



Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.

**Carleton University Senate
Meeting of January 26, 2024 at 2:00 pm
Pigiarvik 608**

Minutes

Present in Person: B. Albright-Peakall, J. Armstrong, M. Barbeau, S. Blanchard, A. Bordeleau, A. Bowker (Proxy: P. Keen), W. Chung, E. Cyr, M. DeRosa L. Dyke, R. Gorelick, S. Hawkins, K. Hellemans, D. Hornsby, L. Kostiuk, A. Lannon (proxy – E. Bilodeau), F. Lepore, A. MacDonald, B. MacLeod, J. Mason, D. Mendeloff, J. Murray, H. Nemiroff, A. North, P. Rankin, R. Renfroe, M. Rooney, S. Seneviratne, O. Shafiq, D. Siddiqi, E. Sloan (Clerk), D. Sprague, J. Tomberlin (Chair), G. Wainer,

Present via Zoom: H. Babb, F. Brouard, S. Burges, B. Campbell, J.P. Corriveau, S. Everts, R. Goubran, K. Graham, T. Haats, M. Haines, M. Huckvale, L. Madokoro, J. Malloy, P. Mkandawire, R. Nelson, B. O’Connor, A. Park, M. Pearson, S. Rajput, M. F. Riazudden, C. Smelser, P. Smith, C. Viau, J. Wallace, P. Wolff

Regrets: M. Baez, H. Becker, D. Caratao, N. Hagigi, L. Marshall, L. Moffitt, B. O’Neill, K. Taylor,

Absent: E. Abou Zeid, A. Clarke, Y. Gandhi, D. Howe, K. Moss, G. Pickton, J. Taber, M. Taghavishavazi,

Recording Secretary: K. McKinley

1. Welcome & Approval of Agenda

The meeting was called to order at 2:01 pm. The Chair welcomed Senators to the first Senate meeting of 2024. He noted that January 27th is Holocaust Remembrance Day and that the O-train bridge will be illuminated in yellow as a symbol of Carleton’s commitment to stand against antisemitism and all forms of hatred. The Chair also highlighted that on January 29th Carleton will be marking the National Day of Remembrance of the Québec City Mosque Attack and Action against Islamophobia. Carleton will illuminate the O-train bridge in green, as a reminder of the work that is needed to eradicate Islamophobia, and also to recognize the resilience and strength of Muslim communities.

The Chair also remarked that the state funeral for the Honorable Ed Broadbent, former leader of the NDP, will be held on Sunday January 28th in the Carleton Dominion Chalmers Centre. On campus, flags will be lowered to half-mast to mark the occasion. The Honorable Mr. Broadbent passed away on January 11, 2024.

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, D. Mendeloff) that Senate approve the agenda for the meeting of Senate on January 26, 2024, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

2. **Minutes:** November 24, 2023 (open session)

It was **MOVED** (D. Hornsby, D. Sprague) that Senate approve the minutes of the open session of the Senate meeting on November 24, 2023, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

3. **Matters Arising**

There were none.

4. **Chair's Remarks**

The Chair began his remarks with an update on the Presidential search, which was launched in the fall of 2023 with the establishment of the Advisory Committee on the President and Vice-Chancellor. Community feedback was received in the Fall of 2023, and community consultations were completed in December of 2023. Boyden Executive Search has been actively involved in generating candidate interest and referrals over the past 3 months. At present, a long list has been generated and interviews with shortlisted candidates are planned for February and March of 2024. Updates will be posted on the Presidential Search website as the process continues this term.

The Chair next noted the following recent Carleton successes:

- 85 Carleton researchers have made the 2022 Stanford Elsevier coveted list of world's most-cited scholars, ranking in the top 2% of most-cited scientists. Among them are Senators Maria DeRosa, Michel Barbeau and Gabriel Wainer. The Chair congratulated all on this achievement.
- Carleton researchers, backed by Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada (NSERC) funding, are pioneering solar-powered heating technology to improve heating in northern communities. Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering Professor Jean Duquette and his team will be designing and prototyping a solar-

driven absorption thermal energy storage system. This project, which could be a game changer for northern communities, is being supported by a new five-year National Science & Engineering Research Council Alliance Grant.

