

CARLETON UNIVERSITY COMMITTEE ON QUALITY ASSURANCE

Cyclical Review for the Bachelor of Commerce, Bachelor of International Business, MBA and PhD in Management.

Executive Summary and Final Assessment

This Executive Summary and Final Assessment Report of the cyclical review of Carleton's Bachelor of Commerce, Bachelor of International Business, MBA and PhD in Management are provided pursuant to articles 4.2.5-4.2.6 of the provincial Quality Assurance Framework and articles 5.1.9.23-24 and 5.1.9.26-27 of Carleton's Institutional Quality Assurance Process (IQAP)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Bachelor of Commerce, Bachelor of International Business, MBA and PhD in Management are administered by Carleton University's Sprott School of Business.

As a consequence of the review, the programs were categorised by the Carleton University Committee on Quality Assurance (CUCQA) as being of **good quality** (Carleton's IQAP 5.1.9.12).

The external reviewers' report, submitted to the School on May 15th, 2015, offered a very positive assessment of the programs. The reviewers observed that "the School has achieved remarkable results and an impressive esprit de corps, with highly engaged students and faculty, in spite of less than ideal physical infrastructure." The reviewers were "particularly impressed by the knowledge, commitment and enthusiasm of the support staff," and they noted that students at all levels were "very complimentary about the support they receive from faculty inside and out of the classroom." They also praised the School for "experimenting with new modes of delivery, like flipped classrooms". Moreover, the reviewers stated that their positive observations about the School, "were reinforced by the intensive and rigorous evaluation of the programs undertaken by the Association for the Advancement of Collegiate Schools of Business (AACSB) which gave Sprott full accreditation in May 2013."

Within the context of this very positive assessment, the report nonetheless made a number recommendations for the continuing enhancement of the undergraduate and graduate programs. The large majority of the recommendations were accepted by the Dean of the Sprott School of Business in a response to the report of the external reviewers that was received by CUCQA on November 11th, 2015.

On March 9th, 2016, CUCQA received and approved an Action Plan detailing how these issues will be addressed. The Action Plan was endorsed by the Dean of the Sprott School of Business and the Dean of the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs.

ACTION PLAN
 REVIEW OF UNDERGRADUATE AND GRADUATE PROGRAMS OF THE
 SPROTT SCHOOL OF BUSINESS
 FEBRUARY 2016

NUMBER	RECOMMENDATION	RESPONSE	ACTION(S)	RESPONSIBLE	DEPENDENCIES	DEADLINE	STATUS	ADDITIONAL COMMENTS
GENERAL								
1	More work should be done to build the reputation of the School and promote its unique features and strengths; for instance, the School's commitment to the student experience is a major strength that should be emphasized as an important differentiator.	The Sprott School of Business continues to employ new communication strategies to further the reach and amplification of our success stories. In particular, we have adopted a content strategy approach this year to bring Sprott's value and the student experience to life through compelling storylines that are presented consistently throughout our communications activities.	1.1. Review 2015/16 communications plan	L. Schweitzer	N/A	Jul-16	Ongoing	
2	Undertake careful review of the focus group results. While the Sprott Business Career Management Centre (SBCMC) receives favourable reviews there may not be sufficient staff support especially for MBA career placements; furthermore, there may not be enough advisory capacity.	This past year, the SBCMC employed external career professionals to coach students on cover letters, resumes and interviewing techniques. In addition, an MBA Admissions and Internship Assistant was added during the critical months of January to April. For the past three years, 100% of MBA students seeking an internship were successfully placed. In terms of the success of our graduates, an alumni survey reported that 90% of students were employed within one year of graduation, earning an average salary of \$50,000 for undergraduates and \$70,000 for MBA students. At the time of the focus group, the primary advisor – the MBA administrator – was on an unexpected leave, resulting in the advisory team being short-staffed. The School's current advising needs are well met through existing support staff – namely the MBA Administrator with assistance from the MBA Administrative Assistant and the Associate Dean (MBA), as required.	No action to be taken	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
3	There should be continuing efforts to meet the needs of the increasingly diverse student body, especially international students and students with disabilities; there should also be greater financial resources to support graduate students generally and PhD students in particular.	Carleton's International Student Services Office (ISSO) is continuously improving its offerings and support to international students attending the School. With respect to MBA students from other countries, the School has augmented its support by providing additional resources such as writing tutorials and additional career resources. Students with disabilities at Carleton are primarily supported through the Paul Menton Centre. The Centre offers an array of services to students with disabilities including screening, counselling, mentorship, personal care and learning strategy support. Carleton University boasts its reputation as the most accessible university in Canada. The University and the School are exploring additional and better ways to offer distance and blended learning to attract and accommodate students of all types and locations. The School agrees that alternative methods of financially supporting graduate students should be explored and current efforts are being made to increase the research funding of our faculty. Specifically, research and grant facilitation mechanisms are currently being redesigned to provide more hands-on support, as well as additional counselling specific to each major funding agency. Subject to budget availability, the School may consider providing additional student funding to enhance the graduate student support provided by the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs (FGPA).	3.1. Continue exploring different models for additional graduate tuition scholarships for international PhD students	J. Tomberlin	Budget availability	Unknown	On Hold	
			3.2. Conclude redesign of research/grant facilitation model to provide support for graduate students.	L. Schweitzer	Budget availability. CURO support.	Jul-16	In Progress	
4	There should be continuing efforts to achieve gender balance in the student body.	It should be noted that the IQAP report referred to achieving a 50/50 gender balance of the School's faculty contingent, as the distribution amongst the student body is already well-balanced. In light of this, there are two notable trends that are expected to result in an increasing proportion of female faculty. Firstly, the last five faculty hires at the School have been female. Secondly, the majority of senior faculty approaching retirement are male.	4.1. Monitor outcomes of 2015/16 hiring and retiring in International Business and Accounting and reassess.	J. Tomberlin	N/A	Jul-16	In Progress	

