



*Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.*

**Carleton University Senate  
Meeting of March 26, 2021 at 2:00 pm  
Via Videoconference**

**MINUTES**

**Present:** S. Ajila, K. AlWazir, V. Asi, B.A. Bacon (Chair), M. Baez, M. Barbeau, O. Baysal, S. Blanchard, A. Bowker, D. Brown, A. Chandler, M. Close, T. Daniels, J. Dawson, D. Deugo, D. Dragunoiu, D. Edi, M. Gagne, P. Garcia, G. Garland, D. Gillberg, R. Goubran, S. Gulati, M. Haines, B. Hallgrimsson, K. Hellemans, C. Joslin, L. Kostyuk, B. A. Kuzmarov (Clerk), E. Kwan, A. Lannon, C. Laurendeau, K. Lucas, A. Luko, C. Macdonald, B. MacLeod, S. Maguire, R. McKay, H. Nemiroff, B. O'Neill, J. Paulson, M. Piché, B. Popplewell, P. Rankin, M. Rooney, D. Russell, S. Sadaf, J. Sinclair-Palm, S. Sivathayalan, E. Sloan, P. Smith, D. Sprague, K. Taylor, N. Tilokani, J. Tomberlin, C. Trudel, L. Tsintsadze, K. von Finckenstein, J. Voordouw, P. Wilson, J. Wolfart, P. Wolff, B. Wright W. Ye

**Regrets:** J. Kovalio, A. Tremblay, C. Viju

**Absent:** A. Ahmad, N. Bruni, J. Bruno, C. Davis, O. Hobbs, F. Hosseinian, M. Lundy, J. Milner, J. Moore, J. Stoner, R. S. Sundarraj, J. Taber, J. Wallace, K. Weary

**Guest:** Steven Levitt

**Recording Secretary:** K. McKinley

---

## **1. Welcome & Approval of Agenda (Open)**

The Chair welcomed Senators to the one-year anniversary of Senate's first virtual meeting due to the pandemic. The Chair began the meeting by acknowledging the recent passing of former Professors Lynn Mytelka and Diane Dubrule, and former staff members Barb Higgins, and Mike Jutting. March 10 also marked the second anniversary of the tragic passing of Professor Pius Adesanmi, who was the Director of the Institute of African Studies. The Chair offered his condolences to family members, colleagues and friends of these individuals.

The Chair acknowledged the March 16<sup>th</sup> massacre in Atlanta Georgia of eight people, including six Asian-American women. Anti-Asian violence has surged in North America

and around the world since the beginning of the pandemic. The Carleton community stands in sadness and solidarity with members of the Asian diaspora in condemning this and all forms of racism in our community and beyond. The Chair highlighted a recent interview on CBC's All in a Day with Carleton Professor Xiaobei Chen on this matter.

On March 11, 2021, Carleton honoured the *National Day of Observance* to mark the millions of lives lost to COVID-19, including 22,000 Canadians. The Chair acknowledged the contributions of frontline workers.

Senators observed a moment of silence.

Turning to the agenda, the Chair noted that item 11(b) *Faculty Gender Equity Report* should be removed from the current agenda, and that it would be coming to Senate in April.

It was **MOVED** (M. Haines, J. Paulson) that Senate approve the agenda for the meeting of Senate on March 26, 2021, as amended.

The motion **PASSED**.

## 2. **Minutes: February 26, 2021** (Open Session)

It was **MOVED** (N. Tilokani, J. Sinclair-Palm) that Senate approve the minutes of the Open Session of the Senate meeting of February 26, 2021, as presented.

A Senator noted one error in the SQAPC motions listed in the minutes. The error was noted and corrected by the Assistant University Secretary.

With this correction to the minutes, the motion **PASSED**.

## 3. **Matters Arising**

There were none.

