



Longitudinal section through Tchorek-Bentall Studio, Warsaw, Poland. Drawing by Piotr Leśniak, 2016.

Instructor: Dr. Jerzy (Jurek) Elżanowski

Location: 1216 Dunton Tower

Time: Thursdays, 17:35-20:25

Office hours: by email appointment

Email: jerzy.elzanowski@carleton.ca

Web: <https://carleton.ca/canadianstudies/people/jerzy-jurek-elzanowski/>

Heritage Conservation I: Contexts of Theory

What brings you to study heritage conservation? What about the discipline inspires you? What do you find troubling? What forms of heritage and conservation praxis – including research – do you want to pursue? In other words, where do you fit in?

With its roots in ancient Aristotelian and, much more recently, in modern Marxist philosophical traditions, *praxis*, understood here as ‘theory in process’, indicates an informed action aimed at societal change. In its meditative capacity, we deploy *praxis* to meaningfully connect this year’s themes of the two core courses in Heritage Conservation: ‘Contexts of Theory’ (CDNS 5401) and ‘Contexts of Practice’ (CDNS 5402 with Prof. Susan Ross).

Heritage Conservation I: Contexts of Theory (CDNS 5401), is an *introduction* to the histories, theories, and political constellations that have come to condition the field. It is organized around five main thematic groupings as they relate to heritage studies and heritage conservation: (post)colonial critique, Indigenous rights and land, construction of values and authenticity, sites of conflict, and finally, research as *praxis*. You will find that many of these themes resonate with the core research interests of students and faculty at the School of Indigenous and Canadian Studies, and constitute the main questions considered in the field of critical heritage studies.

We will start the course with an examination of our individual and collective position/positionality with respect to heritage/identity and conservation in the current Indigenous-settler-colonial contexts in Canada and abroad. We will then reflect on the

changing methods, ideologies, intellectual traditions, and world events that have influenced heritage conservation since the mid-19th century. Finally, we will spend the last few sessions looking at the very pressing problem of contemporary reconstruction and commemoration in the wake of conflict, and consider if there are ways to work towards a 'conservation of reconciliation'.¹ One of the highlights of the course will be a workshop aimed at responding to the Truth and Reconciliation Commission's 'calls to action' as they relate to cultural heritage (class 11).

Final Outline and Course Correspondence

The following outline is a *draft only* – my initial proposal for how the course will unfold. During the first two course sessions we will work together and modify the outline to suit our common interests and goals. **I will circulate a final outline, together with a list of learning objectives, assessment criteria, and peer review models, by the third week of class.** I will distribute detailed assignment descriptions in class and post them on cuLearn as needed. Depending on the schedules of guest speakers, session dates may change. Please check your email as well as cuLearn regularly for updates on session/workshop dates and any changes to scheduled readings.

Please communicate with me through your Carleton email accounts *only*. As a rule, I don't check email messages on the weekends. If you have a pressing question, please make sure to email me before 11am on Friday.

Class Participation, Assignments, and Evaluation

You will be evaluated on the basis of class participation, discussion facilitation, a short response paper, a final symposium presentation/performance, and a final assignment. I will distribute detailed written descriptions for each assignment in class and post them on cuLearn. This is a seminar, so I expect all students to attend class regularly and to participate in discussions, drawing upon thoughtful analysis of the assigned literature. Each week, one or two students will be responsible for facilitating that day's discussion. The student or the pair will be asked to briefly summarize the assigned articles, to suggest a direction for the group discussion, and to prepare questions/an interactive activity for the class.

Grade Distribution

Overall Class Participation (including peer review and TRC workshop): 15%
Discussion Facilitation: 10% (2 sessions)
Short Response Paper: 15%
Revised Assignment Proposal and Bibliography: 10%
Symposium Presentation: 20%
Final Paper/Project Submission (related to the TRC "Call to Action" for heritage): 30%

¹ This in reference to a project on the possible 'architectures of reconciliation' being developed by Rebecca Dolgoy at the University of Ottawa.

I will be meeting with each of you individually to provide an informal assessment of your progress in the course during the week of October 11th. Please remember to schedule an appointment with me.

Tentative Assignment Deadlines

Initial Proposals delivered to colleagues Friday, October 21, 2016

Peer Reviews of Proposals returned to colleagues by Sunday, October 30, 2016 at the latest.

Informal Proposal Presentations, Thursday, November 10, 2016.

Revised Proposals due Friday, November 11, 2016 (Assessed).

Response Papers due 1 week after discussion chosen (I will explain; Assessed).

Symposium Presentations, TBD (Assessed).

Final Projects due Monday, December 12, 2016 (Assessed).

Please hand in all assignments on cuLearn. Under regular circumstances, I will not consider or grade late submissions. If you anticipate being late with an assignment, please let me (as well as your peer review partner) know at least 1 week in advance. For University accommodations, see pages 9-10.