ACTION PLAN
 REVIEW OF UNDERGRADUATE AND GRADUATE PROGRAMS OF THE
 SPROTT SCHOOL OF BUSINESS
 FEBRUARY 2016

5	It will be necessary to develop more specific measures of Learning Outcomes for the next AACSB review. It will be important to have a more robust articulation of learning outcomes both at the undergraduate and Master's levels.	The degree-level learning outcomes (goals, objectives, competencies), rubrics, measures and program governance are all key and evolving elements of the continuous improvement of the academic programs within the School. Assessment of our students against these learning outcomes is critical to this system. The Assurance of Learning (AoL) Committee, Teaching Area Groups, Curriculum Review Committees and Faculty Board are all actively engaged in this continuous improvement cycle. The learning outcomes for the MBA and PhD programs have been reviewed and revised in 2014/15. The learning outcomes for undergraduate programs are currently being updated. The School is currently working on a further refinement of the wording of those objectives to improve clarity. With regards to measurement, the AoL Committee works closely with the Curriculum Review Committees to identify particular courses where learning outcomes can be measured via curriculum maps. For the most part, this has been effective, yet there remains room for improvement. One limitation in the Assurance of Learning system is that degree-level outcomes are not necessarily aligned with the learning outcomes of core courses. The AoL Committee will continue to work with the Curriculum Review Committees to ensure better alignment between course and degree learning objectives.	5.1. Analyze and update learning goals and objectives for Bachelor of Commerce program, as needed.	H. Nemiroff	AoL Committee, Curriculum Review Committee and Faculty Board approval	Jul-17	In Progress	
			5.2. Analyze and update learning goals and objectives for Bachelor of International Business program, as needed.	H. Nemiroff	AoL Committee, Curriculum Review Committee and Faculty Board approval	Jul-17	In Progress	
			5.3. Analyze and update learning goals and objectives for Master of Business Administration program, as needed.	L. Dyke	AoL Committee, Curriculum Review Committee and Faculty Board approval	Jul-17	In Progress	
6	The School should give consideration to an active role in the EFMD and possible EQUIS accreditation.	The European Quality Improvement System (EQUIS) is a worldwide accreditation system for excellence in business schools looking to make an impact beyond their domestic borders. This is strongly aligned with the strategic direction of the School and is seriously being considered. The Associate Dean (Research) attended the EFMD annual conference last year and the School intends to send representatives to an EQUIS accreditation seminar this year. A decision on whether or not to pursue this opportunity will be made by the end of this year. EFMD membership and EQUIS accreditation are more expensive than AACSB membership and accreditation. It will require good evidence of a significant value-add associated with this initiative prior to allocating the financial and human resources that would be required should we decide to pursue this possibility.	6.1. Attend EFMD seminar and decide on whether or not to pursue EFMD accreditation.	S. Gonsalves	Budget availability to pursue accreditation	Aug-16	Not Started	
7	Carleton needs a purpose-built business school facility.	Continuing to reinforce the urgency for a new facility and garnering the support and resources necessary to launch the facility design and construction is a core strategic priority for the School of Business. The School strongly agrees with the reviewers' assessment that states, "The University does not appear to have resolved the need to contiguous space identified in the Baba/Kusy Cyclical Review in 2008. Given the undoubted critical role that Sprott plays within Carleton University this issue needs to be tackled. The School needs a purpose-built business school facility." The Undergraduate Program Review document they refer to identifies the following, "One of the major impediments for Sprott to develop its full potential as an academic community and effectively deliver its programs is the issue of space." This report also provided an interim solution stating, "We recommend identifiable contiguous space be provided as a bridge approach until the business building is built. This space will address a number of issues thought to be fraught with difficulty: faculty mentoring, identity development and a sense of allegiance, hiring good faculty, positioning of the School within the Carleton community, etc." Seven years since this report, little progress has been made. This was also identified in the initial AACSB accreditation report which succinctly states, "The current facilities appear to make it difficult to achieve the mission of economic development and community engagement." The School is currently working towards this via active fundraising and through working with our internal partners on an agreed-upon, comprehensive vision for the facility.	7.1. Continue to work with the university to obtain funding and develop design of new facility.	J. Tomberlin	With Facilities Management and Planning, VP (Finance & Admin), President	Unknown	In Progress	
			7.2. Develop and begin implementation of a fundraising strategy for new facility.	J. Tomberlin	7.1	Unknown	On Hold	