## 4. **Chair's Remarks**

The Chair began by reflecting on the current situation with regards to the pandemic. Although Ottawa is in the red (restrict) zone and the third wave continues to rise, the vaccine rollout is accelerating across Canada and by September, the COVID landscape for Ontario universities will be very different than it is now. As a result, Carleton and other universities in Ontario are looking ahead to the Fall of 2021, and starting to plan for a safe and gradual return to campus. In line with this strategy, the Carleton University Scenario Planning (CUSP) working group will be consulting with stakeholders in order to develop recommendations for a progressive return to campus this fall. The goal is to offer a significant number of courses in person, but to include

online options for maximum flexibility. CUSP will consult with Senators at this (March) meeting, and will return in April with detailed recommendations.

The Chair acknowledged the leadership teams in departments and Faculties as well as support teams, including the Registrar's Office, FGPA, Scheduling & Exam Services and Teaching & Learning Services, for their challenging work in designing a course schedule for this complex environment. The Chair also noted that plans are underway to optimize all mitigating factors including ventilation, PPE, signage, cleaning, and traffic flow, to ensure a safe environment for everyone returning to campus. Human Resources also is leading a process to investigate flexible work arrangements, for those who are unable to return to work for a variety of reasons.

The Chair next updated Senators on recent events across campus. The official launch of the EDI Action Plan was held on March 23<sup>rd</sup>. Over 500 people attended this virtual event. Senators were encouraged to review the final plan, which was included in their meeting package.

The Chair also reminded Senators that the Reputational Enhancement Project will be seeking input on new options for revitalizing Carleton's visual identity. Senators should receive an invitation soon to provide feedback and are encouraged to participate.

On March 8, Carleton celebrated International Women's Day by profiling the stories of 17 outstanding Carleton leaders, including students, staff and faculty members. The Faculty of Engineering and Design also marked the occasion by launching a new program entitled Women in Engineering & IT. This program, the first of its kind in Canada, will shape a more inclusive future in Engineering and IT for women students and professionals. The Chair congratulated the Faculty of Engineering and Design, and everyone involved in this exciting initiative.

In anticipation of the presentation at the end of the meeting, the Chair highlighted Carleton's continued research successes and extended congratulations to Professors Mark Boulay and Adrian Chan, who received a combined \$9.3M from the Canada Foundation for Innovation's Innovation Fund, for their researches into, respectively, dark matter exploration, and accessibility.

Finally, the Chair congratulated the Department of Neuroscience on their 10-year anniversary.

## **5. Question Period**

Three questions were submitted in advance:

### **a) Christine Laurendeau – HyFlex Course Delivery Model**

*The HyFlex course delivery model allows for maximum flexibility for students, by delivering the same course both fully online and fully in person, at the same time, by the same instructor. Our colleagues south of the border, many of whom were forced to adopt the HyFlex model over the past year, are widely in agreement to condemn this mode of course delivery as the worst of both worlds for university instructors. Not only are HyFlex courses even more vulnerable to the usual array of technological issues, they often result in a near doubling of the instructor's workload, especially in the large enrollment courses.*

*With course delivery plans for the 2021-2022 academic year still uncertain, is the university considering mandating the use of the HyFlex model for our courses? If so, will instructors be given the choice to opt out and adopt a strictly hybrid, non-flex approach (with some in-person components, and other online components, as determined by the instructor)? If HyFlex is mandated, will courses offered under this model count for additional credit as part of instructors' workload, to offset the additional amount of work required?*

Response from the Provost: The HyFlex Course Delivery System will be one of several modes of delivery available for instructors. It will not be mandatory. Approximately 30% of our classrooms will be fitted with HyFlex technology for the fall semester, and Carleton is recommending that it be used only for course sections with 60 or fewer students in both face-to-face and remote combined. As an aside, meeting rooms across campus, including those for the Board of Governors and Senate also will be equipped with HyFlex technology. Teaching and Learning Services (TLS) have resources for faculty members who would like to try out this technology. Senators are encouraged to visit the TLS website for details.