Readings

The library will make most of the assigned articles available on ARES. For copyright reasons, some books (and book chapters) may be accessible at the library reserves only. I will be signing out some books from my personal library if necessary. Please make sure to plan your readings in advance, and to coordinate with me if needed. I find that using hard rather than electronic copies of reading material in class is more productive for sharing and learning. Unless this is very difficult to do (e-books), I would ask that you print, mark up, and bring physical copies of assigned articles to class.

Four books will help organize the main historical and theoretical material in the course:

Miles Glendinning, *The Conservation Movement: A History of Architectural Preservation* (London: Routledge, 2013).

Rodney Harrison, *Heritage: Critical Approaches*, (London: Routledge, 2013).

Harold Kalman, *Heritage Planning: Principles and Process* (New York: Routledge, 2014).

Laurajane Smith, *Uses of heritage*, (London: Routledge, 2006).

Since many people prefer to use electronic versions, I will not be ordering any books. Please either order a hard copy of **Kalman** online or buy an electronic copy. Susan Ross will be using the book in her companion course, CDNS 5402. You are welcome to buy Glendinning, but the book is expensive, and there will be a copy on reserve at the library, one available to borrow at my office, and some sections scanned and available

on ARES. Make sure to look at the schedule of assigned readings closely, and to order or otherwise source books far in advance of the scheduled discussion.

None of these books should be seen as 'guides' to conservation. Different sections of all four books occupy different nodes on the spectrum that lies between professional heritage planning/conservation and critical heritage studies. There are, naturally, texts that are more entrenched in what heritage professionals call "doctrine," as well as literature that is far more radical in its critique of heritage conservation practice and language. Our job will be to position these readings within a broader history and philosophical critique of knowledge.

As graduate students you are expected to read beyond the assigned literature, and to consistently demonstrate a level of curiosity, and a research sensibility. So, although I will be assigning only a few chapter or chapter sections from Glendinning, Harrison, Kalman, and Smith, please use these books, and the bibliographies they contain, holistically to broaden your knowledge of the discipline. **Reading broadly and consistently throughout the semester will prepare you for the final assignment, and will help you do well in class discussions and workshops.**

Reading Schedule

Class 1 – 08/09/16: Introductory Class

- **We'll be doing the following reading in class:** Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, *Honouring the Truth, Reconciling for the Future, Summary of the Final Report of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada*, 2015. Reading the Introduction to the "Executive Summary" as well as the "Calls to Action" document, think about the different ways professions you represent are called to change.

Class 2 – 15/09/16: Contexts of Practice (*role-play with Susan Ross*)

- Harold Kalman, "The Setting for Heritage Planning," in *Heritage Planning: Principles and Process* (New York: Routledge, 2014), 3-21.
- Laurajane Smith, "The Discourse of Heritage," in *Uses of Heritage*, 2006, 11-43.
- Andrea Witcomb and Kristal Buckley, "Engaging with The Future of Critical Heritage Studies: Looking Back in Order to Look Forward," *International Journal of Heritage Studies* 19, no. 6 (2013): 562-578.

Class 3 – 22/09/16: Heritage Conservation and (Critical) Heritage Studies

- Laurajane Smith, section on World Heritage Convention – part of "Authorizing Institutions of Heritage," in *Uses of Heritage*, 2006, 95-102.

Documents and Websites:

- Historic England, "Heritage Conservation Defined," <https://historicengland.org.uk/advice/hpg/generalintro/heritage-conservation-defined/>.
- UNESCO, *Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage*, 1972.
- Parks Canada, Introduction and Chapter 1 in *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada*, 2010, viii; 3-14.
- Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, *Honouring the Truth, Reconciling for the Future, Summary of the Final Report of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada*, 2015. (Please re-read the introduction to the "Executive Summary" as well as the "Calls to Action" document, this time focussing on cultural heritage issues).
- ICOMOS Canada, Thematic Priorities for 2016, <http://canada.icomos.org/priorities/>.

Class 4 – 29/09/16: Heritage Conservation (Post)colonial Critique

- Rodney Harrison and Lotte Hughes, "Heritage, Colonialism and Postcolonialism," in *Understanding the Politics of Heritage*, ed. Rodney Harrison, (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2009), 234-269 (focus on the introduction 234-240; skim case studies if you have time).
- Zoe Todd, "An Indigenous Feminist's Take On The Ontological Turn: 'Ontology' Is Just Another Word For Colonialism," *Journal of Historical Sociology* 29, no. 1 (2016): 4-22.
- Achille Mbembe, "What is postcolonial thinking? An interview with Achille Mbembe," *Eurozine*, January 9, 2008 (reprinted from *Revue Esprit*, December, 2006), <http://www.eurozine.com/articles/2008-01-09-mbembe-en.html#>.