UNDERGRADUATE PROGRAMS

ACTION PLAN
 REVIEW OF UNDERGRADUATE AND GRADUATE PROGRAMS OF THE
 SPROTT SCHOOL OF BUSINESS
 FEBRUARY 2016

8	Continue to invest in the BCom areas of Supply Chain Management and Information Systems as those seem particularly pertinent to Ottawa's high-tech private sector.	The School participated in their first case competition for the Supply Chain Management (SCM) group this year and performed very well, making it to the final rounds. Recruitment efforts with prospective students are more explicitly highlighting SCM and major inroads have been made with corporate sponsorship in this area. With regards to the Information Systems area, the School is expanding its efforts with the Centre for Information Technology, Organizations and People (CITOP), and working toward reviving a practicum course in IT to engage with the external community in a more productive way.	8.1. Monitor enrollment outcomes in Supply Chain Management and Information Systems	H. Nemiroff	N/A	Aug-16	In Progress	
			8.2. Undertake review of practicum courses across the undergraduate programs.	H. Nemiroff	N/A	Jul-16	In Progress	
9	Continue to emphasize professional programs, especially the accounting specialization, strengthening its adherence to the new CPA designation.	The introduction of the Master of Accounting (MAcc) degree offers a streamlined pathway for undergraduate students in accounting to continue through to the CPA designation and provides research training going beyond the latter. This is expected to be a desirable draw and benefit to our BCom students specializing in this area. The MAcc director and administrative officer will be attending the Ontario University Fair to play a major role in recruiting at the undergraduate level for this reason.	9.1. MAcc director to provide recruiting role to undergraduate program at Ontario Universities Fair.	H. Nemiroff	N/A	N/A	Completed	
10	In light of its important undergraduate Finance specialization, the School should build a Finance trading laboratory.	The School is actively seeking corporate sponsorship to support the Bloomberg terminals in Dunton Tower and MacOdrum Library. Preliminary vision documents for a contiguous facility for the School include dedicated space to house a Finance trading laboratory.	10.1. Seek corporate sponsorship for Trading Laboratory.	H. Nemiroff	7.1	Unknown	On Hold	
MASTER'S PROGRAM								
11	Seek to strike appropriate balance between international and domestic students in the Master's program; avoid accepting too many students from any one region.	Recently, the School has placed a stronger emphasis on domestic MBA recruitment through participation at additional MBA fairs and via digital advertising on social media channels. Internationally, the School has diversified its recruiting efforts strategically in countries such as India and Colombia.	11.1. Monitor MBA recruitment outcomes (balance between domestic and international).	L. Dyke	N/A	Sep-16	In Progress	
12	Since the part-time MBA program has not been entirely successful, it might be necessary to re-think its appropriateness for the National Capital marketplace. A "flex MBA" model or a weekend "Executive MBA" should be considered.	The School has been able to address the scheduling concerns expressed in the focus group by ensuring part-time MBA students receive the courses that they need in the evening on a rotational basis. Students are provided course maps to help them plan their timetable accordingly. The School is also exploring the possibility of offering intensive MBA courses, similar to those offered in their international programs, to better accommodate the scheduling demands of part-time students. We have no plans for entering the highly competitive executive MBA market at this time.	12.1. Offer intensive MBA courses (first offering).	L. Dyke	N/A	Jul-16	In Progress	
13	Monitor progress made with the acquisition of communications skills by international students.	The admissions process in the domestic MBA program now includes additional screening for the language skills of international applicants using a video interviewing platform. Furthermore, new workshops on communication skills and cross-cultural competencies have been added to the MBA program. For the international MBA programs, new assessments of language skills have been implemented. Additional coursework in communications has been introduced in the China program, in particular. Given that communications skills are a key learning outcomes for the MBA program (domestic or international), the School will continue to monitor the progress made with respect to the acquisition of communications skills by international students through the Assurance of Learning process.	13.1. Use video interviewing to provide screening of the language skills of applicants.	L. Dyke	N/A	N/A	Completed	
			13.2. Monitor achievement of communications learning objective of MBA program.	L. Dyke	N/A	Sep-16	In Progress	
			13.3. Include additional coursework in communications in China MBA program.	L. Dyke	N/A	N/A	Completed	