- Dr. Rafik Goubran, the Vice-President, Research & International, and Chancellor's Professor at Carleton University, has been honoured with the 2023 AGE-WELL Honorary Fellow Award. As a longstanding AGE-WELL researcher and a key figure in the inception of Sensors and Analytics for Monitoring Mobility and Memory (SAM3), a national innovation hub, Dr. Goubran plays a crucial role in leading the Challenge Area dedicated to Supportive Homes and Communities. The Chair congratulated Dr. Rafik for this achievement.
- Carleton University has entered a multi-year partnership with Ross Video to spearhead innovation and foster development in robotics, artificial intelligence, and digital systems and hardware design.
- Four distinguished members of the Carleton University community - Nik Nanos, Noella Maria Milne, Firdaus Khara, and André Picard - have been honoured with the Order of Canada for their significant impacts on Canadian society and the world.

The Chair reminded Senators of the 5th annual Kinàmàgawin Symposium on Thursday February 8th. This year's theme is "Connecting to Indigenous Spirituality." More details on the schedule and speakers can be found on the website.

February is Black History Month, and Carleton will be hosting a number of events to celebrate the many achievements and contributions of Black people and their communities. More information will be posted soon on the website.

Finally, the Chair spoke to a recent announcement from the Federal Minister of Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship (IRCC) regarding changes to the student visa program in Canada.

IRCC recently announced a cap on the number of study permits that will be issued to international undergraduate students at post-secondary institutions. The cap will start in September 2024, and will extend for a period of 2 years. As of January 22, 2024, international students applying to undergraduate programs in Canadian colleges and universities will be required to submit a provincial attestation letter (PAL) along with their study permit application. The attestation letter will provide evidence that the student has been accommodated within the provincial allocation. Provinces are expected to be ready to issue PALs to international applicants by March 31, 2024. No visas will be issued until

the process is in place and the attestation template has been created. The Chair noted that students applying to Masters and Doctoral programs will not be required to submit a PAL.

This action was motivated by the impact of international students on housing demand, and the perception that small licensed private colleges in Ontario were using the system to provide low-quality education and a short-cut to Permanent Residency status.

The cap is expected to result in a reduction in the number of student permits across Canada from approximately 600,000 to 360,000. British Columbia and Ontario will be impacted most significantly. Ontario's estimated allotment will be 142,000 visa applications. It is not clear if unsuccessful applications would permit the province or institution to put another student into the mix.

Visa renewals and existing permits held by international students will not be affected. It is unclear if exchange students and international student applications from within Canada would be included in the cap.

Carleton currently hosts 4,168 international students including 2,927 undergraduate and 1,241 graduate students. Intake of new international undergraduate students has ranged from 548 to 867 in recent years, with some declines in recent years as a result of student permit processing delays.

The Ontario government is still developing a plan, and as such, it is unclear what the final impact on Carleton will be. Carleton is engaging directly with the Ministry of Colleges and Universities and working collaboratively with the Council of Ontario Universities on a regional response, to ensure that the Ontario government understands our perspective.

Discussion/Questions:

A Senator asked if there might be regional quotas or allocations established within Ontario. The Chair responded that it is not yet known whether the province will target certain sectors such as private colleges, or whether there may be allocations by institution, program or other factors.

In response to another question, the Chair emphasized that new incoming graduate students do not need the attestation from the province, so units should proceed as normal in making offers and processing applications.

A Senator asked if student groups (graduate and undergraduate) will be consulted for information-gathering as the university works towards a response to the situation. The Chair replied that input from student groups is welcome as much as time allows. He also noted that student organizations province-wide could work together in advocacy to have conversations with the ministry.

A Senator reported that students are very concerned by this announcement and are looking for more information. The Chair noted that communications to inform students are being prepared. The ISSO newsletter is one resource, and an FAQ page will be available soon, with information that will be updated regularly. The Chair also remarked that students already at Carleton should not be impacted by this event.

In response to another question, the Chair noted that online courses for international students could be an option in some programs, and expanding online offerings for international students will be explored. The Chair also reiterated that the ministry is still developing a process, and as such, how the policy will be implemented is not yet known.

5. Question Period

Questions were submitted by Senators Root Gorelick, Nir Hagigi and Morgan Rooney.

Questions from Root Gorelick:

- *Why has the Senate Educational Equity Committee not yet been reconstituted?*
- Response from Clerk of Senate: It is the intention of the Senate Academic Governance Committee to recommend to Senate the removal of this committee, which has not met in over a decade. However, the committee is tied to the Educational Equity Policy within the umbrella of Carleton's Human Rights Policies and Procedures. Until the policy has been updated, SAGC is not able to proceed with this recommendation.
- *Carleton's administration is proposing budget cuts of 3% for academic programs in 2024/2025. Concomitantly, multiple rumours circulate that Carleton is preparing to start a new medical school and/or a new nursing school, either of which is an expensive new program to establish. Less than a decade ago, Carleton severely underestimated costs for the new Health Science building, especially its animal care facilities. In fall 2023, Carleton University's Strategic Integrated Planning Committee (SIPC) commissioned a report from Ken Steele on how to cope with budget austerity. With that rambling preamble, here are seven related questions:*