Class 5 – 06/10/16: Heritage and Control

- Leanne Simpson, "Nishnaabeg Resurgence: Stories from Within," in *Dancing On Our Turtle's Back: Stories of Nishnaabeg Re-creation, Resurgence and a New Emergence*, (Winnipeg: Arbeiter Ring, 2011), 11-29.
- Val Napoleon, "Looking Beyond the Law: Questions about Indigenous Peoples' Tangible and Intangible Property," in *Protection of First Nations Cultural Heritage: Laws, Policy, and Reform*, ed. Catherin E. Bell and Robert K. Paterson (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2009), 370-393.
- Laurajane Smith, "The Issue of Control: Indigenous Politics and the Discourse of Heritage", in *Uses of heritage*, (London: Routledge, 2006), 276-298.

Class 6 – 13/10/16: - Charters I: Codifying Heritage Internationally

In the following chapters, focus on sections appropriate to the Athens Charter, Venice Charter, and World Heritage Convention:

- Laurajane Smith, "Authorizing Institutions of Heritage," in *Uses of Heritage*, 2006, 87-114

- Harold Kalman, "Charters and Conventions," in *Heritage Planning: Principles and Process* (New York: Routledge, 2014), 127-149.
- Miles Glendinning, "Charters and Conventions: The Internationalization of Heritage, 1945-1989," in *The Conservation Movement: A History of Architectural Preservation* (London: Routledge, 2013), 390-414.

Charters and Conventions:

- *Athens Charter for the Restoration of Historic Monuments*, 1931.
- *International Charter for the Conservation and Restoration of Monuments and Sites* (Venice Charter), 1964.
- UNESCO, *Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage*, 1972.

Class 7 – 20/10/16: - Charters II: Changing Ideologies

- Tim Winter, "Beyond Eurocentrism? Heritage Conservation and the Politics of Difference," *International Journal of Heritage Studies* 20, no. 2 (2014): 123-137.
- James Opp, "Public History and the Fragments of Place: Archaeology, History, and Heritage Site Development in Southern Alberta," *Rethinking History* 15, no.2 (2010): 241-267.

In the following chapters, focus on applicable post-1989 charters and documents mentioned in the articles above and listed below:

- Laurajane Smith, "Authorizing Institutions of Heritage," in *Uses of Heritage*, 2006, 87-114.
- Harold Kalman, "Charters and Conventions," in *Heritage Planning: Principles and Process* (New York: Routledge, 2014), 127-149.
- Miles Glendinning, "Heritage in the Age of Globalization: Post-1989" in *The Conservation Movement: A History of Architectural Preservation* (London: Routledge, 2013), 417-448.

Charters and Documents

- *The Nara Document on Authenticity*, 1994.
- ICOMOS Australia, *The Burra Charter*, 1999 revision.
- *Quebec Declaration on the Preservation of the Spirit of Place*, 2008.

Reading Week – 24-28/10/16 – No Class

Class 8 – 03/11/16: Constructing and Undermining Notions of Authenticity

- Thomas D. Andrews and Susan Bugey, "Authenticity in Aboriginal Cultural Landscapes," *APT Bulletin* 39, no. 2/3 (2008): 63-71.
- Herb Stovel, "Origins and Influence of the Nara Document on Authenticity," *APT Bulletin* 39, no.2/3 (2008): 9-17.
- Byrony Roberts, "Competing Authenticities," *Future Anterior* 12, no. 2 (2015): 1-11.
- Siân Jones, "Negotiating Authentic Objects and Authentic Selves," *Journal of Material Culture* 15, no. 2 (2010): 181-203.

- Reread the *Nara Document on Authenticity*, 1994.

Class 9 – 10/11/16: Guest Session with Peter Hodgins, **Readings TBD.**

Informal Proposal Presentations

Revised Proposals due Friday, November 11, 2016 (Assessed).

Class 10 – 17/11/16: Where does 'heritage value' come from? What about value and authenticity?

- Lisa Prosper, "Wherein Lies Heritage Value? Rethinking the Heritage Value of Cultural Landscapes from an Aboriginal Perspective," *The George Wright Forum*, 24, no.2 (2007): 117-124.
- Alois Riegl, "The Modern Cult of Monuments, Its Essence and Its Development," 1903.
- Miles Glendinning, "Alois Riegl: Towards and International Heritage?" in *The Conservation Movement: A History of Architectural Preservation* (London: Routledge, 2013), 141-144.
- Harold Kalman, "Heritage Values," in *Heritage Planning: Principles and Process* (New York: Routledge, 2014), 199-210.

