



Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.

**Carleton University Senate
Meeting of November 29, 2024 at 2:00 pm
PK608 + Zoom Videoconference**

MINUTES – Open Session

Present: J. Armstrong, M. Barbeau, S. Blanchard, S. Burges, A. Buri, J. Chan, E. Cyr, M. DeRosa, S. Everts, R. Gorelick, R. Goubran, E. Gray, J. Greenberg, N. Hagigi, M. Haines, S. Hawkins, X. Haziza, K. Hellemans, D. Hornsby, D. Howe, L. Kostiuik, G. Lacroix, A. Lannon, N. Laporte, J. Lynch, A. MacDonald, L. Madokoro, A. Marcotte, A. Masoumi, D. Mendeloff, H. Nemiroff, M. Pearson, P. Rankin, R. Renfroe, M. Rooney, E. Sloan (Clerk), C. Smelser, K. Taylor, J. Tomberlin (Chair), C. Trudel, C. Viau, G. Wainer, J. Wallace

Present via Zoom: M. Abarghouei, M. Bahrán, A. Bordeleau, A. Bowker, F. Brouard, J.P. Corriveau, J. Debanne, J. Garcia, B. Heerspink, P. Kouzovnikov, B. MacLeod, L. Marshall, D. Maseko, J. Mason, M. Nadeem, B. O'Neill, S. Sadaf, R. Tfaily,

Regrets: K. Graham, L. Grant, O. Saloojee, D. Sprague

Absent: S. El Fitori, J. Kundu, R. Teather, R. Treasure, P. Williams

Recording Secretary: K. McKinley

1. Welcome & Approval of Agenda

The meeting was called to order at 2:00 pm. The Chair began the meeting by acknowledging the recent passing of Carl McMillan, Professor Emeritus of the Institute of European, Russian and Eurasian Studies (EURUS) and Priscilla (Percy) Walton, Professor of English in the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences. The Chair expressed condolences to all those who know and loved them.

Following a quick review of new procedures for Senators attending online, the Chair noted that the meeting would begin with a Closed Session.

It was **MOVED** (C. Viau, S. Blanchard) that Senate moved into the Closed Session of the meeting.

The motion **PASSED**.

(See separate document for Closed Session Minutes.)

Continuation of Open Session Minutes, after conclusion of Closed Session:

It was **MOVED** (M. Haines, R. Renfroe) that Senate approve the open agenda for the meeting of Senate on November 29, 2024, as amended.

The Clerk requested that the title of agenda item 9 be changed to “Motion from Senator Jody Mason (Reviewing Practice re Chair of Senate).”

The motion **PASSED**.

2. Minutes: October 18, 2024 (open session)

It was **MOVED** (D. Mendeloff, N. Hagigi) that Senate approve the minutes of the open session of the Senate meeting of October 18 2024, as amended.

The recording secretary noted a few errors in the attendance record in the circulated draft; these errors have been since corrected.

The motion **PASSED**.

3. Matters Arising:

Provost Pauline Rankin provided a report on Indigenous hires, in response to a question posed in the October Senate meeting during the discussion of the SIP Implementation Report.

Twenty-seven individuals self-identifying as Indigenous have started positions at Carleton since January 1 of 2020, including 18 faculty members and 9 staff members in continuing positions. In 2019, 10 Indigenous faculty positions were approved through a memorandum of agreement with CUASA, and as part of the 2021-24 Carleton-CUASA agreement the

university agreed to designate 5 additional positions to Indigenous candidates over the course of that collective agreement. One additional position to the Library was approved in the 2021 Budget. These designated positions were created under the special provisions of the Ontario Human Rights Code, but additional Indigenous faculty and staff members have been hired outside of the designated positions as well.

The equity census data that informs reporting on hires is dependent on the survey participation rate. The Provost reminded Senators that participation in the self-identification survey provides data on our community through the lens of equity diversity and inclusion, and Indigenous ways of knowing and learning. The survey can be completed at any time on Carleton Central.

4. Chair's Remarks

The Chair reported that Fall Convocation was held on Saturday November 9 to celebrate the graduation of approximately 1200 students. He thanked all who attended and those who made the event a success.

