



Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.

**Carleton University Senate
Meeting of April 24, 2020 at 2:00 pm
Via Zoom Videoconference**

MINUTES – OPEN SESSION

Present/Registered: A. Ahmad, S. Ajila, K. Weary (proxy for L. Akagbosu), B.A. Bacon (Chair), M. Barbeau, O. Baysal, S. Blanchard, A. Bowker, D. Brown, J. Bruno, A. Chandler, J. Cheetham, M. Close, C. Cruickshank, T. Daniels, J. Deaville, D. Deugo, T. Di Leo Browne, C. Dion, D. Dragunoiu, K. Evans, P. Farrell, D. Gillberg, R. Goubran, P. Gunupudi, H. Gupta, M. Haines, B. Hallgrímsson, K. Hellemans, O. Hobbs, F. Hosseinian, B. Hughes, C. Joslin, L. Kostiuk, J. Kovalio, Z. Kryworuchka, B. A. Kuzmarov (Clerk), E. Kwan, A. Lannon, C. Macdonald, R. McKay, H. Nemiroff, D. Nussbaum, S. Parathundiyil, J. Paulson, M. Piche, A. Plourde, B. Popplewell, M. Rooney, W. Shi, A. Shotwell, D. Siddiqi, J. Sinclair-Palm, S. Sivathayalan, P. Smith, J. Stoner, J. Tomberlin, A. Tremblay, C. Trudel, K. von Finckenstein, J. Voordouw, P. Wilson, J. Wolfart, P. Wolff, B. Wright, W. Ye

Regrets: T. Boswell, N. Cappuccino, J. Liu, P. Rankin, E. Sloan, C. Warner

Absent: S. Boyle, A. Courchene, P. Dion, P. Lagasse, S. Moran, S. Shires, S. Srinivasan

Recording Secretary: K. McKinley

Open Session:

1. Welcome (Chair) & Approval of Agenda

The Chair began the meeting by requesting a moment of silence for the victims of the Covid-19 pandemic and the victims of the recent tragedy in Nova Scotia. He then thanked outgoing student Senators Lily Akagbosu, Ashley Courchene, Hemant Gupta, Sarah Shires, Sidney Moran, Sriyanchita Srinivasan, and Carmen

Warner for their support of Senate over the past academic year.

The Chair reviewed the protocols for Senate meetings by videoconference, then introduced the motion to approve the agenda. He noted a request to reverse the order of the two committee reports on the agenda, so that the Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee Report precedes the report from the Senate Committee on Curriculum Admissions and Studies Policy.

With this change, it was **MOVED** (Z. Kryworuchka, D. Deugo) that Senate approve the agenda for the meeting of Senate on April 24, 2020, as presented. The motion **PASSED**.

2. Minutes:

a. Senate E-Poll March 17, 2020

It was **MOVED** (M. Haines, T. Di Leo Browne) that Senate approve the minutes of the e-poll of Senate on March 17, 2020, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

b. Senate meeting, March 27, 2020 (open session)

It was **MOVED** (M. Close, H. Gupta) that Senate approve the minutes of the Open Session of the Senate meeting on March 27, 2020, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

3. Matters Arising

There were none.

4. Chair's Remarks

The Chair began by reviewing key events of the previous month in light of the global pandemic, beginning with the decision to move all classes online on March 18th, and culminating with the close of the exam period on April 25th. The Chair congratulated students, staff and faculty on the successful completion of the winter semester. Graduating students will be approved by Senate in June, and will have their degree and credentials, even though the Convocation ceremony has been postponed.

Summer term begins May 4th and faculties are offering a full slate of courses online for students. More than 10,000 students have already registered for summer courses.

The Chair acknowledged that the next challenge will be the fall term. The current state of emergency in Ontario may be extended, but as Ontario moves towards gradually relaxing confinement measures in the coming months, it is likely that large assemblies and international travel will be among the last restrictions to be lifted. The university sector will need to find creative solutions to meet this challenge. At Carleton, Deputy Provost Lorraine Dyke will be leading a task force to investigate an array of possible scenarios for the fall semester. Decisions on how to proceed will be made in full compliance with the guidelines of health officials, and will prioritize the safety of Carleton's students, staff and faculty. An update on the fall term will be provided to Senators at the next meeting on May 29th. The Chair added that, on a positive note, student registrations and confirmations for Fall 2020 are looking similar to Fall 2019 at this time.