- 1. *Is a new medical or nursing school at Carleton mentioned in the current Strategic Mandate Agreement (SMA) or any other formal agreement between Carleton University and the Ontario Ministry of Colleges and Universities (MCU)? If so, could senate be provided with that document?*
 - 2. *Are rumours true that Carleton is preparing to start either a medical or nursing school? If such rumours are false, please ignore questions 3-4 and proceed to questions 5-7.*
 - 3. *If such rumours are true, why has senate never been consulted?*
 - 4. *If such rumours are true, how is Carleton justifying budget cuts to existing programs when large monetary sums will need to be redeployed to establish a new medical school and/or new nursing school?*
 - 5. *Regardless of whether there are plans for a new medical or nursing school, will Carleton be following Ken Steele's November 2023 recommendations to SIPC to "revamp low performing programs with potential" and to eliminate "underperforming programs" in order to "redeploy resources"?*
 - 6. *If Carleton will be adopting Ken Steele's November 2023 recommendations to SIPC, how will Carleton gauge what constitutes "low performing programs with potential" and "under-performing programs"? Eliminating academic programs in the face of financial stringency falls under purview of Carleton's senate.*
 - 7. *Has the Senate Review Committee considered Ken Steele's November 2023 recommendations to SIPC?*
- Response from Provost Pauline Rankin: The Provost first noted an error in the preamble to the series of questions from Senator Gorelick. Carleton University did not commission a report from Ken Steele, nor was a report provided by Mr. Steele when he visited Carleton in the Fall of 2023. The Provost reported that a medical or nursing school is not included in the current SMA, but Carleton is preparing to introduce a nursing program in collaboration with the Queensway Carleton Hospital. The new program will be housed in the Faculty of Science. The nursing program will address a pressing society need for additional nurses in Ontario and will be an opportunity to attract new students to Carleton. Revenue estimated to flow from the new program will be an important component of budgetary considerations moving forward. A comprehensive business plan has been prepared by OIRP, and the program will come to Senate for approval via the normal channels.

Questions from Nir Hagigi:

In the wake of the substantial walkout that happened on Thursday, November 9th, a powerful display of solidarity supporting Palestinians that harmoniously brought together students of diverse backgrounds, including Jews, Muslims, and Christians, students are eager to seek an extensive update from the Carleton University Senate.

Could the Senate shed light on the university's stance and provide clarity on the progress or plans in place to address the following demands, as presented during the walkout:

- 1. Properly addressing the needs of Carleton University's Palestinian student population, many of whom have familial ties to individuals affected by displacement, injury, and loss of life. Additionally, explicitly condemning the growing instances of anti-Palestinian and Islamophobic racism on campus.*
- 2. Initiating a divestment strategy from weapons manufacturers implicated in the ongoing conflict, with a focus on dismantling any association with entities that contribute to the genocide of Palestinians.*
- 3. Divesting from defense contractors and weapons manufacturing co-op employers, aligning the university's investments with ethical considerations and human rights principles.*
- 4. Commencing the process of renaming buildings and programs associated with individuals complicit in ethnic cleansing, ensuring that the university's institutional history reflects a commitment to justice and inclusivity.*
- 5. Addressing student concerns regarding study trips to Israel, fostering an environment where all student voices are heard and taken into consideration.*

In light of the visible and widespread support for Palestine demonstrated by the diverse student body and the call for a ceasefire, could the Carleton University Senate provide insights into the university's plans to address these crucial matters? Understanding the steps being taken to acknowledge and respond to these concerns would undoubtedly contribute to fostering an atmosphere of transparency and understanding on our campus.

Response from Chair:

The Chair noted that questions 2 – 5 are not in the purview of Senate. With regards to question #1, the Chair responded that as indicated in earlier messages to the community, Carleton remains focused on our mission to ensure that all students, faculty and staff are able to pursue studies, work, research, and teaching in a safe and supportive and welcoming environment. Issues such as anti-Palestinian racism, Islamophobia, and anti-Semitism will be addressed as they arise.

Question 2/3: The Chair confirmed that Carleton's general endowment does not include investments directly with weapons manufacturers or defense contractors. Carleton follows responsible investment policies for all investment decisions, and all investment managers are signatories to the UN Principles for Responsible Investment. As required by the province, Carleton has an ESG policy in place, and investors are encouraged to consult that policy when making investment decisions.

