



Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.

**Carleton University Senate
Meeting of March 1, 2024 at 2:00 pm
PK608**

OPEN SESSION

Minutes

Present in Person: B. Albright-Peakall, S. Blanchard, A. Bordeleau, A. Bowker, S. Burges, B. Campbell, D. Caratao, M. DeRosa, S. Everts, K. Graham, T. Haats, N. Hagigi, M. Haines, S. Hawkins, K. Hellemans, D. Hornsby, D. Howe, M. Huckvale, L. Kostiuik, A. Lannon, F. Lepore, A. MacDonald, B. MacLeod, L. Madokoro, J. Malloy, J. Mason, D. Mendeloff, L. Moffitt, J. Murray, H. Nemiroff, A. North, B. O’Neill, A. Park, P. Rankin, R. Renfroe, M. F. Riazudden (A. Kallioinen acting) M. Rooney, S. Seneviratne, O. Shafiq, D. Siddiqi, E. Sloan (Clerk), D. Sprague, M. Taghavishavazi, J. Tomberlin (Chair), G. Wainer, P. Williams, P. Wolff.

Present via Zoom: J. Armstrong, H. Babb, M. Barbeau, H. Becker, F. Brouard, W. Chung, J.P. Corriveau, E. Cyr, L. Dyke, R. Goubran, L. Marshall, R. Nelson, B. O’Connor, S. Rajput, C. Smelser, P. Smith, J. Taber, K. Taylor, J. Wallace

Regrets: M. Baez, R. Gorelick, P. Mkandawire, M. Pearson, C. Viau

Absent: E. Abou Zeid, A. Clarke, Y. Gandhi, K. Moss

Recording Secretary: K. McKinley

1. Welcome and Approval of Agenda

The meeting was called to order at 2:01 p.m. The Chair began by noting the passing of two members of the Carleton community: Danny Brown, who was a member of the ITS team, and Jodi White, alumna and long-standing friend of Carleton University. The Chair offered condolences to those who knew and loved them. He also acknowledged the passing of the Honorable Brian Mulroney, former Prime Minister of Canada. As per protocol, Carleton’s flag has been lowered to half-mast and will remain there until his memorial service has concluded.

The Chair noted that the Senate meeting would begin with a Closed Session that includes approval of Carleton's Winter graduates.

It was **MOVED** (M. Haines, N. Hagigi) that Senate move into the closed Session of the meeting. The motion **PASSED**.

(See separate document for Closed Session Minutes.)

Continuation of Open Session minutes, following the end of the Closed Session:

It was **MOVED** (S. Blanchard, D. Sprague) that Senate approve the open agenda for the meeting on March 1, 2024, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

2. Minutes: January 26, 2024

It was **MOVED** (R. Renfroe, S. Seneviratne) that Senate approve the minutes of the Senate meeting on January 26, 2024, as presented.

A Senator noted an error in the summary of a response to a question in Question Period. The recording secretary agreed to amend the text as directed by Senator Siddiqi, who provided the response. It was also noted that the motion referred to in the minutes for Item 9 should have been credited to both Senators Mason and Murray. The recording secretary agreed to make the correction.

With these amendments to the minutes, the motion **PASSED**.

3. Matters Arising

There were none.

4. Chair's Remarks

The Chair reported that Carleton has achieved recognition as one of the National Capital Region's Top Employers for the 10th year in a row, and was also recognized as a Top Family-Friendly Employer for the 2nd time. This recognition highlights Carleton's Commitment to fostering a supportive work environment that prioritizes the work-life balance of its community.

The Chair next highlighted the following achievements of members of Carleton's academic community:

- Cynthia Cruickshank (Mechanical and Aerospace Engineering) received the Ontario Building Envelope Council Rising Star Award.
- Paul Kariouk (Azrieli School of Architecture and Urbanism) was recognized with an American Institute of Architects New York Design Award.
- Fraser Taylor (Geography and Environmental Studies) was named as an Officer of the Order of Canada.
- Halim Yanikomeroglu (Systems and Computer Engineering) was named a fellow of the Asia-Pacific Artificial Intelligence Association.
- James Milner (Political Science) has been appointed co-chair of the Global Academic Interdisciplinary Network (GAIN) — a group of 213 university members from countries around the world formed from the Global Compact on Refugees.