Finally, the Chair noted that Dr. Brenda O'Neill from the University of Calgary will become the new Dean of Carleton's Faculty of Public Affairs on October 1, 2020. Outgoing Dean André Plourde, Carleton's longest serving Dean, will remain in the position until September 30th, and Carleton will have occasion to properly honour and thank him in the coming months.

Discussion: Senators asked how Senate would be involved in the assessment of Carleton's transition to online course delivery in the Winter Term. It was suggested that SQAPC, in accordance with its role in planning and major modifications, would be an appropriate committee to initiate this work, although the Chair of SQAPC noted that the committee would need to consider how this assessment fits with their duties as outlined by the IQAP, since the type of data gathering required is not within the current mandate. Another Senator asked whether a Teaching & Learning subcommittee of Senate might take on such a role. The Clerk of Senate acknowledged that such a subcommittee had been discussed in the Committee review undertaken in Spring 2019, and could be reconsidered by the Academic Governance Committee moving forward.

5. Question Period

Questions were submitted in advance by Senators Andrea Chandler, Morgan Rooney, Hemant Gupta, and Johan Voordouw.

a) The VP Students & Enrollment answered the following questions:

Senator A. Chandler: With the unexpected transition to online learning, what steps are being taken at the university level with respect to the following problems that could impact student success in the winter term:

- students who do not have regular access to the Internet/wifi
- students who do not have regular access to a computer
- PMC students
- students who find themselves in unexpected financial/housing difficulties

Senator A. Chandler: Insofar as the university is trying to communicate with students about changes that could affect them (such as the new Pass/Fail option), what steps is the university taking to ensure that these messages reach students who a) lack reliable Internet access b) are trying to keep Internet usage to a minimum because of issues with cost or access?

Senator M. Rooney: Still on the subject of the Fall term, can the President or Provost update us on any initiatives or efforts—either internal to the institution, or in tandem with the province—that the university is exploring to support student accessibility to Carleton’s courses in the event that our Fall term moves entirely online? Specifically, how will Carleton (on its own or working with the province) support new and existing students who lack access to things such as stable internet connections as well as electronic devices with mics and webcams?

Response: Students without computers or access to the Internet were encouraged to call Carleton’s COVID Information line. Computers and data sticks/SIM cards were loaned to students to allow them to complete the semester. It was noted that the supply of these items has not been depleted. PMC students should be able to access their coordinators virtually or by phone; accommodation requests are being received and approved. Students experiencing financial difficulties have been able to apply to the emergency fund. Funding from the federal government is also available; options are outlined on the COVID FAQ page. Students unable to return home because of travel restrictions or other reasons have been accommodated in the Carleton residences. Over 400 students will be staying there over the summer. Communication with students is proceeding according to the communications policy on all channels, including social media, email, my-Carleton student portal, etc. Phone lines are open as well for students who do not have access to the Internet. We will continue to explore options to support students for the Fall semester.

b) The Clerk of Senate answered the following question:

Senator M. Rooney: Given the current circumstances, will the Clerk of Senate or the Senate Executive consider and recommend the extension of Senate meetings into

the summer months (July and August), on a one-time emergency basis, without setting a precedent? It seems likely that, for this year, important decisions about the future of the institution may well take place in those months when Senate is normally dormant.

Response: At least one meeting of Senate over the summer months (most probably August) is a possibility, and could be discussed at the June meeting, if deemed necessary. Note that new Senate terms begin on July 1st, as usual; as a result, Senators whose terms end on June 30th will not be attending a summer meeting. The Clerk reminded Senators that a number of key vacancies for Senators on Senate standing committees have not been filled, and that these committees must be operational in the summer for Senate to function.

c) The Chair of Senate answered the following question:

Senator M. Rooney: Can the President or Provost update us on any initiatives or efforts Carleton is involved in or investigating in terms of preparing for the possibility that all Fall term courses may need to be taught online? For instance, Alex Usher of "Higher Education Strategy Initiatives" has recently urged a sector-wide approach for common lower-level, larger-enrollment courses. Given Prime Minister Trudeau's declaration on April 9th that "normality as it was before will not come back full-on until we get a vaccine for [COVID19]," it seems increasingly likely that the university will need to operate remotely for quite some time. For that reason, it is urgent that we begin to consider such things now, when there is still some time to do something.

