



Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.

**Carleton University Senate  
Meeting of January 25, 2019, at 2:00 pm  
Senate Room, Robertson Hall**

**MINUTES**

**Present:** F. Afagh, F. Afaq, S. Ajila, S. Angulo, B.A. Bacon (Chair), S. Blanchard, A. Bowker, S. Boyle, A. Chandler, J. Coghill, B. Creary, C. Cruickshank, J. Deaville, T. Di Leo Browne, C. Dion, L. Dyke, P. Farrell, R. Goubran, E. Grant, N. Grasse, P. Gunupudi, H. Gupta, B. Hallgrimsson, J. Hayes, W. Horn, B. Hughes, W. Jones, C. Joslin, S. Klausen, J. Kovalio, S. Kroff, B. Kuzmarov (Clerk), J. Liu, C. Macdonald, R. Mckay, H. Nemiroff, M. Neufang, S. Paul, J. Paulson, M. Piché, A. Plourde, B. Popplewell, M. Qalnle, J. Ramasubramanyam, P. Rankin, M. Rooney, L. Schweitzer, S. Shires, A. Shotwell, D. Siddiqi, E. Sloan, J. Smith, P. Smith, T. Tandon, J. Tomberlin, C. Trudel, C. Viju, J.P. Watzlawik-Li, J. Wolfart

**Regrets:** A. Dodge, D. Dragunoiu, J. Erochko, M. Esponda, K. Evans, B. Hughes, E. Kwan, D. Nussbaum, W. Shi, K. von Finckenstein

**Absent:** A. Ahmad, J. Cheetham, A. Harrison, W. Horn, F. Hosseinian, D. Howe, P. Lagasse, A. Maheshwari, N. Nanos, D. Oladejo, J. Stoner,

**Recording Secretary:** K. McKinley

**Guests:** K. Horn-Miller, B. Michaud (Co-chairs of CUISIC), S. Fai (Chair of the Senate Library Committee)

---

The Chair opened the meeting at 2:04 p.m.

**1. WELCOME & APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

It was **MOVED** (J. Paulson, C. Dion) that Senate approve the agenda of the Senate meeting on January 25, 2019, as presented.  
The motion **PASSED**.

## **2. MINUTES – November 30, 2018**

It was **MOVED** (E. Grant, M. Qalilie) that Senate approve the minutes of the Senate meeting on November 30, 2018, as presented. The motion **PASSED**.

## **3. MATTERS ARISING**

**a) SCCASP Vocabulary Clarification** RE: Revisions to Regulation 2.2.4 in Undergraduate Calendar as discussed in SCCASP Report, October 19, 2018. SCCASP was asked to clarify vocabulary used in this regulation, specifically “final grade” and “overall approximate grade.”

Chair Howard Nemiroff indicated that SCCASP replaced the term “final grade” in 2.2.4 with “cumulative grade earned,” which is the language used more consistently throughout the Calendar. There was no further discussion.

**b) Report on co-teaching responsibilities for new program in Migration and Diaspora Studies, as discussed on October 19, 2018.**

A question was raised at the Senate meeting in October 2018 regarding the potentially heavy workload for faculty involved in co-teaching courses in this new program. Vice-Provost Lorraine Dyke reported that the question was referred back to SAPC and CUCQA for review. Program leads indicated that they did not perceive a cause for concern, but agreed to contact the Dean should any issues arise in the future. CUCQA and SAPC did not feel the need to revisit this issue. In the interim, the program has been approved by the Quality Council and is moving toward Ministry approval.

## **4. CHAIR'S REMARKS**

The Chair wished Senators a Happy New Year, and highlighted some of the recent events and developments at Carleton University:

- Shireen Hassim will join Carleton University's Faculty of Arts & Social Sciences as the *Canada 150 Research Chair in Gender and African Politics*.
- Ellen Waterman has been appointed the first *Helmut Kallman Chair for Music in Canada*, in Carleton's School for Studies in Art & Culture.
- Halim Yanikomeroglu from the Department of Systems and Computer Engineering has been awarded a 2019 Engineering Institute of Canada Fellowship (FEIC) for a lifetime of dedication and contribution to engineering in Canada. Professor Yanikomeroglu also received the IEEE Communications Society Wireless Communications Technical Committee (WTC) Recognition Award in 2018.
- Carleton Science alumna Mary L'Abbé, a leading researcher in nutrition, has been appointed to the Order of Canada.
- Sprott School of Business won a number of awards at the JDCC (Jeux du Commerce Central), central Canada's largest undergraduate business school competition: first prize in Accounting, third prize in Entrepreneurship, and third prize in Digital Strategy.
- Carleton University's Dining Services is the first among Canadian universities to receive a Three-Star SPE Certification.
- The Provost search is progressing well. Short-listed candidates were interviewed last week, and a second round of interviews is planned for early February. A final decision will be made after interviews have concluded.
- Decanal searches are progressing in staggered phases. The Provost is in discussions with the preferred Business candidate, Engineering is on track in the short-list phase, and the search for the Graduate & Postdoctoral Studies Dean has launched.
- The Carleton University Indigenous Strategic Initiatives Committee is now fully staffed and has held two meetings to establish themes and a process for consultation. Co-chairs Kahente Horn-Miller, Benny Michaud and Jerry Tomberlin will present more information to Senate later in this meeting.
- Benny Michaud has been appointed as Assistant Director of the Department of Equity Services. The Chair noted that Benny has been performing admirably in this role as Acting Assistant Director for several months and is a valued asset to Carleton University.