Carleton's new Bachelor of Science in Nursing program was official launched at a special event on November 5 on campus with a follow-up event at CU@Kanata North. Premier Doug Ford and Minister of Health Sylvia Jones were in attendance. This program will be the first new university-based nursing program in Ontario for 20 years, arriving at a crucial time given the current challenges in health care. Classes will start in September of 2025.

The Chair next highlighted the following academic achievements:

- Dr. Hubert Jean-Ruel in the Department of Electronics has been appointed as Canada Research Chair in Advanced Photonic Sensing Components.
- Nicco Timpano, Industrial and Product Design graduate, has been selected as the 2024 Canadian winner of the James Dayson Award, for his ArmBar+ invention that transforms a wheelchair's armrest into a vital support tool. This marks Carleton's second consecutive win.
- For the 3rd consecutive year, Carleton University has been named one of Canada's Top Employers.

Finally, the Chair mentioned the following events:

- Giving Tuesday will be held on December 3, 2024. Carleton is hosting over 60 initiatives live on the FutureFunder.ca website. This year, \$100,000 in matching incentive funds will be available through the Giving Tuesday Challenge.
- Friday December 6 marks the National Day of Remembrance and Action on Violence Against Women, which was established to commemorate the murder of 14 women in

1989 at the École Polytechnique (now Polytechnique Montréal). The Faculty of Engineering and Design will host a commemoration event at 12:15 pm in the lobby of the Minto Centre. Remarks will be provided by the President, the Associate Dean of EDI Cynthia Cruickshank, and the VP External of the Carleton Student Engineering Society Monica Paul, followed by a moment of silence.

The Chair also remarked on the presence of Rebel News on campus on the morning of November 20th. Rebel News has a record of provoking people to express anger through unwelcome impromptu interviews, which occurred when they visited Carleton. Campus Safety was alerted and Rebel News was subsequently asked to leave. No physical violence occurred. The Chair institutionally apologized to those members of the community who were confronted in this unwarranted and unwelcome manner.

Finally, the Chair noted that this will be the final Senate meeting for Interim VP Finance & Administration Angela Marcotte, Faculty of Engineering & Design Faculty Board Secretary Karen Taylor, and FPGA elected faculty member Sarah Everts. The Chair thanked all for their service. He noted as well that this would be his last Senate meeting, as incoming President Wisdom Tettey will be starting his term on January 1, 2025. The Chair stated that it has been a privilege to serve at Carleton in a variety of roles, and he congratulated Senators on conducting themselves in a collegial and collaborative manner throughout.

5. Question Period

Questions were submitted in advance by 3 Senators:

Question from Senator A. Buri:

Following the release of the Maclean's Canadian university rankings, the Faculty of Public & Global Affairs published on its social media that Carleton was ranked #1 in social science research in Canada. This is false, Carleton is ranked #8 in social science research when compared to *all* Canadian universities. Carleton was ranked #1 only among those universities placed in Maclean's "Comprehensive Universities" category, but this critical detail was omitted from the FPGA's posts. Will this misrepresentation be corrected? If it will not be corrected, why not? (I have attached a photo of the LinkedIn post plus the actual Maclean's rankings as proof)

Response from Dean Brenda O'Neill: This was a simple error on the part of those posting, which was corrected in a timely manner.

Question from Senator J. Chan:

At Senate's last meeting, the memberships for the Senate Ad Hoc Committee on the Academic Integrity Policy and Senate Ad Hoc Committee on Petitions and Appeals were established. Why are there no student members on these ad hoc committees? Moving forward in the process, how can students offer feedback on the development of the Academic Integrity Policy as well as the Petitions and Appeals Policy?

Response from Clerk of Senate: The question was raised at the first joint meeting of the two committees. Student perspective is very important and mechanisms for student input such as anonymous feedback via surveys and/or presentations to the committee will be made available once the committees decide which is most appropriate. SAGC will recommend one or more modes for student involvement after consultation with the committees early in the new year. The Chair added that in the future, questions regarding the membership of ad hoc committees should be raised when the Terms of Reference are presented at Senate for approval, and not after the committees have been constituted and have begun their work.

