



Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.

**Carleton University Senate
Meeting of August 21, 2020 at 2:00 pm
Via Zoom Videoconference**

MINUTES – OPEN SESSION

Present: S. Ajila, K. AlWazir, V. Asi, B.A. Bacon (Chair), M. Barbeau, O. Baysal, S. Blanchard, A. Bowker, S. Boyle, D. Brown, N. Bruni, A. Chandler, M. Close, T. Daniels, J. Deaville, D. Deugo, D. Dragunoiu, D. Edi, M. Gagne, G. Garland, D. Gillberg, R. Goubran, S. Gulati, M. Haines, B. Hallgrimsson, O. Hobbs, C. Joslin, L. Kostiuik, J. Kovalio, B. A. Kuzmarov (Clerk), A. Lannon, C. Laurendeau, A. Luko, C. Macdonald, B. MacLeod, S. Maguire, R. McKay, H. Nemiroff, J. Paulson, A. Plourde, P. Rankin, M. Rooney, D. Russell, S. Sadaf, J. Sinclair-Palm, S. Sivathayalan, E. Sloan, P. Smith, D. Sprague, R. S. Sundarraj, J. Taber, K. Taylor, N. Tilokani, J. Tomberlin, C. Trudel, C. Viju, K. von Finckenstein, J. Voordouw, J. Wolfart, P. Wolff, B. Wright, W. Ye

Regrets: K. Hellemans, E. Kwan, J. Milner, J. Moore, M. Piche, K. Weary, P. Wilson

Absent: A. Ahmad, J. Bruno, C. Cruickshank, T. Di Leo Browne, F. Hosseinian, B. Popplewell, J. Stoner, A. Tremblay,

Guests: L. Dyke, D. Hornsby

Recording Secretary: K. McKinley

Open Session:

1. Welcome (Chair) & Approval of Agenda

The Chair began the Open Session of the meeting by extending a warm welcome to Senators, and especially to new Senators just beginning their term. The Chair offered condolences to friends and family of Carleton student Abel Mengistab, and long-serving Carleton staff member Gilles Leblanc, who passed away on June 18 and July 28, respectively. On behalf of the Carleton

community, the Chair offered sympathies as well to all affected by the devastating explosion in Beirut, Lebanon on August 4, 2020.

It was **MOVED** (N. Tilokani, S. Sadaf) that Senate approve the open agenda for the meeting of Senate on August 21, 2020, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

2. Minutes: June 19, 2020

It was **MOVED** (C. Macdonald, M. Haines) that Senate approve the minutes of the Open Session of the Senate meeting on June 19, 2020, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

3. Matters Arising

There were none.

4. Chair's Remarks

The Chair reported on the strong enrolment numbers for both summer and fall terms, and thanked all involved for contributing to the continuing success of Carleton's academic mission. The Chair noted that Carleton's decision to hold courses online for the fall will help protect the health and safety of Carleton's students, staff and faculty and will prevent the outbreaks seen at several schools in the United States. The Chair congratulated students who have chosen to continue their studies during the pandemic. Pursuing advanced learning and obtaining a university degree shows good judgement and will position them well for employment in the future.

In the wake of the police killing of George Floyd and the ensuing protests and unrest in the United States, Canada and abroad, Carleton University has recommitted to enhancing diversity, inclusion and anti-racism on campus. Under the leadership of Michael Charles, AVP of Equity and Inclusive Communities, the Advisory Group on Equity and Inclusive Communities has drafted a series of recommendations for Equity, Diversity and Inclusion Institutional Action. This broad-ranging and comprehensive strategy will bring long-term positive change to Carleton. Campus-wide consultations on the draft will be announced shortly, and the full strategy should be in place by the end of the calendar year. Michael Charles will join Senate on September 25 to lead discussions on the draft strategy.

The Chair next reported on the Carleton Community Anti-Racism and Allyship Conversation, which was held virtually earlier in the week and was very well attended. The culmination of a number of events held over the summer, this session explored strategies to bring anti-racist and decolonializing principles into the work of academics and staff at Carleton. Featured guest speakers included CFL wide-receiver and Carleton alumnus Nate Behar, and Michelle Brownrigg, a Senior Director and Chief Program Officer for Hart House at the University of Toronto. The Chair thanked all who participated in this rich and engaging event.

