Carleton University

Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.

Carleton University Senate
Meeting of September 22, 2023 at 2:00 pm
Pigiarvik 608

MINUTES

Present in Person: E. Abou Zeid, M. Barbeau, H. Becker, S. Blanchard, A. Bordeleau, A. Bowker, S. Burges, W. Chung, J. P. Corriveau, M. DeRosa, L. Dyke, R. Goubran, T. Haats, N. Hagigi, M. Haines, K. Hellemans, D. Hornsby, M. Huckvale, L. Kostiuk, A. Lannon, F. Lepore, A. MacDonald, B. MacLeod, J. Mason, D. Mendeloff, P. Mkandawire, J. Murray, H. Nemiroff, A. North, B. O'Neill, A. Park, G. Pickton, P. Rankin, M. F. Riazudden, S. Seneviratne, O. Shafiq, D. Siddiqi, E. Sloan (Clerk), C. Smelser, D. Sprague, M. Taghavishavazi, K. Taylor, J. Tomberlin (Chair), C. Viau, G. Wainer, P. Wolff
Present via Zoom: J. Armstrong, H. Babb, F. Brouard, S. Everts, R. Gorelick, K. Graham, L. Madokoro, L. Marshall, B. O'Connor, M. Pearson, M. Rooney, P. Smith, J. Wallace
Regrets B. Albright-Peakall, M. Baez, B. Campbell, D. Caratao, E. Cyr, J. Malloy, L. Moffitt
Absent: A. Clarke, Y. Gandhi, D. Howe, K. Moss, S. Rajput, J. Taber
Recording Secretary: K. McKinley

1. Welcome & Approval of Agenda

The meeting was called to order at 2:05 pm. Chair and Interim President Jerry Tomberlin reported to Senators that former President Benoit-Antoine Bacon was recently named the 17th President of the University of British Columbia. The Chair expressed gratitude to former President Bacon for his leadership and service to Carleton over the past 5 years, and noted that as interim President he will endeavor to continue Benoit's good work.

The Chair welcomed 20 new Senators to the meeting, and thanked them for their support of academic governance. He also welcomed the following Senators attending their first Senate meeting in new roles:

- L. Pauline Rankin – new Provost and Vice-President Academic
- David Hornsby – new Vice-Provost and AVP Academic
- Anne Bowker – Interim Dean of the Faculty of Arts & Social Sciences
- Howard Nemiroff – Interim Dean of Sprott School of Business
- Omair Shafiq – Interim Director of School of Information Technology
- Dan Siddiqi – new Chair of SCCASP

The Chair noted the recent passing of the following members of the Carleton community:
- Dr. Susan Landau-Clark, Associate Director of the Zelikovitz Centre for Jewish Studies
- Professor Patrick Selvadurai from the Department of Civil Engineering
- Professor George Frajkor, one of Carleton's longest-serving Journalism professors
- Professor David Watkinson, Professor and former Chair of the Department of Earth Sciences

The Chair expressed condolences to those who knew and loved them.

The Chair next reviewed the recently revised meeting protocols for hybrid meetings of Senate:
- Observers are welcome to attend open sessions of Senate but are not allowed to speak, ask questions or vote.
- Senators are encouraged to attend meetings in person, but those joining online are asked to keep microphones muted and cameras on.
- In-person attendees use their name cards to gain the floor and vote.
- Online attendees use the CHAT feature to gain the floor (to move or second a motion, ask a question or provide a comment).
- Online attendees use the raised virtual hand feature on Zoom to vote.

Turning to the agenda, the Chair noted that the Library Committee Annual Report will be submitted in October, and should be struck from today's agenda under Item 10(b) – Reports for Information – Senate Committee Annual Reports.

It was **MOVED** (P. Wolff, K. Taylor) that Senate approve the agenda for the meeting of Senate on September 22, 2023, as amended.
The motion **PASSED**.

2. Minutes: June 2, 2023 (Open Session)

It was **MOVED** (M. Haines, K. Hellemans) that Senate approve the minutes of the Open Session of the Senate meting on June 2, 2023, as presented.
The motion **PASSED**.

3. Matters Arising
There were none.

4. Chair's Remarks
The Chair began his remarks by highlighting the following recent academic achievements:

- Professor Odae Al Aboud (School of Mathematics & Statistics) and Professor Kifah Gharzeddin (Department of Biology) have been elected as members of the Royal Society of Canada College of New Scholars, Scientists and Artists. The Royal Society recognizes exceptional individuals who demonstrate leading scholarly research or artistic excellence.
- Cati Coe, Leila Mostaço-Guidolin and Jennifer Drake have been announced as Canada Research Chairs in Engineering and Political Science. They will advance research in flood infrastructure, fibrosis treatment and services for aging migrants.
- Two Carleton PhD students – Hannah Johnston (Information Technology) and Evan Wicklund (Sociology) are the recipients of a prestigious 2023 Vanier Canada Graduate Scholarship, worth $50,000 per year for 3 years and awarded for exceptional research.