Carleton's Ravens Women's basketball team has defeated the Ottawa Gee-Gees in the Ontario Athletics Union semi-finals, guaranteeing them a spot in the 2024 U sports national championship, to be held from March 7 – 10 in Edmonton. In addition, Raven Kali Pocrnic set a program record for most points in a single game with 40 points in the February 24 quarterfinal.

The Chair highlighted the following events from February 2024:

- Service Excellence Awards were held on February 22nd, to recognize outstanding contributions of Carleton faculty and staff.
- The 5th annual Kinàmàgawin Symposium took place on February 8th, focusing on connecting to Indigenous Spirituality.
- Black History Month was celebrated with numerous events, articles and stories, including a lecture with Fulbright Scholar Dr. Michele K. Lewis.

The Chair noted that Carleton is looking forward to celebrating International Women's Day on March 8th, focusing on the many achievements and contributions of outstanding women in our community.

The Chair then provided some remarks regarding the ongoing financial challenges of Ontario Universities and Colleges, in light of the provincial government's recent response to the Blue Ribbon Panel report. The government has announced that domestic tuition for students from Ontario will remain frozen for another 3 years, after having been reduced by 10% in 2018, then frozen for the past 5 years. Additional base funding was announced and while this is welcome, it will not be sufficient to cover the rising costs of

inflation. In addition, universities across Canada will be challenged in the enrolment of international students due to the cap on applications for study visas imposed by the Federal Government this year. As a result, Carleton will be forced to cut the operating budget for the next few years and will continue to spend down its reserves for a significant period of time. Open and transparent communication with members of the Carleton community will continue over the coming weeks and months as the Provost prepares the 2024-25 operating budget. The Chair noted that although the situation is serious, every university in Ontario is in much the same position as Carleton.

In response to a question, the Chair noted that timelines for sending out offers to international graduate students should not change. At the undergraduate level, offers have been sent beginning in December and January and will finish by April and May. Processing for all undergraduate international applications has been paused, and visa applications have been returned to students until the Ontario government Provincial Attestation Letters are ready.

5. Question Period

One question was submitted in advance by Senator Laura Madokoro.

Following on the questions posted by Nir Hagigi in the January 2024 meeting, I wish to know what measures the university is taking to protect academic freedom on campus (including physical and virtual contexts).

Response by the Chair:

Carleton is committed to maintaining an open, welcoming and inclusive environment where all members of the community are encouraged to engage in discussions and feel free to express opinions while avoiding hate speech and other restricted speech, and at the same recognizing sensitivities of others involved in the conversation.

Freedom of Expression is a right guaranteed, with some restrictions, under the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms.

According to Universities Canada, academic freedom is distinct from freedom of expression in that it is based on professional competency in an academic discipline as opposed to mere expressions of opinion. Academic freedom for faculty members is enshrined in their collective agreement. Complaints from faculty members who feel that their academic freedom has been infringed upon are dealt with on a case-by-case basis.

Faculty members who are members of a bargaining unit also have recourse to assistance from their unions.

6. Administration

a. Senate Meeting Schedule 2024-25

The Clerk confirmed that the dates for the 2024-25 Senate meetings have been circulated to Senators and posted on the Senate website. She encouraged Senators who are continuing to serve next year to add these dates to their calendars.

b. Report on Senate Membership Nominations for July 2024

The Clerk noted that the Call for Nominations for positions on Senate beginning July 1, 2024 closes end of day March 1. A number of vacancies remain unfilled for faculty members from FASS and Science. The Clerk also advised Senators whose terms are ending that they must apply again if they wish to serve another term. Nomination forms can be found on the Senate website.

c. Call for Nominations – Senate Committees

The Call for Nominations for faculty and student positions on Senate standing committees has been launched, and the closing date is March 31st. The Clerk encouraged Senators to serve on one or more standing committees to deepen their knowledge of academic governance. Details can be found on the Senate website.

7. Reports

a. Senate Committee on Curriculum Admissions and Studies Policy (SCCASP)

Committee Chair Dan Siddiqi presented one item for Senate approval.