Carleton University has won the Carbon 613 excellence award for sustainability in research, teaching and campus programs. This award recognizes our past achievements in sustainability, and our commitment to become carbon neutral by 2050. Carleton has reduced carbon emissions by 35% over the past decade and was recently recognized as the second most sustainable university in Canada by the UI GreenMetric World University Rankings.

The Chair informed Senators that, following a comprehensive review and consultations with the Teaching and Learning community, Carleton has selected BrightSpace by Desire2Learn as Carleton's new Learning Management System. BrightSpace will replace CULearn in the spring of 2021.

The Chair concluded his remarks by extending congratulations to the following individuals for their achievements:

- Carleton doctoral students David Luong (Systems and Computer Engineering), Jean Ketterling (Legal Studies), and Antoine Genest-Gregoire (Public Policy), have each been awarded prestigious Vanier Canada Graduate Scholarships. Each scholarship is valued at \$50,000 per year for 3 years while the recipient pursues doctoral studies.
- Biology PhD student Jill Brooks has won the Eugenie Clarke Memorial Award, for early-career female scientists in biological research.
- Professor James McGowan has been appointed as the new Carleton Chair in Teaching & Innovation.
- Professor Joy Mighty has received the Christopher Knapper Lifetime Achievement Award for her contributions to teaching, learning and educational development in her 40-year career in higher education.

5. Question Period

Five questions were submitted by Senators in advance.

1) Question from Sean Maguire:

Can Senate receive an update on the status of athletic scholarships, given the Covid-19 pandemic? Specifically, have athletic scholarships in place during 2019-2020 been continued into 2020-2021? Were a similar number of new athletic scholarships offered for 2020-2021, notwithstanding the suspension of most interuniversity sports until at least January 2021?

Response from Vice-President Students and Enrolment:

U Sports is allowing universities to provide athletic scholarships in 2021, provided the athlete meets the academic and athletic eligibility requirements. This will proceed, even if athletic activities and competitions are reduced or suspended due to the pandemic. Carleton has committed to the same number of athletic scholarships that were provided in 2019/20, and the same process will be followed in awarding them.

2) Questions from Andrea Chandler:

- a) *I was informed that one of my fall term courses is considered a 'priority course.' What process was used to determine which courses are 'priority courses,' who is involved in these decisions, and what does it mean to be a 'priority course'? Priority for what?*

Response from Associate Vice-President, Teaching and Learning:

The list of priority courses was selected by the Deans of the Faculties, with some additional advice from Teaching & Learning Services. The list typically includes required courses for degree programs, courses with large enrolments, and others that might require additional technical support.

- b) *Could we have an update on the progress of the Quality Assurance Committee for assessing the best practices/lessons learned from the experience of the winter term 2020, as discussed in the May meeting of Senate? What steps have been taken and what consultations are currently in progress?*

This question will be answered during the Report of the Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee (Agenda Item 7b)

3) Questions from Morgan Rooney:

- a) *Can the President speak to any plans, tentative or otherwise, for Winter 2021 course offerings at Carleton? Will courses be all online? If the matter is not yet settled, by what date, approximately, can instructors expect to learn their options for course delivery for the winter term? Given the extra labour required to prepare and teach their courses online in the Fall, it is to be expected that instructors will be over-extended this term and will have limited time for winter course development: the sooner we know, the sooner we can get started. (If this subject is directly addressed in the Chair's Remarks, please ignore.)*

This question will be answered in Agenda Item #10.

- b) *What initiatives or steps is Carleton undertaking to ensure that students are getting easy, advanced access to information about 1) required course textbooks and 2) the course modality of the courses they are enrolled in and the kinds of technology they need to succeed in those courses (e.g., an instructor teaching an entirely synchronous or mixed modality course may well expect students to have a mic and a webcam)? Given the likelihood that mail / package delivery is going to be delayed in September as a result of millions of students across Canada making orders for such things at the same time, it seems highly advisable that students be given the chance to start ordering such items before the start of the term, so as to ensure that they have them on hand during the first week of classes. To do that, they need information from their Fall term course instructors in the weeks before the start of the term.*

Response from the Provost:

Textbook adoption is following normal procedures. Instructors are encouraged to submit their textbook lists to the bookstore four months prior to the start of the semester, or as soon as possible. The Provost's Office is not aware of any current issues with this process, although the concern is noted.