The Chair provided the following research highlights:
- Carleton University has secured an investment of $1.65 million from the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada (NSERC), via their Collaborative Research and Training Experience (CREATE) program. The funding is for research and training in the crucial domains of permafrost, climate change, and sustainability. Through this funding, Stephan Gruber, Canada Research Chair in Climate Change Impacts and Adaptation in Northern Canada, and his team of researchers are tackling the pressing challenges posed by climate change in Arctic communities.

- Dawn Moore (Law and Legal Studies) in partnership with researchers in 3 countries was awarded a $2.5 million Partnership Grant from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council (SSHRC) for their Prison Transparency Project (PTP), which aims to break down barriers in accessing prison information and protecting the human rights of those incarcerated. Also announced was $3.4M in funding for 3 Partnership Development Grants and 15 Insight Grants.
- The Natural Sciences & Engineering Research Council of Canada (NSERC) has awarded $12.5M in research funding to Carleton researchers whose projects support discovery and innovation. These awards include 5 Research Tools & Instruments Grants valued at $468,613 – the highest number and amount that Carleton has historically received. Also included in the NSERC package are one Northern Research Supplement, 3 Subatomic Physics Grants, 12 Discovery Launch Supplements, and 38 Discovery Awards.
- The Canada Foundation for Innovation has granted 13 researchers at Carleton University a total of $1.24 million, under their John R. Evans Leaders Fund (JELF). Funding will support research areas of strategic importance such as health and mental wellbeing, cultural heritage, sustainability, food integrity and language acquisition, among others.

Four distinguished Carleton University alumni have been honoured with appointments to the Order of Canada, in recognition of their profound impacts and contributions to Canadian society and the broader human community:
- Irwin Elman (BA Hons 1982), for his advocacy of children and youth
- Holly Susan McNally (BA, 1970) and Paul McNally (BA Hons, 1970) for advancing Canada's literacy through community-based programming
- Peter Showler (BA 1966) for leadership in immigration and refugee law.

The Chair closed his remarks by noting the following recent events:
- Spring Convocation (June 12 – 16, 2023) celebrated the achievements of more than 5,200 Carleton graduates, and 8 honorary degree recipients.
- Pride Month, in June, was an opportunity to show our respect and support for all members of the 2SLGBTQIA+ community.
- National Indigenous History Month, also in June, was an opportunity to recognize and reflect on the rich history, heritage and diversity of First Nations, Inuit and Métis Peoples across Canada.
- CU Appreciation Day on June 22, was held in person again for the first time in 3 years.

- The Carleton Community Breakfast, held on August 29 and 30, was a chance to say thank-you to former President Benoit-Antoine Bacon for his many contributions and achievements.

5. Question Period

Senator Morgan Rooney submitted two questions in advance:

1) At the 21 April 2023 Senate meeting, the Chair of SCCASP indicated that the existing "Academic Accommodations During Labour Disputes" policy would be reviewed at its August retreat. The key issue at the time was to make sure that Senate, as "the academic head" of the institution (*Academic Governance of the University*, p. 13), is not used in the future as a means to advance non-academic agendas. In particular, Senators sought to clarify the acceptable reasons for altering the normal course of academic matters, especially recommendations or motions 1) to rapidly change modalities and/or 2) to implement SAT/UNS or similar compassionate grading measures. Can the Chair of SCCASP update Senate on progress made on this item and/or provide a timeline for when/if Senate can expect to review a revised version of the "Academic Accommodations During Labour Disputes" policy?

A response to this question was provided during the Report from the Senate Committee on Curriculum Admissions and Studies Policy (SCCASP).

2) In the final week of the CUPE 4600 strike in April 2023, the then-Provost sent out a message to Carleton's academic staff announcing that the administration had taken the extraordinary step of entering into instructors' Brightspace pages without their consent to reactivate course pages that they had deactivated at the start of the legal strike, and in some cases revoked their access to Brightspace altogether. Such actions are likely to have a predictable legacy, degrading instructors' trust in the tool and increasing the likelihood that some will elect not to use it (particularly during terms when their union is in bargaining). Given the many benefits of using an LMS for both instructors and students, the possibility of such an outcome must be of grave concern to Senate given its role as the institution's "academic head." What action(s) has administration taken (or does it have planned) to re-establish trust and to assure instructors that they can use the LMS without fear that doing so could mean putting themselves in a position to undermine the bargaining position of the union that represents them?