ACTION PLAN
 REVIEW OF UNDERGRADUATE AND GRADUATE PROGRAMS OF THE
 SPROTT SCHOOL OF BUSINESS
 FEBRUARY 2016

14	Investigate reasons for the seemingly low two-year completion rate in the full-time MBA program.	Upon further research, the School acknowledges that the data presented in the brief was incorrect. Please view the table below for accurate data. Separate analysis of graduation rates for full-time and part-time students indicate that 91% of full-time students graduate within two years, with a 5% attrition rate that is in line with data from other MBA programs. For part-time students, the minimum time required for completion is three years. For part-time cohorts where a full three years have elapsed since admission (in 2008-2012), 65% have completed the program (44% within three years), 11% are still in progress and 24% have left the program. This data is in line with the business school average of 23% of students withdrawing without completing the program.	No further action required.	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	A 5% attrition rate for the full-time MBA program is actually quite low. Many, if not most MBA students have undergraduate degrees in disciplines other than business and often find the variety of courses ... from Accounting and Finance to Organizational Behaviour and Marketing ... to be very challenging. It is not at all unusual for some of these students to decide to leave the program prior to graduating. The fact that our attrition rate is as low as 5% indicates that we are doing a good job of describing the program to potential applicants. It should also be noted that there was a very high attrition rate for the first very large part-time cohort admitted in 2008/09. For this cohort, there were problems in offering courses during the evening and many expressed frustration and left the program. That problem has since been rectified and the attrition rate for part-time cohorts admitted from 2009-12 is 13%. This is quite low for a part-time cohort given that these students' employment and family arrangements are subject to change over the time period normally expected to complete the program.
15	The School should pursue its double-cohort policy.	The School will continue to accept two cohorts.	No further action required.	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	