- The Provost and CUASA jointly announced a partnership to move towards ten new Indigenous faculty hires for Carleton University.
- The revised Sexual Violence Policy will be posted on January 29<sup>th</sup>. The process allows for public consultations and workshops with various groups. The Chair thanked everyone involved in this important review process.
- The Chair noted the passing of these members of Carleton's community:
  - Bruce Thomlinson and Judy Booth, two alumni killed in the Westboro bus tragedy.
  - Stuart Adam, an important academic leader for Carleton in the 1990s and early 2000s as part of President Van Loon's team.
  - Marc Andrew Hewson, Professor of American Literature and a nationally recognized Ernest Hemingway scholar. The English Department, in conjunction with Dr. Hewson's family, has established the *Doctor Marc Andrew Hewson Memorial Scholarship* to honour his many contributions to the department.
  - Gilles Paquet, who was Chair of Economics and Dean of Graduate Studies at Carleton. Professor Paquet was also an outstanding teacher, researcher and well-known public intellectual. He was awarded a Carleton honorary degree.
  - Peter Calamai, a leading figure in Canadian journalism and an adjunct research professor at the School of Journalism and Communication.
- Finally, the Chair spoke to the recent announcements from Queen's Park regarding changes to tuition, student bursaries and loans, and student fees at Ontario universities.
  - The Provincial Government announced a 10% tuition rollback on domestic student tuition. The cut in Carleton's overall budget amounts to approximately 4%, or about \$20M. The Chair assured Senate that Carleton is in a solid fiscal position, and will adjust the budgeting process to protect Carleton's academic mission and operations.
  - The government has yet to provide more information on the changes to bursaries through OSAP.
  - The government also announced changes to student fees that would differentiate between essential mandatory fees, and non-essential optional fees. The impact on student

associations and important services such as the U-PASS is not yet known. The Chair indicated that the administration will work with student associations to formulate a plan once more details have been released by the government.

**Questions and Discussion:**

A Senator asked who will determine which student fees are essential and whether Senate could make that determination under its mandate. The Chair indicated that these details are not yet known. It is likely that universities will have some leeway, but choices will be based on government guidelines.

The Chair also indicated that the U-PASS is an important program for the city, but it will be difficult to maintain without mandatory fees. This issue will be on the list of questions taken to the technical briefing.

**5. QUESTION PERIOD**

**a) Question regarding the Senate Policy on Accommodation for Student Activities**

A Senator submitted a question outlining specific concerns regarding the *Senate Policy on Accommodation for Student Activities*, which was passed by Senate on March 31, 2017. The concerns focused on issues faculty members have experienced in providing accommodations for student athletes.

It was noted that the policy was not included in the materials circulated to Senators, but can be found on the Senate website policy page, for reference.

The Provost noted first that the policy applies to a broad range of activities, as indicated in paragraph 2 of the policy:

Carleton University strongly supports these activities. Faculty members must provide all reasonable accommodation to students who compete or perform at the national or international level. In particular, this includes varsity athletes, students participating in recognized international academic competitions or student artists performing internationally.

The Provost acknowledged that athletics does appear to be emphasized in the policy, and that the language could be reviewed for possible revision by SCCASP.

The Provost then spoke to the specific concerns raised in the question:

*i) Use of the [McIntyre Exam Centre] MEC for student athletes, without [Paul Menton Centre] PMC accommodations. The issue here is that the MEC is closed to us for other makeup exams, on the grounds that it is only to be used for accommodating PMC students.*

The Provost responded that the use of the MEC is not mentioned or specified in the policy.