Senator J. Voordouw: There is speculation that schools such as UCL in London, UK are moving to online learning for the upcoming fall term. There are also heard rumours that Harvard and Yale are considering pushing back the start of their academic year from September 2020 to January 2021. Given that the provincial and federal government have indicated that the pandemic will be here for the foreseeable future how is Carleton planning to successfully delivery its academic mandate (research and teaching) for the upcoming academic year

Response: This was addressed in the Chair's remarks to the satisfaction of Senate. A number of scenarios for the fall term are being considered, and an update will be brought to Senators at the next Senate meeting in May.

d) The Provost answered the following questions:

Senator M. Rooney: The University of Ottawa and its union for part-time instructors (APTPUO) recently came to an understanding regarding additional compensation for its contingent faculty in order to recognize the extra labour and training they undertook in the wake of the COVID-19 outbreak, as well as for training for summer term instructors. What steps is Carleton taking to recognize and compensate the

extra work and training that contract instructors have done that is, by definition, above and beyond what is stipulated in their contracts for the Winter term—work that, if it had not been completed, would surely have caused considerable (if not insurmountable) problems for departments and students alike?

Response: Discussions are ongoing with academic unions, but the broader question of compensation and labour relations is outside the purview of Senate and cannot be addressed at this time.

Senator M. Rooney: What decision, if any, has the university made regarding the use of teaching evaluations for upcoming summer term courses? As we discussed last month, some of the questions on the current evaluation ("How do you assess your instructor's performance: in speaking audibly and clearly?; in beginning and ending classes promptly?; in meeting classes regularly as scheduled?") do not reflect or account for the very different realities of online teaching, which often has, for instance, a significant asynchronous component. Consequently, the current teaching evaluation questionnaires, if used this summer, would do little to allow students to meaningfully evaluate the actual circumstances of their teaching and learning experience, and much of the data they produce would be invalid as a result.

Response: Student evaluations will take place in a manner consistent with the collective agreement. How these evaluations will be used is a labour relations issue that is being discussed in a different forum and cannot be addressed currently at Senate.

Senator H. Gupta: Why has Carleton not stated that Summer 2020 is a "School-scheduled break" (which is needed for immigration purposes), so that international students may be confident that they can work in the summer?

Response: Regular scheduled breaks must be defined as part of Carleton's academic calendar; the summer 2020 term cannot be considered a break, since a large number of undergraduate and graduate students are registered for courses for both summer terms, and services for students also are still available. Note that in light of the current pandemic, rules regarding employment for international students are changing and fluid; international students are advised to contact the International Student Services Office (ISSO) for the most up-to-date information and resources.

Senator H. Gupta: How is Carleton specifically supporting International Students financially? What resources is Carleton producing or making readily available for international students?

Response: Emergency financial assistance is available for all students, including international students, through Carleton's 2020 *Student Emergency Fund*. Almost \$1M has been disbursed from this fund for students in need. The Chair also noted that Carleton, along with Universities Canada and the Council of Ontario Universities, has been advocating for more assistance for international students and graduate students.

6. Administration (Clerk)

a. Senate membership ratification

Senate was asked to ratify seven faculty members and five students as new Senators for the term beginning July 1, 2020.

It was **MOVED** (B. Kuzmarov, D. Dragunoiu) that Senate ratify the new Senate appointments, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

b. Notice of non-advertised recruitment

The Senate Office received notice of one appointment made contrary to advertisement policy. The appointment was a transfer from term in the School of Linguistics and Language Studies.

c. Senate schedule changes

The Clerk reminded Senators that there will be a Senate meeting on June 19th and it will include graduation approvals.

7. SAT/UNS Implementation Motions

a. Academic Performance Evaluation

It was **MOVED** (J. Tomberlin, H. Nemiroff) that Senate approve the proposal to allow the amendment of the Academic Performance Evaluation rules for the 2019-20 academic year, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**, unanimously.

b. Student Awards

This motion is to ensure that students currently under scholarships are not disadvantaged by changing their grade(s) to Satisfactory (SAT) for one or more courses in the Winter 2020 term.

It was **MOVED** (B. Kuzmarov, J. Sinclair-Palm) that Senate approve the use of Satisfactory (SAT) and Unsatisfactory (UNS) grades for awarding entrance and in-course scholarships as presented.