Questions from Senator J. Mason:

1. The Provost and the [Interim] VP Finance released an "Operating Budget Update" by email on Nov. 8th. This email advises that the deficit for 2024-25 will be worse than initially estimated, and that a Financial Sustainability Framework will be implemented to analyze "cost containment strategies, revenue growth ideas, academic program renewal" and to create "an organizational excellence and optimization plan." Any academic matters related to such "renewal" and "optimization" will need to pass through Senate. My question is as follows: has a private consulting firm been hired to help the university create this "framework," and, if yes, what specific tasks related to "academic program renewal" have been assigned to consultants, and what will their services cost the University?

Response from Provost Pauline Rankin: No consulting firm has been engaged in any way for this process, and so there are no fees attached to any of the measures being implemented.

2. OCUFA reports that Ontario universities recently received information about the Strategic Mandate Agreement 4 from the Ministry of Colleges and Universities. What are the parameters of the SMA4, and how and when will Senate be consulted about the SMA4-related issues that are relevant to academic governance?

Response from Provost Pauline Rankin: The Strategic Mandate Agreement (SMA) is a bilateral agreement between the university and the Ministry of Colleges and Universities. It is related to the funding the university receives from the province. The document includes several

metrics that explain Carleton's institutional mission and strategic goals, and how they support the priorities of the Ontario government. Carleton is now in the final years of SMA3 (2020–25) and is beginning the conversations with the government around SMA4 (2025-30). The provincial government provides the set of metrics on which Carleton will be required to report, including graduation rate, graduate employment rate in a related field, graduate employment earnings, community and local impact, experiential learning, and what we identify as our institutional strength. Carleton will also choose from a set of metrics that the government supplies, one of which will be research. Senate will be consulted on any matters of academic governance.

A Senator asked if the SMA is essentially a funding contract. The Provost responded that Carleton needs to meet the government targets to ensure funding. The metrics provide a sense of what the government wants and expects.

In response to another question on metrics, the Provost noted that Carleton has 2 choices on metrics to add to the menu that the government provides. One of these from the last SMA was degree-level expectation on experiential learning. Carleton has performed very well on this metric, and will continue to report on that metric for SMA4. The other metric choice will be around research; the options for that metric choice have not yet been provided by the Ministry.

The Provost also noted that productive ongoing discussions and sharing of information is occurring via the Council of Ontario Universities. The Academic Colleague added that the group is also working on public advocacy.

A Senator asked if consultations with Senate are planned for the SMA4. The Provost responded that the initial meeting with the ministry suggested very little scope for choice, including metrics, so there is not much capacity for consultation. However, once the ministry releases more information Senate can be updated.

6. Administration (Clerk)

a) Senate Membership Ratification

The Clerk presented a memo to ratify 3 new FASS faculty members:

- Alexis Shotwell
- Megan Rivers-Moore
- Tonya Davidson

It was **MOVED** (E. Sloan, L. Madokoro) that Senate ratify the new Senate appointments, as presented, for service beginning immediately upon approval.
The motion **PASSED**.

b) Chancellor Search Committee

The university is beginning the process of finding a new Chancellor, and Senate is assisting the Board of Governors in this process by electing faculty members and students to serve on the search committee. Open calls for nominations for two faculty members and one student (undergraduate or graduate) were circulated and published in October, and the following individuals have been elected or acclaimed to positions on the committee.

- Emily Gray – faculty member (acclaimed)
- Kevin Graham – faculty member (acclaimed)
- Jayesh Kundu – graduate student (elected)

The Clerk thanked all three for stepping forward to serve on this committee.

7. Reports:

a) Senate Committee on Curriculum, Admissions and Studies Policy (SCCASP)

Committee Chair Julia Wallace presented 4 items for Senate approval and 5 items for information.

Items for approval:

Amending First-Year Grading Policy to allow ESP and IESP students to be eligible

It was **MOVED** (J. Wallace, D. Hornsby) that Senate approves the revisions to TBD-1892 R-UG-5.4 Grading System, effective for the 2025/26 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

A Senator noted that the First-Year Grading Policy is highly valued by students.

