Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.

**Carleton University Senate
Meeting of June 18, 2021 at 10:00 am
Via Videoconference**

<u>Minutes – Open Session</u>

Present: A. Ahmad, S. Ajila, V. Asi, C. Ayalogu, B.A. Bacon (Chair), M. Baez, M. Barbeau, O. Baysal, S. Blanchard, A. Bowker, D. Brown, N. Bruni, J. Bruno, P. Burch (proxy for J. Ramnarine) A. Chandler, M. Close, T. Daniels, J. Dawson, D. Deugo, D. Dragunoiu, D. Edi, M. Gagne, P. Garcia, G. Garland, D. Gillberg, R. Goubran, M. Haines, C. Joslin, L. Kostiuk, J. Kovalio, B. A. Kuzmarov (Clerk), E. Kwan, A. Lannon, C. Laurendeau, K. Lucas, M. Lundy, B. MacLeod, S. Maguire, H. Nemiroff, B. O'Neill, J. Paulson, P. Rankin, M. Rooney, D. Russell, S. Sadaf, J. Sinclair-Palm, S. Sivathayalan, E. Sloan, P. Smith, D. Sprague, R. S. Sundarraj, J. Taber, K. Taylor, J. Tomberlin, A. Tremblay, C. Trudel, L. Tsintsadze, C. Viju, K. von Finckenstein, J. Voordouw, J. Wallace, P. Wilson, J. Wolfart, P. Wolff, B. Wright W. Ye
Regrets: K. AlWazir, B. Hallgrimsson, K. Hellemans, C. Macdonald, J. Milner, M. Piché, J. Ramnarine
Absent: C. Davis, S. Gulati, O. Hobbs, F. Hosseinian, A. Luko, R. McKay, J. Moore, B. Popplewell, J. Stoner
Recording Secretary: K. McKinley

---

1. Welcome & Approval of Agenda (Open)

The Chair welcomed Senators to the Open Session of the meeting.

It was **MOVED** (D. Dragunoiu, S. Sivathayalan) that Senate approve the open agenda for the meeting of Senate on June 18, 2021, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

2. **Minutes: May 28, 2021**

It was **MOVED** (W. Ye, D. Sprague) that Senate approve the minutes of the Open Session of the Senate meeting of May 28, 2021 as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

3. **Matters Arising:**

The Chair provided an update on the situation of PhD student Cihan Erdal, who has been detained in Turkey since September. Cihan has been conditionally released from jail but must remain in Turkey at this time. Carleton continues to work with Global Affairs Canada towards Cihan's safe return to Canada.

4. **Chair's Remarks**

The Chair began his remarks with an update on the pandemic. Ontario currently is in Phase 1 of its re-opening framework. The outlook for Canadians continues to improve as vaccination rates increase and case numbers continue to decline.

The Chair acknowledged the discovery of 215 Indigenous children's remains at a former residential school site in Kamloops. Carleton stands in solidarity with Indigenous communities, faculty and staff as we remember and honour the victims and survivors of the residential school system. Carleton's flags have been lowered to half-mast to honour these children. The Chair also acknowledged that June is Indigenous History month, and reminded Senators that Carleton must continue to move forward with reconciliation efforts and the recommendations of Kinàmàgawin.

The Chair also condemned the June 6th hit-and-run attack in London Ontario, that took the lives of four members of a Muslim family. Terrorism charges have been brought against the driver. Carleton mourns alongside all residents of London Ontario, and stands in solidarity with the Muslim community. Campus flags were lowered to half-mast to honour those who lost their lives.

June is also Pride Month, an opportunity to show support for LGBTQ2S+ members of our community. Carleton is committed to providing a safe space for all on our campus. The Chair encouraged Senators to review the CU News Room for more information on Pride Month features.

Earlier in June, Carleton also celebrated Appreciation Week, a virtual week-long series of events and activities that replaced, this year, the in-person Appreciation Day that normally occurs in mid-June. The Chair thanked all within the community for their creativity and flexibility in successfully completing a long and challenging academic year. In recognition of the hard work and resilience of the Carleton community, an extra Appreciation Day holiday will be offered to faculty and staff on July 2, 2021.