*ii) The policy puts no burden of responsibility on the students: they do not have to make their accommodation request by any particular deadline. There is a related expectation by student athletes that all their games or travel shall be accommodated and missed classes “excused”, and that their athletic schedule should take precedence over their academic schedule.*

The Provost indicated that this is a valid concern. Accommodation requests should be declared to the professor at the beginning of the term if the dates required are known and predictable. The onus should be on the student to do so. The Registrar also noted that the Athletic Director can and should determine which accommodation requests are valid, depending on the level of competition or activity.

*iii) The new policy is inappropriately bundled into the course outlines with human rights and equity policies, though it is neither and should not be conflated with these.*

The Provost responded that the notice from the Provost's Office has bundled these together, but that can be altered moving forward.

*iv) There is no policy for accommodating childcare or work shifts that may require students to miss classes or exams; why travel for athletic competition is more important than these is perplexing and leads to equity concerns.*

The Provost agreed that there is no over-riding policy for health emergencies or childcare emergencies, largely because it has not been required. Students currently are able to request this type of accommodation on an individual basis from their Professor, and can appeal if necessary through the Director of their program, or through the Associate Dean or Dean of their faculty. SCCASP could review this concern, although the current system appears to be functioning well.

- v) As written, the Athletic Director has inappropriate oversight over the acceptability of accommodations made in what should be an academic matter (with the Dean as the only overseeing authority).

The Provost noted that the Athletic Director is the appropriate authority for athletic accommodations, but she would not determine the eligibility of academic or other accommodation requests. The Chair of SCCASP also noted that the policy states that the Dean, when required, will make a determination regarding academic accommodations. The Provost added that SCCASP will review the policy language to see if a revision could clarify this.

A Senator asked for additional clarity around the timelines required for submitting an accommodation request, and whether a deadline could be suggested. Additionally, an acceptable range for the total number of classes missed through these accommodations would be useful. The concern is that learning outcomes will be compromised if too many classes are missed within a semester.

The Provost agreed to take all of these questions back to SCCASP for review and discussion.

## **6. SENATE ADMINISTRATION**

### **a) Convocation Date Changes for Spring Ceremonies (Clerk)**

The Clerk of Senate noted that the Convocation Working Group in coordination with the Registrar's Office has proposed a change to June Convocation in order to accommodate the growing number of Engineering graduates. The proposed change would split the Faculty of

Engineering & Design graduates into two ceremonies on Thursday of graduation week and add a separate 9<sup>th</sup> ceremony on Monday afternoon for the graduates from the Sprott School of Business.

This change requires Senate approval to add an extra date (Monday) to the Convocation week for June 2019, 2020 and 2021.

It was **MOVED** (B. Kuzmarov, L. Schweitzer) that Senate approve the following dates for Spring Convocation: June 10-14, 2019; June 8-12, 2020; June 7-11, 2021.

The motion **PASSED**.

### **b) Senate Committee Review**

The Clerk presented an update on the Senate Committee Review. Stage one of the review, the Benchmarking Study, has been completed. Eighteen universities were involved in a survey of the landscape of committee structures at Ontario universities. Data from this study, circulated to Senators in advance of this meeting, demonstrates the following key observations:

- Carleton University has the most Senate committees of all Ontario universities surveyed, at 14.
- Carleton is the only Ontario university of those surveyed that does not require the Governance Committee and other key committees to be staffed by Senators.
- Other Ontario university Senates have consolidated their appeals committees; Carleton's Senate currently has four appeals committees.

The next step in the review is to focus on the Carleton context. Over the next few weeks, the Clerk will be asking Chairs of Carleton Senate committees for feedback on the functioning, structure, and terms of reference of their committees. This information will be shared with Senate in February. The Clerk thanked Senate for its support of this important project. There were no questions from Senators on the materials circulated, analysis provided or the process followed.

### **c) Notice of Appointments Contrary to Advertising Procedures**

The Clerk noted that in December, the Senate Office was notified of two appointments made contrary to advertising procedures. Both were

Instructors whose positions were converted from term positions to preliminary appointments. There were no questions or comments from the floor.

## 7. REPORTS

### a) Senate Academic Program Committee (SAPC) (J. Tomberlin)

The Provost presented eight major modifications to Senate.