The motion **PASSED**.

English Language Proficiency – specifying Duo Lingo criteria

It was **MOVED** (J. Wallace, S. Blanchard) that Senate approves the revisions to UG-ADM-General-4 R-ADM-General-Section 4. English language Proficiency effective for the 2024/25 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Dual Degree Agreement – clarifying language to show courses at each institution

It was **MOVED** (J. Wallace, R. Renfroe) that Senate approves the revisions to TBD-1842 R-UG-2.2.5 Transfer of Credit Subsequent to Admission effective for the 2025/26 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Engineering Regulations, adding the new ECOR 1030 series of courses

It was **MOVED** (J. Wallace, L. Kostiuik) that Senate approves the revisions to Regulation R-UG-BENG; R-UG-B.Eng effective for the 2025/26 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Items for Information:

- Minor modifications – UG from October 15, November 5 and November 19
- Minor modification – GR from November 5
- Academic Schedule for the 2025-26 year

The Chair recognized former SCCASP Chair Nadeem Siddiqi, who spoke to the Academic Schedule, and noted that unfortunately, the fall break for Carleton does not align with the fall break at the University of Ottawa. As a result students in graduate level joint programs will not have a fall break, and neither will the T.A.s for those courses. Approximately 1/3 of Carleton's graduate courses are joint with the University of Ottawa, particularly in Science and Engineering. However, moving the break to align with the University of Ottawa will create other issues. The committee Chair acknowledged that this issue needs to be addressed and options will be explored by SCCASP and other interested parties.

b) Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee (SQAPC)

Committee Chair David Hornsby presented 5 major modifications for Senate approval. To expedite the process, these were combined into one omnibus motion:

It was **MOVED** (D. Hornsby, M. Pearson) that Senate approve the major modifications as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Individual motions from the omnibus:

- THAT Senate approve the deletion of the Graduate Diploma in Conflict Resolution and LAWS 5708 as presented with effect from Fall 2025.
- THAT Senate approve the introduction of the Collaborative Specialization in Climate Change to the MA program in International Affairs as presented with effect from Fall 2025.
- THAT Senate approve the deletion of the MBA concentrations in International Business, International Business Development Management and Technology Management as presented with effect from Fall 2025.
- THAT Senate approve the deletion of the Mention Français in Political Science and PSCI 4909 as presented with effect from Fall 2025.
- THAT Senate approve the introduction of COMS 6101, 6102 & 6908 to the PHD program in Communications and the PHD in Communications with Collaborative Specialization in Political Economy as presented with effect from Fall 2025.

c) Senate Academic Governance Committee (SAGC) (E. Sloan)

There was no report from SAGC.

8. Proposed Human Rights Policy and Procedures

Associate Vice-President, Equity and Inclusive Communities Noël Badiou presented this item. He reported that the Office of Equity and Inclusive Communities had begun updating Carleton's Human Rights Policy and Procedures earlier in 2024, and had planned an extensive consultation timeline with focus groups that would stretch into summer of 2025.

In May 2024, the provincial government enacted Bill 166, the *Strengthening Accountability and Student Supports Act*, and subsequently issued the *Minister's Anti-Racism/Anti-Hate Directive* on September 9, 2024. The directive requires universities to develop policies and procedures to address and combat racism and hate, and to implement these by January 31, 2025. The directive contains guidelines on content within in the policy/procedures document(s) and mandates a detailed complaints process with timelines.

An annual reporting process is also outlined in the directive, with the first report to the minister due on January 31, 2026. Specific reporting criteria will include number and type of complaints by community member type, number of complaints that do not proceed to review, associated code groups and sub-categories, and incident outcomes.

In compliance with this directive, a new Human Rights Policy and Procedures has been drafted by EIC; this draft was circulated to Senators in advance. The language of the new

policy has been drawn from Carleton's existing policies and incorporates legislative definitions on harassment and discrimination. Content has been guided by the Ontario Human Rights Commission, and definitions have been kept to a minimum as per best practices. Due to the tight timeline imposed by the government, updating the existing policy with new language clarifying and modifying existing procedures seemed to be the best tactic, and this is consistent with the approach taken by other universities.