### **b) Sean Maguire - Question re: Appeal of Student Choice Initiative**

*On March 23 and 24, the Ontario Court of Appeal will be hearing the appeal from the Government of Ontario to reverse a Divisional Court ruling regarding the Student Choice Initiative in November 2019. The Divisional Court quashed the directives on the basis that they are inconsistent with the statutory scheme respecting the governance of universities and colleges. A Coalition of Ontario universities (University of Ottawa, Queen's University, University of Toronto, University of Waterloo, and the University of Western Ontario) are intervening in the appeal. Is there a reason Carleton chose not to be part of this coalition? Does Carleton support the perspective of these universities, who the judge granting them standing noted "claim an impact on their autonomy arising from governmental interference"?*

Response from Steven Levitt, General Counsel (guest): The coalition referred to in the question was not a collective action organized through the Council of Ontario Universities, and Carleton was not approached to participate. In addition, the role of the coalition is to provide the court with context and additional detail regarding the principle of university autonomy. The universities participating are not taking a position on the substantive appeal. Carleton is supportive of the principle of university autonomy and as a result supports the action and perspective of these universities.

**c) Sean Maguire - Question re: Strategic Mandate Agreement**

*In August 2020, Senate heard a presentation from the Deputy Provost on Carleton's Strategic Mandate Agreement with the provincial government. Can Senate receive an update on the Agreement and its implementation, and potential impacts on the University's funding from the provincial government in future years?*

Response from Chair of Senate: In recognition of the impact of the pandemic on post-secondary institutions, the provincial government has placed on hold any link between metric performance and funding until the 2023-24 budget year. In the meantime, Carleton is tracking well against all metrics, and would have met the conditions for full funding this year, had the program been fully operational.

**6. Administration**

**a) Membership**

Two faculty members and five students were ratified as new Senators, with terms beginning on July 1, 2021.

It was **MOVED** (B. Kuzmarov, M. Close) that Senate ratify the following new Senate appointments, as presented, for terms beginning July 1, 2021.

The motion **PASSED**.

**b) Senate Survey – Call for Participation**

The Clerk urged all Senators to participate in the annual Senate Survey which will be released in early April. An email invitation will be sent to all Senators within the next week. The survey will close on April 30<sup>th</sup>.

**c) Notice of Appointments made Contrary to Policy**

The Senate Office received notice of one instance of non-advertised recruitment, which was a spousal hire at the level of Assistant Professor.

## 7. Reports

### a) Senate Committee on Curriculum, Admissions and Studies Policy (SCCASP)

A memo containing 9 items for approval and 3 items for information was circulated to Senators in advance.

1. R-ADM-General Section 15, Special Studies (ACE language changes)  
It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, E. Sloan) that Senate approves the revisions to regulations R-ADM General Section 15 special Studies for the 2022/23 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.  
The motion **PASSED**.
2. Bachelor of Engineering – R-UG-B. Eng (Clarifying “year status”)  
It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, S. Ajila) that Senate approves the revisions to regulation R-UG B. Eng. effective for the 2021/22 Undergraduate Calendar, as presented.  
The motion **PASSED**.
3. TBD-1596: R-ADM-Program-P.B.D. Professional Writing (changes to entry requirements)  
It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, M. Rooney) that Senate approves revisions to regulation R-ADM-Program P.B.D. Professional Writing for the 2021/22 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.  
The motion **PASSED**.
4. TBD-1598 R-UG-Business  
It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, M. Close) that Senate approves revisions to regulation TBD-1598 R-UG-Business for the 2021/22 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

In response to a question it was noted that the language in this item still refers to the Academic Performance Evaluation (instead of the Academic Continuation Evaluation) since the change to ACE does not come into effect until 2022/23.

The motion **PASSED**.

An omnibus motion was presented for Items 5 – 9 inclusive. (These items are language entries in the calendar that support the ACE exceptions approved previously by Senate)

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, J. Wolfart) that Senate approves the revisions to R-UG-3.2.7 for the following programs: Bachelor of Music, Bachelor of Humanities, Bachelor of Architectural Studies, Bachelor of Industrial Design, Bachelor of International Business.