The Chair next noted that twenty-six Senators will be retiring from Senate at the end of this month. He thanked all for their collegiality, hard work, and support of academic governance.

Finally, the Chair extended a warm thank-you to the Clerk of Senate, Betina Appel Kuzmarov, who is leaving her position as of June 30, 2021 after a 3-year tenure. The Chair reminded Senate of Professor Kuzmarov's many accomplishments as Clerk, including her leadership role in the creation of the Free Speech Policy, and her contributions as co-chair of the SIP Task Force. Professor Kuzmarov will be missed for her grace, humility and compassion, and the Chair wished her all the best in her new role as Chair of the Department Law & Legal Studies. Senate welcomes Senator Elinor Sloan as the next Clerk, beginning on July 1, 2021.

5. **Question Period**

Four questions were submitted in advance by Senators:

1) Question from Johannes Wolfart

The University's digital strategy is clearly an academic matter, subject to Senate oversight; however, there are also implications for workloads, technical support, professional development allocations, and the like. Will details of Carleton's digital strategy bargained with affected unions at Carleton? How will such processes intersect with Senate approval procedure?

Senator Wolfart agreed to allow this question to be answered during agenda item 8 (Digital Strategy), later in the Senate meeting.

2) Question from Justin Paulson

One of the Kinàmàgawin calls to action was a recommendation that many more classrooms have moveable furniture and the ability to arrange chairs and desks in a circle. Since the calls to action were released, we have now completed an entire academic year in which no classrooms were used at all—surely an excellent time to move forward on this recommendation and renovate the many classrooms (besides lecture halls) that had fixed seating. Was this done, and to how many classrooms? (I ask because I've been told when trying to schedule in-person graduate seminars for the fall that in most cases they will have to be in rooms with fixed seating.) If no such changes were made in the past year, why not?

Response provided by AVP Teaching & Learning David Hornsby: Teaching & Learning Services, FMP and Scheduling & Exam Services have been working collaboratively on this issue. Out of the 178 general pool classrooms, 105 include movable furniture, but at this time only 50 can enable learning circles as specified in Kinàmàgawin. 20 out of the 21 general classrooms in the new Nicol Building do have movable furniture to this standard, and plans are underway to convert more classrooms, particularly in Southam Hall.

3) Questions from Morgan Rooney
   a. Many Carleton employees took advantage of the university's considerate offer to receive the AstraZeneca vaccination from Health and Counselling Services between May 5 and May 11. At the time of their original booking, those employees also received a booking for a second shot. Now that Ontario has discontinued the first-short use of AstraZeneca, **can administration provide those staff members with an update regarding Health and Counselling Services' current/future role in the vaccination campaign? Do we know yet, for instance, if those second-shot bookings will be honoured? And, if so, do we have a sense as to what type of vaccination (AstraZeneca and/or one of the mRNA options) will be available to that group?**

   Response provided by VP Students & Learning Suzanne Blanchard: Health and Counselling Services is able to administer the Covid-19 vaccine and is collaborating with Ottawa Public Health on allocations to ensure adequate supplies are procured for the Carleton community. Individuals who have received the AstraZeneca vaccine at Carleton as their first dose are being contacted individually and will have a choice of either AstraZeneca or mRNA for their second vaccination. Efforts are underway to procure enough vaccinations to service the entire Carleton community for both first and second shots, including individuals who received their first vaccination off-

campus. Health and Counselling Service anticipates that this additional supply should arrive on campus in early July. Senators are encouraged to visit the Carleton Covid-19 website for the most recent updates to vaccination information.

b. Nearly 8 months ago, in response to a question seeking clarity as to what constitutes a reasonable or appropriate workload in a 0.5 credit course, the Provost committed to "exploring options through SCCASP with the advice of pedagogical experts" (October 30, Senate Meeting Minutes, p.7). Without such guidance, individual faculty members will continue to be left to decide for themselves, students will continue to experience different workload expectations from course to course, and in all likelihood faculty and administration will continue to face workload complains from students. In other words, it is in everyone's interest—administration, instructors, students—that this question be resolved so that there is a common reference point. **Can the Provost or SCCASP update Senate on any progress on this issue, and/or provide a timeline as to when everyone can expect to gain some clarity on this subject?**