Consultations with the Carleton community will take place in November and early December and the policy will be presented to Senior Management Committee in January for approval, to meet the Ministry's deadline of January 31, 2025. Members of the community are welcome to review the draft policy and provide feedback over the next few weeks via an online portal on the EIC website.

Discussion:

In response to a question from Senate, AVP Badiou confirmed that the government expects the final policy (and not just a draft) to be posted and fully implemented by January 2025.

A Senator asked if disability could be included as an area of specificity within the policy, particularly in paragraph 2. In response, it was noted that the Accessibility for Persons with Disabilities Policy, as required under the AODA, would cover this area. That policy is also due to be updated, and will include a consultation phase as part of the process.

Another Senator asked if a section of paragraph 2 listing types of discrimination could mirror the Ministry's more inclusive language: "including *but not limited to* Indigenous racism, anti-Black Racism, antisemitism and Islamophobia." They also asked why students' academic freedom under the students' rights and responsibilities were not referenced in the policy.

In responses to other questions, AVP Badiou also noted that:

- "code-protected group" is a category defined by the Human Rights Code. General harassment would be covered under workplace harassment policies.
- the policy is working from definitions provided by the Ontario Human Rights Commission and also through a study of case law on human rights.
- Reporting will include statistics only (number and type) and will avoid any identifying information to protect the privacy of informants.

- The revision schedule of 5 years is standard for university policies, but this policy can be revised earlier as needed.

The Chair thanked AVP Badiou for the presentation and Senators for the thoughtful engagement and feedback.

8. Motion from Senator J. Mason (Reviewing Practice re Chair of Senate)

Senator Jody Mason presented this item.

Whereas we are transitioning to new leadership under a new University President, a change that invites inquiry into the question of how well current governance practices are working,

Whereas there are other examples of universities in Ontario that maintain a practice of electing the Chair of Senate (York University, Brock University, Algoma University, OCAD, NOSM [Northern Ontario School of Medicine] University),

Whereas the academic decision making that Senate is tasked with carrying out often intersects with non-academic considerations (i.e., labour relations, university finances),

Whereas it is important to the integrity of Senate as a body of academic governance that it be managed without prejudice,

It was **MOVED** (J. Mason, N. Hagigi) that the Senate Academic Governance Committee review the current practice of having the University President serve as Chair of Senate (Article. 5.1 in the Academic Governance of the University) research/consider alternatives (i.e. Clerk of Senate, elected Senator, rotating chairship) and report back to Senate.

Senator Mason noted that back in March 2008 Senate voted in favor—in principle—of the Chair of Senate being an elected faculty member, on the provision that SAGC investigate and come back with a recommendation. In the fall of 2008 Senate passed a motion to confirm the President as Chair of Senate.

The motion **PASSED**.

11. Reports for Information

- a) Senate Executive Minutes (October 8 + October 25 e-poll)
- b) Report from COU Academic Colleague

There was no discussion of these items.

12. Other Business

Senator David Hornsby rose to present a courtesy motion of thanks to the Chair, Interim President Tomberlin, on behalf of Senate. In honour of the occasion, AVP Hornsby composed the following poem:

A Poem for Jerry

For sixteen years, you've walked these halls,
Guiding Carleton through its calls.
From Sprott's vision to Provost's might,
To Interim President, shining bright.
With wisdom deep and steady care,
You've shaped a legacy beyond compare.

Through challenges faced and goals pursued,
Your leadership has stood renewed.
You saw in others what they could be,
Including a chance you gave to me.
A mentor's voice, a guiding hand,
You helped us grow, you helped us stand.

Jerry, your mark will ever remain,
In every triumph Carleton will gain.
With thanks profound, we honor you,
For all you've done, and all you do.

It was **MOVED** (D. Hornsby, H. Nemiroff) that Senate thank Interim President Jerry Tomberlin for his service as Chair of Senate.

The motion **PASSED UNANIMOUSLY**.

13. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned (L. Kostiuk, S. Blanchard) at 3:45 p.m.