Course outlines are not required to be available to students until one week before the beginning of the semester. However, the Provost's Office has requested that course outlines be made available to students as soon as possible, and that the course outlines specify the course modality (synchronous, asynchronous or a combination) that will be used. This is important information for students who may be living and studying in different time zones. Faculty members have

been encouraged to survey students in their classes early in the semester, to be able to adapt to and accommodate students in different time zones.

6. Administration (Clerk)

a. Notice of appointments made contrary to advertising policy

The Clerk reported two appointments made contrary to advertising policy. The first is an Instructor I position, from term to preliminary, as a result of a resignation or retirement. The second position for an Instructor III position (term to preliminary), was not advertised due to lack of time.

b. Senate membership ratification

Nominations were received from one faculty member and two students to fill vacancies on Senate.

It was **MOVED** (B. Kuzmarov, M. Close) that Senate ratify the new Senate appointments, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

c. Reminder: Contract Instructor Call for Nominations

The Clerk reminded Senators that a Call for Nominations for Contract Instructor positions on Senate has been advertised to the Carleton community. The nomination period began on August 11 and will close on September 11. Elections will be held on September 15-16. Newly elected Contract Instructors for Senate will be ratified at the Senate meeting on September 25, and will begin their terms on October 1, 2020.

7. Reports

a. Senate Committee on Curriculum, Admissions and Studies Policy (SCCASP)

Committee Chair Howard Nemiroff reported that SCCASP has met over the summer to discuss current grading practices at Carleton, both within the context of the current pandemic, and with regards to drafting a successful long-term policy. SCCASP has been working with David Hornsby's working group on student success in the classroom, and with CASG President Matthew Gagne to craft a robust policy that will benefit students in years to come.

SCCASP has been accumulating data on practices at universities in Ontario and beyond. One example, the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, has developed a progressive and detailed policy that defines credit and no-credit options per year of study. This policy could serve as a model for Carleton. For first-year undergraduate students at MIT, a pass/fail only option with no grades or CGPA calculation has been developed on an exploratory basis. More flexible options are available to senior-year students to designate pass/fail options after receiving their grades. Several Canadian universities have developed similar policies. It was noted that the committee did not seek examples from European universities.

Over the next few weeks as the policy is being drafted, SCCASP members will bring back comments from their respective faculties, with a view to presenting a policy to Senate over the course of the fall.

b. Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee - SQAPC

The committee Chair, Dwight Deugo, presented one minor modification from Dominican University College to Senators for information. In accordance with Carleton's IQAP, minor modifications made to programs at Dominican University College are forwarded to Carleton University and presented to Senate for information. The process is outlined in the materials that were circulated to Senators.

The committee Chair then provided an update on the ongoing SQAPC review of the move to online course delivery. Since the last Senate meeting in June, results from the OIRP e-learning survey to students have been received, and TLS has responded to faculty and student needs identified in the survey. Another survey on how Carleton handled the pivot is underway, and will be distributed to faculty and staff next week. Responses to this survey will be brought through SQAPC to Senate this fall.

The committee Chair met with the Associate Deans over the summer regarding academic integrity needs, and a review of the policy is underway. The next step will be for the Associate Deans to meet with the Deans to discuss responses to needs with regards to academic integrity. The Chair also has been gathering data on student mental health, and assessment and grading practices.

SQAPC will meet twice in September, and will report on the outcomes of those meetings to Senate on September 25. The committee Chair also noted that concerns and issues identified through the student survey will be reported to Senators in September. Data gathering will continue into the fall, and reports to Senate will continue as the committee develops more insights.

In response to a question, it was noted that a review of the Academic Integrity Policy will be coming to Senate this year via SCCASP.