1. It was **MOVED** that Senate approve the major modifications to the Master of Political Management program as presented with effect from Fall 2019.
2. It was **MOVED** that Senate approve the major modifications to the PhD in Legal Studies and the PhD in Legal Studies with Specialization in Political Economy programs as presented with effect from Fall 2019.
3. It was **MOVED** that Senate approve the deletion of the Carleton-Leeds Internship program as presented with effect from Fall 2019.
4. It was **MOVED** that Senate approve the deletion of the Bachelor of Computer Science, Biomedical Computing Stream program, as presented with effect from Fall 2019.
5. It was **MOVED** that Senate approve the major modification to the Bachelor of Information Technology, Optical Systems and Sensors program as presented with effect from Fall 2019.
6. It was **MOVED** that Senate approve the major modification to the Bachelor of Food Science program as presented with effect from Fall 2019.
7. It was **MOVED** that Senate approve the major modifications to the Bachelor of Arts and Bachelor of Science (Hons, Gen.) in Linguistics programs as presented with effect from Fall 2019.
8. It was **MOVED** that Senate approve the major modification to ALDS 5215 and ALDS 5806 as presented with effect from Fall 2019.

OMNIBUS MOTION:

It was **MOVED** (J. Tomberlin, L. Dyke) that Senate approve the major modifications as presented above with effect from Fall 2019.

Discussion:

A Senator asked to have the second modification (for the PhD in Legal Studies, and PhD in Legal Studies with Specialization in Political Economy) pulled out of the omnibus motion to be considered separately.

The second item was removed from the omnibus motion for separate consideration before the vote.

The motion **PASSED**.

Item #2: It was **MOVED** (J. Tomberlin, L. Dyke) that Senate approve the major modifications to the PhD in Legal Studies and the PhD in Legal Studies with Specialization in Political Economy programs as presented with effect from Fall 2019.

Discussion:

Several Senators objected to this modification, which removes the second language requirement from the PhD in Legal Studies. It was noted that proficiency in a second language has been a standard requirement of most PhDs, and is meant to enhance research breadth. Many Senators felt that there was merit in keeping this requirement, while others felt that graduates could make a solid contribution to scholarship in an area with only one language and that this is not unusual in similar disciplines. The Dean of the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies also noted that there was no objection to this modification at Faculty Board. After a thorough discussion, the Chair called the vote.

The motion **PASSED**, with 36 voting for the motion, 7 against, and 7 abstentions.

The Dean of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs offered to take this issue back to Faculty Board for discussion, to review the percentage of Carleton PhD programs with language requirements and to bring that information back to Senate. The Chair thanked the Dean for this offer and suggested that it be included in Matters Arising at the next Senate meeting.

**b) Senate Committee on Curriculum, Admissions and Study Policy (SCCASP) (H. Nemiroff)**

Three items were brought to Senate for approval, two items were circulated for information and there was one item for discussion.

Items for Approval:

Regulation Changes to the BJ and BJHum: clarification in the calendar to ensure that the CGPA for graduation is embedded in the progression through the program. (6.5 for BJ and 7.0 for BJHum)

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, B. Popplewell) that Senate approve the changes to the Bachelor of Journalism and Bachelor of Journalism and Humanities for the 2019/20 Calendar as presented.  
The motion **PASSED**.

Revisions to Regulation 7.5 for the BComm: Replacement of BUSI1402 with BUSI 2800 as a required course.

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, L. Schweitzer) that Senate approve the changes to regulation 7.5 Bachelor of Commerce for the 2019/20 Calendar, as presented.  
The motion **PASSED**.

Revisions to Regulation 8.2 – Application for Graduation: Deadline for Spring Graduation Applications moved from March 1 to April 1.

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, C. Dion) that Senate approve the changes to regulation 8.2 Application for Graduation for the 2019/20 Calendar as presented.

A Senator asked if this would negatively impact the Registrar's Office in terms of workload. The Registrar indicated that because of improvements to automation processes, resources are adequate for the change.

The motion **PASSED**.

Items for Information:

A list of minor modifications to programs in all faculties was circulated to Senators in advance. There was no discussion and no motion for this item.

The second item - minor modification to calendar language presented in Matters Arising.

Item for Discussion: Senate Policy on Academic Implications of Labour Disruptions

Senate passed a motion in May of 2018 asking SCCASP to develop a policy for student accommodations in the event of a labour disruption on campus. A draft policy was circulated to Senators for discussion and comment.

The Chair of SCCASP noted that this policy is loosely based on an existing policy at York University, with a few key differences. It was also noted that McGill University brought a similar policy to their Senate, but it was defeated on the floor.

One Senator expressed concern with emulating York University policy too closely. In his view, providing too many accommodations for students decreases the pressure to end the strike and can prolong labour disruptions. It was suggested that this could be a factor in the prolonged and frequent strikes in recent years at York University.

A few Senators commented on the language in Section 2.1 of the draft policy - Academic Standards and Quality:

During a Labour Disruption, Senate will ensure the maintenance of academic standards and quality for all programs. No dilution of standards normally expected of students is permitted. Diminution in the instructional or supervisory support given to students should be minimized to the extent possible.