Response from President Jerry Tomberlin: Parts of this question deal with labour relations and as such it would be inappropriate to comment on them at Senate. Regarding the effects on the usage of our learning management system (Brightspace), the data from Teaching & Learning Services does not indicate evidence of any impact on engagement with the system.

6. Administration (Clerk)

a. Membership ratifications

Clerk of Senate Elinor Sloan presented a motion to ratify the following new Senators:

- Shane Hawkins – FASS Faculty member (for 3-year term expiring June 30, 2026)
- Mehrnaz Taghavishavazi – Graduate student member (for 1-year term expiring June 30, 2024)
- Morgan Rooney – Contract Instructor (for 3-year term expiring June 30m, 2026).

The Clerk added that Morgan Rooney won the election held this month for Contract Instructor representative on Senate.

It was **MOVED** (M. DeRosa, D. Sprague) that Senate ratify the new Senate appointments, as presented, for service beginning immediately.
The motion **PASSED**.

b. Senate Survey – summary of results

A report on the fifth annual Senate Survey, conducted in May of 2023, was circulated in advance to Senators. The Clerk presented the following highlights:

- Response rate was 40%, an increase in engagement from 2022.
- Positive feedback included:
  - Senate is efficient, welcoming, open and transparent, well organized and collegial.
- Suggestions for improvement:
  - Include PowerPoints in the binder and provide more time for discussion during the meeting.
  - Revise voting protocol for online and hybrid meetings.
  - Include more information on committees at Orientation.

The Clerk thanked all who completed the survey and noted that the next survey would be released in April of 2024.

c. Report on Senate Executive Committee Summer Empowering Motion

The Clerk reported that the Senate Executive Committee, acting on the Summer Empowering Motion, voted in an e-poll on July 11, 2023 to ratify the membership of the newly created Ad Hoc Committee on Graduate Academic Governance.

d. Advisory Committee on the President & Vice-Chancellor – Senate-elected Membership

The Clerk reported on the recent election of academic staff and student members to the Advisory Committee on the President & Vice-Chancellor. An election for undergraduate and academic staff members was held among Senators on August 29-30. The Senate-elected members to this committee include the following:

- Adrian Chan – Academic Staff member (elected)
- Kim Hellemans – Academic Staff member (elected)
- Betina Appel Kuzmarov – Academic Staff member (elected)
- Mira Gillis – undergraduate student (elected)
- Farzam Sepanta – graduate student (acclaimed)

The Clerk added that the full list of committee members has been posted on the Secretariat website.

7. Reports:

a. SCCASP (D. Siddiqi)

Committee Chair Dan Siddiqi began his report with a response to Question #1 submitted by Morgan Rooney. (See Item 5 - Question Period above.) He noted that the discussion of the Senate Policy on Academic Accommodations During Labour Disputes has begun at SCCASP but that more discussion will be needed before SCCASP is ready to bring a report to Senate.

Three items were then presented for approval and there were 2 items for information.

Items for Approval:

R-ADM-Program Certificate in Science and Policy
It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, H. Nemiroff) that Senate approves the revisions to Regulation: TBD-2093 R-ADM-Program Cert Science Policy Requirement effective for the 2024/25 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.
The motion **PASSED**.

UG-ADM General-4 English language Proficiency Admission Regulation
It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, M. Rooney) that Senate approves the revisions to Regulation: UG-ADM-General-4 English Language Proficiency Requirements effective for the 2024/25 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.
The motion **PASSED**.

R-UG-3.4.4 Application to Graduate (change of dates)
It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, D. Hornsby) that Senate approves the revisions to Regulation: R-UG-3.4.4 Application for Graduation Requirements effective for the 2023/24 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.
The motion **PASSED**.

Items for Information:
- Minor Modifications dated June 6, 2023
- Sprott Micro-credential list for SCCASP, August 2023.

b. SQAPC (D. Hornsby)

Committee Chair David Hornsby presented one cyclical review report for approval.