Question 3: Co-op is not a work placement program, but rather a work-integrated learning program to support the development of future professionals. Students themselves choose which opportunities to apply for and are able to decline any

offers without penalty. Employers are vetted according to Carleton's employer terms and conditions.

Question 4: Carleton's Philanthropic Naming Policy outlines the conditions under which buildings are renamed, in recognition of outstanding individuals or as a result of donor agreements.

Question 5: Study trips are not mandatory; students can choose among the opportunities provided by the university.

Questions from Morgan Rooney:

- *In October 2023, Senate passed the [Academic Consideration Policy for Students in Medical and Other Extenuating Circumstances](#). This policy defines "extenuating circumstances" as circumstances that "are beyond a student's control; have a significant impact on the student's capacity to meet their academic obligations; and could not have been reasonably prevented" (p.2). Meanwhile, in its recent response to the April 2023 "question on academic accommodations in the event of a labor dispute," SCCASP cited Carleton's response to the 2008 OC Transpo strike as evidence that "Transit disruptions are normally considered circumstances that require accommodation." But a city-wide stoppage of all OC Transpo busses/trains is not equivalent to OC Transpo bus operators refusing to cross a picket line (which they don't ever do during a strike). In such circumstances, city-wide transit continues to operate, but passengers coming to Carleton are dropped off at the campus entrance. According to Google Maps, the distance from the Bronson gate to the transit stop in front of the Minto Building is 600 metres and takes roughly 9 minutes to walk. **Could the chair of SCCASP clarify if, based on the terms of the new Academic Consideration Policy, adding a 9-minute walk to students' commute would be considered "extenuating circumstances" that warrant accommodations under the policy? Or, by the terms of the policy, is such a circumstance not "extenuating" and therefore does not merit accommodation, meaning Senate will not see a repetition of the events of March 2023, when the University "recommended" that courses move online for the duration of a strike?***

Response from Chair of Senate and Chair of SCCASP:

The Chair first called attention to an error of fact in the final part of the question. Instructors in March of 2023 were advised that they may choose to move their classes online, at their discretion; the university administration did not recommend that action, as was stated in the question.

The Chair of SCCASP remarked that, while the question comes in the context of a labor dispute, which is more nuanced than just a traffic delay, indeed a minor traffic delay does not meet the criteria of "extenuating circumstances", as evidenced by the recent water line bursting or the opening of the locks, which cause similar delays.

- *During the October 2023 discussion of the [Academic Consideration Policy for Students in Medical and Other Extenuating Circumstances](#), Senate was promised a number of changes to the self-declaration process – i.e., that “all submissions will go through the Registrar’s Office,” that the RO “will track the data and assess supports needed for students,” and so on. As of the date of writing this (January 12, 2024), however, the updates needed to fulfill these promises are incomplete. The [main landing page of the RO’s website](#) still does not reference the policy: instead, one has to click “additional services” from the main menu, then click the ambiguously named “academic consideration for coursework” link, only to be brought to a [new page](#) that mentions forms for short- and long-term requests that are only linked to in the FAQs below ([here](#) and [here](#)). Meanwhile, the first four items that appear in a Google search for “Carleton University Self-Declaration Form” link to the old PDF form, which features outdated instructions and does not allow for tracking. **When can instructors expect that this information will be cleaned up and made more accessible for students (and the old form removed from online)? When that work is done, will all instructors, staff, and students be sent a communication with updated information and links? And is there any reason why we opted for a Wordpress form for short-term requests (which will facilitate easier tracking) but a PDF form for long-term requests (which will make tracking more cumbersome)?***

Response from the VP Students & Enrollment:

Although the revised Academic Consideration Policy was discussed in Senate in October of 2023, the new policy has only become operational as of January 2024. Information will be sent to students and instructors in order to familiarize everyone with the new policy, and the RO website will be updated to include an Accommodations tab on the homepage for easy access. Finally, the long-term accommodation request form will require more IT assistance to convert into Wordpress, due to confidentiality issues.

A Senator asked how to make students more aware that providing false information on these forms is an academic offense. The VPSE responded that students are already required to attest that they are providing true and accurate information, but that the RO will look for additional opportunities to advise students of this through various publications.

6. Administration (Clerk)

The Clerk of Senate presented 3 motions for Senate approval.