PHD PROGRAM

16	To capitalize on the significant potential of the part-time option at the doctoral level, which is unique in Ontario, the School should consider new modes of delivery such as intensive blended formats.	Building on the potential opportunities for students to enroll in and complete PhD part-time is a significant strength for the School. New modes of delivery, including intensive, online and blended formats, are currently being considered. One potential growth area is among current, experienced faculty at newer or smaller universities who need to upgrade to a PhD. An appropriate funding model that will generate resources for faculty support in supervising and working with doctoral students is central to pursuing and successfully harnessing these opportunities.	16.1. Develop new resource allocation model for PhD students in alternative delivery modes.	J. Tomberlin	Budget availability. Requires work with FGPA and VP (F&A)	Jul-17	On Hold	We have received strong interest in a part-time PhD option from our partner in Colombia and see an opportunity amongst developing countries. That being said, we would not be able to mount an extensive summer program without appropriate resources.
17	The supervision of many PhD students is highly concentrated among a small number of supervisors. The program should only grow commensurate with the School's ability to provide excellent supervision. Furthermore, some faculty members teaching at the doctoral level do not seem to have the high-quality publication or funded research records that would be expected.	Over the past two years, significant effort has been made to engage more faculty in PhD student supervision. All eligible faculty are asked to review admissions applications in their disciplinary area and applicants are encouraged to contact faculty in their areas of interest. Faculty supervisions depend, to a large extent, on student interest. Recently revised standards for promotion and tenure now include an expectation of student supervision, which hopes to increase the number of faculty involved. Lastly, the School is currently updating its workload framework which may include student supervision in the calculation of teaching load. The School endeavors to have the most qualified faculty teaching in the PhD program. The School maintains a robust and ongoing assessment of faculty qualifications, through AACSB accreditation, that categorizes faculty based advanced preparation and continued production of peer-reviewed journal articles. In total, 89% of the faculty teaching in the PhD program have been categorized as Scholarly Academic (SA) by these rigorous standards. While there are a great number of faculty active in research, the School is currently engaging its faculty members in how best to incorporate journal quality in publications. A journal quality framework has been proposed and presented to faculty, with discussions ongoing. Significant effort has also been put into assisting faculty in generating more external research funding. Lastly, there are plans to re-introduce a thesis-based Master's degree, which will serve as a feeder to the PhD program, provide faculty with a greater number of research assistants, and round out the qualifications of new faculty to help them increase their publication quality and quantity and the likelihood of receiving grants for their research.	17.1. Offer a thesis-based Master's (MSc) degree.	G. Grant	Faculty Board and Financial Planning Group approval	Jul-16	In Progress	Faculty Board has given approval of the program, in principle. Final approval will be contingent of the approval of the Business Plan by FPG where one additional faculty position would be provided contingent on enrolment meeting or surpassing the breakeven level.
			17.2. Adopt journal quality framework.	L. Schweitzer	Research Committee, Faculty Board approval.	Feb-16	In Progress	
			17.3. Complete design of new Workload Incentive Framework that integrates journal quality.	M. Hine	Workload Incentive Task Force, CUASA faculty members approval.	Jul-16	In Progress	

ACTION PLAN
 REVIEW OF UNDERGRADUATE AND GRADUATE PROGRAMS OF THE
 SPROTT SCHOOL OF BUSINESS
 FEBRUARY 2016

18	More focus should be placed on ensuring that students are equipped to publish in top-tier journals and to obtain research funding.	The revised PhD degree-level learning outcomes put a strong emphasis on publishing in peer reviewed journals and students are encouraged and supported to submit articles to top-tier conferences and publications through their coursework. In addition to submitting written work to academic conferences and journals for publication, students are expected to participate in the academic publication process through familiarity with key researchers and publication requirements of leading journals/conferences and by providing service, such as reviewing papers, for these entities. The School also provides Grant Writing workshops to PhD students to equip students to publish and obtain research funding.	18.1. Monitor achievement of PhD learning objectives related to publishing.	G. Grant	AOL Committee / Curriculum Review Committee	Ongoing	In Progress	
19	There does not seem to be alignment between the research goals outlined in the program and the required courses.	This issue has been rectified with the introduction of the new, streamlined PhD program introduced in Fall 2015. This revised program is easier to follow and gives students more opportunity to choose electives that suit their interests. The revised program now requires students to take 1.5 Credits (3 courses) in research methodology. Two courses, BUSI 6903 Qualitative Research Design and BUSI 6904 Quantitative Research Design were added to give students more methodological training. The core courses were revised and renamed where necessary to make it more relevant for students. One clear set of electives are now part of the program. The revised PhD learning goals and objectives reflect this change. We now have four clear learning goals along with their associated objectives. These are: Develop research knowledge and understanding; conduct scholarly research; communicate research work and results; and, engage in professional activities and functions. Each learning goal has two or three specific and measurable objectives associated with them.	19.1. Develop new learning goals and objectives that reflect streamlined PhD program.	G. Grant	AOL Committee, Curriculum Review Committee and Faculty Board approval	N/A	Completed	
20	The number of required courses could be reduced to address students' concerns about scheduling. This would give more time for independent research.	The important modifications to the PhD program introduced in Fall 2015 offers some flexibility with the electives, though not offering a reduced number of courses. Instead on having tiers of electives, the program now has one set of electives. This makes it easier for students to design their program. Students also have, and have always had, the option to take up to two elective courses within and outside Carleton (with permission) to satisfy the course requirements. We are also exploring the delivery of more courses during the summer semester to meet the needs of both full- and part-time students who often have more flexibility during this period. All of this is dependent on the availability of faculty and supporting resources. The new comprehensive examination structure will make it possible for students to get through the preliminary stages of the program more quickly so they can focus more on their thesis research.	20.1. Investigate improvement of scheduled offerings for PhD program through integration with potential MSc program.	G. Grant	17.1	N/A	On Hold	Subject to approval of MSc program.