Response provided by SCCASP Chair Howard Nemiroff: This question has been on SCCASP's radar, but because of other Covid-related priorities it has not yet been addressed by the committee. Understanding the impact of different and inconsistent workloads will require discussions with various stakeholders and potentially a benchmarking study. The issue is on the agenda for the SCCASP Summer Retreat in August, and Senate will be provided with an update in mid to late Fall of 2021.

6. **Administration (Clerk)**

    a. **Membership ratifications**

    Four faculty members and 2 Board of Governors representatives were ratified for new terms as Senators beginning July 1, 2021.

    It was **MOVED** (B. Kuzmarov, M. Haines) that Senate ratify the new Senate appointments, as presented, for terms beginning July 1, 2021.

    The motion **PASSED**.

b. 2021/22 Revised Senate Schedule

The Clerk noted that the Senate schedule for 2021/22 has been revised to include a possible special meeting, if required, on Friday August 20, 2021 at 2:00 pm. A copy of the revised schedule was included in the Senate meeting package.

7. Reports:

a)   Senate Committee on Curriculum, Admissions and Studies Policy (SCCASP)

Howard Nemiroff, Chair of SCCASP presented three items for Senate approval and one item for information.

Items for Approval:

- **Minimum CGPA requirements for graduation – some additions and updates to CGPA requirements for degree programs**

  It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, D. Dragunoiu) that Senate approves the revisions to regulation R-UG-3.4.6 Minimum CGPA Requirements for Graduation effective for the 2021/22 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

  The motion **PASSED**.

- **Academic Integrity Policy**
  The Chair of SCCASP provided an introduction and broad summary of this item. The last update to the AI Policy was approved by Senate on June 26, 2015. A subcommittee was established over a year ago to work through the policy and to suggest revisions. The policy has been updated to address course-sharing websites (Course Hero, CHEGG) and other new online issues.

  Two major concerns were addressed by the committee in this revision. One issue is the large increase in AI allegations which has

resulted in a backlog of cases; the other issue is the lack of policy education among instructors, teaching assistants and students.

The first issue was addressed through the suggestion of a parking ticket approach, which would allow students to plead guilty on their first AI offence in order to receive a lesser, clearly defined sanction. Since most AI allegations are founded, students who acknowledge they have committed an offence can have their file dealt with quickly. For those students who feel that they have been wrongfully accused, the ombuds service pathway still exists, and students also can request a meeting to discuss the allegation(s).

The policy education issue will be addressed in collaboration with TLS and EIC through the development of videos, workshops, AI Orientation Day discussions, and classroom presentations for TAs, Instructors and students.

Next steps for the committee will include data gathering to determine any inherent biases and/or relationship between academic integrity offences and equity-seeking groups.

The committee Chair noted that a clean document was circulated to Senators in advance, without track changes, for clarity.

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, J. Wolfart) that Senate approves the revisions to the Academic Integrity Policy, as presented.

Discussion:

In response to a question from the floor, it was noted that the new "parking ticket" approach is included in Section VII, Item 3:

The Dean may provide the student with the option to assume responsibility and forego a formal statement. If such an option is provided, it will clearly outline the sanction to be applied.

Some Senators expressed concern with the removal from the policy of unauthorized resubmission of work as an academic integrity violation. The Chair noted that the committee decided that this is a grading issue specific to learning outcomes specified by the Instructor. In other words, the onus is on the instructor to specify in the course outline whether or not they will accept a student's previously submitted work. The instructor could then

address an offence against such a condition specified in the syllabus by assigning a lower grade to the student. If nothing is specified in the syllabus, the matter would be taken up by the instructor in consultation with the appropriate Associate Dean, on a case-by-case basis.