- Ratification of Paul Williams (FASS faculty member) to Senate:
It was **MOVED** (B. MacLeod, D. Siddiqi) that Senate ratify the new Senate member, as presented, for service beginning immediately upon approval.
The motion **PASSED**.
- Approve 4 new Convocation dates and one change to an existing date:
It was **MOVED** (J. Mason, J. Armstrong) that Senate approve the Convocation dates from 2024-27, as presented.
The motion **PASSED**.
- Ratification of a new member of the Athletics Board. Senate is responsible for appointing faculty members to this Board:
It was **MOVED** (D. Hornsby, D. Mendeloff) that Senate ratify the membership of Sean Burges to the Athletics Board, for service beginning immediately upon approval.

A Senator asked why Senate is involved in membership for this non-academic entity. The Clerk responded that as part of the last revision to the AGU, the Senate Office contacted all of the non-Senate committees and Boards listed in Section 9.6 of the AGU, to determine whether Senate should be involved in their membership processes. Some committees were removed from the list, but others, such as the Athletics Board, felt it was advantageous for Senate to assist in the membership process for the faculty members on their Board.

The motion **PASSED**.

7. Reports:

a. **Senate Committee on Curriculum Admissions & Studies Policy (SCCASP) (D. Siddiqi)**

Committee Chair Dan Siddiqi presented 8 items for approval, and 7 items for information.

Items for Approval:

RBD-1363 R-ADM-Program-BCOM – change to admission requirement for the Bachelor of Commerce

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, H. Nemiroff) that Senate approves the revisions to admission requirements for TBD-1363 R-ADM-Program-BCOM effective for the 2024/25 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

TBD-1371 R-ADM-Program-BIT – change to admission requirement for the OSS program in Bachelor of Information Technology

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, O. Shafiq) that Senate approves the revision to admission requirements for TBD-1371 R-ADM-Program-BIT effective for the 2025/26 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

TBD 1596 R-ADM-Program-PBD Professional Writing – deletion of admission regulation in tandem with deletion of program (post-baccalaureate diploma in professional writing)

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, D. Sprague) that Senate approves the revision to regulation TBD-1596 R-ADM-Program-PBD effective for the 2024/25 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

TBD-1597 R-ADM-Program-CPW (Certificate in Professional Writing) – deletion of admission regulation in tandem with deletion of program.

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, D. Sprague) that Senate approves the revision to regulation TBD-1597 R-ADM-Program-CPW effective for the 2024/25 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

TBD-1569 R-UG-COOP-BAS Adm and Cont Requirements – Change to the overall CGPA requirement for Bachelor of Architectural Studies Co-op

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, A. Bordeleau) that Senate approves the revision to regulation TBD-1569 R-UG-COOP-BAS Adm and Continuation requirements effective for the 2024/25 Undergraduate Calendar, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

TBD-1760 R-UG-COOP-BA, BSc Geomatics Adm and Cont Requirements – change to the course pre-requisites for BA Geomatics Co-op

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, S. Blanchard) that Senate approves the revision to regulation TBD-1760 R-UG-COOP-BA, BSc Geomatics Adm and Continuation Requirements effective for the 2024/25 Undergraduate Calendar as presented. The motion **PASSED**.

TBD-1817 R-UG-COOP-BMPD Adm and Cont Requirements – change to the work-study pattern for Media Production and Design Co-op

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, S. Blanchard) that Senate approves the revision to regulation TBD-1817 R-UG-COOP-BMPD Adm and Continuation Requirements effective for the 2024/25 Undergraduate Calendar as presented. The motion **PASSED**.

TBD-1844 R-UG-2.1.2 Full and Part-time Courses – addition of Regularly Scheduled Break language for undergraduate students (international students – for immigration purposes)

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, L. Kostiuk) that Senate approves the revision to regulation TBD-1844 R-UG-2.1.2 Full-and Part-time Study effective for the 2023/24 Undergraduate Calendar as presented. The motion **PASSED**.

Items for Information:

- Minor modifications for November 2023, December 2023 and January 2024 (5 attachments)
- Micro-credentials – Decommissioned Micro-credentials as of January 2024
- TBD-1871 R-UG-3.2.4 – The Cumulative Grade Point Average – new wording to emphasize best grade and its application.

b. Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee (SQAPC) (D. Hornsby)

Committee Chair David Hornsby presented 3 cyclical review reports, 9 major modifications, and one school name change for Senate approval, plus minor modifications from the Dominican University College for information.

Cyclical Review Reports – These were combined into an omnibus motion.

It was **MOVED** (D. Hornsby, D. Mendeloff) that Senate approve the Final Assessment Reports and Executive Summaries arising from the Cyclical Reviews of the programs.

The motion **PASSED**.

Individual motions from the Omnibus:

- MOTION: That Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the graduate programs in Philanthropy and Nonprofit Leadership.
- MOTION: That Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the undergraduate and graduate programs in Psychology.
- MOTION: That Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the undergraduate programs in Greek and Roman Studies.