It was **MOVED** (D. Hornsby, A. Bowker) that Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the Undergraduate and Graduate programs in Geography and Environmental Studies.
The motion **PASSED**.

c. SAGC (E. Sloan)

Committee Chair Elinor Sloan presented a motion to ratify 12 new committee members:

Senate Committee on Curriculum Admissions and Studies Policy
- Pascal Gin (Faculty member – FASS)
- Emily Gray (Faculty member – Sprott)
- Mike Hildebrand (Faculty member – FGPA)
- Vandna Bhatia (Faculty member – FPA)

Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee
- Paul Keen (Faculty member – FASS)

Senate Honorary Degrees Committee
- Jennifer Evans (Faculty member – FASS)
- Donald Russell (Faculty member – FED)
- Chris Worswick (Faculty member – FPA)

Senate Undergraduate Studies Committee
- Ernest Kwan (Faculty member – Sprott)
- Susan Birkwood (Faculty member – FASS)

Senate Review Committee
- Dan Siddiqi (Faculty member) Chair – acclaimed
- Shane Hawkins (Faculty member – FASS)

It was **MOVED** (E. Sloan, L. Kostiuk) that Senate ratify the nominees for Senate committees, as presented, for service beginning immediately upon approval. The motion **PASSED**.

8. Strategic Integrated Plan Annual Implementation Report

The SIP Annual Implementation Report reviews the progress achieved in implementing the latest Strategic Integrated Plan (2020-2025) each year. This year's report was presented in June to the Board of Governors by former President Benoit-Antoine Bacon. A copy of the report was circulated in advance to Senators.

The Chair noted the challenging context for this SIP. It was approved during the early days of the pandemic which then continued for two years. In addition to the general context of economic instability and geopolitical unrest over the past few years, the university has been operating in a challenging fiscal context, due to the frozen provincial grant and continuing tuition freeze.

Despite these challenges, significant progress has been achieved on all three strategic directions and all 15 "We Will" statements of the plan. The Chair presented, in reverse order, his "top 5" highlights from these successes:

#5) Organizational Excellence
- Achieved a balanced budget under challenging circumstances
- 2023 – one of Canada's Top 100 Employers. Only 4 universities are on this list and Carleton is the only one from Ontario.
- 2023 – one of National Capital Region's Top Employers
- Awards of Excellence for Healthy Workplace + Platinum recipient for Mental Health at Work
- Gold rating from AASHE for sustainability
- #1 Sustainable campus in Ontario and #2 Sustainable campus in Canada (2020)

#4) New Innovative Spaces
- Future Learning Hub
- Carleton Dominion Chalmers Centre
- Carleton Hub 350 in Kanata North
- New Engineering Design Centre
- Nicol Building Innovation Hub

#3) Inclusion – Carleton is a sector leader in this area.
- EDI Action Plan
- Coordinated Accessibility Strategy
- Kinàmàgawin Indigenous Strategy
- Student Mental Health Framework

#2) Student Success
- Largest graduation years in history (2021, 2022, 2023)
- 1-year retention rate above 90% for past three cohorts
- 2-year retention rate at historic highs – at or above 83% for past 3 cohorts
- Graduation rate at all-time high of 73% up from 68% in 2017

#1) Research Excellence
- Grants continue to trend upwards
- 3-year average external research revenue at $91.4M
- Holistic Integrated Partnerships have grown by 540% (Ericsson, CAE, QNX, IBM, Bruyère, etc.)

Next steps:
- New Residence opening in Fall 2025 – 450 new spaces
- $100M+ in annual research funding
- Moving towards next fundraising campaign of $500M

- Renewal of the SIP in 2025

Discussion:
A Senator asked for clarification on the growth of graduating students, and whether this is simply due to growth in enrolment. The Chair noted that while graduate enrolment has increased, undergraduate growth has been challenged in recent years, due largely to the pandemic and visa issues for international students. The higher graduation rate can be attributed to improvements in retention.

A Senator asked about Carleton's long-term policy for in-person vs. online work for staff and faculty. The Chair noted that Carleton does have a policy on flexible work arrangements but it is difficult to predict at this time what the mix will be for online vs in person teaching moving forward.

There were no further questions.

9. Artificial Intelligence (AI) Working Group Report

Provost L. Pauline Rankin introduced this item, noting that this complex issue is of great interest to all of the Carleton community, particularly academic staff. Vice-Provost David Hornsby, Chair of the AI Working Group, then provided an overview of the report that was circulated to Senators in advance.

New generative artificial intelligence tools, such as ChatGPT have become widely available to the public and have evolved the capacity to generate content that is often difficult to distinguish from human intellectual property. As a result, these AI tools raise legitimate concerns related to academic integrity. The report considers various adaptive strategies universities may adopt to recognize and deal with both the opportunities and the challenges of generative AI tools within our sector.