8. SMA Update

For the benefit of new Senators, the Chair reviewed the Strategic Mandate Agreement process, outlining the history of the previous agreements from SMA1 in 2014 and SMA2 in 2017 to the status of the most recent SMA3 in 2020. SMA3 began in the Fall of 2019 with a new quantitative approach, focussing on 10 metrics designed to be linked to a proportion of Carleton's funding envelope. The agreement was ready to sign in March of 2020, but was put on hold by the provincial government due to the pandemic. In July, the government re-engaged with the university sector to complete the process.

Deputy Provost Lorraine Dyke presented a review of the 10 metrics of SMA3 and an update on changes made to the agreement since the draft was presented to Senate in March. Key changes approved by the Ministry include the following:

- Impact of performance on funding will be lagged by one year.
- Additionally, performance in years 1 and 2 will not be linked to funding.
- The first performance impact will be in year 4, based on the results of year 3.
- Universities will be consulted before the ministry proceeds to performance-based funding on the year 3 data.
- Institutions will have the opportunity to re-weight the metrics over the first 3 years of the agreement, and to revise strategy narratives.

Changes initiated by Carleton in the agreement include the following:

- A summary of new SIP was added.
- COVID-19 was referenced.
- The Senate policy on ladder credentials was included.
- The Share Online Projects Initiative, in collaboration with University of Ottawa was highlighted.

The Chair added that postponing the performance impact on funding was achieved primarily through advocacy work of the COU and individual institutions.

A Senator asked about the impact of performance-based funding on the Arts and Social Sciences, especially if the funding is linked to post-graduation employment. In response it was noted that Carleton graduates from FASS are successful in finding employment, although in more diverse career paths. Support will continue for programs in Arts and Social Sciences at Carleton.

A Senator asked if the SMA addresses digital learning and micro-credentials. Although there are no metrics on these topics, they are of interest to the ministry, and have been addressed in the minor revisions to the SMA. It was noted as well that international students are not referenced in the metrics, and are not being examined by the Ministry.

The Chair thanked the Deputy Provost and others involved in the SMA process.

9. Preparing for Fall 2020

Guest David Hornsby, AVP, Teaching and Learning, presented a report on the activities of Teaching & Learning Services, in preparing students and faculty for the online Fall semester. Highlights included:

- Identification, development and support of 112 priority courses
- Development of more than 100 projects through the Students as Partners Program and 17 projects through the Shared Online Projects Initiative
- Increase in support and capacity within the teaching community through development of an online teaching toolkit, workshops, one-on-one consultations and professional development sessions
- Acquisition of technology and technological support for teaching and learning
- Acquisition of a new learning management system for 2021 and upgrading CULearn for 2020

In conclusion, it was noted that TLS has responded to the needs of students and faculty with proactive leadership and that instructors have risen to the challenge of adapting, experimenting and pushing new boundaries in meeting the

challenges of the pandemic. The Chair thanked faculty, staff and students for contributing to the successful launch of the Fall semester.

A Senator asked about accommodations for students with barriers to online participation, such as unstable or unavailable Internet connections. Faculty have been advised of this issue and have been asked to include asynchronous elements such as recorded videos and captions whenever possible. The Vice-President of Students and Enrolment indicated that the university has a comprehensive support plan for students through scheduling and exam services, and has developed, on an as-need basis, a tech bursary to assist students in purchasing the equipment they need.

A Senator asked about feedback regarding Big Blue Button and/or Zoom, and whether a student user's group for BrightSpace could be formed before the general rollout next spring. In response it was noted that students were not specifically surveyed about platforms but have provided general feedback and will be able to continue to do so during the transition phase to the new Learning Management System from now to May 2021. The most common concern among students appears to be the mode of instruction (synchronous/asynchronous) and not the platform used.

Some Senators asked about specific pedagogical practices such as mandatory attendance and/or synchronous lectures that are not recorded, and the resulting issues for students in different time zones or without stable Internet connections. It was noted that Senate has not yet forced instructors to adopt specific pedagogical procedures. Instructors will continue to be strongly advised to be flexible and to use asynchronous and/or blended modes of instruction to avoid these issues.

