modification to the Master of Engineering in Sustainable Energy as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- PAPM 4908

THAT Senate approve the major modification to PAPM 4908 as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- PAPM 4099

THAT Senate approve the introduction of PAPM 4099 as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- MPAD 3999

THAT Senate approve the introduction of MPAD 3999 as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- BA programs in English

THAT Senate approve the major modifications to the BA programs in English as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- BA Honours and Combined Honours in French

THAT Senate approve the major modifications to the BA Honours and BA Combined Honours programs in French and the addition of FREN 4060 as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- PSYC 3905

THAT Senate approve the introduction of PSYC 3905 as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- MA Migration and Diaspora Studies- Co-op

THAT Senate approve the introduction of co-op to the MA in Migration and Diaspora Studies program as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

- PHD History with a concentration in Public History

THAT Senate approve the introduction of the concentration in Public History to the PHD in History program as presented with effect from Fall 2020.

8(b) Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee - SQAPC cont'd

Governance Change:

This is a motion to move the administrative home of the Collaborative MA Specialization in Digital Humanities from its temporary home in the Department of English to its permanent home in the College of the Humanities.

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, D. Siddiqi) that Senate approve the change in governance to the Digital Humanities program as presented to take effect upon approval.

The motion **PASSED**.

Cyclical Review:

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, P. Smith) that Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the PhD program in Economics.

Discussion: A Senator asked for clarification of the timeline of the action plan, which lists dates in 2019 for implementation. In response it was noted that this is a joint program with the University of Ottawa, and final approval was delayed due to changes in the IQAPs of both Carleton and the University of Ottawa. A new joint procedural document is being developed to streamline the process moving forward.

The motion **PASSED**.

9. Strategic Integrated Plan Update

Deputy Provost and SIP Task Force Co-Chair Lorraine Dyke presented to Senators a conceptualization of the new Strategic Integrated Plan. She began by outlining the process since the project began in August of 2019. Major highlights and milestones include:

- Formation of an engaged Task Force of 24 members
- A speaker series bringing 13 dynamic guests to campus
- A layered consultation process involving 3 phases and including more than 1300 participants
- Over 200 submissions from students

Eight strategic themes emerged from the consultations, and were shared with Senators in November 2019. Over the next few months, three of these themes were foregrounded:

- Innovation
- Campus-Community Engagement
- Real-World/Social Impact Beyond Disciplinary Boundaries

The Task Force paired these three themes with three top priorities identified in research on student (Generation Z) values (Share, Serve, Impact):

- Innovation (Share Knowledge, Research)
- Campus-Community Engagement (Serve Community, Local and Global)

- Real-World/Social Impact Beyond Disciplinary Boundaries (Impact of Wellness and Sustainability)

The Task Force then looked at the unique geography of Carleton's campus, bounded on three sides by the river, canal and Bronson Street, and they mapped the three themes onto this triangular shape:

- CANAL: Innovation (Share Knowledge, Research)
- COMMUNITY: Campus-Community Engagement (Serve Community, Local and Global) (permeable boundary)
- RIVER: Real-World/Social Impact Beyond Disciplinary Boundaries (Impact of Wellness and Sustainability)

This conceptualization leverages Carleton's unique geography and place within Ottawa to support a focussed strategic vision that is forward-thinking but also rooted in Carleton's values and history.

Co-Chair Lorraine Dyke wrapped up the presentation by outlining the agenda and timeline of the project moving forward. Drafts of the SIP will be brought back to Senate in February and April, and the final document will be completed in May.

Discussion:

- Canal analogy –
 - There was some debate over the correct verb to use. (Share, Seek, Co-create knowledge).
 - One Senator felt it was problematic to use this metaphor for "sharing knowledge" as the Canal was built on human labour which was not necessarily fairly compensated.
- A Senator noted that proximity to water is not unique to Carleton; many universities are similarly situated on or near rivers.
- A Senator asked how the CUISIC Calls to Action feature in the SIP. In response, it was noted that aspects of the Calls are embedded in the themes of the SIP (community, reciprocal knowledge sharing, wellness, sustainability, importance of river/water). It was also noted that multiple plans can evolve in parallel, and that it is not necessary to include the CUISIC Calls in the SIP.
- In response to a question asking for more details on the plan, it was noted that the current presentation is a preliminary conceptualization and more

fulsome explanations will be provided as drafts evolve over the next few months.

The Chair concluded the discussion by noting that this concept is promising because it leverages our Capital Advantage by anchoring our branding on our location in Ottawa - the National Capital - and on our truly unique and beautiful campus.

It was noted that many powerful stories can emerge from this metaphorical model. The Chair thanked Co-Chair Dyke and all members of the Task Force for their work on this project and Senators for their input.

Reports for Information:

a. Senate Executive Committee Minutes (November 19, 2019)

There was no discussion.

10. Other Business

A Senator asked about Carleton's plan regarding the Novel Coronavirus. The Chair responded that Carleton is monitoring the situation, following advice provided by our local health organizations (Ottawa Public health, Ontario Ministry of Health) and in consultation with Universities Canada and the Council of Ontario Universities. Further communications will be released as the situation warrants.

11. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 4:15 pm.