R-G-11: General Regulations 11 – Academic Standing (adding academic standing requirements for graduate diplomas)

It was **MOVED** (D. Siddiqi, P. Smith) that Senate approves the revision to R-G-11: General Regulations 11 Academic Standing effective for the 2024-25 Graduate calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

b. Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee (SQAPC)

Committee Chair David Hornsby presented 2 cyclical reviews, 8 major modifications and one new program for Senate approval.

Cyclical Reviews:

These were combined into an omnibus motion.

It was **MOVED** (D. Hornsby, A. Bowker) that Senate approve the Final Assessment Reports and Executive Summaries arising from the Cyclical Reviews of the programs.

The motion **PASSED**.

Motions from the omnibus:

- THAT Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the undergraduate and graduate programs in European, Russian and Eurasian Studies.
- THAT Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the undergraduate and graduate programs in history.

A Senator noted that the fact that retiring faculty members in the History program are not being replaced is a cause for concern.

Major Modifications:

These were combined into an omnibus motion.

It was **MOVED** (D. Hornsby, P. Williams) that Senate approve the major modifications as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Motions from the omnibus:

- THAT Senate approve the name change of the undergraduate programs in Environmental Studies to Environmental and Climate Change Studies as presented with effect from Fall 2025.
- THAT Senate approve the introduction of the concentration in Criminal Law and Social Order to the undergraduate programs in Law as presented with effect from Fall 2024.
- THAT Senate approve the major modification to the Bachelor of Media Production and Design program and the introduction of MPAD 4906 as presented with effect from Fall 2024.
- THAT Senate approve the deletion of the MA programs in French as presented with effect from Fall 2024.
- THAT Senate approve the change to the MIT degrees in Digital Media and Network Technology as presented with effect from Fall 2024.

- THAT Senate approve introduction of ENSC 4909 and ISAP 4909 and the modifications to the associated programs as presented with effect from Fall 2024.
- THAT Senate approve the governance change for the Technology Innovation Management programs from the Faculty of Engineering and Design to the Sprott School of Business as presented with effect from Fall 2024.
- THAT Senate approve the deletion of the concentration in Linguistic Theory from the BA Hons program and the BSc Hon Linguistics streams in Psychology, Neuroscience, and Computer Science, and the change of name to the BSc Hons in Linguistics with a concentration in Psycholinguistics and Communication Difference for the streams in Psychology, Neuroscience and Computer Science, as presented, with effect from Fall 2025.

A Senator clarified that the TIMS programs were already jointly administered by the Faculty of Engineering and Sprott, and are now moving solely to the Sprott School of Business.

New Program Approval: Graduate Program in Clinical Trials

It was **MOVED** (D. Hornsby, M. DeRosa) that Senate approve the proposed Graduate Program in Clinical Trials and Regulatory Affairs as presented to commence in Fall 2025.

The Dean of Science noted that this is a hybrid, course-based Masters degree that is responding to a need in Ottawa and across Canada for this type of program. A Senator asked for clarification regarding faculty to support the program as there appears to be no internal expertise in this area and only one full-time hire is mentioned in the documents. The Dean of Science responded that the unit's view in their response was that they do have expertise, especially with the new hire that is slated to join the department. There are also ongoing discussions with partners such as Health Canada to support as well.

The motion **PASSED**.

c. Senate Academic Governance Committee (SAGC)

Committee Clerk Elinor Sloan presented a motion to ratify faculty member Jennifer Stewart to fill a vacancy on the Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee.

It was **MOVED** (E. Sloan, D. Hornsby) that Senate ratify the nominees for Senate committees, as presented, for service beginning immediately upon approval. The motion **PASSED**.

Committee Chair Sloan next presented a motion for Senate to approve revised Senate Rules of Order. The Senate Academic Governance Committee has updated this file, combining the previous Senate Rules and Annex into one document, and reorganizing sections for clarity. Classification and rules have been edited to align with the AIP Standard Code of Parliamentary Procedure, which is the standard reference guide for Carleton's Senate.

It was **MOVED** (E. Sloan, D. Siddiqi) that Senate approve the revised Senate Rules of Order, as presented.

Discussion:

It was noted that changes were made in accordance with the most recent version (2023) of the AIP Standard Code of Parliamentary Procedure.