A Senator asked if international TAs would be available for the fall and winter terms. The Provost responded that due to labour legislation and regulations, obstacles to engaging students outside of Canada as TAs and RAs have not been fully resolved at this time.

The Chair thanked David Hornsby and his team at TLS for their dedication in supporting faculty and students through these difficult circumstances.

10. Planning for Winter 2021

Deputy Provost Lorraine Dyke presented a report on the Carleton University Scenario Planning (CUSP) Working Group's recent activities and recommendations for the Winter semester, which were included in a draft memo circulated to Senators. The draft memo is being presented for discussion and feedback at this meeting in advance of a vote to endorse a finalized memo at the September Senate meeting.

Due to a significant resurgence in Covid-19 cases abroad and to some extent in Canada, public health risks to Canadians remain high. Because of these risks and the lack of an approved vaccine at this time, the Public Health Agency of Canada recommends that Canadians continue to avoid closed spaces, crowded places, and close contact. The latest modelling data from August 14th indicates the probability of a second wave of illness in Canada at a much higher rate than the spring, unless guidelines are adhered to rigorously.

As a result, CUSP is recommending that Carleton continue to offer courses through remote delivery in the Winter 2021 term, to protect the health and safety of faculty, staff and students, and to ensure equitable access for all students. CUSP also recommends that any on-campus learning activities, such as capstone projects, be optional, and that on-campus research facilities including the Library, continue to operate according to public health guidelines. Online supports for student services and for teaching and learning should continue to be provided during this time. CUSP is also considering whether small pilot projects, on a voluntary basis, could be brought onto campus for fall and winter terms.

It was noted in response to a question, that Ontario universities are all online this fall and that some have already announced this will continue in winter, with more announcements coming.

Senators asked about programs that are dependent on experiential learning outcomes and hands-on learning. One Senator noted that online courses might be the best Carleton can do at the moment, but they are not necessarily working for programs in which hands-on learning is key. It is hoped that some of the learning objectives can be captured in an online environment, but there could be opportunities for capstone projects and/or other pilot projects to be conducted on campus in the winter, on a voluntary basis, to achieve these outcomes as well. One Senator suggested that

graduating recitals and concerts featuring music students could be an example of this type of project.

A Senator asked if courses could be held outdoors, to lower the risk. A Senator from Architecture indicated that perhaps some of their projects could be undertaken outdoors. CUSP has not considered this, due to the challenges of the Canadian climate, but will take it under advisement.

In response to another question, it was noted that access to campus buildings has resumed but remains restricted for certain groups and circumstances. The priority for staff is to continue to work remotely, but access can be provided to faculty and staff who are not able to work from home. Specific directives have been developed for both public areas and work spaces, in order to comply with health and safety guidelines. In response to a specific question regarding student society spaces on campus, the Vice-President of Students and Enrolment (VPSE) noted that access can be provided under certain circumstances following defined protocols. Student groups who wish to access their office spaces should contact the OVPSE for details.

The University Librarian, Amber Lannon, indicated that the library is moving into the next phase of their recovery plan, which will involve reopening one floor of the library. The number of people allowed inside the building on this floor will be restricted to 50, in accordance with current public health protocols. This will allow library staff to continue to devote their time to curbside pickup, mailing materials and working on acquisitions in order to serve the Carleton community.

In concluding the discussion on this issue, Senators supported the draft memo and provided a preliminary endorsement of the CUSP recommendations. The Chair reminded Senators that in order to provide adequate lead time for instructors and others to be able to prepare Winter term courses, an announcement about this decision may be made before Senate meets to formally vote on the memo on September 25th.

The Chair thanked the Deputy Provost for the report from CUSP and for the group's work on this issue.

11. Reports for Information:

a. Draft SIP Layout

A draft layout of the Strategic Integrated Plan was circulated to Senators for information.

b. Senate Executive Committee Minutes (June 9, 2020; July 15, 2020)

There were no comments or questions.

12. Other Business

The Chair thanked the Clerk of Senate and the Secretariat team for the work in preparing the extra Senate meeting in August, and he thanked all Senators for their dedication to Carleton in these challenging times.

13. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 4:00 pm.