One Senator asked how this policy language could be applied to the variety of possible labour disruptions on campus, from academic staff to support staff, TAs and so on. For example, in the case of a faculty or TA strike, diminution in instructional and/or supervisory support would occur, and likely could not be avoided. Another Senator expressed concern with the implications of the language in the first sentence of this section, specifically what Senate's role would be during a labour disruption, and how Senate would or could guarantee the maintenance of academic standards. The Chair of SCCASP agreed to take these concerns back to the committee for review and discussion.

In response to another question, the Chair of SCCASP noted that the current policy includes accommodations for students “unable” to cross the picket line, but not for those “unwilling” to cross. This wording reflects a preference expressed at Senate last May. It was noted that conscientious objectors are not currently accommodated in the policy, and movement on this issue would require further discussion.

There was some confusion regarding the exact wording of the original motion passed by Senate in May of 2018. The Chair indicated that the minutes from this meeting will be consulted for clarification, and brought to the next Senate meeting under Matters Arising.

The Chair thanked Senators for their input and asked the Chair of SCCASP to take these comments back to SCCASP for consideration.

**c) Reports – Senate Library Committee (S. Fai, guest)**

The Chair of the Senate Library Committee, Steven Fai, provided an update on the activities and mandate of the committee. A question was raised at a previous Senate meeting regarding the committee’s role in overseeing library operations including the weeding of collections.

Professor Fai indicated that he has been the Chair of the Senate Library Committee since 2011. The committee exists as an advisory body to the library, and normally meets once per semester, but due to scheduling difficulties, it has yet to meet this academic year. Professor Fai noted that culling books occurs annually, and is a regular practice at every academic library, including Carleton. He also indicated that the library has been working proactively this year with some departments (Art History and English) that had expressed concerns with the large culls in their collections.

A Senator noted that the Terms of Reference for the Library Committee suggest that there is a role for the committee in collections management. He asked if the Library Committee practices oversight over library policies such as weeding. Professor Fai responded that in his view the mandate of the committee is to help to determine the development of university

library collections. Library operations, including the practice of culling books, is the responsibility of librarians and not the committee.

Another Senator noted that materials belonging to one department are often used by students in other disciplines, and that it is important to remember that a cull in one department would impact several departments across the university. For example, books and materials belonging to the History department are often used by students in Political Science.

A Senator added that in his experience, a department was notified of a cull after it had occurred, only to have the cull reversed to reacquire materials that were still needed. This is an example of how Senate oversight could provide protection from this type of error. It was suggested that the Library Committee could have a more active role in reviewing plans for culls and acquisitions.

Further discussion revealed some disagreement among Senators on the interpretation of the current Terms of Reference of this committee, and to what extent the committee is mandated to oversee library operations and collections management. Several Senators expressed the view that collections management is a deeply academic issue that impacts the ability to deliver programs, and that Senate should have more of a role in this process.

The Chair thanked Senators for their comments and noted in summary the concerns expressed by Senate that the Library Committee has not had the opportunity to review and comment on plans for collections management. The Clerk indicated that a review of the Library Terms of Reference and its mandate will be included in the comprehensive review of Senate committees currently underway.

## **8. CARLETON UNIVERSITY INDIGENOUS STRATEGIC INITIATIVES COMMITTEE (CUISIC) PRESENTATION**

Co-Chairs Jerry Tomberlin, Kahente Horn-Miller, and Benny Michaud gave a presentation on the activities of the newly formed Indigenous Strategic Initiatives Committee. (See attached pdf.)

It was **MOVED** (J. Tomberlin, J. Paulson) that Senate support and endorse the work of the *Carleton University Indigenous Strategic Initiatives Committee* (CUISIC) towards revitalizing our Indigenous strategy and our relationship with Indigenous peoples on and off campus, as presented. The motion **PASSED**.

As part of the consultation process, the Co-Chairs of the committee have agreed to return to Senate within the next few months for a more substantial conversation and discussion. The Chair congratulated the committee Co-Chairs on their achievements so far in working towards positive and lasting change at Carleton.

## **9. REPORTS FOR INFORMATION**

The following items were circulated to Senators for information:

- a) Senate Executive Minutes: November 20, 2018
- b) Membership reports for the University Promotions Committee and the Tenure and Promotions Appeal Committee
- c) Dominican University College - Minor Modifications
- d) SCCASP – Course Program Minor Modifications

There was no discussion.

## **10. OTHER BUSINESS**

There was none.

## **11. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned (J. Paulson, E. Grant) at 4:03 pm.