



Carleton University acknowledges and respects the Algonquin people, traditional custodian of the land on which the Carleton University campus is situated.

Carleton University Senate
Meeting of October 22, 2021 at 2:00 pm
Via Videoconference

Minutes – Open Session

Present: S. Ajila, P. Andrée, B.A. Bacon (Chair), M. Baez, M. Barbeau, O. Baysal, V. Bhatia, S. Blanchard, D. Brown, M. Burns, B. Campbell, A. Chandler, T. Daniels, C. Del Gaudio, M. DeRosa, D. Deugo, P. Garcia, D. Gillberg, F. Goffi, R. Goubran, S. Gulati, M. Haines, K. Hellemans, M. Huckvale, C. Joslin, L. Kostiuk, J. Kovalio, E. Kwan, A. Lannon, C. Laurendeau, A. MacGillivray, B. MacLeod, J. Milner, P. Mkandawire, M. Murphy, J. Murray, H. Nemiroff, B. O'Connor, B. O'Neill, A. Park, G. Patey, J. Ramnarine, P. Rankin, M. Rodney, M. Rooney, D. Russell, J. Sinclair-Palm, S. Sivathayalan, E. Sloan (Clerk), P. Smith, D. Sprague, J. Taber, C. Taylor, K. Taylor, J. Tomberlin, J. Voordouw, J. Wallace, P. Wilson, P. Wolff, B. Wright

Regrets: J. Dawson, G. Garland, L. Hayes, M. Lundy

Absent: V. Asi, C. Ayalogu, V. Gonzalez, B. Hallgrímsson, A. Hashimi, F. Hosseini, K. Keller, C. Klein, S. Maguire, J. Malloy, R. McKay, D. Okoth, S. Sadaf, W. Ye, C. Young

Recording Secretary: K. McKinley

1. Welcome & Approval of Agenda

The Chair welcomed Senators to the open session of the meeting.

It was **MOVED** (M. DeRosa, A. Park) that Senate approve the open agenda for the meeting of Senate on October 22, 2021, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

2. Minutes: September 24, 2021

It was **MOVED** (B. Campbell, J. Kovalio) that Senate approve the minutes of the open session of the meeting of Senate of September 24, 2021, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

3. Matters Arising

There were none.

4. Chair's Remarks

The Chair began his remarks by acknowledging the following recent noteworthy events:

- Orange Shirt Day – September 30
- Inaugural Carleton Pride Festival – Week of October 4
- Mental Health Day – October 7
- Third Annual Inclusion Week – Week of October 18

The Chair thanked all involved in organizing these events, and all who attended them.

The CUSP Working Group has been developing a series of recommendations for the Winter 2022 term, and will be bringing those recommendations to Senate later in the meeting. As announced earlier this week, the University will be closed from December 24, 2021 to January 4, 2022 inclusive, to provide a slightly longer break prior to the Winter 2022 term for faculty, students and staff.

Carleton has maintained its place within the top 5 universities of the 2022 Maclean's University Rankings. Carleton made gains in several key categories including research, student awards, Indigenous initiatives and reputation. The Chair noted that an additional increase to Carleton's annual research funding will be confirmed when the Research Info\$ource rankings are released in November.

Excellence Canada has announced that Carleton is the first university to receive the Canada Order of Excellence for Healthy Workplace, and the Platinum level in the Mental Health at Work framework. The Chair congratulated everyone involved, notably Healthy Workplace Committee co-chairs Adrian Chan and Cindy Taylor, for their work on this important initiative.

Plans are underway to update the Student Mental Health Framework (SMHF) to version 3.0, beginning with the launch of a consultation framework. The Chair encouraged Senators to review the draft plan outlining the consultation process, and to provide feedback via the website over the next few weeks.

Carleton also is launching a broad and inclusive consultation process towards the next iteration of the Sexual Violence Policy. Members of the Carleton

community are encouraged to review the draft plan, and to provide feedback via the dedicated website.

The Carleton University Board of Governors has confirmed the extension of Jerry Tomberlin as Provost and Vice-President (Academic) for an additional year, until June 30, 2023. The Chair congratulated Jerry on the extension, and thanked him for his exemplary service under recent challenging circumstances.

The Chair extended congratulations also to the following Carleton faculty members for their recent achievements:

- Senator and History Professor Jacob Kovalio was honoured by the Japanese government for his contributions to the study of Japan in Canada. He received the Order of the Rising Sun, Gold Rays with Rosette.
- Melanie Adrian, Associate Professor in Law & Legal Studies has been awarded an OCUFA Teaching Award.
- Martha Mullally from the Department of Biology, has been named the 2021 Carleton University Chair in Teaching Innovation.