The motion **PASSED**.

Individual Motions from the Omnibus:

5. R-UG-3.2.7 Bachelor of Music  
MOTION: That Senate approves revisions to TBD-1957 R-UG-3.2.7 Bachelor of Music for the 2022-23 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.
6. R-UG-3.2.7 Bachelor of Humanities  
MOTION: That Senate approves revisions to regulations R-UG-3.2.7 Bachelor of Humanities for the 2022-23 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.
7. R-UG-3.2.7 Bachelor of Architectural Studies  
MOTION: That Senate approves revisions to regulations R-UG-3.2.7 Bachelor of Architectural Studies for the 2022-23 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.
8. R-UG-3.2.7 Bachelor of Industrial Design  
MOTION: That Senate approves revisions to regulations R-UG-3.2.7 Bachelor of Industrial Design for the 2022-23 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.
9. R-UG-3.2.7 Bachelor of International Business  
MOTION: That Senate approves revisions to regulations R-UG-3.2.7 Bachelor of International Business for the 2022-23 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The following items were circulated to Senators in advance for information:

- Course Programs - Minor Modifications
- Bachelor of Journalism and Humanities: realignment of History 2304 singular credit
- Additional Information concerning Academic Continuation Evaluation for some degrees

## 7-Reports, cont'd

### b) Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee (SQAPC)

A binder containing a series of minor modifications from Dominican University College (DUC) was circulated to Senators in advance for information only. In accordance with the affiliation agreement between Carleton University and Dominican University College, Carleton plays a role in curriculum and program reviews and approvals at DUC. Minor modifications approved at the college are forwarded to Carleton for information.

### c) Senate Executive Committee

A memo was circulated to Senators in advance regarding the appointment of a new Clerk of Senate. The Chair summarized that the Committee had received a single nomination, that of Dr. Elinor Sloane, and that it was deemed to be very strong. The Chair briefly summarized the support of the Executive Committee for this nomination.

It was **MOVED** (S. Sivathayalan, P. Smith) that Senate approve the appointment of Elinor Sloan as Clerk of Senate, for a three-year term beginning July 1, 2021.

The motion **PASSED**.

## 8. CUSP Fall Planning Update

CUSP Chair Lorraine Dyke led a presentation and consultation on the CUSP scenario planning for Fall 2021. She began by outlining the current challenges and tasks of the CUSP working group. She also reviewed CUSP's mandate, membership and principles to guide decision making. It was noted that over the next few weeks CUSP will be meeting with as many groups as possible within the Carleton community to receive feedback that will help shape their final recommendations.

The presentation identified five key factors as important considerations in the planning process:

- *COVID case trends* – A rising third wave coupled with the spread of variants is concerning.
- *Vaccination progress* – There is encouraging news regarding effectiveness of vaccines and increased pace of rollout. According to current estimates, all Canadians should have received at least one dose of a vaccine by the end of June.
- *Public Health restrictions* – The timeframe for removal of restrictions is uncertain and will lag behind vaccination progress.



- *Travel restrictions* – 15% of Carleton students are international and will face challenges in returning to campus.
- *Students' willingness to continue online education* – A study in December of 1400 Canadian university students revealed that most are eager to return to F2F learning, and 17% would not be willing to continue online learning even if F2F is not deemed safe.

The most likely scenario over the next 6 months will be reduced case counts and a gradual lifting of public health restrictions due to increased vaccinations. This will allow for significant on-campus activity beginning in the Fall of 2021. By Winter 2022, restrictions should be lifted and a full return to campus should be possible, although online options will be necessary for some students.

The following draft guidelines for academic programming were identified:

- Maximize F2F learning opportunities for students.
- Provide some F2F learning opportunities in all levels of every program.
- Provide online programming options.
- Prepare to implement physical distancing.
- Make strategic decisions regarding mode of course delivery based on program needs and sound pedagogy.
- Provide faculty and staff with accommodations where needed.