Major Modifications: These were combined into an omnibus motion.

It was **MOVED** (D. Hornsby, L. Dyke) that Senate approve the major modifications as presented below.

The motion **PASSED**.

Individual Motions from the Omnibus:

- MOTION: That Senate approve the introduction of the collaborative specialization in African Studies to the PHD program in English as presented with effect from Fall 2024.
- MOTION: That Senate approve the introduction of the collaborative specialization in African Studies to the PHD program in Political Science as presented with effect from Fall 2024.
- MOTION: That Senate approve the major modification to the MA program in Geography as presented with effect from Fall 2024.
- MOTION: That Senate approve the introduction of the collaborative specialization in African Studies to the PHD program in Architecture as presented with effect from Fall 2024.
- MOTION: That Senate approve the major modification to ARTH 4909 as presented with effect from Fall 2024.

- MOTION: That Senate approve the major modification to CHST 2904 & 2905 as presented with effect from Fall 2024.
- MOTION: That Senate approve the major modification to HRSJ 4906 as presented with effect from Fall 2024.
- MOTION: That Senate approve the deletion of the Certificate and Post-Baccalaureate Diploma and the major modification to the Minor in Professional Writing and the addition of ENGL 3420 as presented with effect from Fall 2024.
- MOTION: That Senate approve the standalone PHD program in Canadian Studies as presented with effect from Fall 2024.

Academic Unit Name Change: School of Canadian & Indigenous Studies

It was **MOVED** (D. Hornsby, D. Siddiqi) that Senate recommends to the Board of Governors the change in the name of the School of Canadian and Indigenous Studies to School of Canadian Studies as presented to take effect immediately upon approval.

The motion **PASSED**.

Item for Information:

- Minor Modifications from Dominican University College

c. **Senate Academic Governance Committee (SAGC)** (E. Sloan)

This item was not presented, as there was no report from the committee.

d. **Senate Review Committee** (D. Siddiqi)

The Senate Review Committee met on January 16, 2024 to review the draft Fall 2023 Enrolment Report from the Office of the VP Students & Enrolment. The committee composed a series of questions related to the report. The questions were sent to the OVPSE, and were circulated to Senators, along with the draft Enrolment Report.

VP Students & Enrolment Suzanne Blanchard presented a revised 2023 Enrolment Report to Senators, including extra information in response to the questions submitted by the Senate Review Committee.

The revised Enrolment Report showed full-time new undergraduate enrolment at the first-year level, and overall full-time undergraduate enrolment in degree programs with data from 2019 to 2022 for comparison. Fall 2023 new full-time undergraduate enrolment was down 3.6%, largely due to visa issues for international students. International student enrolment at the undergraduate level has been dropping since 2019. In Fall of 2022, international students were required to be on campus which provided an additional limitation for enrolment.

Overall, undergraduate enrolment is stable, with a slight increase in domestic students, and decrease in international students. Retention levels are high. In terms of corridor funding, the provincial grant has not changed for several years, and the enrolment numbers are within the corridor specified in the SMA.

New Full Time undergraduate student numbers have fallen below the projected targets, largely due to decreased international student enrolment. Within individual Faculties, FASS numbers are up, FPA enrolment has been in decline since 2019, Sprott enrolment increased in 2021, but has decreased since then, and Science has fluctuated over the past few years but is now ahead of 2019 numbers. FED enrolment has fluctuated over the past 5 years due to various trends within the Faculty.

For graduate degrees, which often include more part-time students, Full-Time Equivalent (FTEs) provide a more accurate count. Master's student enrolment shows steady growth over the past 4 years, with a spike for the MBA online enrolment between 2022 and 2023. Doctoral student enrolment overall shows growth and is stable.

The report included a number of graphs that showed enrolment trends within each Faculty over a 12-year period. For undergraduate enrolment, the Sprott School of Business experienced a peak in 2021, due to the completion of the new Nicol Building, and the increase in online offerings. Similarly, FPA experienced a peak in 2012 with the introduction of the BGINs program. FASS, Science and Engineering show overall growth.

Master's enrolment has increased significantly over the past year for Sprott with the introduction of the online MBA. FED has seen some peaks and declines over the past few years, FPA overall is slowly declining, FASS is stable and Science enrolment is stable with a slight decrease this year.

Doctoral student enrolment has seen slow increases in Business and Science, with a peak for Science enrolment in 2021. FPA and FED enrolment is stable and FASS enrolment at the PhD level is stable with some slight peaks.