From one perspective, generative AI tools may provide opportunities for innovative teaching methods and customized learning activities. For example, AI could assist in individual learning by serving as a Socratic opponent, study buddy, or tutor. AI could be used to generate games and challenges to enhance learning. However, in considering options, instructors should always begin by determining whether these tools align with the course's learning outcomes, and must also consider and evaluate any potential risks.

The challenges of AI tools are of particular concern to instructors, as AI can now effectively generate computer code, equations, images, and different types of text, including essays. The report provides a set of guidelines for instructors considering the use of AI tools, plus a number of strategies and pedagogical tips for instructors to adapt course assignment design so that it is more difficult for students to use AI inappropriately.

The report also recommends the following additional actions:

- The Academic Integrity Policy should be updated to reference generative AI tools more specifically.
- Deans' Offices could investigate the creation of a centralized Academic Integrity Office to support disciplinary Faculties, collect data and maintain a website devoted to AI information.
- Similarly, a collaboratively created FAQ page for students and instructors could provide guidelines on the ethical (and unethical) uses of AI tools.

Discussion:
- In response to a question from the floor, the Vice-Provost affirmed that the report may be circulated outside of Senate, provided that Senators do not have any adjustments to recommend. The report will be circulated to the community within the next week via the TLS email list.
- A Senator asked about the recommendation to edit the Academic Integrity Policy. In response it was noted that the suggestion is to insert explicit language stating that the use of AI and text generators constitutes an academic integrity infraction. The Chair added that any changes to the AI Policy will be presented to, discussed at and approved by Senate.
- Regarding other suggestions, these will be discussed among various relevant groups before decisions are made regarding how, when or if to move forward with the recommendations. The working group will continue to meet each term to ensure that they are current with the evolving technologies.
- A Senator commented that adaptive strategies suggested in the report, particularly in re-weighting different types of assignments, have been helpful in reducing the misuse of AI in their classes. The Vice-Provost agreed that creative approaches are useful and needed in encouraging students to treat assessments seriously without defaulting to text generators.
- A Senator asked if a boilerplate template could be made available to use for course syllabi. The Vice-Provost responded that a template should be available for instructors to use next term.
- A Senator asked whether CHAT-BOT bots could be used as a tool for students to evaluate their own writing, to determine if it resembles CHAT-bot output. The Vice-Provost noted that AI detector tools are unreliable and inefficient, and also many have been monetized so that subscription fees may now be required to access them. He added that TLS is working with ITS on Chat GPT from a coding perspective, to support university systems.

The Chair thanked Vice-Provost Hornsby and his team for their ongoing work on this project, and encouraged Senators to send any further suggestions, observations and comments to the Vice-Provost by email as soon as possible in order to be incorporated into the draft before it is circulated to the broader community. Senators also were encouraged to explore the resources provided on the group's webpage for more information.

10. **Reports for Information:**
    a. **Senate Executive Minutes**
        i. **May 23, 2023**
        ii. **E-polls: June 7, June 13, June 14, July 11**

    There was no discussion of this item.

    b. Senate Committee Annual Reports
        i. Senate Student Academic Integrity Appeals Committee (SAIAC)
        ii. Senate Undergraduate Studies Committee (SUSC)
        iii. Senate Committee on Undergraduate Student Awards
        iv. Senate Graduate Student Appeals Committee
    c. Senate Report
    d. Report from COU Academic Colleague

Questions and Comments on Reports:

The Chair introduced each report in turn and invited comments/questions from Senators.

SAIAC Report: A Senator asked the Chair of SAIAC to comment on the noticeable drop in academic integrity cases this year, and also whether there has been an increase in Chat GPT or Chatbot cases. Committee Chair Cristina Ruiz-Martin responded that the return to in-person classes and exams has resulted in fewer cases of academic integrity appeals, particularly in the Faculties of Science and Engineering, which had experienced a high volume of cases in previous years.

A Senator from Science added that the Office of the Dean of the Faculty of Science has been providing instructors with support in finding ways to prevent academic integrity violations. She noted that the number of academic integrity cases in her large classes dropped from 70 to 6 over the past year, through the use of new pedagogical techniques. It was also noted that the Academic Integrity Policy had been revised to include a "parking ticket" option for students, who could plea out, which also reduces the number of appeals.

COU Academic Colleague Report: Kim Hellemans noted topics for discussion at upcoming COU metings will include the Blue Ribbon Panel, International Students and Housing, and university sector responses to Anti-Queer Anti-Trans sentiments

across the country. She advised that she has been appointed to the COU Executive Committee, and reappointed to the COU Government and Community Relations Committee, both for one-year terms to June 30, 2024.

11. Other Business

There was none.

12. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned (D. Hornsby, L. Kostiuk) at 3:42 p.m.