In response to another question, the Chair noted that although the committee did not consult specifically with student groups such as GSA, CUSA and CASG, graduate and undergraduate student voices were represented on the committee, and students did contribute to the discussion around the policy revisions.

A Senator asked a question related to the appeal of sanction (Article X) in the policy, specifically, whether the imposition of a penalty not consistent with the offence is grounds for an appeal. The committee Chair confirmed that this would be grounds for an appeal.

The motion **PASSED**.

- **R UG 5.4 Grading System – GNA (Grade Not Approved)**
  This revision removes the reference to Academic Integrity violation as a reason for the GNA, due to privacy concerns.

  It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, A. Bowker) that Senate approves the revisions to regulation R-UG-5.4 Grading System effective for the 2021/22 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

  A Senator asked whether it might be better for the student to know why they have been assigned the GNA. The Chair responded that the intent is to use the GNA as a general comment. Specific reasons for the GNA should be communicated to students via letter/email from the Associate Dean, and students should be in receipt of the letter before the GNA appears on their record. Any potential issues with communications procedures can be addressed through workshops or consultations with the department(s).

  The motion **PASSED**.

Item for information:

- Course Programs – Minor Modifications (June 1, June 15) were presented for information only.

7-Reports (cont'd):

b)   Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee (SQAPC)

Committee Chair Dwight Deugo presented one new program and one cyclical review report for Senate approval.

Graduate Programs in Data Science and Analytics (new program approval)
Masters (MASc, MEng, MCS, MIT, MSc) and PhD

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, M. Gagne) that Senate approve the proposed graduate programs in Data Science and Analytics as presented.

The motion **PASSED.**

FARES – Computer Science

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, C. Laurendeau) that Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the undergraduate programs in Computer Science.

The motion **PASSED.**

7-Reports (cont'd):

c)   Senate Academic Governance Committee (SAGC) (B. Kuzmarov)

The Clerk presented two items for Senate approval.

Committee membership ratifications

A memo recommending the ratification of new committee members for the Senate Executive Committee, SCCASP, the Senate Academic Integrity Appeals Committee and the Senate Review Committee, for terms beginning in July 1, 2021 was circulated in advance.

It was **MOVED** (B. Kuzmarov, S. Ajila) that Senate ratify the new Senate committee appointments, as presented.

The motion **PASSED.**

Senate Review Committee Terms of Reference Update

Revised Terms of Reference for the Senate Review Committee were circulated in advance. Changes made as a result of reformatting included the addition of quorum/voting information, reporting structure and review schedule. No substantive changes to the content of the TOR were made in the revision.

It was **MOVED** (B. Kuzmarov, D. Russell) that Senate approve the changes to the Terms of Reference for the Senate Review Committee, as presented.

The motion **PASSED.**

7-Reports (cont'd):

d) **Senate Review Committee (D. Russell)**

The committee Chair, Donald Russell spoke to this item. The Senate Review Committee met on May 11, 2021 to review the Operating Budget that was presented to Senate in April. The committee presented a number of questions to the Provost as a result of its review of the budget. A report containing the questions and the responses from the Provost was circulated to Senators in advance with the meeting binder.

There were no further questions from Senators, and there was no discussion.

8. **Digital Strategy**

   AVP Teaching & Learning David Hornsby (guest) presented a summary of the new Digital Strategy for Carleton. The purpose of the Digital Strategy is to highlight the role of digital technologies in achieving the goals of Carleton's Strategic Integrated Plan, while also presenting a vision for strengthening teaching and learning practices, building critical research capacity and modernizing the operational context.

   The Digital Strategy Advisory Committee, composed of a cross-section of faculty, staff and students, began meeting in the Fall of 2020. In March of 2021, the project was announced and the Carleton community was invited to provide feedback via an online form. The Digital Strategy project is now in Phase Two, which includes a series of broad consultations with a variety of stakeholders across the university. The following six themes have emerged from feedback received so far:

   - Simplicity
   - Access and flexibility
   - Collaboration
   - Support
   - Ethical decision making
   - Automatization and virtualization

   Senators were asked to identify key words associated with the digital strategy (via Poll Everywhere), while contributing questions and comments for discussion.