Senators provided the following observations regarding the new Rules of Order:

- Changes were very difficult to follow from the old version of the rules to the new proposed version, without a track-change document.
- Some of the outdated binary pronouns (he/she) from the older version were not updated in the new version.
- The wording for Rule #2 (Quorum) was clearer in the previous version.
- There are no guidelines in the Rules of Order for emergency motions.
- The online voting protocol (11.4) could be revised.

Given the number of concerns expressed by Senators, the Clerk withdrew the motion, and agreed to bring the Rules of Order back to SAGC for further review.

The Clerk asked Senators to submit any additional comments regarding the Rules of Order via email.

The motion was **WITHDRAWN**.

8. Graduate Academic Governance – Motion

Clerk of Senate and SAGC Chair Elinor Sloan introduced this item. She reminded Senators that Senate received the Final Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Graduate Academic Governance in January of 2024. The report included 13 recommendations, and was referred to SAGC for further action. The Clerk noted that after reviewing the report, SAGC determined that the Provost would need to be involved in order to move forward with the implementation of the recommendations of the report.

Provost Pauline Rankin then provided a presentation for Senators that summarized the context for restructuring the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies, and the progress made so far, from the external assessment undertaken in 2021 to the work of the Senate Ad Hoc Committee in 2023. The Provost then presented a 3-part motion to activate the recommendations of the Ad Hoc Committee Report, and a timeline outlining the planned implementation of these changes, which would include delegation of authority from FGPA to line Faculties, and revisions of academic policies and documents, among other work. The implementation stage would begin in the Summer 2024 term and would be completed by June of 2025.

It was **MOVED** (P. Rankin, D. Siddiqi) that:

- Senate devolve curriculum approvals from Graduate Faculty Board to the Faculty Board that offers the program, as per recommendation R1 of the Ad Hoc Committee report, beginning with the 2025-2026 Academic Calendar, and direct the Programs and Planning Committee of GFB to develop the processes and policies necessary to implement recommendation R9 by April 30, 2024.
- In the interim and notwithstanding the Academic Governance of the University policy, other Senate policies, and the Faculty Constitutions, Senate delegate the following authorities to the Dean of the line Faculty responsible for a graduate course:
 - the approval of grades;
 - the resolution of appeals of grades; and,

- the resolution of all allegations of a violation of the Academic Integrity Policy;

and, Senate delegate the following authority to the Dean of the line Faculty responsible for a graduate program

- the process for endorsing the lists of proposed graduate students eligible to graduate and related graduation issues.

These delegations are effective beginning with the Summer term, 2024. If all of the actions required under this motion are not implemented by June 30, 2025, these delegations will end.

- Senate instruct SQAPC and/or SAGC to initiate implementation of recommendations R3, R6, R6.1, R6.2, R6.3, R7, and R13 (AGU) to be completed by June 30, 2025, and Senate supports the Provost in taking actions required for an effective and timely transition of the services affected by recommendations R6, R6.1, and R7.

In response to a question, the Provost noted that there would be no financial implications to this process.

The motion **PASSED**.

9. Motion from Senator J. Mason re Policy on Student Academic Accommodation During Labour Disputes

Senators Jody Mason and Julie Murray submitted this motion to Senate as a follow-up to the January 26th Senate meeting, at which their previous motion to review the policy had been withdrawn. In the preamble to the motion, Senators Mason and Murray noted that SCCASP has confirmed that with the Policy on Student Academic Accommodation During Labour Disputes in place, it is not possible for Senate to remain neutral during labour disputes.

It was **MOVED** (J. Murray, M. Rooney) that Senate repeal the Academic Accommodations During Labour Disputes Policy.

Discussion:

In response to a question, the Chair noted that the policy does not grant any special power to either the Provost or Senate that they did not already have before the policy existed. The procedures outlined by the policy would be followed in any case, with or without the policy. The Academic Continuity Committee existed before the policy, and will continue

to exist in the future, as it is the duty of management to develop a continuity plan for any disruption to academic operations at the university. It is also true that anything within the purview of Senate will continue to be brought to Senate.