The Chair reminded Senators that Carleton's annual United Way Campaign runs from October 26 to November 12, 2021. This important Carleton tradition will include the MacOdrum Library online auction and the annual Polar Bear Dip, which the Chair will participate in with former Senator Chantal Dion. The Chair thanked all for continuing to support this important campaign.

Finally, the Chair noted that registration is open for the launch of Carleton's new Centre for Community Engagement (CCE), which takes place on Wednesday October 27 under inaugural Director and former Senator Professor Chantal Trudel. The Chair encouraged Senators to attend and to participate in workshops and other activities planned for the event.

5. Question Period

Four questions were submitted in advance by Senators:

Question #1 – Andrea Chandler

Has any evidence-based research been done on the:

a) health impacts on professors who teach hybrid classes (i.e. working with multiple screens simultaneously while also engaging students in real time within the classroom, and

b) on the effectiveness of such teaching, compared to more conventional forms of learning (in-person only/online only). I also am interested in

the extent to which teaching online/teaching with multiple screens might create some separate challenges that are different from doing other kinds of work completely online (such as Zoom meetings).

Response: AVP Teaching & Learning David Hornsby noted that the literature in Teaching & Learning does speak to the issue of increased cognitive load for instructors working with multiple screens. More active learning strategies can help to mitigate this issue. AVP Hornsby referred Senators to the following academic resource for more information:

Bower et al. "Design and Implementation Factors in Blended Synchronous Learning Environments: Outcomes from a Cross-case Analysis," *Computers & Education* 86 (2015): 1 – 17.

AVP Hornsby then referred Senators to a literature review on the effectiveness of hybrid teaching models, and reminded Senators of Carleton's involvement in an upcoming cross-institutional collaborative study on Hyflex modality in the classroom. He noted that the critical piece with any teaching modality is how it is used, and the pedagogy that instructors adopt with it.

Raes et al. "A Systematic Literature Review on Synchronous Hybrid Learning: Gaps Identified," *Learning Environments Research* 23/4 (2020)

The Chair added that eyestrain can be a common problem for instructors and students in online and hybrid teaching environments. Resting the eyes, taking frequent breaks away from the screen(s) and applying screen filters can help with this issue.

In response to a follow-up question, AVP Hornsby noted that, except in response to accommodation requests, recordings of lectures are not recommended as the primary mode of course delivery, as they do not represent effective interactive pedagogy that encourages student engagement.

Question #2 – Mackenzie Huckvale

The largest group impacted by decisions about return to campus activities are the 31 000 undergraduate and graduate students whom the University serves. This impact has been felt academically, socially, and professionally, as it has for many others throughout the past eighteen months. Many students express their opinions and issues to student leaders, with the expectation that those leaders then have a platform to raise those issues to higher levels of University governance.

The Carleton University Scenario Planning Working Group's (CUSP) composition lacks direct representation from both Undergraduate and/or Graduate students, and consultations with "Student Government Leaders" appear to only have taken place in March of 2021. I was hoping to get more clarity on who the "Student Government Leaders" are, what organizations they represent, and what advice they provided, as this is not defined in report documents. I would also appreciate clarity on what the plans for continued consultation with student leaders are as we enter the 5th term of potentially "irregular" academic instruction.

Senator Huckvale agreed to allow this question to be answered during Item #8 on the agenda (CUSP Report).

Question #3 – Meghan Burns

Students have been calling attention to the fact that Carleton's Attendant Services Program was suspended this semester. This means that students with physical disabilities are not able to receive the support they need to be on campus or to participate in their in-person classes. Students have not been given any alternatives, such as being able to hire their own support workers, which is an option that many other universities in Canada continue to provide. Why was the Attendant Services Program suspended when residence, varsity sports and large events like the Panda game returned this fall? What steps are being taken by Carleton to rectify this situation for the affected students?

Response from VP Students & Enrolment Suzanne Blanchard: The Attendant Services Program is an intensive, interactive and highly effective program of personal support for students with disabilities at Carleton. Unfortunately, the rise of the fourth wave of the pandemic over the summer months coincided with the decision-making timeline for the program and as a result Carleton was not able to plan for and provide this support for the Fall 2021 term. The current context, however, is different, with a declining fourth wave, Covid cases stabilizing in Ottawa, minimal cases on campus, and a fully vaccinated residence precinct. As a result, the decision has been made to begin preparations to set up the program again for January 2022. Applications should be available by the first week of November.

Question #4 – Johan Voordouw

The polling feature in Zoom lets senators vote anonymously. When we move back to in-person meetings, will we maintain the confidentiality of Senator's votes, or go back to the show of hands. If there is a desire to maintain confidentiality how might that system be implemented?

Response from Clerk of Senate Elinor Sloan: Carleton's Senate follows a parliamentary model and parliamentary rules of procedure, in which voting occurs via a show of hands by those who are present at the meeting. This is standard voting procedure for Senate and historical practice, which will continue once in-person meetings resume.