It is likely that physical distancing will continue to be recommended and preferred for in-person courses in the fall. CUSP recommends a reduced classroom occupancy that is in line with public health guidelines, setting a maximum capacity for F2F sections of 60 people.

Major considerations in prioritizing courses for F2F delivery include the following:

- Learning outcomes of the course, including experiential learning outcomes, lab components and skill development goals
- Centrality of course to program objectives
- High impact pedagogical practices
- Providing options for students so that for each program and year level at least 1 – 2 courses are F2F and 1 – 2 are online.

Guidelines are being developed to support the transition back to campus in the fall. Faculty and staff who are unable to return to campus for medical or unusual family situations should discuss reasonable accommodations with their manager. In scheduling courses, Chairs and Directors are encouraged to accommodate faculty preferences for online vs. F2F when possible.

The presentation concluded by contextualizing CUSP's role within the overall return-to-campus planning framework which includes, in addition to CUSP, the Return to Campus Committee and the Carleton University Flexible Arrangements Working Group (CUFA).

Discussion:

In response to a question from the floor it was noted that a higher profile for online learning at Carleton in the post-pandemic period is being discussed and considered.

A Senator asked if Carleton would implement a vaccination policy and if there are any guidelines for developing such a policy. General Counsel Steven Levitt responded to the question. All 20 universities in Ontario have agreed to jointly retain external legal counsel to explore this issue. In the absence of any guidelines from the government, this group would develop a sector-wide legal opinion on the appropriate guidelines and principles around vaccinations for post-secondary institutions.

A Senator inquired about how student groups fall into the return-to-campus planning, and when they might have access to their offices on campus. The Vice-President Students and Enrolment replied that the Return to Campus Committee will continue to consider individual proposals from student groups in coordination with public health guidelines and restrictions, and an assessment of mitigating factors in place. In response to a follow-up question it was noted that tunnel access remains a complex issue due to challenges with ventilation, maintaining physical distancing and access to various buildings. The Return to Work Committee is reviewing this issue and will make recommendations on tunnel access and use in accordance with public health guidelines as we approach opening dates.

A Senator asked how the Hyflex model, which is a synchronous model of course delivery, would work for international students in different time zones. The CUSP Chair noted that it is expected that larger courses will be fully online, and units will need to prioritize the smaller courses that will be offered in a F2F format. International students may not have full choice for their courses if some are offered in F2F/Hyflex delivery, but other online options will be available for these students.

A Senator asked how decisions are being made regarding in-person course delivery for Contract Instructors, and tutorial sessions for Teaching Assistants. The CUSP Chair responded that these decisions would be made collegially by the individual units at the program level, and that preferences of individual instructors would be taken into consideration where possible. TA assignments also can be changed and shifted to accommodate individual preferences as needed. In a follow-up question, another Senator asked if a centralized accommodations process could be established for

Contract Instructors and Teaching Assistants. In response, the Chair of CUSP noted that assignments will be made at the unit level and should take the individual's preferences into account. An appeal process for accommodations is available, if necessary.

The Chair thanked the Deputy Provost and the CUSP team for their work on this file, and noted that CUSP will return to Senate in April with a full report and recommendations for Senate review.

## **9. Carnegie Classification of Community Engagement**

Deputy Provost Lorraine Dyke and Associate Vice-President Research & International Karen Schwartz presented a brief update on the Canadian pilot of the Carnegie Classification of Community Engagement. Following a review of the Carnegie application process and the current status of the application, the presentation focussed on the results of the March 15<sup>th</sup> Carnegie site visit.

The purpose of the site visit was to receive feedback on the pilot application and to engage with Carnegie to benefit from their experience. The three-hour virtual visit included discussions with Carleton faculty and staff directly involved in community engagement, Deans and AVPs, and senior leadership as well as the Carleton Carnegie team.