A Senator noted that the policy dictates timelines for action, since according to the policy, the special committee is created on the 11th day of a strike, resulting in an artificial and arbitrary sense of emergency. In response, the Chair repeated that the Academic Continuity Committee would be constituted anyways, with or without the policy, in order to ensure continuity of academic operations within the university.

Another Senator noted that while one may sympathize with those who feel that the policy can appear to undermine the power of those on strike, students want to know what specific measures would be put in place to provide accommodations for them during a labour dispute, should the policy be repealed. The VP Students & Enrolment responded that the role of the university is to support students, and that a process will be in place to address these types of situations, with or without a Senate policy. Repealing this policy does not preclude the university from being able to accommodate students. Any accommodations that are in Senate's purview will be brought to Senate for approval.

A Senator asked for some historical context on the ACC and accommodations granted to students during crises, including the pandemic. The Chair noted that the policy was developed after the CUPE 2424 strike of 2018, and was approved by Senate in January of 2020. In March of 2020 once the pandemic hit, Carleton adopted a similar process; the ACC brought recommendations for accommodations to Senate for approval.

Several Senators commented that in their view, the policy provides baseline protection for students and a framework for action by Senate during a labour disruption. Without the policy in place, could Senate be convened quickly, and if so, would calling a Senate meeting (short-notice or emergency) to discuss and vote on these issues not be seen as a politicized decision? The Chair responded that an emergency meeting could be called, either by Senate Executive, or through a request to the Clerk by a certain number of Senators, which could include Student Senators, and the Academic Continuity Committee could still be formed as needed.

Another Senator remarked that in 2023 during the previous labour dispute, students were not properly informed of the measures being taken by administration and Senate through this policy. With or without the policy, how can the university ensure that moving forward students are adequately informed of actions and decisions taking place during disruptions

such as a labour dispute? The VP Students & Enrolment replied that the university is in daily contact with students through many channels including via student associations such as CASG, CUSA and GSA, in addition to website, social media, and emails.

A Senator announced that the Carleton Student Engineering Society has submitted a letter expressing concerns that without the policy in place, long labour disruptions could potentially threaten accreditation and therefore graduation for students in engineering. In response, it was noted that emergency meetings can be called without the policy, in order to prevent severe consequences for students.

The motion **PASSED**.

Vote count:

- In favour: 33 (23 in room + 10 online)*
- Opposed: 25 (20 in room + 5 online)

*Note that the original online count for those in favour (9) was revised to 10 after checking totals with the online administrators.

10. Motion from Senator N. Hagigi re Senate Statement

Senator N. Hagigi submitted a motion in response to the ongoing conflict in the Middle East.

WHEREAS the current conflict in Gaza has regrettably seen an alarming rise in global anti-Palestinian racism, anti-Semitism, and Islamophobia accompanying the outbreaks of violence, **it is MOVED (N. Hagigi, L. Madokoro) that Senate:**

- Condemns unequivocally the rise in global anti-Palestinian racism, anti-Semitism, and Islamophobia that has accompanied the recent outbreak of violence in Gaza, reaffirming the importance of fostering a culture of tolerance, understanding, and respect for religious and cultural diversity.
- Supports initiatives led by students, faculty, and staff aimed at promoting dialogue, reconciliation, and peace-building through academic collaborations, cultural exchanges, and grassroots advocacy efforts.

Discussion:

In response to a question, it was noted that this motion belongs to the category known as “courtesy motions” that can be submitted to Senate from time to time.

A Senator noted that there are at least 45 other current conflicts in the world, and they questioned why this one should be privileged by a motion from Senate. Several Senators responded that this conflict has impacted students much more significantly than any of the other conflicts that are currently occurring. Many Carleton students have been harassed, and have suffered anti-Semitism and anti-Palestinian racism on campus. Another Senator mentioned that they appreciate the spirit of this motion in creating solidarity at Carleton.

A Senator made a suggestion to amend the motion to remove “the rise in” from the first bullet point. The mover and seconder accepted this as a friendly amendment, and there was no objection from Senate.

The motion, as amended, **PASSED**.

11. Reports for Information

a. Senate Executive Committee Minutes (January 16, 2024)

12. Other Business

There was none.

13. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned (M. Rooney, S. Seneviratne) at 4:03 p.m.