Discussion:

A Senator noted that departments within FED are undergoing budget cuts, and asked if these can be tied directly to decreases in international student enrolment. The VP Students & Enrolment replied that the impact of changes in international student enrolment on specific programs is difficult to predict. She noted that Carleton continues to be very active in international recruitment and engages a number of international agents who are intentional in their targets and are looking at emerging markets. Domestic enrolments are showing positive trends at the undergraduate level, which is also encouraging.

A Senator asked if comparison data can be provided provincially for undergraduate intake by Faculty. The VPSE noted in response that numbers do vary and this can be attributed to different strategies undertaken by other institutions. For example, during Covid, some of the top tier universities in Ontario opened up enrolments to increase numbers, which negatively impacted Carleton's enrolments. Other variations can be attributed to the changing popularity of various programs over time. Carleton continues to add recruitment strategies to maximize opportunities, but it is a very competitive field.

A Senator asked how to reconcile budget cuts with healthy enrolments. It was noted, in response, that universities in Ontario have faced declining revenue for several years, as the province has frozen domestic tuition fees and has not increased the government grant to universities. Expenses, however, are constantly increasing, which puts enormous pressure on the budget. Recruitment towards healthy enrolments can help to reduce some of this stress. Since Carleton has resumed face-to-face recruitment, applications from Ontario high schools have increased overall 5%, and are up 12% for first-choice applications. Domestic numbers are encouraging; international enrolment trends for the future are not yet known.

A Senator asked if the planned re-opening of the O-Train line to campus might have an effect on enrolment. The VP Students & Enrolment acknowledged that currently some students are facing a difficult and long commute to campus, but there are indications that the new line could be open later in 2024, which would help Carleton competitively.

In response to another question, the VP Students & Enrolment noted that the university is looking at additional strategies to increase enrolment, including for example many small initiatives in the GTA and increased integration with Faculties.

Finally, there was a request not to use colour-delineated graphs for future presentations, in consideration for Senators who are colour-blind.

The Chair thanked the VP Students & Enrolment for the presentation and Senators for their engagement.

8. Report from Senate Ad Hoc Committee on Graduate Academic Governance

Provost Pauline Rankin introduced this item, and welcomed Professor Donald Russell, Chair of the Ad Hoc Committee on Graduate Academic Governance, back to Senate.

Before Professor Russell presented the report to Senate, the Provost introduced the motion for Senate:

It was **MOVED** (P. Rankin, D. Siddiqi) that Senate receive the final report of the Senate Ad Hoc Committee on Graduate Academic Governance and refer the report to the Senate Academic Governance Committee for further action.

Presentation by Professor Russell:

The Ad Hoc Committee on Graduate Academic Governance (CGAG) was mandated by Senate in June of 2023 to review the impact of the transfer of graduate curriculum approval authority from FGPA to the line Faculties, and to provide recommendations to address any concerns or issues resulting from this change.

The committee was formed in the summer of 2023, and met nine times between September 2023 and January of 2024. Professor Russell thanked the members of the committee for their productive and insightful work in carrying out their mandate and producing the report, which was circulated in advance to Senators.

It was noted that the committee's scope of work was limited to those issues under the purview of Senate as outlined in the Carleton University Act. The committee also came to an agreement on a number of definitions and underlying principles that formed the basis for the work of the committee. These are listed at the beginning of the report.

The report includes a total of 13 recommendations, which are presented as a package to be accepted together. In terms of academic issues, the committee recommends that:

- Graduate curricular approvals be devolved to the 5 line Faculties and 4 independent schools (Architecture, Information Technology, Industrial Design, Computer Science);

- Grade approvals, academic integrity (as per the AI Policy) and graduation should not be separated from control of curriculum, and should also move to the line Faculties; and
- Graduation regulations, policies and procedures should remain a central process, for consistency and uniformity across the university.

In terms of Academic Governance Issues, the committee recommends that:

- The Graduate Faculty Board no longer be a faculty board in the AGU of the university, since, if the above recommendations are adopted, it would no longer have responsibilities that would define it as a faculty board (curriculum approval, control of grades and graduation);
- Senate remove ex officio membership on Senate for the Dean of FGPA; and
- Senate removes or changes FGPA representation on and reviews the Terms of Reference of relevant Senate standing committees.

The committee also recommends that:

- Oversight of graduate awards be reviewed;
- Issues related to post-doctoral Fellows be handled centrally;
- Cross-Faculty programs be governed following the undergraduate model;
- Joint Institutes be overseen centrally;
- Granting of graduate supervisory privileges be managed centrally;
- A consultative committee of Associate Deans, Graduate Studies be established; and
- The Academic Governance of the University (AGU) joint policy and the By-Laws of the University be revised accordingly.