6. Administration (Clerk)

a) Senate Membership Ratifications

The Clerk presented a memo to Senators for the ratification of new Senator Kathleen Moss, who won the recent election for the vacant Contract Instructor position on Senate.

It was **MOVED** (M. Rooney, M. Murphy) that Senate ratify the new Senate appointment, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

b) Report on Committee Chair Meeting

The Clerk reported on her October 7th meeting with the Chairs and Secretaries of Senate standing committees. This was the inaugural meeting of an annual series planned to review and discuss best practices and governance issues at the committee level with the Chairs and Secretaries of all Senate committees. It is part of the overall endeavor within the Secretariat Office to ensure the development of good governance practices in Senate. The specific focus of this meeting was on minute-taking and record keeping practices, issues that were identified in the recent Senate Committee Survey.

7. Reports

a) Senate Committee on Curriculum, Admissions and Studies Policy (SCCASP)

Committee Chair Howard Nemiroff presented 5 items for approval and 3 items for information.

R-ADM-General Section 4

(to update section and clarify language)

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, S. Sivathayalan) that Senate approves the revisions to regulation UG-ADM-General Section 4, English Language

Proficiency effective for the 2022/23 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Senate Guidelines – Academic Year Planning

(revisions include changing the date for course withdrawal and including sub-terms for .25 credit courses)

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, S. Ajila) that Senate approves the revisions to the Senate Guidelines for the Academic Year as presented.

Discussion:

A Senator asked how the extra four exam days in Oct/Nov and Feb/Mar for 0.25 credit courses would be integrated into the academic year, and if the terms will need to be extended as a result. In response, the SCCASP Chair noted that the terms will not be extended, and that students will be writing exams for the 0.25 credit courses while taking other courses concurrently. He added that efforts will be made to schedule these exams on weekends to minimize conflicts with the students' courses.

There were no further questions.

The motion **PASSED**.

3.1.10 Minimum CGPA requirement for Change of Program Element

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, P. Wolff) that Senate approves the revisions to regulation R-UG 3.1.10 Changes of Degree and Program effective for the 2022/23 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

3.1.5 Student Categories (deletion of regulation as redundant)

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, P. Wolff) that Senate approves the deletion of regulation R-3.1.5 Student Categories effective for the 2022/23 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

R-UG-7.1 Academic Regulations for Certificate Students (adding language regarding student status when in concurrent certificate)

The SCCASP Chair asked that the motion be amended to add the missing word "Calendar." The Chair accepted this request as a friendly amendment.

It was **MOVED** (H. Nemiroff, J. Taber) that Senate approves the revisions to regulation R-UG-7.1 Academic Regulations for Certificate Students effective for the 2022/23 Undergraduate Calendar as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Items for Information:

- Bachelor of Social Work program regulations – continuation of ACE adjustments
- Glossary definitions of Special Topics/Selected Topics
- Minor Modifications

7-Reports, cont'd

b) Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee

Committee Chair Dwight Deugo presented five final assessment reports and executive summaries arising from cyclical reviews, for Senate approval. An omnibus motion was presented to cover all five FARES.

Omnibus Motion for FARES (Cyclical Reviews)

It was **MOVED** (D. Deugo, S. Ajila) that Senate approve the Final Assessment Reports and Executive Summaries arising from the Cyclical Reviews of the programs.

The motion **PASSED**.

Individual Motions:

FARES (Computer Science) – Individual Motion #1

MOTION: That Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the graduate programs in Computer Science.

FARES (Communication & Media Studies) – Individual Motion #2

MOTION: That Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the undergraduate programs in Communication and Media Studies.

FARES (Social Work) – Individual Motion #3

MOTION: That Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the PhD program in Social Work.

FARES (Environmental Science) – Individual Motion #4

MOTION: That Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the undergraduate programs in Environmental Science.

FARES (Earth Sciences) – Individual Motion #5

MOTION: That Senate approve the Final Assessment Report and Executive Summary arising from the Cyclical Review of the undergraduate programs in Earth Sciences

7-Reports, cont'd

c) Senate Academic Governance Committee (SAGC) (Clerk)

The Clerk presented two motions from SAGC to Senate – one for the ratification of new committee members, and the other for the approval of revised committee Terms of Reference.

A memo was circulated in advance regarding the ratification of one graduate student member to fill a vacancy on the Senate Quality Assurance and Planning Committee (SQAPC) and one faculty member to fill a vacancy on the Senate Academic Governance Committee.

It was **MOVED** (E. Sloan, D. Deugo) that Senate ratify the new Senate committee appointments, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

Revised Terms of Reference (TOR) with track changes for the Senate Honorary Degrees Committee were circulated to Senators in advance. As part of the process of the review of all Senate Committee TORs undertaken by SAGC, the Honorary Degrees Committee Terms of Reference were updated to reflect current practice, and were reformatted to a new template.