Class 11 – 24/11/16: - Workshop – Implementing the TRC's Call to Action

The goal of this workshop will be to come up with reflections and recommendations in response to the TRC's call to amend the Historic Sites and Monuments Act/Board and modify the National Program of Historic Commemoration. Although this will be a theoretical rather than strictly a policy workshop, I do hope to involve members of the heritage planning and policy community, Indigenous and Canadian Studies, Law and Legal Studies, and Anthropology faculty, as well as other guests. Please come carefully prepared, with the sense that we will take the TRC's call to heart and work hard to come up with provisional responses.

NB: The workshop will be held from 17:00-21:00. Please make arrangements to attend the entire session. We will shorten other sessions to balance out the total course hours.

Please read:

- Shelley Ruth Butler and Erica Lehrer, Introduction to *Curatorial Dreams: Critics Imagine Exhibitions* (Montreal; Kingston; London; Chicago: McGill Queen's University Press, 2016), 3-23.
- Kurt E. Dongoske and Theresa Pasqual, "Steps toward Decolonizing the National Historic Preservation Act, in *Bending the Future: Fifty Ideas for the Next Fifty Years of Historic Preservation in the United States*, ed. Max Page and Marla R. Miller (Amherst; Boston: University of Massachusetts Press, 2016), 67-71.

Class 12 – 01/12/16: Reconstruction: Sites of Conflict, Sites of 'Conscience', **Readings and possible guest TBD.**

Class 13 – 08/12/16: Personal/Professional Reflections: Multidirectionality in Scholarly Praxis

- Michael Rothberg, "From Gaza to Warsaw: Mapping Multidirectional Memory," *Criticism* 4, no. 53 (2011): 523-548.

My reflections in class will be based on the following:

- Jerzy Elżanowski, "Domesticating Violence: Notes from a Socio-Spatial Incursion into Warsaw's Anthropogenic Stratum," in *Presence/ Absence/ Traces: Contemporary Artists on Jewish Warsaw*, ed. Ewa Chomicka and Agnieszka Pindera (Warsaw: POLIN Museum of the History of Polish Jews, 2016), 164-181.
- Jerzy Elżanowski, "Putting Roosevelt Back into Play: Reflections on the *National Parks Now Competition*," in *'Im Kontext': Essays in Honour of Hans-Rudolf Meier*, ed. Daniela Spiegel and Simone Bogner, Bauhaus-Universitätsverlag Weimar, forthcoming.

Academic Integrity

The following texts are part of Carleton's academic integrity and equity policies.

Plagiarism: Plagiarism is a very serious academic offence. It occurs when someone tries to pass anyone else's work as their own. It occurs when a student either a) directly copies more than one of two sentences of another's written work without acknowledgement; or b) closely paraphrases the equivalent of a short paragraph or more without acknowledgement; and c) borrows, without acknowledgement, any ideas in a clear and recognized form, in such a way, as to present them as the student's own thoughts, where such ideas, if they were the student's own would contribute to the merit of his or her work.

Instructors who suspect plagiarism are required to submit the paper and supporting documentation to the Department Chair, who will refer the case to the Dean. Students are reminded that plagiarism can result in a range of penalties including failure in the course. It is in the student's best interests to keep all of their research papers intact after handing in papers.

Resubmission of Work: Prior approval of the instructor must be obtained if you intend to submit work that has previously or concurrently been submitted, in whole or in part, for credit in any other course.

For more details see the Academic Integrity Policy
<http://www1.carleton.ca/senate/ccms/wp-content/ccms-files/Academic-Integrity-Policy.pdf>

Academic Accommodation

You may need special arrangements to meet your academic obligations during the term. For an accommodation request the processes are as follows:

Pregnancy obligation: write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

Religious obligation: write to me with any requests for academic accommodation during the first two weeks of class, or as soon as possible after the need for accommodation is known to exist. For more details visit the Equity Services website: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>

Academic Accommodations for Students with Disabilities: The Paul Menton Centre for Students with Disabilities (PMC) provides services to students with Learning Disabilities (LD), psychiatric/mental health disabilities, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), Autism Spectrum Disorders (ASD), chronic medical conditions, and impairments in mobility, hearing, and vision. If you have a disability requiring academic accommodations in this course, please contact PMC at 613-520-6608 or pmc@carleton.ca for a formal evaluation. If you are already registered with the PMC, contact your PMC coordinator to send me your *Letter of Accommodation* at the beginning of the term, and no later than two weeks before the first in-class scheduled test or exam requiring accommodation (*if applicable*). **Requests made within two weeks will be reviewed on a case-by-case basis.** After requesting accommodation from PMC, meet with me to ensure accommodation arrangements are made. Please consult the PMC website (www.carleton.ca/pmc) for the deadline to request accommodations for the formally-scheduled exam (*if applicable*).

You can visit the Equity Services website to view the policies and to obtain more detailed information on academic accommodation at: <http://www2.carleton.ca/equity/>