Discussion:

A Senator asked which central body would be responsible for some of these recommendations, if FGPA is devolving. In response, Professor Russell noted that this work (granting of supervisory privileges, post-doctoral Fellow issues, etc.) already is being carried out within Graduate Studies, and would remain centrally managed. However, the definition of what that central body would be is beyond the scope of CGAG.

A Senator asked whether supervisory privilege is really an employment issue and not an academic issue. Is the question not whether an instructor is qualified to supervise graduate students? In response, it was noted that the question is related to employment issues, specifically whether or not the faculty member has tenure, and not academic qualifications. The condition of tenure for supervisory privileges is to protect the student's interests, by guaranteeing the continuing relationship with the student.

Another Senator asked for clarification regarding the process for de-establishing the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs, since according to the Carleton University

Act, Senate does not have the power to do this. The Chair noted that the Board of Governors has the power to de-establish FGPA, upon a recommendation by Senate. The Chair recognized the University Secretary, who added that the recommendation from Senate would first go to the Board's Governance Committee for review. This review would then trigger a review of the Bylaws by the Governance Committee plus a review of the recommended changes of the AGU (from Senate). The final step would be a suite of recommendations for the Board, including revisions to the Bylaw and the AGU.

The motion **PASSED**.

Senator Laura Madokoro requested that her vote to abstain be recorded in the minutes.

9. Review of Senate Policy on Academic Accommodations During Labour Disputes – Motion from Senators Mason and Murray

Senator Jody Mason introduced this motion and spoke to the reasons for its submission. She remarked that when the Senate Policy on Academic Accommodations During Labour Disputes was passed in 2020, it was not known how the policy might come into conflict with Senate's mandate. The CUPE 4600 strike in March of 2023 demonstrated that the policy can be used to politicize Senate and to undermine the position and power of the striking workers. The first part of the motion thus asks SCCASP to determine whether or not Senate can remain neutral while implementing this policy in the context of labour disputes.

It was MOVED (J. Mason, M. Rooney) that SCCASP make its review of the *Academic Accommodations During Labour Disputes Policy* its next order of business (i.e., that SCCASP report to Senate at the earliest opportunity, and no later than the April 2024 meeting). Specifically, SCCASP shall investigate and report back with a reasoned response to the following question: "Is it possible for Senate to implement the *Academic Accommodations During Labour Disputes Policy* while also remaining neutral in the context of a labour dispute?" Should it decide that the answer is "no," SCCASP shall either recommend revisions to the policy that will allow Senate to remain neutral or, if deemed impossible, recommend the policy's repeal.

Discussion:

The Chair of SCCASP indicated that the committee met earlier in the week to review the motion, and to discuss the question regarding Senate's neutrality. SCCASP first determined that there is no provision within the Bylaw or AGU that stipulates that Senate must remain neutral during labour disputes. However, if there is an assumption that Senate should remain neutral, that neutrality is incompatible with the Policy on Academic Accommodations During Labour Disputes, and in fact, the creation of the policy has rendered neutrality impossible for Senate. The Chair of SCCASP added that the committee does not believe that the issue of neutrality could be resolved by revising the policy.

A Senator noted for the information of those who recently joined Senate, that the policy was created in 2020 at the request of Senate and in response to the CUPE 2424 strike of 2018.

The Chair of SCCASP called for a motion to table the motion on the floor, or alternately for the mover of the motion to withdraw it. However, he withdrew his motion after Senators pointed out that there had been no opportunity for them to discuss the original motion first.

Several Senators then spoke in support of the call for an immediate review of the policy, with perhaps the result that SCCASP would recommend that Senate repeal the motion, as indicated in the last section of the motion.

The Chair of SCCASP indicated that the question driving the first part of the motion, the request to determine Senate's neutrality while the policy is in place, has been answered. The second part of the motion, asking SCCASP to recommend the repeal of the policy, is not in order since Senate cannot tell committees what to recommend to Senate. The Chair concurred that this part of the motion is not in order.

Senators Mason & Murray then agreed to withdraw their motion, and to submit another motion for Senate within 10 days of the next Senate meeting. There was no objection from Senate to the withdrawal of the main motion.

10. Reports for Information:

- a. Senate Executive Minutes – November 14, 2023**
- b. Report from the COU Academic Colleague**
- c. Report on New Awards from Senate Undergraduate Student Awards Committee**

There was no discussion of these items.

11. Other Business

There was none.

12. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned (D. Howe, L. Dyke) at 4:18 p.m.