It was **MOVED** (E. Sloan, S. Sivathayalan) that Senate approve the changes to the Terms of Reference for the Senate Honorary Degrees Committee, as presented.

The motion **PASSED**.

8. CUSP Report

Deputy Provost Lorraine Dyke presented a report from the Carleton University Scenario Planning (CUSP) Working Group, with recommendations for the Winter 2022 term.

The CUSP Working Group met several times over the Fall semester to review data and information from provincial and municipal public health agencies, and to consider the best recommendations for a continued safe and gradual return to campus over the next few months, while maximizing opportunities for students.

Although in the current context the 4th wave of the pandemic is in decline and vaccination rates in Ontario and in Ottawa are high, much uncertainty remains, and Ottawa Public Health continues to recommend physical distancing in classrooms.

As a result, Carleton will continue to follow the advice of public health officials by offering a mixture of in-person and online course delivery for the Winter 2022 semester. The full set of recommendations from CUSP are as follows:

- Deliver courses through a mix of face-to-face and online instruction.
- Ensure that there are both face-to-face and online learning opportunities at all levels of every program, wherever possible.
- Plan classroom capacities in line with OPH physical distancing requirements for face-to-face learning, with online delivery for larger classes.
- Ensure a robust selection of online courses for students who are not able to come to campus.
- Prioritize courses for face-to-face delivery based on learning outcomes, pedagogy and choice for students.
- Provide key experiential learning opportunities (e.g. teaching labs) while maintaining safe distances. This will be achieved by modest increases in lab capacities where deemed safe by Environmental Health and Safety.

It was noted that some increases for in-person classroom capacity may be possible if recommendations from Ottawa Public Health are revised.

It was **MOVED** (J. Tomberlin, K. Hellemans) that Senate confirm that Winter 2022 courses at Carleton be offered through a mix of face-to-face and online delivery in line with the recommendations of the Carleton University Scenario Planning (CUSP) Working Group.

Discussion:

Provost Jerry Tomberlin began by addressing the question posed in advance by Mackenzie Huckvale, regarding student representation on CUSP. (See Item 5 - Question Period.) He noted that student input was sought during the CUSP formal consultations held in May 2020 and April 2021. Student government leaders from CUSA and GSA also were consulted in the Fall of 2020 and 2021, and student survey results were reviewed and considered by the CUSP Working Group.

In response to a question, it was noted that the Winter 2022 semester will resemble the Fall 2021 term, but that capacity limits for some in-person classes could be increased if public health measures are relaxed. A Senator asked who decides on which courses will be offered online vs in person. It was noted in response that these decisions are made via conversations within the units and Faculties; if necessary, the Provost's Office and Scheduling and Examinations Services also are consulted.

A Senator asked how changes in course delivery might be communicated to students, particularly those in large classes. Deputy Provost Lorraine Dyke responded that large classes will remain online due to physical distancing requirements, but that a revised schedule will be sent to students in the coming weeks. It was noted that the modality of courses will not be changed without consultation and conversations with the Instructors of those courses. Vice-President Students & Enrolment Suzanne Blanchard added that the modality of all courses for Winter 2022 will be finalized by mid-November, and students will be advised accordingly. Most courses already assigned will not change modality, but additional sections could be offered in some online courses to increase face-to-face opportunities.

A Senator asked if the size of in-person classes might be adjusted, and increased if public health recommendations change. The Chair responded that some increases might be possible and this would be decided within the departments and Faculties, in collaboration with the Scheduling Office.

The motion **PASSED**.

The Chair thanked Senators for their support and extended thanks to the CUSP Working Group, Scheduling and Examination Services and all others involved in this detailed and complex work.

9. Kinàmàgawin Implementation Report

The Director of the Centre for Indigenous Initiatives, Benny Michaud, was not able to attend the meeting due to an emerging issue. Assistant Vice-President, Indigenous Initiatives Kahente Horn-Miller was also unavailable. As a result, the Kinàmàgawin presentation to Senate was postponed. The Chair encouraged Senators to review the implementation update that was circulated in their meeting package, and noted that the Kinàmàgawin team will return to Senate in the Winter term to present an updated and more formal report.

10. Reports for Information

- a) Senate executive Minutes (September 14, 2021)
- b) Report from COU Academic Colleague
- c) TPAC and UPC Membership Report

COU Academic Colleague Kim Hellemans provided a brief summary of her report for Senate and noted several recent examples of the positive role of COU in advocating for our sector.

11. Other Business

There was none.

12. Adjournment – The meeting was adjourned (M. Rooney, J. Sinclair-Palm) at 3:40 pm.