Areas of strength for Carleton University identified through the site visit include:

- Commitment to community engagement
- Engagement with Indigenous peoples
- Co-curricular record

Areas of reflection in order to bring community engagement at Carleton to the next level include:

- Identifying exemplary CE practices across the university
- Training faculty and students in CE exemplary practices
- Evaluating social impact of CE with community partners

Moving forward, Carleton will incorporate lessons from the Carnegie process and will consider the development of a Canadian Carnegie process.

The Chair thanked the presenters for their update on this project.

## 10. Research Update

Vice-President Research and International Rafik Goubran presented an overview of Carleton's research achievements and successes.

Dr. Goubran began by noting the importance of research to Carleton's academic mission. Research has a major impact on reputation and ranking, and helps to attract top students and faculty members. Research at Carleton is funded by several sources, including federal and provincial governments, corporations and industry partners, the Tri-Agency (SSHRC, NSERC, CIHR), international sources and foundations.

Tri-agency funding is particularly important for Carleton as it supports central research infrastructure in the form of Research Support Funds (RSF) and Incremental Project Grants (IPG), and it is correlated with the number of Canada Research Chairs (CRCs), the funding envelope from Canada Foundation for Innovation (CFI) and some scholarships and funding from other agencies. Successes in these national competitions are a testament to the excellence of Carleton's researchers and the outstanding quality of their research projects.

Dr. Goubran provided examples of Carleton's core research strengths in many disciplines, including Physics, Public Affairs, Autonomous Systems, Information and Communication Technology, Aerospace, Indigenous Studies, Conservation Biology, Refugees, African Studies and Forensic Psychology. Many of these are world class projects with multiple international collaborations and Carleton in a leading role.

Dr. Goubran also provided two examples of well-known multidisciplinary research clusters at Carleton. Carleton's Wellness cluster includes pioneering work by Carleton researchers in accessibility, plus research contributions from several other disciplines and collaborations and partnerships with regional and national social health networks and hospitals. Carleton's Sustainability cluster includes research in climate change, renewable energy and communities, with well funded initiatives from Efficiency Canada, the NSERC Flare Strategic Network and NSERC Permafrost Strategic Network.

Dr. Goubran then outlined Carleton's research performance metrics. The most common research metrics used by granting agencies, governments and ranking agencies are external research funding (tri-agency, government, corporate), publications, impact on the field (including citations) and impact on society.

Several examples of recent successes in research and tri-agency funding were provided including the prestigious SSHRC Partnership Grants, SSHRC Insight Grants, NSERC CREATE grants, NSERC Strategic Networks grants and CIHR Project Grants.

The presentation then demonstrated Carleton's strong research performance over the past several years, as measured by the following metrics:

- Significant increase in *external research funding* over the past three years, from a plateau of approximately \$55M in 2016-17 to \$86.5M in 2019-20.
- *Tri-agency funding* increase from \$22.2M in 2016/17 to \$30.9M in 2019/20.
- Increase in *Industry Funding* from \$4.1M in 2017/18 to \$13.8M in 2019/20.
- Steady increase in *publications*. Three researchers at Carleton have been recognized as some of the world's most highly cited researchers.

Finally, a number of key research priorities for research in 2021/22 were identified. These include:

- Increasing research productivity
- Expanding industry partnerships
- Promoting and celebrating research successes
- Reputation building through rankings and nominations
- Strengthening of Carleton International
- Empowering strategic multidisciplinary research clusters

A Senator asked how the pandemic has impacted funding at Carleton. Dr. Goubran noted in response that multi-year projects have not been affected. Although some decline was seen in government contracts, these were balanced by additional opportunities for funding, particularly in research related to COVID. Estimates are that the overall level of research should be approximately the same as the previous year.

The Chair thanked Dr. Goubran for the comprehensive overview and congratulated all researchers at Carleton for the impressive surge in research funding, productivity and impact over the past few years.

## **11. Reports for Information**

### **a) Senate Executive Minutes (February 16, 2021)**

## **12. Other Business**

There was no other business.

### **13. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned (J. Tomberlin, N. Tilokani) at 4:00 p.m.