   A Senator thanked AVP Hornsby for the presentation and for the philosophical approach, but noted that if the digital strategy results in course delivery changes, labour issues will inevitably occur. The Hyflex Teaching Model, for example, has resulted in numerous cases of workload issues that have not yet been addressed according to CUASA standards. There are many other examples of previous initiatives that were grieved and/or abandoned because of similar labour issues. The Senator noted that to ensure buy-in from teaching staff, these issues should be bargained with CUASA proactively, so that the Digital Strategy is a lasting initiative. AVP David Hornsby thanked the Senator for the input and noted that the Advisory Group will take these views into consideration in their deliberations. Any changes to provisions and conditions outlined in

collective agreements will mandate negotiations through formal mechanisms.

A Senator commented on the use of terms like holistic, integrated, synthesis, and university-wide in describing this project. The concern is that these terms direct faculty members to assimilate into a single system. Conformity and unity may serve a purpose at the administrative level, but they are at odds with the academic dimension that values and celebrates diversity, freedom and experimentation in teaching and research. The Chair responded that a holistic consideration of systems need not result in monolithic strategies, and he agreed that solutions need to remain local in the research and academic spheres. AVP Hornsby added that the Digital Strategy should be an enabling document that can incorporate diversity of research and pedagogies.

In response to a question from the floor it was noted that the Hyflex technology will be here to stay in classrooms as they are renovated, since it enables a range of engagement activities. Hyflex pedagogy, however, is not mandated and will remain a choice available for instructors.

The Chair thanked AVP David Hornsby and the Digital Strategy Advisory Group for their work on this initiative, and reminded Senators that the Digital Strategy team will return in the Fall for an additional fulsome consultation with Senate.

9. **SIP Implementation Report**

Due to time limitations, the Chair suggested that this item be tabled until the next Senate meeting.

It was **MOVED** (M. Rooney, J. Sinclair-Palm) that the SIP Implementation Report be tabled until the next Senate meeting.
The motion **PASSED**.

10. **Reports for Information**

    a)   Senate Executive Minutes (May 18, 2021)
    b)   Senate Committee Annual Reports (Library, SAIAC, Student Awards)

A Senator noted some inconsistencies in the Student Academic Integrity Appeals Committee (SAIAC) report regarding appeals and sanctions. Since the Chair of SAIAC was not present at the meeting to respond to the question, the Senator was advised to submit the question in writing to the Senate Office, to be forwarded to the Chair of SAIAC, then reported back to Senate at its next meeting via Matters Arising.

11. **Other Business**
   - The Chair addressed a question from Senator Justin Paulson regarding the implementation of the recommendations from Kinàmàgawin. Senator Paulson's question had been submitted in time for Question Period but due to a filing error was not circulated within the meeting package:

     It has been more than a year since Senate endorsed the Kinàmàgawin report and its 41 calls to action. The children's remains discovered at the Kamloops IRS is a harsh reminder of the urgency and importance of the implementation of these calls to action as a bare-minimum commitment by an educational institution built on unceded land. Can we please have an update from the administration as to how many of these calls have been addressed (and recommendations implemented) to date, which are being prioritized, and what the roadmap for full implementation looks like?

     The Provost noted that the annual report is being prepared and will be presented to Senate in the Fall.

   - The Chair noted that a motion has been proposed to recognize Betina Kuzmarov's outstanding contributions to Senate throughout her three-year term as Clerk of Senate from 2018 – 2021.

     It was **MOVED** (M. Rooney, S. Maguire) that Senate waive the notice of motion for a motion of thanks to the outgoing Clerk of Senate. The motion **PASSED**.

It was **MOVED** (J. Paulson, D. Dragunoiu) that Senate thank Betina Kuzmarov for her outstanding contributions to Senate during her three-year term as Clerk of Senate from 2018-2021.

The motion **PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

12. Adjournment
The meeting was adjourned at 12:12 pm.