The motion **PASSED**, with 1 opposed and 4 abstentions.

8. Reports:

a. Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee - SQAPC

The Chair of the committee, Dwight Deugo presented 5 motions for Senate approval.

- i) Revised Cotutelle Policy: A revised copy of the policy with track changes was circulated to Senators in advance. The revisions clarify language and timing regarding eligibility and duration.

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, W. Shi) that Senate approve the revised Cotutelle Policy.

The motion **PASSED** with 2 abstentions.

- ii) Cyclical Review: Infrastructure Protection and International Security graduate programs

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, P. Smith) that Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the graduate programs in Infrastructure Protection and International Security.

Discussion: A Senator expressed concern with responses in the documents to some of the issues and weaknesses identified in the programs. The Chair of SQAPC noted that the programs were categorized as of good quality and that concrete action is expected on any items of concern. The midterm review will provide an opportunity to review what actions have been taken.

The motion **PASSED**, with 5 abstentions and 1 opposed.

iii) Cyclical Review: Undergraduate programs in Nanoscience

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, C. Macdonald) that Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the undergraduate programs in Nanoscience.

The motion **PASSED**, with 2 abstentions.

iv) Major modification: BSc Linguistics new concentrations

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, D. Siddiqi) that Senate approve the introduction of the Concentrations in Linguistic Theory (Computer Science) and Psycholinguistics and Communication Disorders (Computer Science) to the BSC Linguistics program as presented with effect from Fall 2021.

The motion **PASSED** with 1 abstention.

v) New Program Approval: Graduate Diplomas in Economic Policy

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, D. Siddiqi) that Senate approve the master's-level graduate diplomas in Economic Policy, to commence with effect from Winter 2021.

The motion **PASSED** with 1 abstention.

b. Senate Committee on Curriculum, Admissions and Studies Policy (SCCASP)

The Chair of the committee, Howard Nemiroff, presented the following two items for information. There were no motions for Senate.

- i. Minor modifications – one item related to the Experiential Learning component for a Cognitive Science course.
- ii. Calendar entry for new Graduate Diploma in Economic Policy

9. SMA Update

The Chair noted that the provincial government has placed all Strategic Mandate Agreements on hold, until impacts of the Covid-19 pandemic are known. No agreements will be signed at this time.

10. SIP – Second Draft and Notice of Motion

A copy of the second draft of the Strategic Integrated Plan was circulated in advance to Senators. SIP Co-Chair Lorraine Dyke presented an update on the process of the Strategic Integrated Plan, including a high-level overview of community feedback plus a list of key updates and edits made to the first draft as a result of that feedback. She concluded her presentation with a timeline showing key dates for final presentations and approvals. In response to a question from Senate, it was noted that the Covid-19 pandemic is not specifically referenced in the SIP but global and public health issues are highlighted at various points in the document. Co-Chair Betina Kuzmarov provided Senate with a notice of motion on the SIP for the next Senate meeting on May 29, 2020. The Chair of Senate thanked the four co-chairs and all task force members for their work on this endeavour.

Discussion: One Senator asked if the “we will” statement in the future tense led to the impression that these objectives were not being pursued in the present. The co-chairs said this point would be brought back to the task force.

11. Preliminary Operating Budget 2020-21 Presentation

Provost Jerry Tomberlin presented the 2020-21 preliminary operating budget to Senate for information. It was noted that no covid-19 related budget compressions have been made at this time, but that a budget update is planned for the fall of 2020.

12. Reports for Information:

- a. Senate Executive Committee Minutes**
- b. Faculty Gender Equity Report**

There was no discussion of these items.

13. Other Business

- a. FASS Faculty Board Resolution**

This item was circulated in advance to Senators for information. Senator J. Deaville presented this item, noting that it arose from a meeting of

graduate supervisors in FASS in early April, and reflects the feelings of FASS faculty with regards to the need for financial relief for students. Senator Deaville requested one correction in the document:

We urge that fees charged for MA and PhD students be revisited and possibly recalibrated to reflect the changing level in the University's provision of services and the needs of our students.

Should be changed to this:

We urge that fees charged for Masters and PhD students be revisited and possibly recalibrated to reflect the changing level in the University's provision of services and the needs of our students.

The Chair thanked Senator Deaville and the FASS Faculty Board for bringing this item to the attention of Senate.

14. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 4:00 pm.